ABSTRACT

Title of Dissertation: THE UNHEALED WOUND: CONTEMPORARY BLACK DIASPORIC LITERATURE AND THE CONTINUING MEMORY OF THE DUVALIER DICTATORSHIP

Norrell Edwards, Doctor of Philosophy, 2019

Dissertation directed by: Professor, Peter Mallios, English
Professor, Valérie K. Orlando, French

In the 1990s, as Haiti continued to withstand the aftershocks of the end of a 29 year father-son dictatorship, the United States and France hovered in the periphery to "help" Haiti's transition to democracy. World systems theory dictates that a country like Haiti would be relegated to the periphery while countries like the United States and France inhabit the core. *The Unhealed Wound: Contemporary Black Diasporic Literature and the Continuing Memory of the Duvalier Dictatorship* inverts this dynamic. This work places Port-au-Prince at the core, while New York and Paris—secondary homes to Haitian exiles and emigres—becomes the periphery. Traversing national borders, politics and disciplines, this study investigates how memory, history and literature shape the physical and imagined cityscapes of New York, Port-au-Prince and Paris. Bringing together authors such as Edwidge Danticat, Lyonel Trouillot and Shay Youngblood, Edwards questions and explores dynamics of the Black immigrant body and Haitian body in these cities in the 1980's, 1990's and early 2000's.

THE UNHEALED WOUND: CONTEMPORARY BLACK DIASPORIC LITERATURE AND THE CONTINUING MEMORY OF THE DUVALIER DICTATORSHIP

by

Norrell Edwards

Dissertation submitted to the Faculty of the Graduate School of the
University of Maryland, College Park, in partial fulfillment
of the requirements for the degree of
Doctorate of Philosophy
2019

Advisory Committee:
Professor Peter Mallios, Co-Chair
Professor Valérie K. Orlando, Co-Chair
Professor Edlie Wong
Professor Merle Collins
Professor Julie Koser, Dean’s Representative

© Copyright by
Norrell Edwards
2019

Acknowledgements

It is surreal that I have finally finished this project; all that's left to do is say thanks. Thank you to my home department in English at the University of Maryland, College Park as well as the various faculty members who I have received support from over the years. I have benefitted from a number of professional workshops and programs such as the 2016 NEH Summer Institute "Arts of Survival: Recasting African Cities" where I began much of my thinking about representations of Port-au-Prince. I am very grateful for that hot summer in Bloomington. The Social Science Research Council has provided me with numerous opportunities to network with other scholars of color as a Mellon Mays Undergraduate Fellowship alumna. Those moments as well as the SSRC's funding grants have truly nourished me, literally and figuratively.

Many thanks to my dissertation committee that reviewed the project. Professor Merle Collins first introduced me to Edwidge Danticat's *The Dew Breaker* and provided me with invaluable insight on the Caribbean as well as Duvalier dictatorship. As an estranged member of the Jamaican diaspora, I truly enjoyed spending time with Professor Collins. Her wisdom was a special treasure. Professor Edlie Wong has been such as wonderful and reliable mentor, despite being outside of my field. I cannot thank her enough. Finally, I cannot begin to describe my gratitude for my lovely Co-Directors Professor Valérie K. Orlando and Professor Peter Mallios. Without them, this project would not exist. I am honestly not sure whether I could have finished this program without their support, sage criticism, empathy and

diligence. Thank you both for being such wonderful mentors who have stuck with me since the beginning.

Of course thanks to my family who have been patiently waiting for me to graduate and to my partner who assuaged me during many an anxious break down. Shout out to all my friends who were with me in the trenches, in Kaldi's, Tawes, Zed's and PJ's: Abby, Delisa, Cristi and Dominique—your Black Girl Magic inspires me to no end. Keep shining!

Table of Contents

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS .... **II**

INTRODUCTION **1**

Part 1: Paris *4*
Part 2: Port-au-Prince *5*
Part 3: New York *6*
THEORETICAL FRAMES 7
Historical Background *8*
Contemporary Haitian Politics *24*
Black Studies *27*
Memory Studies *30*
Combining Literary and Urban Studies: Literature and the City *34*

PART 1. PARIS **37**

WITNESSING, MEMORY AND THE RIGHT TO PARIS 40
DUVALIER AND HIS OVER-EXTENDED STAY IN THE LAND OF ASYLUM 48
PARIS NOIR 55
BLACK GIRL IN PARIS 59
LA MÉMOIRE AUX ABOIS 68

