‘“The White Man’s Way:”’ Navigating Race and Memory in “Federal Indian Boarding Schools”

Sylvia Cotten

Advised by Dr. Woods

Table of Contents

Introduction

On September 30th, 2022, residential school survivor Dennis Saddleman shared his poem "Monster, A Residential School Experience" for the Canadian National Day of Truth and Reconciliation. The day "honours the children who never returned home and the Survivors of residential schools" as well as their families and communities.[1] It was established by the Canadian legislature in response to the Truth and Reconciliation Commission's recommendation following their report on "94 calls to action," which details the burial sites, poor treatment, and overall intergenerational harm of Canada's "140 federally run residential schools" from 1867-1996.[2] Taking place on September 30th, the federal holiday also shares the date with the "Indigenous-led grassroots commemorative" Orange Shirt Day, which encourages Canadians to wear orange as a symbolic reminder "of the stripping away of culture, freedom, and self-expression experienced by Indigenous children over generations."[3] Saddleman's impactful performance actualized the trauma of attending the Kamloops Indian Residential School by detailing the lasting nature of the horrors he experienced. For eleven years, Saddleman braved the "ugly face grooved with red bricks" that crunched up his language, choked on his sacred spirit, and "ate up his Indianness." Even in his adult life, he was haunted by the "slimy monster oozing in the shadows of [his] past."[4] The poem ends with a reconciliation between the "monster" and Saddleman, though the lasting trauma of federal boarding schools endures in North America. Whereas Canada has started to address reconciliation efforts, the United States

---

[1] "National Day for Truth and Reconciliation," Government of Canada, last modified November 1, 2023, https://www.canada.ca/en/canadian-heritage/campaigns/national-day-truth-reconciliation.html.
[2] "National Day for Truth," Government of Canada.
[3] "National Day for Truth," Government of Canada.
[4] CBC News, "Residential school survivor Dennis Saddleman shares poem about his experience," YouTube, September 30, 2022, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=uD2ysbp8708.

has yet to do so to them same extent even though the harm done by boarding schools continues to persist.

Both the Canadian and United States federal governments created boarding schools to disperse tribal relations and dispossess Indigenous people. The Canadian government has more adequately recognized these events with programs, holidays, and movements, but the United States is still lacking. By studying dynamics in thought and memory between Indigenous children and their boarding school environments, I use this information to echo Indigenous propositions and methods of reconciliation that better encompass the tragedies the United States has incurred.

Boarding schools created by the United States federal government in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries continued the longstanding process of Indigenous dispossession. Historian Nicholas Guyatt argues that the United States is constructed from ideas of separate but equal persons because of the way in which elite colonists viewed non-white races as degenerative rather than progressive in American society.[5] These ideas constructed a race hierarchy that only benefited white Americans, and they felt threatened with any challenge to their status quo. Expansionists guaranteed new land for the United States through warfare and dubious treaties, but the novel Indian Appropriations Act in 1871 "prohibited the making of further treaties with [tribes] and ended their independent status."[6] Tribal ties were further dispersed in 1887 under the Dawes Act wherein the United States government decided that they had the right to divide "communally-held Indian lands into individual allotments."[7] I agree with

---

[5] Nicholas Guyatt, *Bind Us Apart: How Enlightened Americans Invented Racial Segregation* (New York: Basic Books, 2016).
[6] Theodore Fischbacher, "A Study of the Role of the Federal Government in the Education of the American Indian" (PhD diss., Arizona State University, 1967), 459.
[7] Fischbacher, "A Study," 460.

Brian Delay when he argues "that U.S. relations with Indians were foreign relations," meaning that these instances were imperial methods to grow an empire by forcibly annexing territory.[8]

Boarding schools purposely sought to weaken tribal community relations by disrupting what it meant to be "Indian" by forcing younger generations to conform to whiteness. The Civilization Act of 1819 appropriated annual federal funds for the purpose of "civilizing" Indigenous tribes through education. The act expressed "the first…national concern for the education of American Indians" and was still regarded as the "'organic legal base for…the educational work of the Indian Service."'[9] David Wallace Adams studied these boarding schools and concluded that they sought to remove the "Indianness" from children by Christianizing, individualizing, and republicanizing them for the "civilizing" mission.[10] I further this idea by arguing that whiteness is synonymous with the "civilizing" mission. The components of whiteness (as instructed by the schools) consisted of labor, Christianity, racism, English literacy, and American nationalism, all under the guise of said "civilization." The schools themselves are another step in the longstanding genocide of Indigenous people enacted by the federal government; many deaths occurred on the premises of schools, and, moreover, the education in "whiteness" was a component in the cultural genocide of Indigenous families and tribes. On-reservation boarding schools continued to take up space on native reservations that had already been allotted to Indigenous people, serving as a constant reminder of oppression by the United States government. Off-reservation boarding schools took children (often forcibly) away from their families, uprooting them from their culture and dispersing tribal identities.

---

[8] Brian DeLay, "Indian Polities, Empire, and the History of American Foreign Relations," *Diplomatic History* 39, no. 5 (November 2015): 928.
[9] Fischbacher, "A Study," 110.
[10] David Wallace Adams, *Education for Extinction: American Indians and the Boarding School Experience, 1875-1928* (Lawrence: University of Kansas Press, 2020), 365-366.

The United States government refers to these institutions as "Federal Indian Boarding Schools," but I think that the name is unfit. Though it recognizes the United States' role in creating these schools for Indigenous children, it neglects to include the deeply entrenched child labor that was endured by the students and instead normalizes the institutions, making it seem as if they functioned like any academic institution. Students were subjected to working long hours in gendered trades, and the schools engaged in military drills meant to teach uniform behavior. The "manual labor" trades that students learned in schools were simultaneously present with the "hard labor" of the outing-system. I propose to call them Forced Indigenous Labor Schools (FILS) or Federal Forced Indigenous Labor Schools (FFILS) to account for the resistance and resilience of Indigenous tribes against the United States government and the way in which these schools actually treated the children. By eliminating the term "Indian," I also seek to erase colonial terminology and instead encompass the aboriginal nature of North American tribes in what is commonly known as "the United States of America."

Understandably, many Indigenous people identify with "Indian" because it is a testament to the history and ongoing resistance of Native Americans against the federal government. Indigenous scholars Brooke Bauer and Elizabeth Ellis argue that terms like "Indian" and "American Indian" are useful to "talk about the shared colonial experiences of Indigenous people within the United States" and that "*Indian* remains a useful term for discussing racial and federal policy."[11] By proposing FILS or FFILS terminology, I seek not to erase nor police terms of identification, but instead to encourage other ways of thinking about these schools and the legacy of their harm.

---

[11] Brooke Bauer and Elizabeth Ellis, "Indigenous, Native American, or American Indian? The Limitations of Broad Terms," *Journal of the Early Republic* 43, no. 1 (Spring 2023): 61-74, Project MUSE. Bauer is a citizen of the Catawba Indian Nation of South Carolina, and Ellis is a citizen of the Peoria Tribe of Indians of Oklahoma.

My research takes inspiration from Julie Morrow's investigation into Anishinaabeg perseverance at the Carlisle Indian School. She analyzes 625 Carlisle periodicals from *The Red Man* and *The Carlisle Arrow* under their various names from 1904 to 1918, finding that "Student authors [demonstrated] how the forces of assimilation did not define their identities and perspectives but were incorporated into adaptive ways of being Anishinaabeg in a changing world."[12] I trace the ways in which memory interacted within and through these schools, which shaped the lives of Indigenous children by subjecting them to white biases that disconnected them from tribal identities. Using newspapers from two different institutions, I categorize perspectives of students, their families, the United States government, and FILS staff to recognize traumatic interactions that occurred simultaneously. I look at the terminology each group uses to describe themselves and one another, the types of articles published, emphasis on certain ideological themes, and the literal information itself to determine these "memory relationships." I define this term as the way in which prior experiences of certain groups influence how they interact with and perceive one another. Adding a component of "time" recognizes a lasting connection of thought that changes how reconciliation efforts may work to better suit not only how these students wanted to be remembered, but the current needs of modern Indigenous tribes. These levels of awareness serve to educate about the gross depth of whiteness in boarding schools and assist in constructing successful methods of reconciliation. Determining these interactions and levels of perception considers how the students may have wanted to be remembered in tandem with how Indigenous communities are still currently affected by FILS. Memory relationships can be categorized by a number of different kinds of relationships or perspectives including: how Indigenous children viewed themselves, how school

[12] Julie Morrow, "Adapting Against Assimilation: Recovering Anishinaabe Student Writings in Carlisle Indian School Periodicals, 1904-1918," *Australasian Journal of American Studies* 40, no. 2 (December 2021): 71-102, JSTOR.

staff viewed the children, how Indigenous children viewed the staff, how school staff wanted Indigenous children to be perceived by external white society, how ordinary white society views Indigenous tribes, how Indigenous children viewed their families, how Indigenous families (parents specifically) viewed their children, how the United States government viewed Indigenous tribes, and how Indigenous tribes viewed the United States government.

My analysis of these relationships was determined by newspapers published in two boarding schools from Genoa, Nebraska and Carlisle, Pennsylvania. Four issues from each volume were chosen so that all times of the year could be accounted for. *The School News* was Carlisle's second publication. Running from late 1880 to early 1883, it was mostly students who produced these monthly issues.[13] Continuing directly after *The School News*, Carlisle's more notable paper *The Morning Star* was looked at from 1883-1886. Genoa's *The Indian News* was used from 1906-1909 because it was the closest to Carlisle available in the archive. Carlisle has two newspapers because there is no direct equivalent at Genoa to *The School* News. Though a slight change over time may be identifiable, the papers serve to gauge trends in myth and memory-making in terms of perception of the situation of which the children were subjected to.

As a white woman with no Indigenous heritage, I recognize my position as a researcher and how it may seem that I am speaking for historically othered communities. I do not mean to impose subjectivities on a topic that I have no relations to, but I genuinely believe that FILS need to be made aware of and that the United States could be doing more to recognize and reconcile with these tragedies.

Indigenous children viewed themselves in three different ways: identifying more with whiteness, identifying more with their tribes, or identifying with both simultaneously as a "split

---

[13] Carsten Brodbeck, "Publications of the Carlisle Indian Industrial School," Gardner Digital Library, www.gardnerlibrary.org/encylopedia/publications-carlisle-indian-industrial-school.

subject." This memory relationship was determined by analyzing the terminology Indigenous children used in the newspapers to describe their identities. These identities were prominent in essays published by the children, letters they wrote to their families or to the schools, and overall commentary on their experiences at the schools. *School News* is very useful in determining this interaction of memory because it was written completely from the perspective of the children, but *The Morning Star* and *The Indian News* still display similar trends.

The staff at these schools had mixed opinions about the children, and these thoughts were prevalent in the ways in which they described the children and their interactions with them during school hours. Whereas some teachers prided themselves in the work that they were doing for students, others felt that the children did not conform to the "proper degree" of whiteness and still found them uncivilized. Overall, there remained a hierarchy and general air of superiority for the teachers over the students (though based on levels of whiteness rather than academia).

Indigenous children viewed the staff in a fairly positive light, often calling them "school mothers" or "school fathers." Though this terminology may be generally used throughout schools during the time, it is unlikely that the children would term their teachers after their parents if they recognized that the teachers were treating them poorly. Arguably, the children were treated poorly due to the intense manual labor that both sexes were forced to do in separate gendered spheres (yet the guises of whiteness and conformity may have prevented this recognition). Captain Pratt, the founder of Carlisle, was almost deified by the students. These interactions in memory are determined by the ways in which the students reacted to the labor they were allotted, the ways in which the students described their joy for the teacher's mundane extracurricular lives, and the ways in which they wrote to the teachers when the students were in the outing-system and no longer at school.

The ways in which the staff wanted the children to be perceived by outside white society varied as much as their opinions about the children. Each of the papers were created to generate profit to fund the mission of white conformity (or as the papers called them, the "civilizing mission"), so they most likely wanted to appeal to differing views in white society: those that believed in the project of "civilizing" Indigenous tribes, and those that could not understand the reformation of "savages." This can be understood as the children wanting to show external white society what exactly their experience was going to school at Carlisle. As the paper was still for-profit, it is most likely that they wanted to earn money for either better living conditions within the school, or because they genuinely thought white education would be to their benefit. This memory relationship was determined through the ways in which the teachers wrote about the students, what types of student essays they published, and the types of didactic literature they chose to publish for readers (assuming that the students would read the papers as well).

The ways in which Indigenous children viewed their families (including parents, siblings, and overall tribes) varied depending on the degree of whiteness they identified with. Whereas some children expressed homesickness for tribal culture, others implored their families to embrace whiteness (specifically Christianity) and send their siblings to boarding schools for a white education. Evidence of this memory relationship is found most prominently in the letters written by children to their families that are subsequently published by the papers. Whereas students may have given consent to have their letters published, it is uncertain as to whether they assisted in determining the specific excerpts or full consent in general. Alongside this subjectivity stands the fact that students were only allowed to communicate with the outside world if they wrote in English.

Indigenous families (specifically parents) viewed their children in varying ways depending on whether they were for or against education. This memory relationship is equally found in correspondences between parent and child alongside published reactions of Indigenous parents to school events. Indigenous parents supported white education in multiple ways: they did not want to be taken advantage of by white society and they recognized the encroachment of whiteness into tribal affairs. Some parents also genuinely supported the integration of their children because they felt that whiteness offered access to a more comfortable lifestyle. Indigenous parents opposed white education for similar reasons: they recognized the cultural genocide of tribal ways and did not want their children to lose their culture, and they felt that their children would fare better in maintaining tribal traditions.

The United States government did not view Indigenous people as "useful" or human unless they conformed entirely to whiteness. Even when Indigenous people conformed strongly to whiteness, there are instances wherein the children expressed a desire to become United States citizens and were refused. There is also a less-prominent recognition that full conformity could not nor will ever exist, and these memory relationships are seen in articles republished from other papers or speeches addressing the country. I call this country the "United States" because "America" could refer to either North or South America, and "America" is also a reminder of European colonialism (once again) renaming places without taking native terminology into account. By using "United States" specifically, I encourage readers to be mindful about the way in which the United States federal government chose to build their imperial empire on top of pre-existing cultures and communities.

Finally, Indigenous tribes viewed the United States government as an invasive threat. Many only sought white conformity for fear of further violent eradication of their people, and yet

the United States government continued to dispossess the tribes of their land and families through extended violation of treaties, missionary activity, and the boarding schools. This memory relationship is built upon the ways in which children and parents interacted with white society and the processes that were being enacted upon them to force white conformity. The ways in which this memory relationship was determined can be seen through republished letters and speeches given by Indigenous people.

My argument is organized chronologically to illustrate the multitude of interactions in memory relationships and values of whiteness that were simultaneously present in the daily lives of Indigenous students and those in their environment. The repetitive nature serves to cement trends that were both present at Carlisle and Genoa, whereas the chronology shows a shift in answers to the "Indian Question" as the late nineteenth century gives way to the twentieth. The first chapter constructs an idea of the environment that Indigenous children experienced at Carlisle in the late nineteenth century. I draw from *The School News* to define whiteness and the types of memory relationships that children at Carlisle interacted with. I analyze what these interactions mean in terms of treatment of the children and the progression of the "Indian Question." I note significant forms of resistance and how they play into ideas of whiteness, cultural dispersion, and dispossession. My second chapter continues this analysis of memory at Carlisle and uses *The Morning Star* to encompass memory relationships that were not present in the student-led paper. My third chapter solidifies the consistencies in memory relationships by placing them in the early twentieth century across the country from Carlisle. As there was no newspaper at Genoa similar to *The School News*, I use *The Indian News* to build upon the definition of whiteness and continue to trace these memory relationships. I indicate trends in memory relationships as well as shifting solutions to the "Indian Question." These ideas are

significant because they promote an awareness in uplifting Indigenous voices and beneficial methods of reconciliation rather than falling into harmful repetitions of the past. I list current methods of reconciliation in the United States and propose ideas as to why they are enacted to the extent that they are. I critique and compare current methods of reconciliation to those in Canada, and openly ponder why and how the United States could be doing better.

Chapter 1 – *The School News* and Student Perspectives

The Carlisle Indian Industrial School was opened in Pennsylvania by Richard Henry Pratt "as the first government-run [off-reservation] boarding school for Native American children" in 1879.[14] After lobbying in Washington for a location to build, he was granted unused military barracks and the authority to recruit a starting number of 125 children for his school.[15] Opposing the popular mindset "that the only good Indian is a dead one," Pratt instead championed the idea to "Kill the Indian…and save the man."[16] Carlisle was meant to individualize Indigenous children and disperse tribal customs. By physically and culturally isolating the children from their homes, Pratt believed his school would aid in the assimilation of native children into white civilization.

Carlisle was the next step in an earlier project of Pratt's. Conflicts in 1874 during the Red River War had Pratt named as the supervisor for a group of incarcerated warriors charged with theft, rape, and murder.[17] White settlers encroaching lands of the "Southern Plains Indians" combined with "the failure of Congress to live up to treaty obligations" caused Kiowa, Cheyenne, and Comanche warriors to engage in a series of bloody skirmishes that ended in the capture of seventy-two prisoners.[18] They were "comprised of thirty-four Cheyenne, two Arapaho, twenty-seven Kiowa, nine Comanche, and one Caddo" warrior, mostly consisting of young men.[19] After their capture, the warriors were transported to Fort Marion in Florida, where Pratt had the idea to "redeem" them through forced assimilation instead of imprisonment. He implemented practices like cutting the hair of the warriors, teaching them English, forcing them

---

[14] Bryan Newland, U.S. Bureau of Indian Affairs, *Federal Indian Boarding School Initiative Investigative Report: List of Federal Indian Boarding Schools*, Deb Haaland and Bryan Newland, Volume 1, Washington, D.C.: May 2022, p. 58, https://www.bia.gov/sites/default/files/dup/inline-files/appendix_a_b_school_listing_profiles_508.pdf. Accessed January 22, 2024.
[15] Wallace Adams, *Education for Extinction*, 54.
[16] Captain Richard Henry Pratt, "The Advantages of Mingling Indians With Whites," in *Proceedings of the National Conference of Charities and Correction at the Nineteenth Annual Session Held in Denver, Col.: June 23-29, 1892*, ed. Isabel C. Barrows (Boston: Press of Geo. H. Ellis, 1892), 46.
[17] Wallace Adams, *Education for Extinction,* 43.
[18] Wallace Adams, *Education for Extinction*, 43.
[19] Wallace Adams, *Education for Extinction*, 43.

to wear uniforms with trousers, and teaching them about Christianity.[20] These same conditions for prisoners were later forced upon the students at Carlisle, dispossessing each group of their culture. It was never about selfless education because the practice started as punishment.

Carlisle's demographics had always been diverse and grew to encompass a student body comprised of over 100 tribes.[21] The first group of students not only came from Fort Marion, but the Rosebud and Pine Ridge agencies, the Ponca and Pawnee agencies, the Kiowa, Comanche, and Wichita agencies, the Cheyenne and Arapaho agencies, the "Bay" agency, and the Sisseton agency.[22] Alongside other students from "Sioux country," Carlisle's original group totaled 147 students ranging from ages 8 to 20, with 29 being a sole outlier.[23] Most of the students were between 10 and 17; leaving their families so young made them more impressionable to Carlisle's "civilizing" efforts. Pratt hoped that isolating the students would dispel them of their "Indianness" and encourage principles of whiteness.

Instructions in values of whiteness were consistently present throughout the existence of FILS. They manifested during the daily lives of Indigenous students in the lessons they were taught, the rules they were forced to follow, and the mindsets that school officials and instructors sought to get native students to believe in. Similar to the analysis of memory relationships, whiteness is defined in the newspapers through content, terminology, and reception. By tracing the way in which entities perceived one another, a definition of whiteness appears in *The School News* and *The Morning Star*. It then solidifies itself in *The Indian News* at Genoa in the early twentieth century. I introduce these articles chronologically and thread the values of whiteness

[20] Wallace Adams, *Education for Extinction*, 46-49.
[21] Deb Haaland and Bryan Newland, *List of Federal Indian Boarding Schools*, 58.
[22] Richard Henry Pratt to Ezra H. Hayt, November 13, 1879, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[23] Richard Henry to Ezra, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.

throughout the memory relationships of the students to more seamlessly present the information gathered.

The School News was Carlisle's second newspaper, and it was greatly influenced by the student body. First published in June of 1880, Carlisle students oversaw the writing, editing, and publishing of *The School News* until it was absorbed into *The Morning Star* by 1883.[24] *The School News* is advertised as being "Not any white man's writing but all the Indian boy's writing," though this may be false as the first article is signed with the same initials as Pratt's son, Mason D. Pratt. [25] The way in which this newspaper was falsely advertised recognizes a first instance of whiteness because it negates the opportunity for students to prove they can produce a successful English newspaper.

The first issue of *The School News* introduces the Christianizing efforts at Carlisle, the individualizing tasks that students partake in, provides student memories, and discusses a visit from the external public. A speech presumably delivered by one of the students implores his peers to "follow the white man's road" and "not walk in the Indian road anymore" because he has accepted Christianity and feels that it is best for other Indigenous students to do so as well.[26] He ends the speech with "[God] will help you and I will pray for you every day and ask Him to make you good."[27] Though it is presumed that "Chas. Ohetoint" was at one point a student, it is unclear as to whether he was attending Carlisle at the time of the speech. Ohetoint distances himself from his Indigenous roots by preaching to the students "not [to] walk in the Indian road anymore" and instead to align with Christianity and "the white man's road." Christianity is hence

---

[24] *The Morning Star* 3, no. 12 (July 1883): 4, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[25] Samuel Townsend, "Editorial," *School News* 1, no. 1 (June 1880): 2, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[26] "A Speech Delivered by Chas. Ohetoint, Before the Students, In Our Chapel.," *The School News* 1, no. 1 (June 1880): 4, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[27] "A Speech Delivered by Chas.," 4.

a tenet of whiteness. Ohetoint's speech represents a memory relationship of how the students viewed themselves. Even if he was not a student at this point, he connects more with whiteness and Christianity rather than his original culture. Whether or not this system of belief was free from coercion is unclear, though it is likely that Ohetoint was subjected to cultural dispossession at Fort Marion because he mentions "[learning] something about the good way [in Florida]."[28] He may have been brough to Carlisle either because he genuinely believed in the values of whiteness he was taught, or as a deliberate individual to vouch on Pratt's behalf for his "civilizing" methods.

Weekly Christianizing efforts are also mentioned alongside Ohetoint's speech. *The School News* is very useful for determining memory relationships of how the students viewed themselves and how they perceive those in their environments because a large portion of the newspaper is student observations about internal Carlisle events. An unnamed student describes their Sunday evening prayer meetings, where "Capt Pratt reads in the Bible" and "[the boys] pray to our Father in heaven…to help us to be good."[29] Usage of "us" assumes that their peers lack the capacity to "be good" unless they are Christian, similar to how Ohetoint says he will pray to the Christian god and ask "Him to make [them] good." To what extent is this assumption impressed upon the students instead of allowing them to derive their goodness outside of whiteness? Christianity is again aligned with whiteness since it is being dictated by Pratt and is thus present in policing student identity and perspective.

Efforts to individualize students at Carlisle were rooted in the "outing-system" and hard labor. Though the "outing-system" does not appear until later issues of Carlisle newspapers, it is significant to recognize the program as another method of tribal dispersion. This program was

---

[28] "A Speech Delivered by Chas.," 4.
[29] "School News," *The School News* 1, no. 1 (June 1880): 3, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.

essentially "an apprenticeship for civilization" wherein "Indian boys and girls…[lived] in private [white] homes for a period of time in order to gain practical experience in self-support."[30] Students were expected to spend two years at Carlisle improving their designated, gendered trade before taking part in the outing-system. Whereas it was originally an incentive for academic achievement, the outing-system was later to open all students since it was seen as an effective method of the "civilizing mission."[31]

In this first issue of *The School News*, students wrote about their daily chores. Girls do the sewing and darning of socks, and boys learn carpentry, blacksmithing, and tin smithing. Though "Guy and Samuel" are noted to "make pretty good bread," baking and cooking is excessively listed in later Carlisle newspapers as a task for the girls.[32] These trades are thought to have prepared students for future familial roles, with women in the domestic sphere and men in the public and occupational spheres. Impressing roles unfamiliar to Indigenous children is a method of cultural dispersion meant to distance the students from their backgrounds. As these roles were placed upon them and practiced by white society, individualization was a form of whiteness and "civilizing."

The first issue also recognizes the memory relationship of how students view themselves, which is apparent through an article from Henry C. Roman Nose. Roman Nose was part of the original group transferred from Fort Marion to Carlisle with Pratt. Eventually, he grows up to become Chief of the Cheyenne tribe.[33] He recalls his days before Carlisle, reminiscent about "[his] old home in Indian Territory" where he killed buffalo and birds, swam, and went to "war against the Pawnees."[34] Recognition of an "old home" implies that Carlisle is Roman Nose's

---

[30] R. L. Brunhouse, "Apprenticeship for Civilization: The Outing System at the Carlisle Indian School" in *Educational Outlook* (U.S.A.: University of Pennsylvania, 1939), 1.
[31] Brunhouse, "Apprenticeship," 3-4.
[32] "School News," 3.
[33] "Henry Roman Nose Student File," accessed April 26, 2024, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.

"new home," which further insinuates that he aligns with the "civilizing" efforts taught at Carlisle as well as his old tribe.

Another article from the first issue of *The School News* provides insight as to how the staff at Carlisle wanted external white society to view the children. "Visitors From Harrisburg" describes a short visit by "ladies and gentlemen" who "went in all the school rooms and saw the Indian children reciting and reading out loud and behaving themselves."[35] The visitors seemed surprised that students wrote the paper themselves, and the article concludes with a promotion for buying the paper at "twenty-five cents a year."[36] Inviting outside members of society to come view Carlisle students sounds a lot like wanting to prove that Indigenous children have the capabilities to be "useful" members of society with English literacy and ideas of politeness.

The next issue of *The School News* is from September of 1880, and includes another story from Henry C. Roman Nose, an article on education, internal school affairs, and letters from the students. Roman Nose describes the many things he had seen on a trip to New York, stating that "[he] can not tell all…because [he does not] understand how to spell and call them."[37] He also makes his excitement known about being allowed to visit his "old relations" at "Indian Territory," where he hopes to help them by "[teaching] them about the good way of the white man road and to love God."[38] Christianity is once again associated with "the white man's road," further embedding it as a tenet of whiteness. Roman Nose exemplifies the memory relationship of how the students view themselves because he exists in the worlds of his tribe and at Carlisle.

---

[34] Henry C. Roman Nose, "An Indian Boy's Camp Life," *The School News* 1, no. 1 (June 1880): 1, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[35] "Visitors From Harrisburg," *The School News* 1, no. 1 (June 1880): 2, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[36] "Visitors," 2.
[37] Henry C. Roman Nose, "Roman Nose Goes to New York," *The School News* 1, no. 4 (Sept. 1880): 1, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[38] "Roman Nose Goes to New York," 1.

His excitement for visiting home clearly indicates that he cares deeply for his family, though imploring that they accept Christianity is an effect of Carlisle's "civilizing" efforts.

After Roman Nose's story, "Education" is an essay arguing that education should be equally accessible for both "Indians" and white people. Black people are not mentioned in this article, though students are aware of their existence in the United States because of racist excerpts found in later boarding school papers. Whether the student wanted to compare the merits of Indigenous tribes to white people or exclude black people based on deliberate racism is undetermined. The student argues that "[whites] would not know how to make steam-engines and steam-boats" if they did not have an education, and would therefore "hunt and [fight] and do other bad things [like Indians]."[39] The student then goes on to say that a lack of school houses and books would cause Indigenous tribes to have "very little minds to think with."[40] Deliberately associating cultural norms with negativity implies that the student's education condemns anything that does not fit into white societal standards, tearing them between two worlds. In the second quote, the student identifies "we" with having "very little minds to think with," insinuating that they have learned from Carlisle that Indigenous people are unintelligent unless they follow standards of white society. This implies that Indigenous tribes do not have schools that function the same way that white schools, insinuating that tribes are not as smart as white people. However, Indigenous communities have an abundance of knowledge that is highly valued and passed down by their communities, to which this student does not consider because they have been taught that white education is more "intellectual." Associating "education" with "whites" signifies that it is specifically a *white* education that the student seeks for their peers, inadvertently continuing Carlisle's process of cultural eradication.

---

[39] "Education," *The School News* 1, no. 4 (Sept. 1880): 2, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[40] "Education," 2.

Internal school affairs in this issue include information about military drills, Pratt's short-term sickness, the start of the school year, and a student giving a religious speech. Though it does not list the specific illness, Pratt "was sick about one week."[41] This implies that Pratt was so closely tied to Carlisle that the students felt it important to report on his health. This demonstrates the memory relationship of how students view Carlisle staff because of the almost "deification" that Pratt experiences throughout his time as headmaster. Reports of his insignificant illness show that students either genuinely appreciated him or were made to care about him to the point where he was associated with their "success" in "civilization." Most significant were the daily evening military drills that the boys were subjected to.[42] It is most likely that Pratt may have felt that these drills exemplified the students' abilities to be "smart" and orderly, proving to external visitors that Indigenous children had the same merits as white children. Regardless, it is a continuation of the military practices reserved for prisoners at Fort Marion. Like the outing-system, military drills were intrinsic to Carlisle and made to strip students of their individuality and learn discipline. Both girls and boys were subjected to this treatment.[43] Another excerpt details that "Robert made a good speech last week in the chapel," recognizing that Christianity is equally drilled into students.[44]

The final part of this issue includes an opinion piece by a student as well as letters sent to Samuel Townsend, the editor of *The School News*. Townsend entered the institution on October 22nd, 1879, and discharged September 18th, 1883. He later entered the school for a second time in September of 1891 and was expelled in 1892. Though his file lacks further information, it was likely that Townsend spent much time in the outing system because he seemed to be well-liked.

---

[41] "School News," *The School News* 1, no. 4 (Sept 1880): 2, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[42] "School News," 2.
[43] Wallace Adams, 126.
[44] "School News," 2.

This member of the Pawnee nation later continued his trade in the press and became a printer.[45] The article "Anna Raven, An Araphoe Says;" presumably provides Raven's insights about summertime, Carlisle, and Indian Territory. She "[thinks] that it is good for Indians to send their children to learn how the good way is," and she "[likes] to live like white people."[46] "The good way" most likely represents white civilization, continuing an idea of white supremacy exhibited in earlier articles. Raven uses "we" to refer to herself in tandem with other Indigenous students and expresses excitement for *when* her Indigenous friends visit Carlisle.[47] Her terminology and wishes mark her neither "white" nor "Indian," showing that her experiences at Carlisle have transformed the relationship between her environment and memory to exist within a liminal space. Indigenous students were never going to be truly "white," only "good Indians" and "bad Indians" depending on how strongly they conformed to values of whiteness. Though they may have learned to live in "the white man's way," it never erased their tribal roots in the eyes of white society and the United States government.

The letters to the editor at *The Morning Star* detail further individualizing efforts of manual labor and profits. The first letter from Joe Vetter of Iowa discusses that the boys continue to have evening military drills and that they have returned to Carlisle after recovering from illness at home.[48] He also discusses the way in which boys hone their trade skills and profit from them.[49] Profiting from manual labor learned in the training school exhibits the tent of individualization and furthers Carlisle's dispossessive nature because it is a method in which to disperse tribal customs of community. The next letter from Elwood Dorian of Iowa "[tells the

---

[45] "Samuel Townsend Student Information Cards," 1-3, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[46] "Anna Raven, An Araphoe Says;," *The School News* 1, no. 4 (Sept. 1880): 4, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[47] "Anna Raven," 4.
[48] Joe Vetter, *The School News* 1, no. 4 (Sept. 1880): 4, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[49] Joe Vetter, 4.

reader] something about [his] native home" where they used to hunt and compares it to how students "begin to know something about what is good" by creating with their hands and minds at Carlisle.[50] Dorian's association that students only know "something good" through their education at Carlisle implies that Indigenous students lack intelligence unless they are taught in whiteness. However, possessive terminology of "home" in Indian Territory indicates Dorian's identification with Indigenous heritage, marking himself as neither "white" nor "Indian." Edward Upright finishes the issue with a final letter that details how he is "[learning to] make tin-cups and pails" alongside other boys and shares his plans for continuing his trade "when [he goes] home to [his] people."[51] Though Upright is subjected to the manual labor method of individualization at Carlisle, whiteness is only semi-successful here. Upright does intend to continue his trade upon returning to his family, though using possessive terminology when mentioning his tribe identifies more of an alignment with Indigenous heritage.

The third issue of *The School News* is from December of 1880, and includes information about Roman Nose's imprisonment in Florida, English literacy efforts, Christmas traditions, and the life story of an Apache student. Roman Nose was part of the original group of students that Pratt brought from Fort Marion. He recounts how Pratt "took [Roman Nose and his peers] away from all sadness and bad thoughts and sinners" and "taught them all about the good ways of the whites" starting with the English alphabet.[52] Roman Nose's possessive terminology displays an identification with his Indigenous peers, but Pratt's effective whitewashing also has Roman Nose eager to shed his cultural roots. The latter is evident from a continued idea of "the good ways of the whites." Not only does Roman Nose demonstrate the memory relationship of how students

---

[50] Elwood Dorian, *The School News* 1, no. 4 (Sept. 1880): 4, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[51] Edward Upright, *The School News* 1, no. 4 (Sept. 1880): 4, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[52] "Experiences of H. C. Roman Nose," *The School News* 1, no. 7 (Dec. 1880): 1, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.

viewed themselves, but he also views Pratt as a type of savior because he "benefitted" Roman Nose's situation. Finally, whiteness is also associated with English literacy in this article by linking "the good ways of the whites" with "[showing Roman Nose's group] A B C."[53]

English literacy is also continued in the second article of *The School News* issue from December of 1880. An "Editorial" describes the Carlisle children's thirst for knowledge, discussing how they want to learn English because it is the only language they are allowed to use for corresponding with family via letters.[54] This likely means that students were isolated from the outside world until they learned English, limiting what their families knew about the lives of students. Even if students successfully learned English, families may not have had access to this information unless they had a translator available. Either way, it was another deliberate method to distance children from their families and communities until "properly civilized." The author implores others to attend Carlisle because "[the students] can see so many things…that [they] can not see at [their] tribe and [they] learn much faster."[55] The author identifies both with their tribe and Indigenous peers, yet expresses excitement for Carlisle's white education. The way in which the student views themself is once again split between two worlds. Another memory relationship that is expressed in this segment is the way in which the students view their families. Though an identification with their tribe is present, the student does seem to prioritize white values of English literacy over their cultural practices. Saying that they would learn "much faster" at Carlisle implies that the life skills and communal values learned within a tribe are less significant than the arithmetic, English literacy, Christianity, and hard labor the students are subjected to.

---

[53] "Experiences," 1.
[54] "Editorial," *The School News* 1, no. 7 (Dec. 1880): 2, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[55] "Editorial," 2.

Christmas traditions at Carlisle denote a strong sense of Christianity. The section for internal school affairs notes how "Santa Claus brought Capt. Pratt's children a very nice piano" and that "students have learned some new hymns to sing on Christmas day."[56] It is already established that students associate Christianity with whiteness, and that Carlisle wishes to dispossess and diminish Indigenous culture. Imposing Christmas traditions on the students is another step in the process of forcing Indigenous tribes into whiteness.

The final article in this issue is the experiences of an Apache student before they attended Carlisle. They discuss how they had been away from their tribe for nine years and that their tribe would not know what a reservation was if they resided there, stating "Such is the way with all the poor ignorant nation as red men."[57] Condemnation of their own tribe demonstrates Carlisle's success in impressing values of whiteness upon students, specifically white supremacy in this instance. They conclude that the "red men" should not make enemies of white people, and they should not live so far from "civilization."[58] The contrast between the way in which they view their tribe as "ignorant" compared to their conclusion that eastern white society is "civilized" denotes a stronger alignment with whiteness. Combined with the fact that they had not seen their tribe for nine years, it is likely that Carlisle's influence may impact this student's perspective more strongly than others.

The final issue I have analyzed from *The School News*'s first volume is the tenth one from March of 1881. This issue continues Roman Nose's story, a republished speech from the Ex. Secretary of the Interior, and letters written by students. It has a strong sense of individualization via hard labor methods and introduces the outing system at Carlisle. Roman Nose concludes his story about his journey from Florida to Carlisle, recalling that he did not like

[56] "School News," *The School News* 1, no. 7 (Dec. 1880): 3, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[57] "Story of an Apache," *The School News* 1, no. 7 (Dec. 1880): 4, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[58] "Story," 4.

the "Indian clothes" the Sioux children were wearing because it "looked like wild Indian people who had learned nothing" except how to play all day, punish each other, fight with sticks, and hurt their bodies.[59] As Pratt had forced Roman Nose and his peers to wear "white man's clothes" since their journey from Florida, it is no great shock that Roman Nose found the Sioux clothes unfamiliar. However, his intensely negative language is certainly a product of Pratt's disapproval of Indigenous culture. Roman Nose continues to say that Pratt threw away their clothing, and patiently assisted the Sioux students in "the right way the white man's way."[60] Roman Nose concludes his account by sharing his happiness "now that [he] can be useful polite and love God" and "[prays] that [the Christian god] will Bless all [his] Benighted Race."[61] Roman Nose associates the good "white man's way" with Christianity, again defining the religion as part of whiteness. Since Carlisle seeks to "civilize" the children, the whiteness learned is synonymous with "civilizing." Associating a Christian Carlisle education with being "useful" also implies that Roman Nose was taught that his Indigenous peers and family were not useful to "civilization" unless they conformed to a certain degree. However, the connotative distaste towards his tribe may negate the kindred ship he expresses for "[his] Benighted Race," viewing himself more aligned with ideals of whiteness because that is what he was forced to believe in.

A speech given by Ex. Secretary of the Interior Carl Schurz was republished in this issue of *The School News* and argues that there should be more government funded boarding schools to elevate Indigenous women.[62] He felt that "the Indians [would] never be civilized unless they [were] attached to a permanent home" which would only be accomplished by Indigenous women practicing domesticity.[63] Shurz also felt that educated Indigenous students should marry one

---

[59] "Experiences of H. C. Roman Nose (Concluded)," *The School News* 1, no. 10 (Mar. 1881): 1, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[60] "Experiences," 1.
[61] "Experiences," 1.
[62] "Ex. Sec. Schurz," *The School News* 1, no. 10 (Mar. 1881): 2, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.

another to maintain the gendered roles they learned.[64] Impressing Western gender roles on Indigenous tribes and calling for more boarding schools are both acts of cultural dispersion and individualization. Upon returning to their reservation, many Indigenous women were seen as oppressors because they were taught in values of whiteness and to look down upon those who continued traditional ways. On the other hand, women were taught in the methods used to exterminate Indigenous culture and used the information to resist extinction.[65] Schurz is overall a supporter of whiteness, and the fact that this speech was republished in *The School News* meant that staff most likely wanted the readers to view the children as capable of such.

Letters written by students in this issue center around individualization efforts via hard labor. These excerpts are taken from letters sent from Carlisle students to relations and loved ones. The fact that all of the letters discuss trades or gender roles either means that Carlisle fervently pushes this individualization method, or the excerpts are hand-picked to portray hard working Indigenous children and successful implementation of values of whiteness. Sophie Rachel from the Nez Perces (presumably an anglicized name) details how she bakes sweets and milks the cow at a Mr. Miller's house, and how her friend Celia wishes to go with her next time.[66] This references the outing-system, a program where students were sent to "live, work, and worship" with white families for an extended period ranging from a single summer to multiple years. It would evolve into Pratt placing students into industrial or urban settings where children "could learn skills other than farming."[67] Mary North from the Araphoe tribe shares her experiences washing and ironing clothes, sewing, cooking, and cleaning at Carlisle. She

---

[63] "Ex. Sec.," 2.
[64] "Ex. Sec.," 2.
[65] Deirdre A. Almeida, "The Hidden Half: A History of Native American Women's Education," *Harvard Educational Review* 67, no. 4 (Winter: 1997): 766. Harvard Education Publishing Group.
[66] "What one little girl 13 years old has learned and her little friend wants to learn," *The School News* 1, no. 10 (Mar. 1881): 1, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[67] Wallace Adams, *Education for Extinction*, 174.

expresses her gratitude that she "learned a great many things" unknown to her, demonstrating an eagerness to align with western gender roles impressed upon her.[68] Frank Twist and Luther Standing Bear of the Sioux both write of their improvement and hopes for their tin smithing trade, Joseph Wisacoby of the Menomonee writes about his will to continue working with as a shoemaker, Elwood Dorian of the Iowa shares about his progress as a carpenter and that he wants "white men" and "Indians" to be friends, Nellie Cary of the Apache describes a similar labor routine to Mary North, and Katie La Croix of the Yankton Sioux describes how she and peers practice domesticity by playing house.[69] This excessive amount of labor done by children denotes whiteness in their daily routines.

The second volume of *The School News* starts in June of 1881 and includes letters written by the students, student life experiences before Carlisle, and further instances of whiteness. The first letter is written by a Kiowa boy named Lucius Aitson, and he tells his father about his recovery from illness in the hospital, how he wants to speak English and be "industrious," how he identifies as a "Christian boy" that prays daily, and that he wishes to help his father with agriculture when he returns home.[70] Aitson continues the connection of English literacy and Christianity as aspects of whiteness because he associates them with the "white man's way." The implication that Aitson would only be "industrious" at Carlisle combined with his willingness to assist his father with agricultural practices may denote Pratt's effectiveness at individualizing via labor methods. Aitson demonstrates the memory relationship of how the children view themselves by aligning both with the values of whiteness and simultaneously maintaining connections to his tribe through correspondence. Just like his peers, Aitson identifies with

---

[68] "Mary North," *The School News* 1, no. 10 (Mar. 1881): 3, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[69] "The following extracts were taken from letters the boys and girls wrote home and some from letters they wrote to other people.," *The School News* 1, no. 10 (Mar. 1881): 4, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[70] "Lucius Aitson Kiowa, Writes to His Father in Indian Territory," *The School News* 2, no. 1 (Jun. 1881): 1, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.

multiple worlds. He may also demonstrate the way in which the children view their families. Should his eagerness to assist with agriculture denote a product of Carlisle's individualization methods, Aitson would want to share his learned values of whiteness with his family. Even if Carlisle uses labor as a method of cultural dispossession, it is possible that Aitson only wishes to share his newfound knowledge with his father because of the pride it brings him.

The second letter within this issue is written by a Kiowa boy listed as "P. C. Z.," and he tells his brother about familial affairs. The context given is that he went to school in New York and recently returned to his tribe when the letter was written. It is most likely that the student did not attend Carlisle, though the letter may have been republished in *The School News* because the recipient attends Carlisle at the time of writing. P. C. Z. shares that Yellow Hair's wife left him for another man and that one of their cousins passed away, signing off with "God bless you be a good boy."[71] P. C. Z. demonstrates values of whiteness through Christianity and English literacy, though his correspondence identifies a connection between him and his brother. P. C. Z. therefore views himself and his brother in two separate worlds.

Samuel Townsend, the editor of *The School News*, provides an account of what life was like for him as part of the Pawnee tribe before attending Carlisle. He discusses their migration from Nebraska to presumably Arkansas in Indian Territory, sharing how difficult it is to travel 100 miles for supplies and how thankful he is for attending Carlisle and having the ability to retain the English language.[72] Though Townsend seems proud of his English literacy, multiple uses of "we" in reference to his tribe denote stronger alignment with the Pawnee than those at Carlisle. The article itself may have been published to show readers that students are grateful to

---

[71] "Good many other nice girl yet.," *The School News* 2, no. 1 (Jun. 1881): 3, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[72] Samuel Townsend, "A Little History of the Pawnee," *The School News* 2, no. 1 (Jun. 1881): 2, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.

attend Carlisle, promoting an idea that Indigenous tribes benefit more from conforming to whiteness rather than existing as they have for many generations.

Another student's life experience before Carlisle focuses on war and the suffering of his tribe. Michael Burns recounts how he was "taken from the wilderness by the whites," how the young men "had to go through all sorts of horrible ways or torture to be subchief" and great warriors, and realizes that his tribe "would not have had the suffering and hard times" if they were faithful and good to the Christian god's promise.[73] Though Burns recognizes that he was taken from his home, Carlisle's "civilizing" efforts effectively taught him to prefer Christianity and other aspects of whiteness as opposed to continue living as he was with his tribe. This expresses the memory relationship of the way in which the students view themselves, demonstrating a growing understanding of how values of whiteness may be beneficial to them. However, possessive terminology does portray that Burns retains an attachment with his tribe.

Student experiences and letters express how students were coming to learn the values of whiteness the school sought to teach them, and internal school affairs further detail these instances. This is the first time that *The School News* has specifically organized a titled section for their school affairs. "About Our School" has excerpts listing students in the outing-system, successes of students in the carpentry trade, external visitors from Philadelphia, students wanting clean clothes and cleaning their clothes, and an excerpt sharing how "the small boys like their new school mamma."[74] Whether or not a "school mamma" may refer to a matron of a dormitory or grade level is undetermined. Should it reference the way in which students view their families, this could be interpreted as Carlisle dispersing traditional Indigenous familial dynamics in favor of instructing the students about the nuclear family as the appropriate familial structure. The

[73] Michael Burns, "An Apache Boy Writes Something About Himself," *The School News* 2, no. 1 (Jun. 1881): 4, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[74] "About Our School.," *The School News* 2, no. 1 (Jun. 1881): 3, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.

outing-system, success of students building wagons, and students wishing for clean clothes and cleaning their clothes denote individualization efforts of hard labor to disperse communal values. External visitors from Philadelphia on the day of student exams demonstrate the memory relationship of how Carlisle staff wants external white society to view the students. Since visitors were specifically invited on exam day, Carlisle staff may have wanted to prove that Indigenous children were just as capable of having a "civilized" education as their white counterparts. Proving this may have guaranteed Carlisle more donations from patrons, as there are often complaints and advertisements in boarding school newspapers that they lack appropriate funding from the United States federal government.

The second issue I analyzed with this volume is from September of 1881. This issue includes a student experience before living at Carlisle and strong values of American nationalism. Nellie Carey contrasts her living situation at Carlisle and the outing-system to "Navajo country." Carey expresses her gratitude for living at Carlisle, saying "How glad [the girls] are not at home" because "the Navajoes live any way," meaning that they had structure in their living conditions as opposed to living in tents.[75] She also mentions the living conditions of the white family she lived with before "the Government would not let them stay," describing her chores on their farm and the beautiful scenery.[76] The sub-heading of the article cements Carey's appreciation for white society, as it labels her article with "How Glad (The Girls Are) They Are Not At Their Homes."[77] Though this could have been added as an afterthought by the editor of Carey's essay, it emphasizes to readers that Indigenous children fare better in white society than with their tribes as they had been living for generations.

---

[75] "Nellie Carey, Apache, Tells About Navajoes.," *The School News* 2, no. 4 (Sept. 1881): 1, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[76] "Nellie Carey," 1.
[77] Nellie Carey," 1.

The second page in this issue is dedicated to American patriotism and the death of former President James A. Garfield. Feeling slighted by his lack of recognition, Charles Guiteau planned and successfully executed his assassination of the President.[78] The first article describes how "[Garfield] made himself wise and great" through hard work, and that "people of every tongue in [the United States mourn] for [their] beloved leader."[79] Former President Garfield worked hard to achieve his position as a proponent of universal education and support of black suffrage for freed people, though mentioning the "hard work" could be a product of Carlisle's manual labor training and individualization methods. Speaking on behalf of everyone in the United States at this time denotes a strong sense of nationalism taught at Carlisle as another value of whiteness. As the students do not exist in a vacuum, it is most likely that not everyone agreed with this statement. A second piece on former President Garfield recognizes that everyone did not originally prefer Garfield as president, and Creek student Ellis B. Childers shares that Guiteau "had [no] right to go and shoot our good president."[80] Possessive terminology determines that Childers views himself as part of the United States because he accepted former President Garfield as his leader, even though Indigenous tribes did not yet have access to the privilege of United States citizenship.

Though not about the death of the former president, a third segment implies American nationalism through a conflict with a student and teacher. The segment opens with context that Carlisle has "sergeants and corporals to keep the boys orderly," which calls back to imprisonment at Fort Marion in Florida.[81] Why impose military practices on an educational

---

[78] "Excerpt from the text of the 1881 confession of Charles Guiteau, who assassinated President James A. Garfield," Columbia University, p. 4-14, accessed April 27, 2024, https://dp.la/primary-source-sets/patronage-and-populism-the-politics-of-the-gilded-age/sources/963. HathiTrust.
[79] "James A. Garfield," *The School News* 2, no. 4 (Sept. 1881): 2, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[80] Ellis B. Childers, "The People of the United States are Mourning.," *The School News* 2, no. 4 (Sept. 1881): Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[81] "Sergeants.," *The School News* 2, no. 4 (Sept. 1881): 2, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.

institution unless it was meant for punishment? The nationalism is expressed when a teacher reprimanded a student for not following directions, and he replied with "Where are your stripes?"[82] Using the United States flag as an excuse for "freedom" continues to this day. The fact that this defense was the student's immediate response upon confrontation denotes a strong sense of nationalism being taught at Carlisle. Finally, an excerpt in "About Our School" expresses gratitude that students became friends with Confederate soldiers who visited Carlisle.[83] A student mentions how "soldiers of the South" visited Carlisle, and that these soldiers "used to fight against North soldiers" but are now good friends to one another.[84] This may reference the unification efforts between Union and Confederate soldiers as a didactic method to teach Carlisle students to coexist within white society despite differing beliefs. Anyone can argue that the Civil War was fought solely over states' rights, but they would be wrong. Introducing Carlisle students to enslavers and proponents of othering when they are also victims of deliberate cultural dispersion is incredibly insensitive. Though this could be Pratt's attempt to instill nationalism via teaching that certain groups can reconcile, the end of the Civil War did not put an end to racism and prejudice. This exemplifies a value of whiteness in the sense that it seeks to continue a cycle of cultural dispossession by glossing over the goals of the Confederate soldiers. It may also portray the memory relationship of how Carlisle staff wants the students to be portrayed to external society because Pratt wants to show his effective methods of cultural dispersion to those who also tried to brutally enact it.

The next issue from this volume comes from December of 1881 and continues to closely tie English literacy with Christianity through different segments. It also includes another story about student life before Carlisle. The first page has a published letter from Reuben Quick Bear

---

[82] "Sergeants.," 2.
[83] "About Our School.," *The School News* 2, no. 4 (Sept. 1881): 3, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resources Center.
[84] "About Our School.," 3.

to his friend Austin, imploring him to "speak only English now."[85] Quick bear tells his friend that a person can only learn if they start by making mistakes, and that "Our Heavenly Father will help [them and] bless [them] to do the right way" if all Sioux boys try to speak English.[86] In a previous "Editorial," Samuel Townsend notes how students were only to correspond with loved ones if they wrote in English.[87] It is possible that Quick Bear was so thrilled to hear from Austin and wanted to learn English so that he could broaden the information that was shared with his friend and tribe. Linking English literacy with Christianity is a product of Pratt's plan to culturally disperse the students. Pleasing the Christian god with their writing skills is a deterrent to practice the students' multitude of native languages, forcibly integrating them with values of whiteness. Publishing this letter specifically could represent the memory relationships between the way in which Carlisle staff wants the students to appear to external readers, and how the students view themselves. Publishing a letter from the perspective of a student eager to learn English shows readers that Carlisle is effective in answering the "Indian Question," inclining them to further donate to the cause. Though Quick Bear implores his friend Austin to speak English, it still shows that he has connections to members of his tribe outside of the values of whiteness that have been pushed at Carlisle, therefore existing in a liminal space.

An article titled "Reapers" appears directly after Quick Bear's letter and continues to champion English literacy. Student A. E. V. McKellop compares his peers to reapers, stating that "[they] are reaping the good seed which [their] teachers are sowing [at Carlisle]." It is significant to note that this is biblical language, furthering the idea of Christianity as a value of whiteness taught in school. McKellop argues that they first need to "reap the English language" to be a

---

[85] Reuben Quick Bear, "How a Little Sioux Boy. 13 Years Old, Feels About Talking English.," *The School News* 2, no. 7 (Dec. 1881): 1, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[86] Reuben Quick Bear, 1.
[87] "Editorial," 2.

"prominent [man] of [the United States]."[88] He portrays the memory relationship of how the United States viewed Indigenous tribes. Though his piece does not directly reference federal affairs, McKellop was taught that Indigenous tribes were only useful if they strongly conformed to values of whiteness, which in this case is a fluency in English literacy. Similarly, a letter from Ruth Sioux wishes that her father would get into agriculture, send her sisters to school to learn English, and stop wearing "Indian clothes."[89] Though Ruth demonstrates the memory relationship of how students viewed their families, she may not have written in this manner to her father if she was not taught that her tribe and family members were only useful if they conformed to a degree of whiteness. In this case, it would be the individualization via agricultural labor, English literacy, and lack of cultural dress. By extension, it is almost as if she is being taught that her family is to blame for their circumstances as victims of the United States government.

The final article in this issue that links English literacy as a value of whiteness is "English Speaking Night." Rosalie Ross of the Cherokee tribe shares that Carlisle students gather in the chapel each Saturday night to practice their English-speaking skills with Pratt and Rev. Doctor Riggs. Like Quick Bear, Ross feels that no harm would come from making mistakes while learning English and that ultimately the "Heavenly Father will help [them]" through it.[90] Impressing Christianity and English literacy upon young Indigenous students deliberately disconnects them from their culture, marking these tactics as values of whiteness.

---

[88] A. E. V. McKellop, "Reapers," *The School News* 2, no. 7 (Dec. 1881): 1, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[89] "Ruth Sioux to Her Father.," *The School News* 2, no. 7 (Dec. 1881): 4, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[90] Rosalie Ross, "English Speaking Night.," *The School News* 2, no. 7 (Dec. 1881): 2, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.

Other than English literacy, this issue has a strong article about a student experience before Carlisle. In "Our Battle at Indian Territory.," this student describes how the Kiowas, Comanches, and Wichitas fought against white soldiers. He then ties it to his time at Carlisle, now knowing that it would be better to be educated and support his people through agricultural practices.[91] Carlisle's individualizing influence is present in the sense that the student feels it is a better option than going to war. He represents the memory relationship of how students view themselves because he prefers to support his people through Carlisle's methods rather than traditionally warring with others, signifying an existence in a liminal space. It could also be read as a call by an indigenous student for Indigenous tribes to stop resisting the federal United States government's "civilizing mission," though instead of saying it out of fear for his future, it seems to be what the student genuinely believes is best and most effective. This is a testament to Carlisle's success in rigorously drilling values of whiteness into Indigenous students.

The final issue in this volume comes from March of 1882 and centers around a student trip to Philadelphia and an exchange of letters between Carlisle and a California boarding school. Dessie Prescott recounts the Carlisle students' visit to Philadelphia, describing the surprise of a Mr. John Wanamaker when she promptly answered that she could successfully darn stockings and wash dishes. Prescott also makes note that the purpose for the Philadelphia visit was to seek funds for Carlisle because the government could not provide them.[92] The interaction between Prescott and Wanamaker represents the memory relationship of how Carlisle staff wants the students to be viewed. Since Prescott answered Wanamaker's questions correctly, Pratt is successful in demonstrating that Indigenous students can conform to western gender roles and

---

[91] "Our Battle at Indian Territory.," *The School News* 2, no. 7 (Dec. 1881): 4, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[92] "Thirty of Our Children Went to Philadelphia – Dessie Prescott Tells What She Thinks About it.," *The School News* 2, no. 10 (Mar. 1882): 1, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.

ultimately values of whiteness. It also suggests that the children are seen as inferior commodities to be consumed for external white society even if they conform to white values. Upon visiting the mint, Prescott comments that "white people have got [riches of the Earth] and are making it into money" and giving some of it to "Indians" and Carlisle, and the only reason why "Indians" did not get to them earlier is because they did not know how to access them.[93] Prescott presents this anecdote in a manner that infers her knowledge of settler colonialism and a learned superiority of "white people." Should she recognize that the land belongs to Indigenous tribes and not white people, the emphasis on her gendered tasks along with this realization suggests that she exists within a liminal cultural space.

The next significant article within this issue is an exchange of letters from students at the Camp Wright Indian Boarding School to C. Kihega at the Carlisle Industrial Training School. William Hughes of the Red Wood tribe, William John of the Ukie tribe, Charley Jones of the Ukie tribe, and Sam Potter of the Potter Valley tribe write to see what Carlisle is like. They share that Camp Wright has 50 students, a carpenter shop, a shoe shop, an organ, and marching drills, but they require more teachers because of the lack of government funding.[94] Creek student Ellis Childers answers their questions by discussing Carlisle's events which included weekly prayer services, evening speech and choral practices (presumably in English), the daily work efforts of boys, and the printing, shoe, carpentry, tin, tailor, blacksmith, harness, and bakery shops that the students practiced their trades in.[95] Funding issues from FILS on either side of the country signify the memory relationship of how the United States government views the children. The overarching government does not even appreciate Pratt's efforts to educate the children in

---

[93] "Thirty of Our Children," 1.
[94] "Letter From California.," *The School News* 2, no. 10 (Mar. 1882): 2, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[95] "Letter," 2.

whiteness, instead preferring to answer the "Indian Question" by not caring about Indigenous tribes regardless of how they conform. It is also interesting to note that Carlisle's influence in military drilling had reached the west coast in such a short span of time, which may denote a popularity in answering the "Indian Question." Military training reinforces the idea that these FILS were never for Indigenous benefit and instead for punishment akin to that of the original Fort Marion.

The final volume analyzed in this paper starts with an issue from June of 1882. It includes information about a young girl's trip to Carlisle, students getting married, and a piece written by the editor about relations between Indigenous and white people. Justine A. LaFromboise's "Description of a Journey to Carlisle" spans half of the issue and explains LaFromboise's traveling process from her home in the west to Carlisle in the east. Though she does not specify a starting point for her journey, La Fromboise lists Artville, Bismark, and Chicago as places they pass through so it can be assumed that her physical displacement is greatly impactful.[96] La Fromboise recounts that she originally did not want to learn at Carlisle, changing her mind only when her father expressed regret for his own illiteracy. This encouraged La Fromboise to "beat [him]" and do better by learning as much as she possibly could at Carlisle, and she "[thanks the] Heavenly Father" for choosing her.[97] The article ends with La Fromboise explaining how she got over her homesickness, and how she wishes to share all she has learned with her sisters once she has returned home. This article approaches multiple memory relationships and values of whiteness. The way in which La Fromboise's father encourages her to study demonstrates the memory relationship of how parents view their children, and La Fromboise's response demonstrates the way in which children view their families in return. It is

[96] Justine A. LaFromboise, "Description of a Journey to Carlisle.," *The School News* 3, no. 1 (Jun. 1882): 1 and 4, Carlisle Digital Indian Resource Center.
[97] La Fromboise, 1.

unclear as to why her father regrets his inability to succeed at a school; it could be personal pride or the realization that the only way to deal with white encroachment is to conform to a degree of whiteness. Regardless, he sees his daughter as a brave individual and wants her to succeed. Though her language of "doing better" than her father may seem harsh, La Fromboise genuinely cares for her family as well, especially since she struggles with homesickness. Considering her deep familial bond, La Fromboise may view herself in a liminal space especially since she recognizes the Christian god. Christianity and English literacy are thus identified as values of whiteness, and La Fromboise's multi-week journey effectively displaces Indigenous students and their respective cultures.

Another significant event notes that students are getting married. Though many Carlisle students were quite young, I often use "students" rather than "children" to describe them because their ages did vary into adulthood. The marriage between Etadleuh and Laura of the Kiowa tribe demonstrates an age range of Indigenous youth taken to Carlisle.[98] Their situation is interesting due to a great emphasis of white society wanting Indigenous students educated in whiteness to marry one another as a method to disperse tribal community culture. It was believed that individuals educated in the "ways of civilization" would continue those practices in the home and be passed down to future children instead of engaging with traditional culture. A letter written to that same "Etadhleuh" (an extra 'h' is included) also appears in this issue. Jock Bull Bear thanks his friend Etadhleuh for helping him to be a "true Christian," as he knows it is good for them to "stand fast for Jesus in liberty."[99] External white society would further appreciate the marriage between Etadleuh and Laura since he practices values of whiteness to a great degree, thus effectively carrying out cultural dispersion through Carlisle's effective indoctrination

[98] "Marriage," *The School News* 3, no. 1 (Jun. 1882): 3, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[99] "One Indian Boy Helps Another in the Right Way," *The School News* 3, no. 1 (Jun. 1882): 4, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.

methods. They would then presumably spread these values to their children, exterminating "Indianness" from white society.

The final significant article in this issue comes from *The School News* editor Charles Kihega who was an Iowa student at Carlisle. He argues that both white people and Indigenous people are mistaken about one another and that education for both groups benefits each.[100] Kihega believes that it is a mistake for Indigenous people to "believe that white people are equal to Great Spirit" because they do not consider the privileged education that allows white people to create goods like "wagons and shoes."[101] Kihega also believes that white people are mistaken because "they think Indians cannot learn anything because they are not the same color and wild."[102] He resolves these thoughts by sharing how Carlisle students believe that Indigenous students can do anything that white people can, allowing them to "get a long very nicely."[103] Kihega does not seem to identify with either group with the distinct way he discusses how they are mistaken. Kihega demonstrates the memory relationship of how students view themselves, instead feeling more aligned with the liminality that many Carlisle students experience.

The next issue in this volume comes from September of 1882 and includes student experiences upon returning to their tribes and correspondences between students and their intended recipients. The first article is about Ellis Kaque's visit to the Kiowa tribe where he tried to teach them about values of whiteness. Though he was a student at the time, it is noted that he was not "well enough" to return. His story is framed by the author's words, stating that Kaque's "people have no knowledge of civilization, as will be seen by the following [story]."[104] Kaque

---

[100] Charles Kihega, *The School News* 3, no. 1 (Jun. 1882): 2, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[101] Kihega, 2.
[102] Kihega, 2.
[103] Kihega, 2.
[104] "Pulling Against the Stream.," *The School News* 3, no. 4 (Sept. 1882): 1, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.

recalls that his friends refused to hear about or believe in the Christian God and the Bible, to which he calls them out on their idolatry and stating that ‘“the white people know everything, but you don’t know nothing.’”[105] Whereas most children felt homesickness and torn between tribal tradition and Carlisle’s teachings of whiteness, Kaque others himself by not identifying with his tribe nor as a white person (though he does strongly align with them). On the other hand, Charles Kihega has a positive experience with implementing values of whiteness on his return home. He describes their successful farming techniques and crops, concluding that “If the Iowa tribe can learn to farm and take care of themselves I think others can learn.”[106] It is interesting to note that the school is choosing to praise success stories and point out Kaque’s efforts as inherently doomed from the start because of who he is and his tribe as a whole/ Though most students spreading values of whiteness display Carlisle’s effectiveness in teaching them “the white man’s way,” the duality in acceptance represents how varied the responses to values of whiteness actually were. By associating both with their tribes and spreading these values, Kaque and Kihega demonstrate the memory relationship of how the students view themselves because they once again exist in a liminal space.

After Kaque and Kihega’s stories, letters from students are published inquiring after home, individualization methods, and gender roles. Hattie from the Sioux tribe writes to her friend about not knowing whether she would return from Carlisle or not, and that she “[does not know] what is the month of this.”[107] This implies that Hattie does not know the month it is when her letter is written and sent to her friend Nancy, which is problematic because it infers that the skewed passage of time at Carlisle is a method to further disorient and distance the children.

---

[105] “Pulling Against,” 1.
[106] “Returned.,” *The School News* 3, no. 4 (Sept. 1882): 2, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[107] Hattie, “Does Not Know What Month It Is: Too Far Away.,” *The School News* 3, no. 4 (Sept. 1882): 2, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.

However, it could very well mean that she recognizes a change in the seasons as the children have just returned from school but does not know the specific Gregorian month to list. Regardless, the fact that so many articles from this issue are about visits home recognizes a homesickness within students and an effective method of cultural dispersal. Harry Shirley also writes home, and tells his father about his bed at Carlisle, the many students, and his homesickness. It is most interesting that he writes a brief sentence about how "one negro boy got killed on the rail rod," proving that Carlisle students did not solely exist in a vacuum between whiteness and their tribes.[108] Shirley too exists in that liminal space between values of whiteness at Carlisle with his English literacy, and longing to return to his father. He also displays the memory relationship of how students view their families because he genuinely cares about how his father is faring. In publishing this letter that includes a violent death, Shirley's words also represent the memory relationship of how Carlisle staff wanted students to be perceived to outside society because of the way in which values of whiteness at this time championed othering and racism. Therefore, staff may have wanted readers to praise Shirley for his perceived indifference towards this unnamed boy.

Individualization is also a prominent theme in letters written home. White Buffalo writes to his "School Father" about wanting "to go some place to work on farm" to speak English so that he can understand the Carlisle staff.[109] Considering that his letter is published in English, and that students are only able to write letters if they are in English, White Buffalo's English literacy is already very good. His desire to engage with Carlisle's outing-system combined with English literacy demonstrate Pratt's successful implementation of values of whiteness at his school. The

---

[108] Harry Shirley, "A Happy Little Caddo Boy Who Came Last Month, Writes the First Letter Home.," *The School News* 3, no. 4 (Sept. 1882): 4, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[109] White Buffalo, "White Buffalo, Cheyenne, Wants to Go on a Farm.," *The School News* 3, no. 4 (Sept. 1882): 3, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.

"School Father" is most likely a member of the Carlisle staff, as there are also "School Mothers" mentioned for the girls. They may be "family" that the students live and work with, or "overseers" taking on familial terminology to integrate the children. It seems as if there are multiple "School Parents," but it is likely a hierarchy of teachers holding different positions with Pratt as the headmaster. Since White Buffalo wishes to better understand and build rapport with his "School Father," this instance may be the memory relationship of how students view Carlisle staff. Familial terminology for the staff may also be a strange method of cultural dispersion to make students not feel as homesick if they have a physical "mother" or "father" with them. On the same page, the letter is paired with other successes of manual labor. Publishing frequent articles about individualization efforts and home visits after a summer break may be a deliberate attempt for external readers to perceive Carlisle as successful in answering the "Indian Question" because they see how students exhibit characteristics that are not far from their own values.

Finally, gender roles are significant to this issue's set of letters. Arguably they are also present in White Buffalo's and Shirley's letters because agricultural labor is designated to the men, but J. W. Ralph's letter to her "dear friend and teacher Miss Fisher" is more discernable. Previously known as Julia Good Voice, Ralph discusses her marriage to fellow student Ralph Iron Eagle Feather after their return home. She claims that she "[did] not want to do any Indian ways any more," refused to marry without the "Christian ways," and "did not want to marry any Indian man" who lacked knowledge of the "white man's ways."[110] Values of whiteness are present here in regards to Christianity and the memory relationship of how students view themselves that Ralph demonstrates. She happily accepts her role in domesticity as a housewife who waits for her husband to build their home and her kitchen, furthering the impact of western

[110] J. W. Ralph, "Good News," *The School News* 3, no. 4 (Sept. 1882): 4, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.

gender roles as a value of whiteness. Just like the previous Carlisle marriage, these former students follow the government's wishes for Indigenous children educated in whiteness to marry one another as an answer to the "Indian Question" and method of cultural dispersion.

The third issue of this volume comes from December of 1882 and includes student letters as well as articles about the outing-system and Christmas traditions. Just like the last issue, notable student letters address school "parents." Doty Seward addresses his letter about work to "School father Captain Pratt" and Justine La Fromboise addresses her letter about marriage troubles and education to the "School Mother."[111] Each student signs off as a school "son" or "daughter," and this use of terminology represent the memory relationship of how students view the Carlisle staff. The establishment of familial dynamics at Carlisle could be a further method of cultural dispersion. By implementing a parental figure at the school, students may not be as homesick and more likely to engage with values of whiteness. Calvin Red Wolf writes a letter home to his actual father, updating him on his hard work, how they speak English at Carlisle, and how "it is a pleasant school."[112] He exemplifies the memory relationship of how students view their families because even if Red Wolf is far away at Carlisle, he genuinely cares about his father and wants to make him proud.

The next issue starts off with an article about Henry North's experience in switching jobs over summer break. Like Red Wolf, he makes his way into white society through manual labor. He starts with stable work, then tobacco planting, and finishes with his current occupation as a printer. North's goal is to open a printshop in Indian Territory "so the white people can hear more about the Indians" and build more FILS to encourage this spread of ideas.[113] Though he does not

---

[111] "I Am Little Man, Anyhow" and "A Sisseton Sioux Girl Writes From Her Home," *The School News* 3, no. 7 (Dec. 1882): 4, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[112] "Calvin Red Wolf's Home Letter," *The School News* 3, no. 7 (Dec. 1882): 2, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.

necessarily view himself as either white or Indigenous, the argument can be made that he aligns more with whiteness because he wants to spread these values to others. The effectiveness in Carlisle's teachings of white values is also present in his words because of the way in which he feels so strongly about labor and calling for more FILS.

The other significant article from this issue details Christmas at Carlisle. Presumably written by *The School News* editor Charles Kihega, the student writes about how they celebrated both Santa Claus and Jesus Christ in their traditions. Kihega pens how Santa Claus and Mrs. Claus delivered presents to the students, and that the day is called "Christmas" because of "our Saviour Jesus Christ."[114] Values of whiteness are present here in celebrating a Christian holiday at school. This article may also demonstrate the way in which the Carlisle staff wanted the children to be viewed by external society because they may take away that the students embrace Christianity just like them, especially since the shared celebration may serve to humanize the students. Should the students be similar enough to external white society, it is more likely for them to be welcome and that Carlisle itself would receive funding from patrons.

The final issue in this volume comes from March of 1883 and contains articles written by students about hard work, visitors to Carlisle, and trips away from Carlisle. E. B. Childers discusses his experience with manual labor before coming to Carlisle with his article "To The Pupils of Indian Training School." He advises students to take up agriculture, "Love and obey your teachers, and trust in the almighty God" to succeed in life.[115] In a similar article written by H. North, he wants students to support "[themselves] after [they] get through school" by living with "white people" instead of their tribes.[116] Both students felt it necessary to promote manual

---

[113] Henry North, "What I Learned in Lancaster County This Summer.," *The School News* 3, no. 7 (Dec. 1882): 1, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[114] "Christmas.," *The School News* 3, no. 7 (Dec. 1882): 2, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[115] E. B. Childers, "To The Pupils of Indian Training School," *The School News* 3, no. 10 (Mar. 1883): 1, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.

labor and equate it with success, denoting the effective of Carlisle's teachings in individualization as whiteness. However, North takes a harsher approach towards Indigenous tribes, stating that "God did not make Indians to be lazy and be fed by the white people."[117] Whereas Childers positively identified and supported his fellow students, North takes a negative approach towards his culture. He may feel as if it is the tribes' choice to be dependent on the federal government, when in reality it is a forced relationship that is deliberately cultivated by the United States government since the conception of the country. These students exemplify the memory relationship of how students view themselves in varying ways, expressing a complicated identity relationship due to Pratt's indoctrination via values of whiteness.

There were multiple visits from external members of society to Carlisle, and one account of a student trip to external society within this issue. Each of these experiences express the memory relationship of how Carlisle staff wants Indigenous students to be viewed by said white society. "Washington Visitors" details the visit of Secretary of the Interior H. M. Teller and Commissioner of Indian Affairs H. Price to Carlisle. The school welcomed them with a band performance and a long speech given by a student who did "not [know] any English when he came [three years ago]."[118] An excerpt also makes note of how "A party of 250 visitors" that were "nearly all Methodist ministers" visited Carlisle during that same March.[119] Students entertained the guests because Pratt wanted visitors to see how "successfully civilized" they were, which was determined by the values of whiteness like English literacy they expressed. Ministers may have been deliberately invited because of the way in which Pratt may have wanted them to further influence students.

---

[116] H. North, "Work Out Your Own Living.," *The School News* 3, no. 10 (Mar. 1883): 2, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[117] North, "Work Out," 2.
[118] "Washington Visitors," *The School News* 3, no. 10 (Mar. 1883): 2, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[119] "Items," *The School News* 3, no. 10 (Mar. 1883): 3, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.

Finally, Louis Big Horse recounts his trip to Pittsburg alongside other students in his article "Pittsburg." He shares that a few students "made speeches [at a public school]" as well as a church, and that students were also able to observe trades that enabled the creation of glass and iron nails.[120] Giving speeches to public schools and churches are deliberate ways in which Pratt wants to positively influence the opinion of FILS like Carlisle to external white society by demonstrating values of whiteness like English literacy.

The School News demonstrates an unmatched connection between Indigenous students and their environments. With the advantage of great student influence, it is very useful for portraying the way in which students viewed themselves. Torn between taught values of whiteness and tribal traditions, most students existed within a liminal space that combined both. Students themselves linked "the white man's way" with Christianity, English literacy, and hard work. Students engaged in trades at school like carpentry, baking, tinsmithing, and sewing based on western gender roles. United States nationalism is also encouraged. The memory relationship of how students viewed their families is also present within this newspaper. Many students reported homesickness at Carlisle, yet when they wrote home many students implored their families and loved ones to engage in agricultural individualizing efforts, embrace Christianity, speak English, and "follow the white man's way." This speaks to the effectiveness of Pratt's "civilizing" plan for dispersing Indigenous communities by specifically targeting the children. Publishing content that spoke to Pratt's successes expressed the memory relationship of the way that Carlisle staff wanted the students to be perceived by external white society. Focusing only on the achievements of students in "civilization" attracted visitors and profits for the paper, funding Carlisle efforts and inspiring other FILS.

---

[120] Louis Big Horse, "Pittsburg.," *The School News* 3, no. 10 (Mar. 1883): 4, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.

Chapter 2 – *The Morning Star* and Federal Perspectives

The Morning Star was Carlisle's premier newspaper from its inception. It was originally known as *Eadle Keatah Toh* when the newspaper started in 1879, but the anglicization of the newspaper's name in 1882 was most likely a method of encouraging English literacy from the students. As compared to *The School News*' four-page issues, *The Morning Star* features issues that increase from four to eight pages over the years. Combined with its smaller text, *The Morning Star* is a lengthier read with far more articles spanning student life and republished government speeches to general updates on "The Indian Question."

This newspaper was run mostly by Carlisle staff and had less student influence than *The School News*. In this sense, it is less useful for exemplifying the memory relationship of how students view themselves because the paper lacks their voices. Instead, there is a greater presence of how Indigenous tribes and the United States government view one another alongside how Indigenous students and their families view one another. This does not negate the presence of other memory relationships and values of whiteness, ss they have been established at Carlisle via *The School News* simultaneously. Analysis of *The Morning Star* serves to elaborate on these perspectives by focusing on memory relationships and other values of whiteness that may not have been as present in *The School News*.

The first issue in this segment of *The Morning Star* picks up from *The School News* in August of 1883. Though *The School News* continued for a few issues after March of 1883, continuing with the structure of four issues per year consolidates information while still providing broad sources to interpret. This issue includes a republished letter from the Secretary of the Interior, a long address by Pratt, and reports of varying success within the outing system. H. M. Teller, Secretary of the Interior at the time, writes to the Reverend J. C. Hartzell

apologizing that he cannot attend the ‘“National Education Assembly”’ and specifically ‘“Our Indian Day.”’ Presumably, it is a conference designated for important figures to speak on “The Indian Question” wherein the United States government decides what to do with Indigenous tribes and white encroachment. Teller shows his support for Pratt’s assimilationist approach at Carlisle by arguing that “the Indian can be educated” because of how “the Indian mind is largely a blank” that “takes the impressions sought to be stamped it.”[121] Though Teller distinguishes between manual labor schools, agency schools, and boarding schools, he does not define the differences of each. Carlisle is termed a “FIB” by the contemporary government, yet a “training school” in early iterations. If other schools were similar to the routines at Carlisle, then they may all be deemed “manual labor schools” because of the way in which Indigenous students were forced to learn trades and participate in the outing system.

Teller’s recognition of “manual labor schools” reiterates that these schools were never meant to benefit Indigenous tribes; only to benefit white society. As a government official, Teller’s letter represents how the United States government viewed Indigenous tribes. He feels that they lack the intelligence to become “civilized” due to their “blank minds,” emphasizing that they are only useful to the United States if they conform to a specific degree of whiteness. Whiteness is also defined in an interesting manner within this speech. Teller states that if the United States government “[withdraws] its protection and aid from the Indian, [they] would soon disappear,” meaning that Indigenous tribes only exist because white politicians in office allow them to.[122]

Pratt’s address to the National Education Convention denotes a similar conclusion to Teller’s letter. Pratt claims that “Indian civilization is not a success” because of their lacking

---

[121] H. M. Teller, “Indian Education,” *The Morning Star* 4, no. 1 (Aug. 1883): 1, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[122] Teller, “Indian Education,” 1.

performance compared to "negroes."[123] He argues that African Americans came "from a condition as purely savage as that of [the] Indians," yet they are "[white] equals" in producing professionals "worthy [of standing] upon the platform with [white people]."[124] Usage of brackets indicate Pratt's conflation with "white people" and "us" in reference to his own race. As racism is prevalent in the United States today, there is no doubt that many felt differently about black people being equals to white people during the Reconstruction era. While simultaneously being supportive of the progress that former enslaved people had made in the years since the American Civil War, Pratt reinforces racism through usage of derogatory terminology and creates a hierarchy that pits Indigenous tribes and black people against one another. This defines values of whiteness as both racism and white supremacy. Pratt also expresses the memory relationship of how Carlisle staff wanted Indigenous students to be perceived by outside society because he feels that Indigenous tribes remain "savages" unless they become "civilized" via education. His words only reinforce this idea when he states that "they will remain savages among us and a blot on [white] history" unless white society devotes the appropriate funds and detail to "civilizing."[125]

Reports from the outing system constitute the final significant portion of this issue. They range from "successful" students wanting to stay longer, to those who behave "poorly" and wish to return home. Considering that Carlisle students are young adults and some even children, it may not be fair for *The Morning Star* nor farmers within the outing system to berate them for acting their ages. One report from a "Mr. K's" farm has "P" noted to be of a rude manner with insolent speech, and the excerpt calls for "P" to return to Carlisle.[126] Stating that a student should

---

[123] Richard Henry Pratt, "Address of Capt. Pratt before the National Educational Convention at Ocean Grove, N. J., August 11, 1883.," *The Morning Star* 4, no. 1 (Aug. 1883): 2, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Project.
[124] Pratt, "Address," 2.
[125] Pratt, "Address," 2.

return to Carlisle for further training marks them as unsuccessful in the outing system, though it is redundant because students are sent to farms for individualization purposes as part of their "civilizing" process. On the other hand, "C. W. H.'s" English is reported to have "improved greatly" and that he "would like to remain [on the farm] another year."[127] Farmers are also present at some of their interviews and have sway on whether or not a student remains. Due to "L. E.'s" homesickness as the "only Indian girl in Columbia county," her overseer "Mrs. K" voices her support for "L. E." to return to Carlisle.[128] It is significant to note that the modern Carlisle is seated in Cumberland County, and Columbia County is roughly two hours by car, further displacing students from their connections not only at home but at Carlisle. One unnamed student voices their own concerns with the outing system, stating that "[they] worked until the ends of [their] fingers begins to bleed from binding wheat," and that they continued on working "the best [they] could."[129] The way in which external society views Indigenous students is that they are only useful should the students provide exceptional manual labor for white farms. The manual labor as exemplified by the student binding wheat seems more akin to punishment than for the student's benefit, exploiting them in the name of "civilization" for white benefit.

The second issue from this volume comes from November of 1883 and includes a report from the Commissioner of Indian Affairs, a report from Pratt on his trip West, and excerpts from students that update loved ones on their lives and experiences. Presumably given again by H. M. Teller, the report starts with a generalized idea that "the Indian must be taught to work for his own support, and to speak the language, or…give place to people who do."[130] Teller also links

---

[126] "Report of a Visit to Our Pupils on Farms in Columbia County.," *The Morning Star* 4, no. 1 (Aug. 1883): 4, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[127] "Report," 4.
[128] "Report," 4.
[129] "What the Boys and Girls Write from the Country," *The Morning Star* 4, no. 1 (Aug. 1883): Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.

together "labor and language" by stating that they should be "uniform and universal," defining whiteness in terms of hard work and English literacy alongside the aforementioned racial hierarchy.[131] The report provides statistics about the types of schools being built, the increase in students, and most significantly the contribution of Christian religious groups. Teller calculates an "aggregate of $239,430" that Christian religious groups have contributed to maintaining schools, and in the same breath he defines Indigenous tribes as "degraded and ignorant."[132] Christianity is once more defined as a value of whiteness, and his prejudice demonstrates the memory relationship of how the United States government views Indigenous tribes. Published directly after the report is an excerpt that demonstrates the same memory relationship. It describes how Comptroller Knox declined to allow a "National Bank [to operate] in the [Indian] Territory" because Indigenous tribes were not considered citizens even if they were "wealthy," "well-educated," or "graceful orators."[133] Regardless of how strictly tribes conformed to values of whiteness, the United States government saw them as inferior people.

Pratt's report of his visit West is the next significant article in this issue, and he describes the successes of schools being built across the United States while including experiences from Indigenous parents he encountered along the way. Pratt recounts that during a council meeting, Standing Buffalo was in favor of education for Indigenous students, stating that '"Indians are now as on a battle field, contending for their place among the people, surrounded on all sides by the whites, who are educated.'"[134] Standing Buffalo's statement demonstrates both the way in which Indigenous families viewed their children, and the way in which Indigenous tribes viewed

---

[130] "Annual Report of the Commissioner of Indian Affairs.," *The Morning Star* 4, no 4. (Nov. 1883): 1, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[131] "Annual Report," 1.
[132] "Annual Report.," 1.
[133] "In the Indian Territory," *The Morning Star* 4, no. 4 (Nov. 1883): 1, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[134] "Capt. Pratt's Account of His Western Trip. – The Indians at Home. – Agency Schools. – Our Returned Pupils.," *The Morning Star*, no. 4 (Nov. 1883): 2, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.

the United States government. Standing Bear is in favor of education for children not because of tribal benefit, but because he is threatened to do so by encroaching white society. In this manner, he cares deeply for his loved ones and feels that sending them to boarding schools is the best way to protect them. He rightly views the United States government as a threat because he recognizes that the schools are for white benefit and that the United States government deliberately does not have Indigenous interests at heart. Other parents felt the same way as Standing Bear. Boss Sun wishes to visit Carlisle, stating that "[Indigenous tribes] are just as though a handkerchief were held before [their] eyes" and that they "can't see what [they] are doing" because of their lack of education.[135] He too recognizes the significance of education because of the way in which he fears being left behind and would rather have children from the Petehowerat tribe attend school so that they do not suffer the same fate.

Indigenous students also featured in this issue via their included excerpts, letters, and republished stories. One story by an unnamed student recounts her interaction with "a little colored girl." The student finds out that the girl had '"never saw an Indian before,"' and that "she was afraid [of the student]."[136] The student lied to her, thinking it funny to share that '"Indians fly around in the trees just like birds.'"[137] Though it could be read as children playing games with one another, it could also point to how the education in whiteness at Carlisle could have exposed her to the stereotype that black Americans were inferior to whites and Indigenous peoples. After all, articles have been published in Carlisle papers comparing the two marginalized groups.

Significant excerpts from the students are taken from Carlisle and other schools in the country and republished in *The Morning Star*. Though seemingly written by a staff member, one

---

[135] "Capt. Pratt.," 2.
[136] '"Letters and Parts of Letters From Our Pupils in the Country.," *The Morning Star* 4, no. 4 (Nov. 1883): 4, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[137] "Last Week," 4.

excerpt reads "Segregation and isolation is what hinders Indian progress."[138] It is important to recognize the irony in this statement because of the deliberate isolation imposed on Indigenous students to promote cultural dispersion. The author most likely means "segregation and isolation of races," but racism is taught at Carlisle and prejudice is implied because of the way in which the statement neglects black segregation. This excerpt may demonstrate the way in which Carlisle staff viewed the students because it implies that students are only "progressing" if they successfully partake in the laborious outing system with white families.

Other excerpts speak to the poor conditions at these schools. One of them mentions "twenty cases of mumps [interfering] with [Carlisle] school work" over the course of two weeks, and another one mentions the death of student Alice Springer of the Omaha tribe because of "consumption."[139] Barring the lack of modern day medicine, a school that genuinely cares about its students would not allow tragedy to befall them. Though there are multiple articles about Carlisle being underfunded and asking for donations from other non-federal sources, this instance is one of many wherein it demonstrates how these schools were never meant for Indigenous benefit. A boy presumably writing about the outing system feels a similar way. He claims that he "don't want to stay this place because not good to eat everytime, just we keep busy."[140] The staff member who copied this excerpt into the paper named him "Lazy Boy" because they felt as if he was ungrateful for growing tired of manual labor and terrible food. This excerpt illustrates how at least one staff member viewed the students, and the way in which they wanted Carlisle students to be perceived by outside society. Publishing this excerpt in *The Morning Star* distinguishes a "bad Indian" because of the extent to which the student does not wish to conform to values of whiteness in terms of individualization and hard work.

---

[138] "Briefs.," *The Morning Star* 4, no. 4 (Nov. 1883): 3, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[139] "School Items.," *The Morning Star* 4, no. 4 (Nov. 1883): 3, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[140] "Letters and Parts," 4.

The third issue within this volume includes a republished letter from General Howard, a correspondence between an "Indian Agent" and *The Morning Star*, and reports from students and patrons of their experiences in the outing system. The author who republished Howard's letter in *The Morning Star* prefaces with the fact that "no man in the nation is better qualified to give an opinion on the matter than he," to which Howard's opening statement is the fact that "[he] is not well enough informed…to suggest improvement" for the boarding school methods.[141] The ironic conflict must be noted to further the idea that the United States government was never equipped for FILS in the first place. As a prejudiced proponent of Christianity, Howard argues that the only thing more important "than the training of the intellect of the youth" is their "religious and moral" foundations as guided by domestic life and the church.[142] He feels that the only way for white Christians to "save" Indigenous tribes "lies in their complete conversion from savage to civilized methods of doing and living."[143] Not only does this define Christianity as a value of whiteness and "civilization," but Howard's racist words demonstrate the memory relationship of how the United States government views Indigenous tribes. He believes that they would only be useful if they were "civilized" via Christianity. It also demonstrates the memory relationship of how Carlisle staff wanted the students to be viewed because of how the letter was republished in *The Morning Star*. If a student was not following Christianity, then they must be "saved" from their "savage" ways until white society deemed them successful.

In a similar manner, an anonymous correspondence between an "Indian Agent" and Carlisle depicts how "value" was assessed in terms of Indigenous children—that is, if the student learned to "help themself" and find a "suitable" job after their education then they would have

---

[141] "Educating the Indians.," *The Morning Star* 4, no. 7 (Feb. 1884): 1, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[142] "Educating," 1.
[143] "Educating," 1.

worth in a white society. The unnamed Indian Agent writes to share that "[discharging students] for 'want of funds'…is the *greatest calamity* that has ever struck Indian civilization at this agency" and he feels that it turns "their influence…against [the Commissioner]."[144] The Agent's only regret is the fact that doing this will cause "friends of the Indian" to lose their reputation, not because of the fact that they are leaving students unprepared. In response, *The Morning Star* finds it "a rather discouraging outlook for the Government" to find federal occupations for all of the students, and agrees that discharging them was a poor idea.[145] However, *The Morning Star* also states that it could find agricultural employment for them on nearby farms, and finds it necessary for "the government [to] undertake the education of Indian children whether the parents will or no."[146] A parent reading this paper may understandably take this as a threat to the safety of their children because the statement caters to education as being beneficial for white society and neglects the wishes of Indigenous families. This exchange illustrates how the United States government viewed Indigenous tribes because it portrays how students are only "useful" if they conform to a degree of whiteness; that being finding themselves a "respectable" job after forced or voluntary education in FILS.

The last section of this issue is dedicated to excerpts from students and their patrons in the outing system. One student writes, '"I am glad that I am out farm and learn how to work. I like to stay here,'" while another shares '"I am happy every day. I thank you for such excellent opportunity.'"[147] White patrons report that students are '"doing finely,'" '"obedient in every respect and…handy,'" and '"faithful, and honest, and very well disposed.'"[148] These excerpts are

---

[144] "Important Letter From an Indian Agent.," *The Morning Star* 4, no. 7 (Feb. 1884): 2, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[145] "Important Letter," 2.
[146] "Important Letter," 2.
[147] "Letters and Parts of Letters From Our Pupils in the Country.," *The Morning Star* 4, no. 7 (Feb. 1884): 4, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.

excessively positive and indicates how Carlisle staff likely wanted students—and the form of education offered at Carlisle—to be viewed by outside society. If negative reviews of the students and their experiences were published, it would signal to readers that Carlisle's "civilizing" mission failed.

The final issue from this volume comes from May of 1884. It contains a response from Secretary of the Interior Henry M. Teller, excerpts about manual labor and the expansion of schools, as well as an article about United States government officials visiting Carlisle. Teller's letter responds to a Superintendent asking him to purchase $3.00 shoes for girl students as compared to $0.74 shoes. Teller denies the request, explains how "[he does] not consider [book knowledge] the main object of attendance at school," and uses the rest of the letter to further how "literary studies and not…manual labor exercises" should be neglected if a choice in education had to be made between the two.[149] As the person who oversaw the Bureau of Indian Affairs, Teller's words demonstrate that FILS were never meant to academically educate Indigenous students for their own benefit. Instead, he confirms that these institutions were implemented to benefit white society by exploiting others by forcing them to conform to values of whiteness – in this case, these values are "hard work" and "individualization."

Scattered throughout the issue are numerous excerpts about students' manual labor and the expansion of schools. Teller's letter shares space on the same page with "The Carlisle School.," which provides information about student demographics and the amount of goods they manufactured over the course of 1883. As of publication, 455 students from 37 different tribes attended Carlisle. It is also listed that 33 students died under Carlisle care.[150] The names of the

---

[148] "What Patrons Having our Pupils in Charge say of them.," *The Morning Star* 4, no. 7 (Feb. 1884): 4, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[149] Henry M. Teller, "Secretary Teller's Views Upon Indian Education.," *The Morning Star* 4, no. 10 (May 1884): 1, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.

deceased are not even recorded; they are given no more than a line of text in the middle of the section titled "Statistical Items." It begs the question as to whether Carlisle genuinely cares about its students for their benefit – granted, Carlisle staff only cares about what *they* think is best for students.

In the section detailing the products students made, manufactured goods are separated by gender roles, with girls doing the sewing, laundering, table-setting, and presumably cooking and baking. The boys tend to carpentering, tinning, shoemaking, printmaking, and blacksmithing. Other trades like baking, tailoring, harness making, and painting are more ambiguous, but they are listed as being carried out by students as well. As per Teller's recommendation, academia is second to the manual labor prioritized at Carlisle. 4,000-5,000 pieces of laundry were washed and ironed by the girls each week. 4,305 tin pails, 7,498 cups, 1,072 coffee boilers, 145 funnels, 5,340 pans, and 5,211 joints of stove pipes were made by the boys from the tin shop. 50,400 pounds of potatoes were one of the many resources produced on the farm in 1883.[151] Children engaging with this forced labor may be doing so under poor conditions that tire their bodies, making them more susceptible to weariness and disease. Though this "individualization" is what Carlisle staff and *Morning Star* readers deem as "successful," the fact that 33 students died indicates an environment that was likely unhealthy.

Manual labor is further prioritized in an advertisement calling for donations of $13,734. Pratt uses "Our Farm" to describe Carlisle's process in obtaining land for students to work with agriculturally. He "[abandons] the hope that Congress will hear [the plea for funds]" and instead feels it necessary "to make an appeal to friends of the work" for the money.[152] In all his fervor for

---

[150] "The Carlisle School.," *The Morning Star* 4, no. 10 (May 1884): 1, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[151] "The Carlisle School.," 1.

promoting "hard work" to succeed, where is this "hard work" now in asking for others to give him money? Pratt's hypocrisy illustrates the general neglect that characterized Carlisle's structure. It may also demonstrate the memory relationship of how Carlisle staff views the students because Pratt feels they are only useful and successful if the students farm land at Carlisle.[153]

The last significant article in this issue describes a "Congressional Visit" to Carlisle. As compared to external visits documented in *The School News*, this segment mostly contains information about the types of officials seeing Carlisle rather than what actually occurred during the event. Other than discussing the many members from the "committees of appropriations, Indian affairs and education," and members from both houses of Congress and their families, the most substantial piece of information was that the company left with "many expressions of appreciation."[154] Did the children perform speeches or play on their instruments? Did the visitors look into every classroom and interview the students? The lack of substance certainly caters to the white audience who would actually care about these officials rather than the nature of how the students were faring. This article—and the lack of detailed information about the students—represents a larger pattern in how the United States government views tribes in general in that it omits any information on students' wellbeing or the wellbeing of tribes in general. It may also denote how Carlisle staff wants students to be viewed – as exhibits for "more important" people to be pleased with rather than as individuals with their own agencies.

---

[152] R. H. Pratt, "Our Farm.," *The Morning Star* 4, no. 10 (May 1884): 2, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.

[153] Sharing the same page, there are three excerpts which mention land donations from Kansas, New Mexico, and Oregon worth hundreds of acres for the purpose of erecting "Indian Industrial [Schools]."To what extent is this land legitimately bought and sold? This represents the memory relationship of how the United States government views Indigenous people because of the way in which they are most likely cheated out of their rightful land in these instances. The government feels that tribes are useful as targets to be robbed for furthering white society.

[154] "Congressional Visit.," *The Morning Star* 4, no. 10 (May 1884): 3, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.

The second volume from this paper begins in August of 1884. By this point in time, *The Morning Star* has established consistent sections of "School Items" detailing excerpts of school events, and a section that includes letters from the students and excerpts from their patrons within the outing system. Though "School Items" was originally featured in *The School News*, its persistence in *The Morning Star* is where most student voices appear. These sections may be consistent because they track student improvement and prove Carlisle's success in the "civilizing mission." Indeed, the first issue includes a republished article from the former Secretary of the Interior that clarifies as to who government officials like the Secretary of the Interior thought was responsible for "civilizing" Indigenous tribes. Former Secretary of the Interior Carl Schurz's article was originally published in 1881 for the *North American Review*, and he discusses what he feels are "Present Aspects of the Indian Problem." Schurz starts by defending the actions of the United States government's earlier "Indian Policy" and states that "the Government has never been intent upon robbing the Indians" because it only tried to protect them from "[white] encroachment."[155] He contrasts this stance by noting in the next sentence how the United States government failed to do just that by "[yielding] to the pressure" of encroaching white settlers.[156] The irony illustrates how poorly the United States government continued to handle Indigenous matters through the time of the issue's publication. Schurz ultimately calls for the destruction of reservations and feels that "civilizing," individualizing, and further splitting up Indigenous lands is the only way to make them "no longer stand in the way of the development of the country as an obstacle" but instead add to it.[157] Schurz's words reflect the view that the government tried but "failed" to protect tribes from white settlers, but he nonetheless obscures how the United States

[155] Carl Schurz, "Present Aspects of the Indian Problem.," *The Morning Star* 5, no. 1 (Aug. 1884): 1, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[156] Schurz, "Present Aspects.," 1.
[157] Schurz, "Present Aspects.," 1.

government not only encouraged white settlement but used the United States Army to "protect" settlers from tribes. Yet, like at Carlisle, what is relevant to "Indian policy" at the moment is not the history of United States Indian policy but rather the training of indigenous youths to "benefit" white society – Schurz does not see them as having inherent worth unless they do something for his country specifically. His "good faith" argument is blatantly false because these broken treaties, stolen lands, and further dispersion are only in "good faith" for the white United States citizens they benefitted. He defends the United States government as a "protector of lands" and yet by calling for the destruction of the reservation system, calls for further dispossession of Indian land.

A similar article titled "Who is Responsible?" uses statistics from the Report of the Indian Commissioner for 1883 to place blame on who is responsible for the "uncivilized" nature of Indigenous tribes. The article links Christianity with "civilization" and defines them as instrumental to maintaining a successful United States. It concludes that "an important part of [the] Indian mission field has been almost over-looked" and does not affirm as to whether it is the fault of a denomination of Christians or the United States government.[158] The article assumes that forcing tribes to conform to values of whiteness would placate them and benefit white society, and forced conversion would most likely continue to exacerbate tension and cultural dispersion in white favor. Though it is bolstered heavily by their research, this article is not written by a government official. Instead, it replicates the views of those at Carlisle to a broader audience. Based on prior evidence, it may be assumed here that Carlisle staff feel their students are unsuccessful should they not embrace Christianity. Since the research is done by United

[158] "Who is Responsible?," *The Morning Star* 5, no. 1 (Aug. 1884): 2, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.

States government officials, their deliberate connection between choosing to research "civilization" and Christianity promotes a similar view.

A final interaction between a student's letter to a friend and a reference to a previous Carlisle article republished in this issue again denotes feelings of failure when students are deemed as lacking values of whiteness. The article, titled "Look Out!" is a seeming exaggeration of an Australian man's visit to Carlisle and his interactions with students. In having a conversation with a female student, the Australian concludes that '"They have no minds of their own'" as she agrees with his degrading remarks. Since the student condemns her Indigenous roots in easily agreeing with the Australian man, he believes that students are "sheep" who follow whatever they are told to do. However, the student also uplifts her classmates and emphasizes some of their good habits, recalling how a classmate wants to be a '"sober, hard-working saving Indian who has a home of his own."'[159] Though some students may be more inclined to highlight peers who may not be conforming to whiteness, to what extent is this encounter truthful? The Australian man notes that he always meant for some of his journaling to be published for Carlisle students, so it is possible that he is deliberately catering to a larger audience with skewed words. Even if the experience demonstrates how the girl viewed herself as more inclined to follow values of whiteness, it cannot be taken as an honest assessment because her words are not explicitly recorded. However, Maggie S. Looking demonstrates the effect of degrading comments when reacting to this article in a letter to her friend. She states that she "was so awfully ashame[d] to read the 'Lookout!'" that she "felt as though [she] would hang [herself]."[160] Looking continues her letter by highlighting the bias that "Look Out!" holds,

---

[159] "Look Out! A Man on the Band Stand," *The Morning Star* 5, no. 1 (Aug. 1884): 2, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[160] Maggie S. Looking, "My Dear Friend," *The Morning Star* 5, no. 1 (Aug. 1884): 3, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.

describing that she has seen [white] people just as lazy.[161] Looking illustrates how students could be horrified by stereotypes that generalized Indigenous people as "lazy." However, she also aligns with values of whiteness because she feels that "God will help [her and her peers] and to make [them] more better."[162] This interaction between "Look Out!" and Looking's letter ultimately displays a complex disconnect that interacts within different parties even if they hold similar values of whiteness.

The next issue in this volume combines both October and November of 1884. It contains the fourth annual report of the Commissioner of Indian Affairs, correspondences between students and their parents, and a letter from the Brigadier-General of the U.S. Army. The annual report praises the "civilizing" mission and happily expresses that "the Indian will be able to care for himself, and be no longer a burden but a help to the Government" should these "civilizing" procedures continue.[163] Here again, the view of the United States government is clear; Indigenous tribes and people could only be "useful" if they strongly conformed to values of whiteness. The report provides information about student attendance and tribe demographics, differentiates between boarding, training, and reservation schools, and implores the United States government to appropriate more funds to accommodate students. Whereas it may seem as if the Commissioner genuinely cares about benefitting Indigenous students' quality of life, he also states that "Hungry children would need little urging to become inmates of boarding school with well-spread tables."[164] The Commissioner understands the suffering tribes were facing—though he likely would not view this suffering as something that his government deliberately impressed upon Indigenous tribes by the United States government. Nonetheless, he uses the hunger of

---

[161] Looking, "My Dear," 3.
[162] Looking, "My Dear," 3.
[163] "Report of the Commissioner of Indian Affairs.," *The Morning Star* 5, no. 4 (Oct. & Nov. 1884): 1, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[164] "Report of the Commissioner," 3.

Indigenous children as a tactic to force children into FILS and away from their communities. His words support the idea that FILS were never meant to benefit Indigenous tribes, and the cultural dispersion has always been for white benefit rather than genuine care.

Following the report are other excerpts that define whiteness and portray Carlisle experiences, yet the most significant section is the interactions between parents and their children at school. Students were only able to write letters to their family if they wrote in English, which is a deliberate method of cultural dispersion because of the language disconnect. Whereas previous letters that have been published were overwhelmingly positive, this batch of letters varies between students wanting to continue their education, experiencing strong negative emotions, and aligning with values of whiteness. One student writes that "We have more determination to get an education this year than last," signaling Carlisle's success in encouraging "civilization."[165] Another student shares with their parent that "sometimes [their] equanimity is in despair," and a third student expresses their desire to return home.[166] A final student shares that they are "always thinking about [their] home" and that it makes them feel like crying.[167] These letters depict how some students at FILS viewed their parents. Whereas sometimes students align more with values of whiteness and seek to continue their education, others care more deeply for their families and miss their loved ones.

The final large section in this issue gives space to "A Letter from General Crook to Mr. Herbert Welsh," and it further explores values of whiteness and the memory relationship of how the United States government views Indigenous tribes. Crook first states that if Indigenous peoples were Greeks or Romans, the United States would "read with pride" their

---

[165] "Sentences from Letters Written to Parents.," *The Morning Star* 5, no. 4 (Oct. & Nov. 1884): 6, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[166] "Sentences," 6.
[167] "From Letters to Parents.," *The Morning Star* 5, no. 4 (Oct. & Nov. 1884): 8, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.

"determination." However, because he sees them as barriers between white men and coal or silver mines, Crook feels that "it is not always possible to do justice to [their] virtues."[168] As the Brigadier-General of the U.S. Army, Crook is subjectively valuing Indigenous tribes through the perspective of the United States government. He a tension that at least some in the United States government has in terms of their views towards the tribes. Yet, ultimately, as Crook concludes, gaining access to materials on Native reservations outweighed any sense of "pride" he might express for the "determination" of Indigenous tribes.

The first issue of the next volume, from February of 1885, indicated that Carlisle had raised the cost of the newspaper from $0.25 to $0.50. This volume was lengthier—8 pages in total—and so the increased cost may denote the success and expansion of the paper, or it could point to the continuous funding issues the school faced, especially considering the tandem articles calling for further appropriations. This issue also featured a history of former presidents' responses to the "Indian Question," and includes solutions from Presidents George Washington, Thomas Jefferson, James Madison, James Monroe, John Quincy Adams, and Andrew Jackson. In the article, Washington's policy is characterized as one that seeks to regulate trade by working with Indigenous tribes. Trading with the tribes would be, according to Washington, beneficial for the United States, and "should be conducted without fraud, without extortion, [and] with constant and plentiful supplies."[169] Jefferson wishes to preserve peace, though recognizes the white desire to settle on Indigenous lands. He concludes in a private letter that the best outcome would be "to let [white] settlements and [Indigenous tribes] meet and blend together, to intermix, and become one people."[170] Madison follows a similar policy and wishes for "the habits of the savage to

---

[168] George Crook, "A Letter From General Crook to Mr. Herbert Welsh," *The Morning Star* 5, no. 4 (Oct. & Nov. 1884): 7, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[169] "The Fathers of the Republic and the Indians.," *The Morning Star* 5, no 7 (Feb. 1885): 1, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.

[transition to] the arts and comforts od social life," denoting his preferential treatment of values of whiteness over Indigenous culture.[171] Monroe is the first to mention the implementation of schools, and wishes to "draw [tribes] there" as part of the "civilizing" mission.[172] He also feels that the United States should have "complete and undisputed" control over Indigenous tribes to "save" them from extinction, treating them as if they are endangered animals.[173] Quincy Adams recognizes that the United States "[appropriated] to [itself] their hunting-grounds," and in doing so feels that the federal government has a responsibility to provide tribes with "the arts of civilization, and the doctrines of Christianity."[174] Finally, Jackson recognizes that the United States desire to "civilize and settle the Indian" conflicts with the "opportunity to purchase their lands and thrust them further into the wilderness."[175] He expresses hypocrisy by describing the Trail of Tears directly afterwards. The change over time in these presidential responses to "The Indian Question" represents the memory relationship of how the United States government views Indigenous tribes. The government has consistently viewed Indigenous peoples as inferior unless they confirm to specific degrees of whiteness, and their "solutions" have always been for white benefit. Including this history in Carlisle's newspaper may imply that their solution is the most "humane," despite the lasting harm and intergenerational trauma impressed upon impacted Indigenous survivors and communities. History here is used as a propaganda that separates villainous treatment from sympathetic, modern solutions—the irony being that the United States government continues to answer the "Indian Question" in horrible ways despite its various responses.

---

[170] "The Fathers," 1.
[171] "The Fathers," 2.
[172] "The Fathers," 2.
[173] "The Fathers," 2.
[174] "The Fathers," 2.
[175] "The Fathers," 2.

Also included in this volume of the paper were estimations about financial deficits regarding Indigenous treaties, and republished speeches on the Congressional "Indian Appropriations Bill." A second article about financial deficits also expresses the way in which the United States government views Indigenous people. Republished from the *N. Y. Tribune*, it describes how the United States government is lacking in fulfilling their treaties. The House of Representatives found that $4,285,000 is owed to Indigenous tribes because of treaties that promised schools to be built and funds to be appropriated for such. Monetary estimates for the Apaches, Kiowas, Comanches, Cheyennes, Araphoes, Crows, Navajoes, Shoshones, Bannocks, Sioux, and Utes are listed and grouped by Commissioner Price. The article also mentions that "members of the Appropriations Committee" found "the Government [to be] absolved of its obligations under [the treaties]" because many tribes did not want schools when the treaties were made.[176] The memory relationship of how the United States government views Indigenous tribes is present in this article because of how it neglects treaties with Indigenous peoples. Whereas the United States government had discounted past answers to the "Indian Question" that refused uphold treaties, the hypocrisy may serve to legitimize the supreme power of the United States government over Indigenous tribes. The fact that this information was even reported was viewed by some members of the Appropriations Committee as '"a piece of impertinence,"' so it could also be possible that the *N.Y. Tribune* and other papers wanted to uncover federal cruelties.[177]

The final featured section includes excerpts from different Congressional speeches on the "Indians Appropriations Bill." Congressman E. J. Ellis feels that it is best to reduce the amount of money appropriated to tribes so that they "would be dependent on [their] own exertions" to "become self-sustaining," and in a similar vein J. H. Rogers feels that tribes "must be taught to

[176] N.Y. Tribune, "Indian Deficiency Estimates.," *The Morning Star* 5, no. 7 (Feb. 1885): 4, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[177] N.Y. Tribune, 4.

lay aside the hunting rifle and take up the hoe and the chopping ax."[178] Both Congressmen express a desire for Indigenous tribes to conform to values of whiteness by forcing them to work for themselves and engage in individualizing efforts that benefit white society. This demonstrates a memory relationship of how the United States government views Indigenous tribes because they are not valued unless they conform to values of whiteness.

The last issue in this volume comes from May of 1885 and includes an article about races and missionary work, comparisons between Canadian and United States Indigenous tribes, and excerpts of correspondences between Indigenous families and their students at Carlisle. Professor Horace Bumstead of Atlanta University proposes two distinct policies that would be the most effective in promoting Christianity between different races. Instead of isolating each race from one another and evangelizing them separately, he argues that it is best to mingle different races with one another since it would "magnify the idea of human brotherhood" while simultaneously minimizing race and class distinctions.[179] Bumstead proceeds to "preach" about how teaching people about Christianity in groups made up of different races upholds the tenets of the religion. Promoting Christianity to "uplift" and "better" all races corresponds with the values of whiteness taught at Carlisle because it assumes that white settlers are the ones to teach and "civilize" other races.

A similar definition of whiteness is given in the article about Canadian Indigenous tribes through a comparison of the dialects of the Cree, Stoney, and Blackfoot tribes. The veteran missionary who wrote this section for the Canadian paper (which was then republished in *The Morning Star*) observes the Cree to be "friendly to the white man," therefore praising them as

---

[178] "From Speeches on the Indian Appropriations Bill in Congress.," *The Morning Star* 5, no. 7 (Feb. 1885): 6, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[179] Horace Bumstead, "The Mutual Helpfulness of the Races as an Element in Missionary Work.," *The Morning Star* 5, no. 10 (May 1885): 1, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.

"as intelligent people who…perceived the irresistible nature of the forces of civilization."[180] He seems to also think highly of the Stoneys, expressing discomfort that the "Indian Department has turned [them] into foes."[181] As for the Blackfeet, he feels as if they have always been "loyal and good, but hunger has dulled their respect for the white man."[182] The terminology that this veteran provides makes it seem as if these tribes are only "good" if they view "the white man" as a superior, or respect values of whiteness. In another article by the same author, he claims Christianity as the "purer faith" than the "sorcery" that Indigenous peoples practice, saying that Christian missionaries "struck [Indigenous people] from the fetters of barbarism."[183] Christianity is therefore defined as a value of whiteness because of the way in which it creates a hierarchy that promotes white supremacy in this instance.

The last excerpts in this issue point to how some parents viewed their children and the "civilizing" mission. Whereas some of the letters may have been written in English, the subheading notes that the excerpts have been published with the assistance of a translator. Whether or not the translator knows every Indigenous language that is spoken by the multitude of tribes remains to be seen, so the letters may not entirely convey the messages that the parents wanted. However, it does note that the letters were published with permission. Every single excerpt republished, whether written by student or guardian, positively aligns with values of whiteness. Red Eye of the Cheyenne tribe, for example, wishes for their niece to "forget what [they] learn about Indian ways" and encourages her to "be greedy like the white man."[184] M. D. from the Osage Agency wishes that "[he were] a school boy [himself]."[185] A Cheyenne pupil to

---

[180] J. B. A, "Canada and Her Indians," *The Morning Star* 5, no. 10 (May 1885): 2, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[181] J. B. A.,"Canada," 2.
[182] J. B. A., "Canada," 3.
[183] J. B. A., "The Indian as a Man.," *The Morning Star* 5, no. 10 (May 1885): 3, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[184] "Correspondence Between Indian Parents of the Various Tribes and Their Children at Carlisle," *The Morning Star* 5, no. 10 (May 1885): 8, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.

their father "Hawk" writes that they feel discouraged "when [they] hear that [their] tribe is way behind in civilization" and wants their siblings to attend.[186] Each familial interaction demonstrates a close relationship between student and parent that transcends cultural bounds. However, the deliberate publishing of excerpts that only align with whiteness demonstrates Carlisle's bias in only wanting to promote their success in "civilizing" Indigenous tribes.

The last volume in this sequence for *The Morning Star* begins in August of 1885. Whereas *The School News* provided the best information for internal Carlisle events, definitions of whiteness, and memory relationships from student perspectives, *The Morning Star* revealed more regarding the perspective of the United States government and the parents of students. This observation persists in the issue and is found in the articles that provide information about General Sheridan's answer to the "Indian Question," citizenship for Indigenous tribes, and a translated and republished speech by an Osage chief. An article titled "General Sheridan's Plan" presents Civil War General Sheridan's plan for members of the Cheyenne tribe. He believed that if Cheyenne conscripts were brought into the "regular army" on "full regulation pay" it would "divert their minds from mischief."[187] Though the *Philadelphia Bulletin* finds that the idea would not do much for the "Indian Question," *The Morning Star* thinks the idea would "promote peace" and "[end Indigenous tribes] as a disturbing element [to white society]."[188] How would the conscription be enforced? It is doubtful that the "most turbulent Cheyennes" would willingly conform to Sheridan's plan, signifying a deliberate proposal for cultural dispersion.[189] As he formerly worked for the government in the army, Sheridan's plan demonstrates how the United

---

[185] "Correspondence," 8.
[186] "Correspondence," 8.
[187] "General Sheridan's Plan," *The Morning Star* 6, no. 1 (Aug. 1885): 2, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[188] "General Sheridan," 2.
[189] "General Sheridan," 2.

States viewed tribes because in this instance the government only views them as a nuisance to get rid of due to their culture and lack of white values.

A correspondence between Pratt and acting Commissioner E. L. Stevens illustrates a similar view United States government officials had towards Indigenous people in a discussion regarding tribes and United States citizenship. Pratt wonders whether an educated student at Carlisle can obtain citizenship. Stevens responds with "The fact that Indians are born in the country does not make them citizens of the United States" concluding that "it is to be hoped that appropriate legislation upon [citizenship] will be had at an early day."[190] It seems redundant to instill values of whiteness in Indigenous tribes if there is no end goal for citizenship. Regardless of how "white" a tribe may be, without representation in the U.S. government native people would still lack the ability to influence policy decisions made by the United States government. Furthermore, they will only be useful should they deeply conform to these values of whiteness, which also defines "citizenship" as a value of whiteness.

A final article in this issue is a republished speech given by chief White Horse of the Osage tribe, and he demonstrates another way of how Indigenous parents viewed their children. He starts by describing how "[his] people of old warned [him]…that Indians one day would become as the white people," and continues by encouraging the audience to "educate [their] children" and take up agricultural practices.[191] The tone White Horse uses makes it seem as if he feels threatened by the encroachment of white settlers, and finds that the easiest way to deal with them is by accepting defeat and assimilating with values of whiteness. In this sense, he recognizes the dispersion of his culture and hopes for the next generation to have a better future, therefore encouraging other Indigenous parents that it is best for them to do the same. His tone

[190] "Citizenship for Indians.," *The Morning Star* 6, no. 1 (Aug. 1885): 2, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[191] "An Osage's Council.," *The Morning Star* 6, no. 1 (Aug. 1885) 4, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.

also demonstrates the way in which Indigenous tribes view the United States government because of how his wording hints at his discomfort with the deliberate cultural dispersion.

Whereas the last issue spanned four pages, this next issue from November of 1885 spans twelve pages to make up for lost space. A quarter of the issue is dedicated to the "Sixth Annual Report of the Indian Industrial School," describing the success of Carlisle, living conditions, and future plans. It also includes excerpts about different sentiments on the "Indian Question," and multiple republished papers on "The Indian Problem." Pratt takes up the first quarter of the issue by republishing his "Sixth Annual Report of the Indian Industrial School" as he writes to the Commissioner of Indian Affairs. Pratt starts by providing statistics for the boys and girls at Carlisle, including eight deceased, 174 new students, 494 total pupils at school, and 38 different tribes.[192] He addresses positive reviews of the outing-system from patrons, the great number of goods produced by the many trades learned by the Carlisle students, details the separation of school "grades," student living quarters, Carlisle involvement at the New Orleans World's Fair exhibit, school sanitary conditions, and contributions to the institution via charities. Unsurprisingly, he concludes with a racist comparison and indirectly belittles the value of Indigenous people. Pratt states that over the course of 250 years, "black, exotic savages" were transplanted and increased in numbers in the United States, and that they "[grew] out of barbarism and barbaric languages" because they were thrust into the individualizing "experience" of what it meant to be part of the United States, or white society.[193] He uses this observation to promote "Any policy which invites the Indian to become an individual," assuming that Indigenous people are also not useful unless they conform to values of whiteness via benefiting the United States through hard work and self-sustainability. This not only indicates

[192] R. H. Pratt, "Sixth Annual Report of the Indian Industrial School," *The Morning Star* 6, no. 4 (Nov. 1885): 1, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[193] R. H. Pratt, "Sixth Annual," 4.

how racist ideas were a facet of whiteness, but in this statement Pratt also expresses how Carlisle staff wants their students to be viewed by external white society, and how the United States government viewed Indigenous tribes. By publishing Carlisle's successes, Pratt wishes to continue his "civilizing" project because he believes it is for the overall benefit of the United States. In a similar vein, he is writing to a government official and used to work for the United States himself, so in concluding that individualization is best he is actually thinking about what is best for a white dominant society.

Pratt is not the only one who continues to feel that cultural dispersion is favorable to Indigenous (and therefore white) benefit, as multiple excerpts by unnamed authors follow suit. One feels that proposals of "land, law, and citizenship" for Indigenous tribes "are still weak and of a most insidious, and shirking character."[194] This author feels that not many would "take hold of this degraded, soiled brother" and "clean him up and teach him to keep himself so," but feels that it is best for Indigenous tribes to do so.[195] Another author states that the U. S. "[does] everything [they] can to destroy" Indigenous ambition and efforts to be white U.S. citizens while simultaneously encouraging every other man to hold these ambitions.[196] They conclude with the idea that Indigenous people may be "white" in the future, but not at the moment.[197] This teasing tone implies a racial hierarchy that suggests how U.S. officials only want assimilation as an idea, not a literal practice. These excerpts recognize a change in how Indigenous peoples have been perceived and accepted by white society. Whereas "Kill the Indian, Save the Man!" was once a popular saying, this volume emphasizes controversy surrounding individualization and citizenship.

---

[194] "The sentiment that," *The Morning Star* 6, no. 4 (Nov. 1885): 6, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[195] "The sentiment," 6.
[196] "We have never" *The Morning Star* 6, no. 4 (Nov. 1885): 6, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[197] "We have," 6.

More thoughts on "The Indian Question" are present in I. N. Cundall's "The Indian Problem," which incorporates multiple papers he wrote that detail his opinions on assimilation, Indigenous rights to U.S. privileges, interracial marriages, voting rights, and education. He is a unique proponent for giving Indigenous tribes the same rights as white men, arguing a plan of action to "First, open the Indian land to the Indian, and do it now. Second, give the Indian the same civil rights as the white man, and do it now. Third, make education of Indian youth in the English language compulsory, and do it now."[198] Whereas forcing English literacy is a definitive value of whiteness, the other ideas in his papers follow suit with these progressive core values. As he was the former principal of the "Wooster Indian Academy" in "Indian Territory," Cundall is likely to have more knowledge of Indigenous matters and is therefore likely to be trusted more by readers of *The Morning Star*. However, his opinions may reflect the memory relationship of how ordinary white society views Indigenous tribes because of his lack of affiliation with the government and complex opinions on the situation.

The following issue comes from February of 1886 and like the issues before it, prominently features pieces on government policy including different Congressional opinions on the "Sioux Bill," an opinion piece that defines Christianity and individualization as whiteness, and excerpts from letters written by students. This issue returns to the normal length of eight pages, representing Carlisle's growing success and need for funding. In the piece on the "Sioux Bill," Senators Teller, Dawes, and Plumb provide their opinion on what should be done about the United States' lack of fulfillment for an 1868 treaty. Senator Teller summarizes the previous treaty conditions, stating that the United States government promised to build houses, provide farm animals, and establish a school for every thirty children. Teller estimates that the Sioux are

[198] I.N. Cundall, "The Indian Problem.," *The Morning Star* 6, no. 4 (Nov. 1885): 9, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.

owed "over three and a half million dollars," and feels that it is foolish to "pay all this money under the [current] terms" of the treaty.[199] He instead proposes to "abrogate every Indian treaty [the United States has] ever made," and proceed by interspersing stolen land with white settlers and fulfill only a portion of these goods.[200] Senator Dawes agrees that "the best mode of relieving [the United States] of [Indigenous tribes]" is assimilation with the white population, though he argues that it would be more effective to execute the process slowly.[201] Senator Plumb feels that paying Indigenous tribes 50 cents per acre is more than what they are entitled to, and blames the lack of education on the Sioux because "The Army of the United States would not have been sufficient" to force them to go to school should the school-houses have been built.[202] The fact that they are pleased with the scamming of the Sioux represents the memory relationship of how the United States government views Indigenous tribes. The government does not care if the situation does not benefit white people.

Republished from the *Randolph Register*, Anson B. Archer's "Shall we leave him to his ruin and our shame" views Indigenous people in a similar light as the aforementioned Senators. Archer believes that it is the duty of Christians and "citizens of a republic which boasts of freedom" to focus on the "education" (read: "civilizing" mission) of Indigenous peoples.[203] He wants to "Offer the Indian the same inducements that [white men] offer every other race" so that their progress "[gives] way to the silent march of civilization."[204] Archer links Christianity and United States citizenship with "the white man," therefore defining them as values of whiteness.

---

[199] "Senator Teller's Views on the Sioux Bill as Recently Expressed in Congress," *The Morning Star* 6, no. 7 (Feb. 1886): 1, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[200] "Senator Teller," 2.
[201] "Senator Dawes on the Sioux Bill," *The Morning Star* 6, no. 7 (Feb. 1886): 2, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[202] "Senator Plumb on the Sioux Bill," *The Morning Star* 6, no. 7 (Feb. 1886): 3, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[203] Anson B. Archer, "Shall we leave him to his ruin and our shame," *The Morning Star* 6, no. 7 (Feb. 1886): 7, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[204] Anson B. Archer, "Shall we," 7.

He does mention that he has experience spending time around Indigenous tribes but is not listed as a government official in the article. Therefore, Archer may demonstrate how ordinary people view Indigenous people because of his lack of affiliation; however, he does promote values of whiteness. It is also plausible that he may be associated federally and that his occupation is deliberately left out or his contribution is an indication of how government thinking on the "Indian problem" had become "commonsense" in mainstream discussions.

Excerpts from letters written by students comprises the final portion of this issue. The excerpts are prefaced with the statement that "There is no restriction placed upon students in the matter of home letters" save the ones that are examined once a month, to which these excerpts have been taken from.[205] It is redundant to express strong objectivity and then publish only the letters which are specifically examined by the Carlisle staff. This bias may suggest that the letters have consistently been hand-picked by the staff to promote a more successful view of Carlisle's "civilizing mission." The students may have also deliberately catered their letters to such. It is also backwards to mention the lack of restrictions on students when they are deliberately forced to communicate with families in English, as has always been the policy at Carlisle. The institution has never been for Indigenous benefit, and their practices had sought to put restrictions on Native students from the start. These letters also demonstrate some of the ways Indigenous students viewed themselves and their families. One student says "[They] cannot help doing good and bad both," and another grimly states "If [they] have not died when [they] get home [they] will succor [a loved one]."[206] Other students "desire to be with [their loved ones]," and implore them by the will of God "to labor not to idle around."[207] Aligning with both values of

[205] "Extracts From Home Letters Written By Our Pupils.," *The Morning Star* 6, no. 7 (Feb. 1886): 8, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[206] "Extracts From Home," 8.
[207] "Extracts From Home," 8.

whiteness and still connecting with their tribe puts these students in a liminal space wherein they exist within both worlds simultaneously. They view their loved ones positively, wishing them well and encouraging them to benefit from what is learned at Carlisle. Even if Carlisle was never for Indigenous benefit, the students genuinely believe that these teachings will assist their tribes.

The last issue in this volume comes from May of 1886 and includes a very long piece that recounts speeches given by numerous visitors to Carlisle, an article on why white people want Indigenous tribes to be educated, and essay on the question of Indigenous citizenship written by a student. This sequence of speeches is contextualized by a program celebrating Carlisle's summertime break, wherein visitors to the institution were able to speak to an audience presumably comprised of visitors, staff, and students. Frank La Flesche of the Omaha tribe is the first in this sequence, and he argues that the solution to the "Indian Question" "rests mainly with the Indians themselves."[208] Flesche feels it necessary for educated students to teach their loved ones about "civilization" so that "[they] can have an equal chance with the white people to make a living."[209] Flesche recognizes the threat of white encroachment and encourages his people to survive, therefore showing how some members of Indigenous tribes viewed the United States government and white society. On the other hand, he is employed by the Department of the Interior, so he may instead be aligning with whiteness and thus demonstrates how Indigenous tribes could view themselves as being split between two worlds. A Mr. Hammond defines whiteness by imploring students to embrace God so that they may be "[rewarded] for doing well" when they die, and Senator Dawes implores the audience not to let "the Indian [be] a failure…because the Indian himself chooses to be a failure."[210] A Mr. Wellborn defines

---

[208] "Our Examination Exercises, May 12th.," *The Morning Star* 6, no. 10 (May 1886): 3, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[209] "Our Examination," 3.
[210] "Our Examination," 3 and 6.

"civilization" and therefore values of whiteness as "intellectual, religious, and industrial training."[211] General B. M. Cutcheon of the House of Representatives recognizes stolen land by stating "Your fathers were here hundreds of years before we were. This continent was yours. This land was yours with all its wealth, and now you have come into this glorious store of intelligence."[212] Finally, a Judge Perkins from the House of Kansas concludes by encouraging students to share their "privileges and benefits of Carlisle education" with the rest of their tribes.[213] All of these men demonstrate the memory relationship of how the United States government views Indigenous tribes because they belittle Indigenous wellbeing in favor of values of whiteness. General Cutcheon deliberately admits to the United States stealing Indigenous land and tries to make it seem as if life is better for Indigenous people in this circumstance.

The next article continues to express values of whiteness by introducing possible ideas as to why Indigenous people are being educated. The author suggests that they may either "assume the great dignity and privileges of American citizens," or remain "a nation within [the United States]" and "harass the [white] future."[214] He links American citizenship and nationalism with Christianity, calling it "un-American and un-Christian" that tribes are barred access from United States citizenship.[215] Values of whiteness expressed in this article are then both American citizenship and Christianity. Though he is for the implementation of American citizenship for Indigenous tribes, the author implies a mindset similar to that of the speeches, wherein citizenship would be the most feasible way to culturally disperse Indigenous tribes; therefore benefitting white people first and foremost. Citizenship for tribal nations would mean a threat to

---

[211] "Our Examination," 6.
[212] "Our Examination," 6.
[213] "Our Examination," 7.
[214] "What For?," *The Morning Star* 6, no. 10 (May 1886): 4, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[215] "What For?," 4.

white society because it should eliminate a racial hierarchy and provide opportunities for Indigenous people to find their place in a world different than their communities, though it may have also guaranteed a victory for white encroachment.

The citizenship question is finally addressed by a Pueblo student attending Carlisle. Henry Kendall is in favor of citizenship for Indigenous peoples, though recognizes that "[not] all the Indians are…fitted to carry the load of citizenship."[216] For those that are educated, he feels that "It means to DIE where you are in idleness and barbarism," expressing that he aligns with values of whiteness in that it is most beneficial for Indigenous tribes to be "civilized."[217] Kendall demonstrates the memory relationship of how students view themselves because of the way in which he exists in a liminal space between values of whiteness and connecting with his tribe. He also describes how Indigenous people deserve the same rights as other United States immigrants and non-white citizens, supporting his claim with how Lincoln "considered the Indian equal to the negro."[218] Both of these marginalized groups were and are still othered from white society.

The Morning Star preserved the definitions of whiteness and memory relationships that *The School News* established and built upon them by adding new memory relationships centered around the United States government and Indigenous families. As *The Morning Star* absorbed *The School News*, the paper eventually grew from four, to eight, and at one point 12 pages, signifying Carlisle's success. As the paper grew, so did the profits, from $0.25 to $0.50. White responses to the "Indian Question" now centered around whether Indigenous tribes should have access to United States citizenship, changing from the previous debate about whether they should be "dealt with" via education or war. The United States government continued to view these

---

[216] Henry Kendall, "Shall the Indians be Admitted to Citizenship?" *The Morning Star* 6, no. 10 (May 1886): 8, Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center.
[217] Henry Kendall, "Shall the Indians," 8.
[218] Henry Kendall, "Shall the Indians," 8.

tribes as useful to white society only if they conformed to a strong degree of whiteness, and even then, they were still deemed inferior to whites in the racial hierarchy that officials cemented. Even though education was agreed upon by white society to "benefit" the tribes, Indigenous families had varied reactions to the "solution." Whereas some parents felt that it would genuinely benefit their students, others feared white encroachment and the extinction of their culture so they conformed to it for the "best interests" of their children. While Carlisle is the premier FILS that inspired many of these interactions, Genoa continued these definitions and memory relationships into a later date and more remote location. This "civilizing success" is a testament to the depth of which these experiences were strongly pushed by white society, and how they deeply impact Indigenous tribes even to this day.

Chapter 3 – *The Indian News* in Maintaining Changes and Continuity

The Genoa Indian School's newspaper, *The Indian News*, comprises the final set of newspapers analyzed in this thesis. Established in 1884, the Genoa U.S. Indian Industrial School in Nebraska opened its doors to over 4,300 children until its closure in 1934.[219] Spanning from 1906-1909, the volumes of *The Indian News* are not as neatly organized as Carlisle's, though this may account for lack of archival record. The paper is useful in comparison to Carlisle because it demonstrates the continuity and depth of the definition of whiteness taught at Carlisle and numerous present memory relationships, regardless of the school's remote location or later date of the volumes.

The first issue of *The Indian News* comes from September of 1906. Though the closest accessible issue to *The Morning Star* is from March of that same year, that issue is from the previous volume, and starting with it would provide inefficiently organized data. Compared to Carlisle's newspapers, this first issue is twenty-eight pages long and includes advertisements, denoting reader's continued and growing interest in these schools. However, there are less words per page than both of Carlisle's papers, though the advertisements could still point to a retained audience. This issue includes a lengthy article about the significance of the environment that a person lives in, articles about habits that make a person, and a republished letter from the "Indian

[219] "About Genoa & Indian Boarding Schools," Genoa Indian School Digital Reconciliation Project, accessed March 29, 2024, https://genoaindianschool.org/about-genoa-indian-boarding-schools.

Department." The issue centers around the way in which Indigenous students "should" behave, defining values of whiteness throughout.

"Our Environments" is featured as the first article in this issue of *The Indian News*, and argues in favor of maintaining a "good" character. In the piece, the unnamed author describes the way in which an environment "[moulds] body and mind" and expresses the significance of adapting to different environments to gain new, pleasant insights.[220] The article also warns of times when it is "necessary to rise above his environments" despite being in an "enlightened age…[boasting] of modern civilization and Christian advancement."[221] Here, the author criticizes the moral ills that still persist in a modern society, and expresses the need to practice good character regardless of external influence. It is significant to note that they imply "good" morals as "Christian" morals. The inferred didactic connotations demonstrate a memory relationship of how the staff at Genoa wish for the children to behave and be seen because of the way in which they define "good" character in line with values of whiteness. This character is linked with Christianity and "civilization," therefore defining values of whiteness. It is also interesting to note the masculine use of pronouns, possibly adding patriarchy to the aforementioned mix of values.

A second group of articles follows a similar set of memory relationships and definitions. Judge B. Lindsay's "A Timely Talk to Boys" implores them to instill good habits within their character, lest they become "a worthless man, if not actually a criminal."[222] He lists these habits as being "clean, wholesome, decent, manful, cheerful boy, loyal to home, school, and chums" and concludes with "may God bless you."[223] Lindsay also links Christianity with "good"

---

[220] Hattie Ogden," Our Environments.,"" *The Indian News* 9, no. 1 (Sept. 1906): 1, Genoa Indian School Digital Reconciliation Project.
[221] Hattie Ogden, "Our Environments.," 2.
[222] "Judge B. Lindsay, "A Timely Talk to Boys.," *The Indian News* 9, no. 1 (Sept. 1906): 4, Genoa Indian School Digital Reconciliation Project.

character, furthering a definition of whiteness seen in Carlisle's newspapers. Republished from *The Courier*, H. D. Schaff's "False Excuses" also links Christianity with "good" character and habits while promoting hard work and individualization. He calls for faithfulness to Christianity above all, stating that "Excuses are not reasons; they are subterfuges that cover up reasons" and guilts the reader by inquiring if they would "lay [excuses] before Christ and expect him to believe [them]."[224] Schaff also links Christianity with "good" character, cementing this definition of whiteness by differentiating between a successful, "good" Christian man and a wrongful one who does not follow the faith. Each of these articles, which push values of whiteness as "good" character to the boys specifically, illustrate how the school staff viewed the children and want them to be viewed by external society.

A republished letter from the "Indian Department" offers a final comment on the theme of "proper" character to Indigenous students. Francis Leupp, the Commissioner of Indian Affairs from 1905-1909, a Mr. Ellis for the position of "chief clerk of the Office," stating that his stellar attendance, remarkable overtime and early arrival earned him the occupation.[225] Leupp believes that Ellis' moral character will be a reward to the entire office itself, though tragically it seems as if Ellis had passed before his appointment.[226] The way in which hard work is prioritized implies that embracing the ideals of whiteness leads to a "good" character that—in this example—would have landed Ellis a promotion.

Rather than being the fourth issue in the volume, the next issue is the fifth from January of 1907 since the fourth issue is missing from the archive. It includes another article about how

---

[223] Judge B. Lindsay, "A Timely Talk," 4.
[224] H. D. Schaff, "False Excuses.," *The Indian News* 9, no. 1 (Sept. 1906): 17, Genoa Indian School Digital Reconciliation Project.
[225] "A Hint to the Wise.," *The Indian News* 9, no. 1 (Sept. 1906): 24, Genoa Indian School Digital Reconciliation Project.
[226] "A Hint," 24.

one's "good" character can be shaped by one's environment as well as excerpts written by students about daily Genoa events, and written descriptions of the chiefs of the "five civilized tribes." This issue also places heavy emphasis on the "good" character that is necessary for students' success and republishes a great deal of content from other papers and letters.

The main article written about "good" character in this issue stresses the significance of domestic gender roles. Proponent for education and art Henry Turner Bailey's "The Home a Potent Factor in Education" argues that older generations had homes in which the husband and wife efficiently performed gendered tasks that made it "the most potent factor in education," presumably in terms of manners and "civilized" success.[227] He most likely idolizes the Victorian concept of "separate spheres," in which a husband attends to public business outside of the home, and the wife masters all domestic affairs and looks after the children. As for modern times, Bailey believes that "the discipline of the old self-supporting home is no longer in force," and public schools must adapt to that role via "nature" and individualization to build "moral back bone, ethical muscle and brotherly blood."[228] He expresses individualization and western gender roles as values of whiteness because of the way in which he links them with "civilization" and as necessities to "discipline" students at boarding schools.

Similar to the Carlisle newspapers, each issue in Genoa also includes a section of excerpts written by the students. Though it is difficult to determine at times how authentic these excerpts are because they lack appropriate authors and titles, the use of the terminology of "we" generally denotes student authorship. They focus mainly on student trades, sports, student sickness, or staff occurrences. One student reports that a "Henry Cogswell is now the best engineer of the boys in the boiler house," whereas another updates that "the sewing room girls

---

[227] Henry Turner Bailey, "The Home a Potent Factor in Education.," *The Indian News* 9, no. 5 (Jan. 1907): 4, Genoa Indian School Digital Reconciliation Project.
[228] Henry Turner Bailey, "The Home," 9.

have just about completed their work for the Jamestown Exposition."[229] These continue a definition of whiteness that values hard work by teaching students trades in order to individualize them and disperse their communal ties. It is also odd to have a student in the boiler room – this excerpt possibly points to poor living conditions and a lack of care for student wellbeing, especially combined with multiple reports of recovery from sickness. At the very least, it indicates that students were learning skills that could be put to use in the upkeep or maintenance of the school itself. Another excerpt reports that Miss Liniger, presumably a staff member at Genoa, "was called home" and that the boys "will miss their matron very much." Further wishes express that "[the students] all hope she will return soon."[230] This excerpt provides insight into how students view the boarding school staff. The students express their sorrow for their teacher's departure, showing that they genuinely have grown to care about her. However, the fact that these boarding schools deliberately skew a more "civilized" idea of the students to the audience may mean that part of this sentiment is not genuine and does not account for all opinions on boarding school staff.

This terminology itself represents how the U.S. government and the broader public used ideals of whiteness to assess the civilizational status of native tribes. The five civilized tribes—Cherokee, Chickasaw, Choctaw, Creek (Muscogee), and Seminole tribes—were termed as such in the mid-19th century because they had, according to white observers, adopted some Anglo-European ways of living compared to other tribes that were deemed as "wild" or "savage."[231] Governor Douglas H. Johnston, Chief of the Chickasaw nation, is described as "a well educated Indian," but his portion of the article also makes note of the conflict of his

[229] "Pupils' Items.," *The Indian News* 9, no. 5 (Jan. 1907): 14, Genoa Indian School Digital Reconciliation Project.
[230] "Pupils' Items.,"16.
[231] Andrew K. Frank, "Five Civilized Tribes," Oklahoma Historical Society, The Encyclopedia of Oklahoma History and Culture, accessed April 28, 2024, https://www.okhistory.org/publications/enc/entry?entry=FI011.

inauguration and states that "the entire support of the United States Marshal" was needed to seat him.[232] This discontent suggests a divided nation that refuses to recognize Indigenous people's capability to hold power, demonstrating the memory relationship of how ordinary people of white society view Indigenous tribes as a whole. Terminology of "a well educated Indian" assumes a separation between an educated "man" and "Indian." Chief Green McCurtain of the Choctaw nation is described as "a vigorous, forceful type" and a "fair fighter," which seems to be a more objective observation since it weighs multiple aspects of his character.[233] Chief W. C. Rogers of the Cherokee nation is described as "a splendid specimen of Indian manhood," dehumanizing him as a creature to be looked at rather than a great and powerful man.[234] Chief Pleasant Porter of the "Greeks" (presumably "Creeks") is also praised by the author as "a man of high education" and states that "President Roosevelt regards him as the best Indian on politics and current affairs."[235] This too assumes a separation between "Indian" and "[white] man," establishing a racial hierarchy based on capability. John Brown, "governor" of the Seminoles, is the final Chief in this article, and is described as "a brainy man" and the first to "[secure] the…best treaty with the government."[236] This expresses the memory relationship of how the government views Indigenous tribes because Brown's success is only based on the fact that he conformed to values of whiteness and made a treaty with the United States government.

The next issue in this volume is from March of 1907, and includes articles about a woman's work in the FILS system, students' arguments in favor of non-reservation schools, and a republished article from *Success Magazine* that dehumanizes an Apache chief. This first article

---

[232] "Pen Pictures of Chiefs of Five Civilized Tribes.," *The Indian News* 9, no. 5 (Jan. 1907): 21, Genoa Indian School Digital Reconciliation Project.
[233] "Pen Pictures," 21.
[234] "Pen Pictures," 21.
[235] "Pen Pictures," 21.
[236] "Pen Pictures," 21.

praises Miss Estelle Reel for "[doing] a man's work in a woman's way" because of her successful work as "Superintendent of the Indian Schools for the United States" for the previous nine years.[237] Though she grieves when an "Indian" girl does not utilize her education, Miss Reel also "does not believe in making a white man of the Indian, but thinks it best to educate him and let him remain an Indian."[238] Not only is it unique to praise a women in power during a time when they did not even have the right to vote, but Miss Reel also recognizes that whiteness is not necessary for Indigenous success. She demonstrates an interesting memory relationship of how the United States government views Indigenous tribes. Whereas previously conforming to values of whiteness was the only way in which the government would recognize Indigenous value, Miss Reel sees their value regardless of whether they choose to conform to values of whiteness. What matters to her is that they have the option to do so.

The next article also discusses off-reservation boarding schools, though it is unclear if Indigenous students wrote these excerpts. Some boarding schools integrated Indigenous children and children from other races, but this article does not list an author. One student believes that non-reservation boarding schools take pupils further into their education and enable them to learn more about "white civilization," while another student vouches for the effectiveness of cultural dispersal by stating that "they give a pupil the opportunity to leave the reservation where they lived according to the Indian ways." Others still vouch for off-reservation boarding schools because of their individualization efforts via learning trades and laboring.[239] Since the students are using 'them' and not 'we,' it is possible that these pupils are not Indigenous—but it is also possible that these are native students who have adopted the education in whiteness that they've

---

[237] "Woman's Great Work for the Government: Miss Estelle Reel is Superintendent of Indian Schools for It," *The Indian News* 9, no. 7 (Mar. 1907): 1, Genoa Indian School Digital Reconciliation Project.
[238] "Woman's Great," 2.
[239] "Reasons given By Eight grade 'B' Pupils Why There Should Be Non-reservation Schools," *The Indian News* 9, no. 7 (Mar. 1907): 4, Genoa Indian School Digital Reconciliation Project.

been taught at Genoa. If they were, then it would denote the memory relationship of how students view themselves because of the separation between "civilized" and "uncivilized" pupils. "Civilization" is also noted as a value of whiteness, which is explicitly linked by one of the students.

A final significant article within this issue demonstrates how white society views Indigenous tribes by dehumanizing an Apache chief. The article "classed [him] as a 'good' Indian," and describes how tourists on his reservation tormented him by showing him a phonograph, claiming it was The Great White Spirit.[240] The chief refused to believe the tourists, and so the article concludes the recounted interaction with the chief's withdrawal "in scorn, [leaving] with an enlarged opinion of his own importance."[241] Titling the article "A Diminishing Soul," mocking the chief's intelligence, and inadvertently labeling him "arrogant" are all ways in which this interaction, and its reporting, dehumanized this Apache chief. The fact that the tourists were most likely white may demonstrate a value of whiteness in the sense that they imposed a racial hierarchy in this instance because they presumed themselves as smarter than he.

The final issue in this volume comes from June of 1907 and includes articles about the history of Genoa, the history of cotton, and articles that promote intelligence and hard work through the profession of a painter. Genoa "Indian Industrial School" was opened February 20th, 1884, and according to the article, enabled students "to interpret the English language have a practical knowledge of business affairs, be able to think logically and combat with the world intelligently."[242] English literacy continues a pre-established definition of whiteness, and "business affairs" infers cultural dispersion methods through learning trades, reinforcing the idea

---

[240] "A Diminishing Soul," *The Indian News* 9, no. 7 (Mar. 1907): 22, Genoa Indian School Digital Reconciliation Project.
[241] "A Diminishing," 22.
[242] "Genoa Indian School," *The Indian News* 9, no. 10 (Jun. 1907): 2, Genoa Indian School Digital Reconciliation Project.

that "hard work" was a component of whiteness. Assuming that students are not "logical" and "intelligent" until they obtain an education through a boarding school demonstrates the memory relationship of how white society views Indigenous tribes. Specifically noting that "training in industrial work [is] suited to [the] age and strength of the child" recognizes that these "educators" are aware of the harsh conditions and child labor that they willingly perpetuate, furthering the idea that these schools were never for Indigenous benefit.[243]

Another article about "hard work" appears after the history of Genoa and is conveyed through a retelling of the history and uses of cotton. Mabel Davis, a student, provides a brief synopsis of where the plant has been, from "the Arabians," to Rome, to China, to Europe, to Mexico, and eventually the southern United States. She describes the process of cotton cultivation in depth, stating "that nearly all the work on the plantation is hand labor and is performed by the negroes," whom she describes as "earnest workers."[244] She finishes the article by demonstrating how to cut an apron from cotton cloth, promoting "hard work" alongside racism as values of whiteness.[245] It is highly unlikely that black people producing cotton during this time were "earnest workers" satisfied with their occupation, as most of them may have been formerly enslaved or forced into debt and sharecropping practices. Davis' ignorance means that she was taught a whitewashed idea of the scenario where they were honestly laboring, signifying Genoa's success in implementing values of whiteness. The fact that her essay was published in the paper with values agreeable to white society denotes the memory relationship of how the Genoa staff wanted external white society to view the students. Alternatively, she may

---

[243] "Genoa," 1.
[244] Mabel Davis, "Cotton.," *The Indian News* 9, no. 10 (Jun. 1907): 5, Genoa Indian School Digital Reconciliation Project.
[245] "Cotton.," 5.

demonstrate the memory relationship of how the students view themselves because she aligns with values of whiteness in exuding what values Genoa has taught her.

A final set of articles which center around "hard work" describe the significance of "good" character and intelligence when it comes to a profession. The first article states that successful painters "must be neat and clean, up right and honest, agreeable and gentlemanly," truthful, artistic, and know his profession well.[246] Assuming that someone is only "successful" or "good" based on these qualities is akin to assuming that Indigenous children are not "logical" or "intelligent" if they do not obtain an education from FILS. "Success" and "goodness" are relative qualities, so assuming a binary "civilized" version of each denotes a value of whiteness in the sense that there is a "right" and "wrong" character for students to learn from. The other article about painting compares a "skilled" painter to one who has a lesser skill quality, arguing that being "well prepared" is a necessary quality for an occupation.[247] This article follows suit by assuming a "correct" and "incorrect" standard for an occupation, failing to recognize that people of all skill levels are welcome in the field. It also disregards the fact that people are privileged in having certain amounts of wealth, so having different skill levels to choose from still allow access to certain goods and services.

The first issue of the next volume comes from September 1907, and includes a republished article praising peace instead of war, an article about an Indigenous man preaching Christianity, and a section on how to incorporate and appreciate Indigenous art. Reprinted from *The Nebraska Teacher*, the first article argues that education "should glorify the arts of peace above the art of war" by "[instilling] proper ideals of life and heroism" and differentiating

---

[246] William Sherman, '"The Man Behind the Brush,'" *The Indian News* 9, no. 10 (Jun. 1907): 18, Genoa Indian School Digital Reconciliation Project.
[247] Antoine LaFrinier, "Is Painting a Profession?" *The Indian News* 9, no. 10 (Jun. 1907): 20, Genoa Indian School Digital Reconciliation Project.

between different types of war.[248] The article is deliberately aware of misogyny, stating that as soon as a girl studies history, she regrets "[having] been born a girl" because military glory belongs to boys.[249] This defines western gender roles as values of whiteness because it promotes the dominant white male perspective in the archive. It also perpetuates misogyny by assuming that all girls want to be conquerors and disruptors of life. Interestingly, the article also makes note that patriotism for a country can also be taken to the extreme. However, the article concludes with the idea that the United States can one day be a bringer of peace to "weaker nations" via the "three and a half [million" teachers in the "civilized world."[250] This demonstrates the memory relationship of how the United States government views Indigenous tribes because these teachers in the "civilized world" are all in the FILS education system on behalf of the federal government. The author positions them as saviors of "weaker [Indigenous] nations," portraying the fact that these tribes are not valued unless they conform to "civilization" via values of whiteness.

On the other hand, this next article provides insight into how Indigenous tribe members view themselves and the United States government. "Don't Like Darwin Theory" is "part of the Sermon preached by Rev. C. L. Thomas, [an] Indian evangelist" as part of the "Indian Camp meeting at Northport, Mich."[251] The prelude already keys in the idea that he aligns with Christianity, a value of whiteness, signifying that Thomas exists as a split subject between the two worlds of his Indigenous roots and white alignment. Thomas argues that evolution is the wrong system of belief, starting with the idea that '"Every man…has to acknowledge that Jesus

---

[248] Nathan S. Schaeffer, "What Can the School Do to Aid the Peace Movement," *The Indian News* 10, no. 1 (Sept. 1907): 1-2, Genoa Indian School Digital Reconciliation Project.
[249] "What Can the School," 1.
[250] "What Can the School," 2.
[251] "Don't Like Darwin Theory," *The Indian News* 10, no. 1 (Sept. 1907): 3, Genoa Indian School Digital Reconciliation Project.

Christ came into the world 1900 years ago, in order to make his check valid.”’[252] He uses another example, ‘“In God We Trust,”’ to further the idea that Christianity is the “correct” religion because of the way in which the United States government incorporates Christian ideals within its practices. Thomas overall implores the audience that they are ‘“created in the image of God”’ and meant for more than being evolved from animals.[253] His examples demonstrate the memory relationship of how Indigenous tribes view the United States government because he indirectly praises it for usage of the “correct” religion.

A final article within this issue is reprinted from a speech read by Angel De Cora, an Indigenous teacher at Carlisle. According to the Angel De Cora Memorial Museum and Research Center, she was born around 1869-1871 as a member of the Hōcąk tribe and later became “one of the first nationally known Native American artists.” A graduate of Smith College, De Cora was also “a boarding school survivor, artist, educator, & activist” and her love for Indigenous art and students shines through in this article.[254] De Cora recognizes great value in her students’ work, sharing with the Department of “Indian” Education that “none of their Indian instincts have perished but have only lain dormant” after being “civilized” at Carlisle for many years.[255] She praises their usage of color and design, recognizing “that in order to be a so-called civilized person, he must discard all such barbarisms.”[256] De Cora recognizes that the white community she speaks to finds that Indigenous people are “barbarous,” so defending her students and culture is extraordinarily brave. She expresses the memory relationship of how Indigenous tribes view themselves because of how deeply she aligns with preserving and sharing her culture. As a

---

[252] “Don’t Like,” 3.
[253] “Don’t Like,” 3.
[254] “About Us,” Angel De Cora Memorial Museum and Research Center, accessed 3rd April 2024, https://winnebagotribe.com/angel-decora-museum/.
[255] Angel De Cora, “The Native Indian Art,” *The Indian News* 10, no. 1 (Sept. 1907): 18-19, Genoa Indian School Digital Reconciliation Project.
[256] Angel De Cora, “The Native,” 19.

boarding school survivor herself, her commentary on how these "instincts..[lay] dormant" emphasize FILS' lack of success in culturally wiping out entire nations of peoples, ultimately championing Indigenous resilience.

The next issue comes from January of 1908, and is also the fifth rather than the fourth issue due to a lack of consistency in the archive. This issue's most significant articles include an argument for men's professions, New Year's resolutions for Indigenous students, and an opinion piece on the significance of teaching others selflessly. The first article about men's professions maintains that "The idle man is a dangerous man" and "all labor is honorable."[257] It also subscribes to the idea that boys should be respectful, work honestly, and know the worth of money.[258] These values are part of the individualization process, which deliberately disperses Indigenous culture by teaching students about "hard work" and capitalism as a means to benefit white society. It may also demonstrate the memory relationship of how Genoa staff wants the students to be viewed by external society. Instilling these values into students means that readers will view the school as a successful solution to the "Indian Question," subscribing to the paper and providing profit for Genoa to keep its doors open. If the article was written by one of the student editors, then it may show how some Indigenous students viewed themselves because of the way in which this article aligns strongly with whiteness rather than promoting cultural ties. As for many of these articles, the author remains nameless, so it is most likely written by a white staff member because of the way in which it caters to all "boys" without usage of "we" terminology.

An article about New Year's resolutions is similar in the didactic sense in that it discusses and prescribes how an Indigenous student should behave. It states that a student should "like

---

[257] "A Profession for Our Boys.," *The Indian News* 10, no. 5 (Jan 1908): 1, Genoa Indian School Digital Reconciliation Project.
[258] "A Profession," 1.

[their] work" more than "anything else in the world," maintain a positive attitude, eat slowly, work solely for money rather than morals, stay humble, subscribe to a newspaper focused on individualization and trades, and submit stories to *The Indian News*.[259] These resolutions are not catered to the benefit of students, but rather to the success of Genoa's newspaper and the institution's "civilizing mission." As the article uses "we" terminology for liking work, it is most likely written by an Indigenous student. This article demonstrates the memory relationship of how the students view themselves because of the author's alignment with whiteness despite being an Indigenous student, showing a liminal state of being.

The final significant article in this issue promotes a similar idea of the significance of "hard work" and how to behave with "good" character. It implores readers to "not keep the treasures [of knowledge] gained by experience under a lock of selfishness" because "[a] neighbor would much more enjoy the lesson from the lips of the experienced" rather than read it from a book.[260] This indicates a view that white promoters of boarding schools likely envisioned students to become emissaries to the tribes, dispersing the values learned at boarding schools to their home communities. It concludes with the editor asking for assistance from others since they wish to be successful with the "Farm, Dairy, Garden" section of *The Indian News*. The irony of this article is that it promotes community and assistance, whereas FILS seek to deliberately disperse these values in terms of students' relationships to their tribes. As the editor is most likely a student because of the way in which they use "we" and "us" terminology, this article demonstrates the liminal space that boarding school students inhabited because of the way in

[259] Anna R. Frey, "Editorial.," *The Indian News* 10, no. 5 (Jan. 1908): 7, Genoa Indian School Digital Reconciliation Project.
[260] A. A. Gillette, "Be Helpful.," *The Indian News* 10, no. 5 (Jan. 1908): 16, Genoa Indian School Digital Reconciliation Project.

which the author aligns with both values of whiteness (as taught by Genoa) and their fellow students.

The next issue from this volume comes from March of 1908 and includes articles about boys' manners, a report from the Secretary of the Interior, and a reply to the first article. Centering around boys' manners, this first article by G. Stanley Hall, a noted psychologist and educator, argues against the "good" character that Genoa continuously pushes. Instead, Hall believes that mothers raise boys to be "too soft" and effeminate. He wishes for fathers to "take more personal interest in [their] boys" and proposes multiple solutions of violence in dealing with unruly boys.[261] As opposed to the strict teaching of "manners" and "gentlemanliness" at Genoa, Hall proposes that a small amount of rowdiness is good for a boy's health. He aligns heavily with western gender roles, defining it alongside a strong patriarchy as values of whiteness. Since this article was reprinted from the *Herald* in *The Indian News*, it may demonstrate the memory relationship of how Genoa staff wanted Indigenous children to be perceived, which is a shift from previous "upright" teachings.

The second article demonstrates the memory relationship of how the United States government views Indigenous children because of the way in which the Secretary of the Interior acknowledges the lack of success of off-reservation FILS. The report states that "The experiment of placing Indian children in schools far removed from their natural surroundings has not been a success," which is the first time in any of these newspapers where a negative perception of boarding schools expressed by a United States government was published.[262] It also makes note of how "the moment an Indian had his land alloted to him he became a citizen of the United

---

[261] G. Stanley Hall, "Feminization of Boys," *The Indian News* 10, no. 7 (Mar. 1908): 1-2, Genoa Indian School Digital Reconciliation Project.
[262] "The following is from the Secretary of the Interior's Report for the Fiscal year ending in June '07," *The Indian News* 10, no. 7 (Mar. 1908): 18, Genoa Indian School Digital Reconciliation Project.

States" as of "nineteen years prior to May 8, 1906."[263] The author most likely meant that Indigenous peoples should act like proper United States citizens from the moment the federal government allowed itself to divide their land, even if tribes did not yet have access to United States citizenship. In Carlisle's newspapers, it was still debated as to whether or not Indigenous people should become United States citizens. This is yet another shift in the way in which the "Indian Question" has been answered by the United States government. Instead of pushing for off-reservation boarding schools like Carlisle, the Commissioner feels it most beneficial to educate the students in these "civilizing" institutions on reservations, taking more space from Indigenous communities. This demonstrates how the United States government views Indigenous students and tribes as a whole because of the way in which they still want to "civilize" them for white benefit despite recognizing that answers to the "Indian Question" have not "worked."

The final significant article within this issue is a woman's response to the first article, "Feminization of Boys." Alice Stone Blackwell, a leader in the women's suffrage movement, argues against G. Stanley Hall, "[laughing]" at the suggestion that the teaching of manners to boys endangers their "manliness."[264] She recognizes his misogyny in the sense that he blames women for the actions of men, and believes his judgement to be "seriously discounted" because of the way in which he fails to recognize that the fight for equal opportunities is not '"of sex against sex,"' but of both regressive men and women against progressive men and women.[265] It is interesting that Genoa would publish a feminist article within their paper, as the institution has frequently been pro-patriarchy. There is a chance that they only recognize Blackwell's response

[263] "The following," 18.
[264] Alice Stone Blackwell, "Feminization of Boys: A reply to Dr. Stanley Hall's Opinion," *The Indian News* 10, no. 7 (Mar. 1908): Genoa Indian School Digital Reconciliation Project.
[265] Alice Stone Blackwell, "Feminization of Boys: A reply," 24.

because of the way in which Hall argued for rowdiness in boys, which would not conform to Genoa's values of "good" character. This article affirms that Indigenous students do not exist within a vacuum that grapples solely with their tribal identity, but rather one that opens them up to intersectional struggles.

The final issue in this volume comes from June of 1908 and includes articles about Booker T. Washington's speech to students, letters from former students at Genoa, and the annual Commencement festivities. Booker T. Washington, activist and educator, gave a speech to his Tuskegee students urging them to continue their "hard work" over the summer. He feels "that all kinds of idleness is a disgrace" and implores them "to help in any department of activity that [their] parents may be interested."[266] The original speech is directed towards black Americans attending his school, and he also encourages them to attend church regularly.[267] Since this speech is reprinted in *The Indian News*, it illustrates the similarities between boarding schools and Washington's emphasis on "industrial education" for African Americans. That said, printing an article by a prominent black figure is a departure from the typical anti-black articles. In this way, it marks an important departure by exposing students to a current in black opinions and thoughts.

A second significant section in this issue contains letters from former Genoa students written to the institution. Many students report continuation of their trade, success of finding occupations within white society, and positive marriage prospects. Leon L. Poitras reports of his successes as a teacher in passing "the examination for Industrial teacher," as a man who "still [works] at [his] trade [of harness making] sometimes," and as a husband with a wife who "graduated at Riggs Institute."[268] Clarence Fisher reports of his successes in continuing his "Shoe

---

[266] "Planning for the Summer Vacation: Booker T. Washington's Sunday Evening talk to the Students at Tuskegee, Ala.," *The Indian News* 10, no. 10 (Jun. 1908): 1-2, Genoa Indian School Digital Reconciliation Project.
[267] "Planning for the Summer," 3.

Maker trade," marrying a Martha Payer who "was at Genoa School a year," and having two children who "can not speak Indian."[269] None of the published excerpts bare ill-will towards Genoa, which is most likely skewed in favor of the success of the institution in "civilizing" Indigenous children. This represents the memory relationship of how Indigenous students view themselves because they condemn "Indian" ways of living and align heavily with values of whiteness. However, Edw. L. Hatchett feels that "[They] Indians have just as good a chance as whites," and his "we" terminology places him in a liminal space in both worlds of white and Indigenous.

The annual Commencement festivities at Genoa also promote similar values of whiteness and the memory relationship of how white society views Indigenous tribes as a whole. The program features prayer, a band concert, a play, and numerous varying industrial trade demonstrations given by students. The *Genoa Leader* reported that "exhibits in the school rooms were excellent and spoke highly of both pupil and instructor," agreeing with the Superintendent that 1908 "has been one of the most successful years in the history of the school."[270] A celebration of student accomplishment for graduation is uniform in all instructions, though specifically demonstrating industrial trades may express the memory relationship of how white society views students. In solely wanting to express Genoa's success in "civilizing" Indigenous students, they may be viewed as commodities to be consumed because of how curious it is for spectators to truly believe that "civilizing" work can be done.

The first issue in the final volume comes from September of 1908 and includes articles linking "good" character with success and Christianity, thoughts from the National Education

---

[268] "The following are extracts from letters received from ex-pupils of this school.," *The Indian News* 10, no. 10 (Jun. 1908): 4, Genoa Indian School Digital Reconciliation Project.
[269] "The following," 5.
[270] "Commencement.," *The Indian News* 10, no. 10 (Jun. 1908): 13-14, Genoa Indian School Digital Reconciliation Project.

Association (NEA), and the translation of Indigenous folk songs. Originally preached by Reverend J. Parker at the Congregational church, this reprinted excerpt from his sermon emphasizes the role of schools in maintaining "good" character as determined by Christian standards. He believes that "the character of [a nation's] citizens is [her] most valuable asset," and this character is based off of the idea that "the sacred and the secular are one," meaning that labor, good moral character, and religion are all necessary teachings.[271] Linking Christianity with a "right" way to act aligns with both Genoa's and Carlisle's definitions of whiteness.

An article about the NEA's meeting follows a similar definition of whiteness because of the way in which it defines "good" character as a measure of FILS' successes. The NEA adopted principles that Indigenous students should *not* be taught about the Bible in a theological sense, "but as a master-piece of literature." The NEA also proposed that indigenous students should be taught in morals and ethics and "essential subjects," and that courses should be adapted to pupils' needs.[272] It is most interesting that the Bible and its values have been previously pushed in a theological rather than literary sense, possibly noting a shift in the way in which "success" is defined for Indigenous students. However, defining a correct way for Indigenous student to learn as linked with Christianity regardless defines the religion as a value of whiteness. This article may also represent the memory relationship of how Genoa staff views Indigenous students because they are more compassionate to the needs of pupils and their identity, rather than strictly conforming to values of whiteness. This marks one of the first hints that schools are starting to shift toward Indigenous rather than white benefit, but they are still terribly lacking.

---

[271] Rev. J. Parker, "Education.," *The Indian News* 11, no. 1 (Sept. 1908): 1-2, Genoa Indian School Digital Reconciliation Project.
[272] E. L. Fisher, "Notes from the N. E. A.," *The Indian News* 11, no. 1 (Sept. 1908): 3, Genoa Indian School Digital Reconciliation Project.

A unique article translating Winnebago folk songs is the final significant piece within this issue. Reprinted from *The Pender Times*, it recounts an interview of Oliver Lamere from the Winnebago tribe and the role in translating his tribe's folk songs and important speeches into a written language. When interviewed, he dissuades the stereotypes that he is afraid of "automobiles," and the author of the article notes him as "one of the most cultured and accomplished members of the tribe" because "he speaks perfect English."[273] It has been mentioned in other articles that federal officials feel it a "shame" to erase Indigenous culture, but in the sense that they would performatively pity the consequences of their own actions. As Lamere is from the Winnebago tribe, archiving his own oral histories demonstrates the memory relationship of how Indigenous tribes view themselves because of how he appreciates his roots yet adapts to the white world via English literacy. The author of the article does promote values of whiteness despite Lamere's identity because of the way in which it calls him "the most cultured" due to his English literacy; equating "refinement" with the English language.

The second issue in this volume comes from December of 1908, and includes articles about the profits of off-reservation boarding schools, Indigenous education legislation, and a racist segment promoting "othering" to Indigenous students. The first article recognizes "[differences] of opinion as to whether non-reservation schools…are profitable for the government or of permanent benefit to those there educated."[274] The author gives the example of the Nez Perce tribe becoming "civilized" with a constitution, and hopes that as they continue their efforts to become "civilized," they will "drop the somewhat contemptuous name of Pierced Noses and be known by a more dignified title."[275] This viewpoint demonstrates the memory

---

[273] "Oliver Lamere.," *The Indian News* 11, no. 1 (Sept. 1908): 11, Genoa Indian School Digital Reconciliation Project.
[274] "Indian Education in Practice.," *The Indian News* 11, no. 4 (Dec. 1908), 5, Genoa Indian School Digital Reconciliation Project.

relationship of how white society views Indigenous tribes because of how the Nez Perce are seen as "inferior" to white people unless they fully conform to the "civilizing mission," name changes and all.

The second article within this issue continues white opinions on Indigenous matters by questioning the efficiency of the FILS system and proposes reformation by allotting funds and integrating white and Indigenous children. The "Staff Correspondent" states how the Oklahoma delegation realizes "that the fullblood Indian children are not, and cannot successfully be educated in the public schools of the state under the present system."[276] This is another rare recognition of the United States' government failure to implement the FILS system to the extent that they wanted to. Instead, the solution to keeping students in school is making "Indians who are competent…would be required to attend white schools" to maintain their learned white values.[277] Earlier conflicts demonized Indigenous tribes for mingling with white society in terms of marriage and occupational opportunity. In integrating Indigenous and white students, this shift in perspective may represent a more tolerant white society, though they are integrating students for the wrong reasons. Instead, this represents the memory relationship of how the United States government views Indigenous tribes because of how this integration is for the benefit of maintaining white values, not the privileged access to better education within white schools.

A final excerpt within this issue illustrates that Indigenous students did not exist within a vacuum of FILS, but faced intersectional issues that were heightened with exposure to values of whiteness. This excerpt promotes "othering," and hints at the racism learned in these schools. In this interaction, "an old negress [called] to a piccaninny" who had run off, and this was

---

[275] "Indian Education," 6.
[276] Staff Correspondent, "Indian Schools Under One System," *The Indian News* 11, no. 4 (Dec. 1908): 9, Genoa Indian School Digital Reconciliation Project.
[277] Staff Correspondent, "Indian Schools," 9.

overheard by a young woman who asked the child's name. The other woman proudly proclaimed "Yessum, de chile's full name is Eczema."[278] It is unclear as to whether this excerpt was written by Indigenous students or white staff, though it was most likely read by students. Seeing as the excerpt is a product of its environment and written with other "jokes," it infers that racism is discussed at Genoa. Though there may have been anti-black racism within the tribes, it could also have been taught by the teachers at Genoa since a history of taught racism resides within the schools, defining racism as a value of whiteness and possibly a larger patter as a whole. This excerpt may also represent the memory relationship of how the staff see the students because of their prejudice towards other races; if they see themselves as superior to black people, then white people may also view the students and their tribes as inferior.

The third issue within this volume comes from March of 1909 and includes articles about being owed a living, Indigenous tribes and alcohol, and an eventful marriage at Carlisle. Reprinted from *Success Magazine*, the first article opens with a boy being questioned by the court as to why he stole eight dollars. His response was that '"the world owes [him] a living,"' to which the author argues that idleness is a "[deformity]" which gives a man "selfish, coarse, animal pleasure" instead of "the higher satisfaction which [comes] from doing the work of a real man in the world."[279] This demonstrates the value of "hard work" because of the way in which the author diminishes people who do not engage in it. The author does not account for those who must steal for a living because they are not privileged enough to have a job or home, portraying a limited perspective that does not show empathy for impoverished communities. They also link Christianity with this "hard work," stating that "the Creator has put an enormous penalty on

[278] "Ma Meant Well, Anyway.," *The Indian News* 11, no. 4 (Dec. 1908): 20, Genoa Indian Digital Reconciliation Project.
[279] "Does the World Owe you a Living.," *The Indian News* 11, no. 7 (Mar. 1909): 1-3, Genoa Indian School Digital Reconciliation Project.

idleness…of weakness, of deterioration, of destruction, of annihilation."[280] The article as a whole demonstrates the memory relationship of how Genoa staff views the students and wants them to be viewed due to the enforcement of "hard work" as being a good person.

The second article in this issue recounts an Indigenous man's thoughts on alcohol usage. Chief "Macketepenassy" of the Ottawa tribe, or Andrew J. Blackbird, feels that '"The greatest harm is done to [Indigenous tribes] by the white man's poison of intoxicating liquor."'[281] He also makes the statement that '"[Indigenous] lives are just as precious and sweet to us as to any Caucasian race"' despite their darker skin color, and that it pains him to see both '"white or Indian"' brothers under the effects of alcohol.[282] Blackbird recognizes the deliberate method of control that white settlers have historically enacted upon Indigenous tribes, yet still feels sympathy for the white people who are affected by it. His words demonstrate the memory relationship of how Indigenous tribes view themselves, as well as white society because of his sympathy for both his people and others.

This final noteworthy article recounts the eventful marriage of Joseph Twin from the Winnebago tribe and Lystia Wahoo of the Cherokee tribe. After falling in love during Twin's baseball game at Carlisle, the two later planned their elopement which was frowned upon by the authorities. This article quotes Twin's recollection of the story, sharing everything from the '"big red touring car"' that carried them to their destinations to Twin's plans of '"going back to [Wahoo's] people to live."'[283] Twin recalls '"the police of Philadelphia…scouring the city in search of [them]."'[284] Authorities were sent after them because they wanted students to finish

---

[280] "Does the World," 3.
[281] "The effects of alcohol upon the Indian Character.," *The Indian News* 11, no. 7 (Mar. 1909): 14, Genoa Indian School Digital Reconciliation Project.
[282] "The effects of alcohol," 14.
[283] "Indian Romance Story.," *The Indian News* 11, no. 7 (Mar. 1909): 7, Genoa Indian School Digital Reconciliation Project.
[284] "Indian Romance.," 7.

their education at FILS before getting married and settling down. Previous articles have emphasized the significance of educated Indigenous people marrying others to promote values of whiteness back on reservations. As Twin was a student of Carlisle for many years, and the article infers that Wahoo was as well, this may speak to the institution's success in teaching values of whiteness. It also represents Carlisle's widespread influence because of how popular the school is, even out in Nebraska, since the article was published in Genoa's paper. This may demonstrate the memory relationship of how the United States government views Indigenous people because Twin and wahoo's elopement is only not supported because she refused to finish the teachings that would "civilize" her. The author's statement assumes that United States authorities would not pursue her if she had finished the program at Carlisle, therefore viewing her as "inferior" or a dissenter.

The final volume of *The Indian News* is from June of 1909 and includes articles about a former Carlisle student attending a luncheon with United States government officials, a student's essay describing how her tribe used to live, and the changing of imagery on currency. The first article commends Alexander B. Upshaw for his success in accepting "civilization" and ability to gather information from various tribes. According to the article, his contributions to historical work are "unparalleled" due to his "knowledge of the ways of the white man" learned at Carlisle and his background as the "son of one of the most noted warriors of the Crow Indian tribe."[285] This enables him to feasibly gather and archive information from various tribes alongside photographer Edward S. Curtis. Upshaw is also described by the author as "a splendid specimen of aboriginal manhood," which dehumanizes him as something to be looked at and filed away rather than a historian making great strides in archiving tribal histories.[286] This article

[285] "E. S. Curtis Entertains Carlisle Man.," *The Indian News* 11, no. 10 (Jun. 1909): 1, Genoa Indian School Digital Reconciliation Project.

demonstrates the memory relationship of how white society and the United States government view Indigenous tribes because of the commendation of Upshaw's white values alongside the diminishment of his identity.

The second article is an essay written by Genoa student Mary L. Rutledge, and she recalls what life was like before school when she lived with her tribe, the "Piegan," a part of the Blackfoot Confederacy or, as the paper puts it, "the Blackfeet Indian tribe." Rutledge prefaces with the fact that her reservation is in the process of being "allotted" and then "thrown open" so that her tribe "can not depend upon the government all the time."[287] She also proclaims her disappointment should FILS be "abolished." Rutledge continues by describing her childhood memories, sharing the process of women erecting wigwams, the simple meals that "do not consist of as many courses as they do in the homes of [her] white friends," how to dry meat in the summer, and what clothing looked like.[288] Rutledge's essay demonstrates the memory relationship of how Indigenous students view themselves because of the way in which she recognizes her roots and uses possessive terminology of "our" when determining white people as friends. She then exists in a liminal space of both worlds.

The final article in this volume is about the erasure of Indigenous imagery on United States currency. The unnamed author describes how "the eagle, buffalo, and Indian are to be banished from…banknotes…almost as ruthlessly as they were banished from their early haunts in years gone by."[289] They continue by listing which United States government official will appear on each bill or coin. Though the author believes the transition to be "the result of a desire

---

[286] "E. S. Curtis," 1.
[287] Mary L. Rutledge, '"My People in the Early Days,"' *The Indian News* 11, no. 10 (Jun. 1909): 3, Genoa Indian School Digital Reconciliation Project.
[288] Mary L. Rutledge, '"My People,"' 5.
[289] "No More Indian," *The Indian News* 11, no. 10 (Jun. 1909): 18, Genoa Indian School Digital Reconciliation Project.

for uniformity and simplicity of design" as well as being more difficult to counterfeit, the author's recognition of stolen lands may align with the idea that the coinage was changed to further erase Indigenous culture.[290] The event demonstrates the memory relationship of how the United States government views Indigenous people because the "uniformity" denotes "assimilation" tactics consistently used to control Indigenous people. The author's recognition of cultural dispersal may also situate them in a liminal space because they do not explicitly praise the federal changes to the currency either.

Genoa's paper *The Indian News* succeeds in maintaining preestablished values of whiteness as dictated by Carlisle's *The School News* and *The Morning Star*. These values include Christianity, "hard work," "good" character, self-help, racism, western gender roles, and English literacy. Though *The Indian News* expresses similar memory relationships to *The School News* and *The Morning Star*, it also presents a shift in answers to the "Indian Question." Students continued to exist within a liminal space by acknowledging their Indigenous roots while aligning with values of whiteness. The United States government only viewed students and Indigenous tribes as "useful" or having "value" if they conformed to values of whiteness and provided for the economy. Genoa staff viewed their students in a similar manner as the United States government and wanted to be perceived as successful in the "civilizing mission" because of the positive content they published in favor of values of whiteness. Students at Genoa did not exist within a vacuum and were privy to intersectional experiences in terms of race, class, and gender. Whereas Carlisle newspapers debated as to whether educating Indigenous children was the most effective way to culturally disperse tribes and forcibly assimilate them into white society, *The Indian News* concluded that education through FILS was effective to a certain extent and focused a shift toward on-reservation boarding schools to maintain values of whiteness closer to home.

---

[290] "No More," 18.

The newspaper also indicated that public thought was now focused on Indigenous access to United States citizenship and the same rights as white United States citizens.

Conclusion

Analysis of *The School News*, *The Morning Star*, and *The Indian News* ultimately demonstrates shared trends in Indigenous experience during their attendance of FILS. It also recognizes a shift in answers to the "Indian Question" as the United States government increases self-awareness in the flawed efficiency of their "civilizing mission." To be "civilized" is to conform to values of whiteness, and these values are consistently defined throughout each newspaper.

Values of whiteness included Christianity, English literacy, "hard work" and labor through individualization, western gender roles, racism, nationalism, and white supremacy. FILS

idolized these values for a "successful" white United States society, making them synonymous with the "civilizing" mission. Deliberately dispersing Indigenous tribes and indoctrinating them through these institutions was a method of cultural genocide as enacted by the United States government. These values set the boundaries of how each group perceived one another, emphasizing memory relationships. The impact of Christianity within FILS cannot be neglected, as even the Pope recognized the great depth to which it affected the structure of Canadian boarding schools. The same has not yet been done for United States FILS.[291]

Students existed within a liminal space by viewing themselves as part of their tribe and aligning with values of whiteness taught by FILS. The greater a student condemned Indigenous ways, the more successful a boarding school was in impressing values of whiteness upon them. Whereas a student may align more with whiteness or with their tribe, the majority of them existed within two worlds. This memory relationship was determined through terminology of "us" and "we" in referencing peers and tribes, positive content about tribes or values of whiteness, and the prevalence of this content published or referenced by students.

Staff at each of these institutions wanted students to be perceived as successful, "civilized," and "white." They wanted external white society to see that students could be educated and determined "useful" to the United States by conforming to values of whiteness and disposing of tribal values. This memory relationship was determined by excessive content published that highlights student success in conforming to values of whiteness, staff commendation of student behaviors that reinforce these values, and articles about visitors to these schools as well as student field trips to other places.

---

[291] The Associated Press, "Pope Francis issues an historic apology for 'devastating' school abuses in Canada," *NPR*, July 25, 2022, accessed April 28, 2024, https://www.npr.org/2022/07/25/1113378991/pope-apology-canada-indigenous-schools.

Students viewed the staff at Carlisle in a fairly positive light. This memory relationship may not have been as established because of the lack of first-person student observation, though students did not seem to mind staff except for a general distaste of authority at times. Though there were many excerpts in the later staff influenced *The Morning Star* and *The Indian News*, these pieces seemed moreso pointed at relatives of FILS staff to keep up with their lives rather than students genuinely interested in their teachers' lives. This memory relationship was determined by how often newspapers published content about FILS staff, and how they spoke on behalf of students about staff lives.

FILS staff seemed to view the children in a similar manner to the United States government. If they successfully conformed to values of whiteness and were making genuine progress in the name of "civilization," staff encouraged students to do well and valued them. This memory relationship was determined by articles written by staff that praised students for their efforts in demonstrating values of whiteness.

Students viewed their families in similar ways to how they viewed themselves. Many of them were homesick and felt lonely because of the deliberate cultural dispersion they experienced, establishing an emotional connection of how much they cared for their families. Others welcomed their education, imploring their own families to follow Christianity and take up agriculture. Regardless of whether their families conformed to values of whiteness, students genuinely cared about their families and wished them well. This memory relationship was determined by letters exchanged between students and their families and the excerpts taken from them. It is significant to remember that students were made to write to their families in English; otherwise they would be unable to communicate with their loved ones.

Indigenous families, specifically parents of the students, were often concerned for the wellbeing of their children. Parents recognized the growing white encroachment and urged their children to attend FILS because they felt it was the only way to survive in a changing world. Whereas some parents wanted their children to succeed in a white society, others were against the attendance of their children and the erasure of Indigenous traditions and values. They loved their children, and prioritized their safety above all else. This memory relationship was determined by letters exchanged between parents and students, speeches given by Indigenous tribe members, and the beliefs about values of whiteness expressed in each.

The United States government viewed Indigenous tribes and students as useful only if they conformed to values of whiteness and peacefully cooperated with their deliberate cultural dispersal. Otherwise, they were viewed as inferior and excluded from white society. This memory relationship was determined by the way in which government officials and those adjacent to their positions discussed Indigenous matters and how they praised values of whiteness.

Indigenous tribes viewed the United States government as an oppressive threat to their livelihoods. They rightly did not welcome the federal intrusion into their daily lives, and only conformed to its demands when they were forced to do so. The lack of citizenship and continuous belittlement of Indigenous identity even when conforming strongly to values of whiteness portrays the unreasonable expectations of the United States government impressed upon tribes and their ability to hold value for white society. This memory relationship is determined by speeches and reports given by government officials and reprinted in newspapers.

A final memory relationship is adjacent to how the United States government views Indigenous people, and that is how ordinary white society viewed Indigenous tribes. Though

some may have strongly been divided and conformed to values of whiteness, others recognized that the issue may not have been as black and white and felt that the government could have been doing a much better job in answering the "Indian Question." This memory relationship emerged in articles and excerpts from non-government individuals discussing their experiences with Indigenous students or tribes.

Support from all types of people is necessary in successfully processing the full extent of this part of United States history. The longstanding history of oppression in this country cannot be reversed, only reconciled with, and Indigenous people in power and accurate education of their struggles is crucial to reconcile with this part of United States history. Current Secretary of the Interior Deb Haaland's "Federal Indian Boarding School Investigative Report" is the first step in emphasizing the destructive nature of FILS and their grave depth in impacting Indigenous communities. Whereas the report calls these institutions "Federal Indian Boarding Schools" or FIBS, it is necessary to recognize that these schools were rooted in whiteness and forced labor upon their students. "Forced Indigenous Labor Schools" not only decolonizes the terminology, but it better encompasses the rough "individualization" process that students were made to take part in.

The recent Investigative Report is part of Secretary Haaland's "Federal Indian Boarding School Initiative," which aims to '"address the inter-generational impact of Indian boarding schools to shed light on unspoken traumas of the past."' Principal Deputy Assistant Secretary for Indian Affairs and citizen of the Bay Mills Indian Community (Objibwe), Bryand Newland, adds that they wish to '"engage in Tribal consultation on how best to use this information, protect burial sites, and respect families and communities."[292] The report accounts for 408 boarding

schools across 431 sites from 1819-1969, and provides summaries, classifications, and locations for each.[293] Initial analysis of these institutions finds that approximately 19 FILS accounted for more than 500 child deaths.[294] The report also recognizes a total of 53 marked or unmarked burial sites at school locations, with sites subject to change as further investigations occur.[295] Though not every school reported death in their newspaper, Carlisle and Genoa often reported the passing of students and illness in their excerpts detailing internal affairs. Children were forced to work long hours in the trades they were assigned for "individualization" purposes, making their weary bodies more susceptible to disease. It may not have been as prevalent, but that means roughly 5% of FILS accounted for over 500 deaths. Thousands of other tragedies may then lay silent in the archive, and this does not account for more than 1,000 federal and non-federal institutions that may have impressed these same values on Indigenous children as methods of cultural genocide.[296]

The report provides solutions for reconciling with the horrors that occurred within these schools and the intergenerational trauma and health issues inflicted upon FILS families. It proposes efforts such as: further investigation and archival of Indigenous voices, the protection and voluntary identification of survivors to provide a safe environment for processing and communication, preservation of FILS sites, creation of a centralized record system to feasibly access FILS information, engagement of other federal agencies to support the "Federal Indian

---

[292] "Secretary Haaland Announces Federal Indian Boarding School Initiative," U. S. Department of the Interior, accessed April 21, 2024, https://www.doi.gov/pressreleases/secretary-haaland-announces-federal-indian-boarding-school-initiative. Haaland is a member of the Pueblo tribe.
[293] Bryan Newland, U.S. Bureau of Indian Affairs, *Federal Indian Boarding School Initiative Investigative Report*, Deb Haaland and Bryan Newland, Volume 1, Washington, D.C.: May 2022, p. 6, https://www.bia.gov/sites/default/files/dup/inline-files/bsi_investigative_report_may_2022_508.pdf. Accessed April 21, 2024.
[294] Bryan Newland, U.S. Bureau of Indian Affairs, *Federal Indian Boarding School Initiative Investigative Report*, p. 9.
[295] Bryan Newland, U.S. Bureau of Indian Affairs, *Federal Indian Boarding School Initiative Investigative Report*, p. 86.
[296] Bryan Newland, U.S. Bureau of Indian Affairs, *Federal Indian Boarding School Initiative Investigative Report*, p. 87.

Boarding School Initiative," advance the revitalization of Indigenous languages, promote Indigenous health research, and erect a federal memorial recognizing the impact of FILS on generations of children and their families.[297] As compared to Canada, the United States would do well to implement a centralized archive like the National Centre for Truth and Reconciliation, which "was charged [by the Truth and Reconciliation Commission] to listen to Survivors, their families, communities, and others affected by the residential system" to educate Canadians and feasibly maintain boarding school records and oral histories in one place.[298]

Currently, the United States does not have a National Day for Truth and Reconciliation for Indigenous survivors of schools like Canada does. Though some states do recognize Indigenous People's Day, the federally recognized holiday on that same date is Columbus Day. Why celebrate a colonizer? What holds the United States back from providing a space for reconciliation for those who need it? The federal government has taken a step in the right direction by implementing the Native American Graves Protection and Repatriation Act (NAGPRA), which requires federal agencies and institutions that receive federal funds to return remains and other cultural items back to their appropriate parties.[299] This protects the burial sites in the ongoing Investigative Report, as well as burial mounds.[300]

Though it is not federally recognized, the National Native American Boarding School Healing Coalition (NABS) is a growing nonprofit organization "whose purpose is to advocate on behalf of Native peoples impacted by U.S. Indian boarding school policies."[301] In February of 2024 they introduced a bill into the House that is currently being prepared for a Senate vote. If

---

[297] Bryan Newland, U. S. Bureau of Indian Affairs, *Federal Indian Boarding School Investigative Report*, pp. 97-99.
[298] "About NCTR," National Centre for Truth and Reconciliation," accessed April 26, 2024, https://nctr.ca/.
[299] "Getting Started," Native American Graves Protection and Repatriation Act, National Park Service, accessed April 22, 2024, https://www.nps.gov/subjects/nagpra/getting-started.htm.
[300] Christen Mucher, *Before American History: Nationalist Mythmaking and Indigenous Dispossession* (Charlottesville: University of Virginia Press, 2022). JSTOR.
[301] "About NABS," The National Native American Boarding School Healing Coalition, accessed April 22, 2024, https://boardingschoolhealing.org/.

passed, it would establish a federal Truth and Healing Commission that would follow many of the reconciliation methods the Investigative Report proposed. NABS is one of several indigenous rights organizations, including Landback and Missing and Murdered Indigenous Women (MMIW), that have sought to connect history to contemporary issues.

The memory relationships determined in this essay seek to highlight the many interactions between students, their families, the United States government, and white society that existed simultaneously within FILS. Examining the way in which interactions in memory were defined by values of whiteness recognize that the United States government has never had the interests of Indigenous people at heart, and that FILS alongside other solutions to the "Indian Question" have always been for the benefit of white society. An imperialist empire has no excuse for generations of lasting harm, and by acknowledging North American Indigenous claims to land and their historical oppression, so too should the struggles of Native Hawaiians and Alaskans as well as occupied "territories" be seen.

Archives

Carlisle Indian School Digital Resource Center

The School News (1880-1883)

The Morning Star (1883-1886)

Genoa Indian School Digital Reconciliation Project

The Indian News (1906-1909)

Bibliography

Adams, David Wallace. *Education for Extinction: American Indians and the Boarding School Experience, 1875-1928*. Lawrence: University Press of Kansas, 2020.

Almeida, Deirdre A. "The Hidden Half: A History of Native American Women's Education." *Harvard Educational Review* 67, no. 4 (Winter: 1997) 757-772. Harvard Education

Publishing Group.

Angel De Cora Memorial Museum and Research Center. “About Us.” Accessed April 3, 2024. https://winnebagotribe.com/angel-decora-museum/.

Bauer, Brooke, and Elizabeth Ellis. “Indigenous, Native American, or American Indian? The Limitations of Broad Terms.” *Journal of the Early Republic* 43, no. 1 (Spring 2023): 61-74, project MUSE.

Brodbeck, Carsten. “Publications of the Carlisle Indian Industrial School.” *Gardner Digital Library*, www.gardnerlibrary.org/encylopedia/publications-carlisle-indian-industrial-school.

Brooks, Brad. “Burial sites found at 53 Native American boarding schools, U.S. government says.” *Reuters*, May 11, 2022.

Brunhouse, R. L. “Apprenticeship for Civilization: The Outing System at the Carlisle Indian School.” In *Educational Outlook*, 1-9. U.S.A.: University of Pennsylvania, 1939.

CBC News. “Residential school survivor Dennis Saddleman shares poem about his experience.” YouTube, September 30, 2022, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=uD2ysbp8708.

Child, Brenda J. *Boarding School Seasons: American Indian Families, 1900-1940*. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1998.

Churchill, Ward. *Kill the Indian, Save the Man: The Genocidal Impact of American Residential Schools*. San Francisco: City Light Books, 2004.

Clements, William M. *Native American Folklore in Nineteenth-Century Periodicals*. Athens, Ohio: Ohio University Press, 1986.

DeLay, Brian. “Indian Polities, Empire, and the History of American Foreign Relations.” *Diplomatic History* 39, no. 5 (November 2015): 927-942. JSTOR.

Emery, Jacqueline, ed. *Recovering Native American Writings in the Boarding School Press*. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2017.

"Excerpt from the text of the 1881 confession of Charles Guiteau, who assassinated President James A. Garfield." Columbia University. Accessed April 27, 2024, p. 4-14. https://dp.la/primary-source-sets/patronage-and-populism-the-politics-of-the-gilded-age/sources/963. HathiTrust.

Fischbacher, Theodore. "A Study of the Role of the Federal Government in the Education of the American Indian." PhD diss., Arizona State University, 1967.

Frank, Andrew K. "Five Civilized Tribes." Oklahoma Historical Society, The Encyclopedia of Oklahoma History and Culture. Accessed April 28, 2024, https://www.okhistory.org/publications/enc/entry?entry=FI011.

Government of Canada. "National Day for Truth and Reconciliation." Last modified November 1, 2023, https://www.canada.ca/en/canadian-heritage/campaigns/national-day-truth-reconciliation.html.

Guyatt, Nicholas. *Bind Us Apart: How Enlightened Americans Invented Racial Segregation*. New York: Basic Books, 2016.

Hungry Wolf, Adolf and Beverly. *Children of the Sun: Stories by and About Indian Kids*. New York: William Morrow and Company Inc., 1987.

Mandell, Daniel R. '"Turned Their Minds to Religion.'" *Early American Studies, An Interdisciplinary Journal* 11, no. 2 (Spring 2013): 211-242. EBSCOhost.

Mickleburgh, Rod. “The Monster, a Poem for National Indigenous Peoples Day.” Wordpress, June 21, 2021. https://mickleblog.wordpress.com/2021/06/21/the-monster-a-poem-for-national-indigenous-peoples-day/.

Morrow, Julie. “Adapting Against Assimilation: Recovering Anishinaabe Student Writings in Carlisle Indian School Periodicals, 1904-1918.” *Australasian Journal of American Studies* 40, no. 2 (December 2021): 71-102. JSTOR.

Mucher, Christen. *Before American History: Nationalist Mythmaking and Indigenous Dispossession*. Charlottesville: University of Virginia Press, 2022.

National Centre for Truth and Reconciliation. “About Us.” Accessed April 26, 2024.

National Park Service. “Getting Started.” Native American Graves Protection and Repatriation Act. Accessed April 22, 2024. https://www.nps.gov/subjects/nagpra/getting-started.htm.

Newland, Bryan and Deb Haaland. U.S. Bureau of Indian Affairs. *Federal Indian Boarding School Initiative Investigative Report: List of Federal Indian Boarding Schools*. Volume 1, Washington, D.C. (May 2022): 1-435. https://www.bia.gov/sites/default/files/dup/inline-files/appendix_a_b_school_listing_profiles_508.pdf. Accessed January 22, 2024.

Newland, Bryan and Deb Haaland. U.S. Bureau of Indian Affairs. *Federal Indian Boarding School Initiative Investigative Report*. Volume 1, Washington, D.C. (May 2022): 1-106. https://www.bia.gov/sites/default/files/dup/inline-files/bsi_investigative_report_may_2022_508.pdf. Accessed April 21, 2024.

Peshkin, Alan. *Places of Memory: Whiteman’s Schools and Native American Communities*. New

Jersey: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Inc, 1997.

Pratt, Captain Richard Henry. "The Advantages of Mingling Indians with Whites." *Proceedings of the National Conference of Charities and Correction at the Nineteenth Annual Session Held in Denver, Col.* (June 23-29, 1892) ed. Isabel C. Barrows. Boston: Press of Geo. H. Ellis, 1892.

The Associated Press. "Pope Francis issues an historic apology for 'devastating' school abuses in Canada." *NPR*, July 25, 2022.

The National Native American Boarding School Healing Coalition. "About NABS." Accessed April 22, 2024. https://boardingschoolhealing.org/.

Unger, Steven, ed. *The Destruction of American Indian Families*. New York: Association on

American Indian Affairs, 1978. U.S Department of the Interior. "Secretary Deb Haaland." Accessed April 24, 2024. https://www.doi.gov/secretary-deb-haaland.

U.S. Department of the Interior. "Secretary Haaland Announces Federal Indian Boarding School Initiative." Accessed April 21, 2024. https://www.doi.gov/pressreleases/secretary-haaland-announces-federal-indian-boarding-school-initiative.