PART 2. PORT-AU-PRINCE **79**

I. 79
An Unlikely Pair: Roxane Gay and Lyonel Trouillot *79*
Imaginary Port-au-Prince: The Poetics of the Uncanny and Cynical Indifference *83*
II. 93
Street of Lost Footsteps *93*
Cyclical History and Violence *99*
Sexual Violence and the Flesh *104*
Navigating the City and Juridical Humanity *112*
An Untamed State *121*
Wealthy Indifference *124*
Complicity *129*
Haitian Literary Conventions and Migrant Narratives *133*
III. 140
Military & Memorials *140*
Memorials *143*

PART 3. NEW YORK **152**

EDWIDGE DANTICAT AND TEJU COLE 155
WITNESSING IN NEW YORK: HUNTER OR PREY 156
THE DEW BREAKER 157
Family Affairs *159*

Talking Trauma *161*
Body Double *163*
Mapping Memory and Trauma *165*
Police Brutality in New York City *168*
OPEN CITY 170

PART 4. NEW DIRECTIONS 179

AFTERWORD 186

BIBLIOGRAPHY 197

Introduction

In the 1990s, as Haiti continued to withstand the aftershocks of the end of a 29-year father-son dictatorship, the United States and France hovered in the periphery to "help" Haiti's transition to democracy. World systems theory dictates that a country like Haiti is relegated to the periphery while countries like the United States and France inhabit the core. *The Unhealed Wound: Contemporary Black Diasporic Literature and the Continuing Memory of the Duvalier Dictatorship* inverts this dynamic. This work places Port-au-Prince at the core, while New York and Paris—secondary homes to Haitian exiles and emigrés—become the periphery. Traversing national borders, politics and disciplines, I investigate how memory, history and literature shape the physical and imagined cityscapes of Paris, Port-au-Prince and New York.

During the tumultuous years of the Duvalier dictatorships, many Haitian authors were forced to write from abroad, creating a "lost generation" of writers—their absence palpably felt on the island. As Clarisse Zimra further explains in her 1993 interview with Haitian author Yanick Lahens, "At the center of the Haitian stage is the gaping wound, the absence…of those people now between the ages of twenty-five and fifty whose creativity was snuffed out by repression or pushed into alien directions by exile."[1] In 1993, at the time of this interview, the wound of the dictatorship was still incredibly fresh. Acknowledging this pain, Zimra explains that Lahens has called Haitian authors to "heal the wound of memory, and overcome the silence of the whole generation stranded on both shores of the sea of exile."[2] Yet,

even twenty and thirty years later this wound continues to bleed, yet simultaneously it is forgotten as new political crises emerged, and the atrocities of the Duvalier dictatorships were further eclipsed by the problems of the present. The title of this project originates from Yanick Lahens's words. At the center of all of the literary texts I examine, there are unhealed wounds. Varying across these texts, the wounds are either physical or psychological. I deploy several theoretical frames to address each type of wound, be they corporeal or psychological, and the trauma that envelops them.

This dissertation is divided into three sections. Each section focuses on a specific city: Paris, Port-au-Prince and New York. I have chosen to examine novels by six Black authors: Lyonel Trouillot, Évelyne Trouillot, Edwidge Danticat, Shay Youngblood, Teju Cole and Roxane Gay. Each of the novels I examine grapples with overlapping questions of immigration, belonging, trauma, memory, government violence and history. I have paired the novels in order to compare the authors' exploration of what it means to exist in their respective city between 1986-2004. Not all of these authors are explicitly writing about the Duvalier dictatorship. Shay Youngblood, Teju Cole and Roxane Gay write about migrants or the children of first-generation migrants whose searches for identity are caught between a matrix of national politics, memory and trauma. For these authors, the Duvalier dictatorship lingers at the periphery but is not at the center of their narratives. I argue that juxtaposing novels that focus on the Duvalier dictatorship or political violence in Haiti with novels in which these concerns are tangential exposes how memory of

political violence in Haiti influences cities where Haitian migrants have settled. The memory of the Duvalier dictatorship serves as a crucial symbol of Black unhealed trauma. The fate of Haiti not only affects Haiti, but the Black diaspora.

The contemporary political struggles that Haiti has faced, remnants and extensions from the Duvalier dictatorships, provide a useful foil for discussing other issues of immigration, sovereignty and international affairs. These are topics covered by authors Évelyne Trouillot, Lyonel Trouillot and Edwidge Danticat, all Haitians who have been tremendously impacted and shaped by the Duvalier dictatorships.

The novels are all set between the early-mid 1990's and mid 2000's and were published in the mid 1990's through to 2014. *Open City* has the most contemporary setting—2006. All of these novels depict the complex ways that Black individuals interact with their cities. The authors are invested in depicting the complex and often problematic contradictions that exist in city space. Cities are heterogenous places spaces that contain millions of people with different stories, memories and traumas. These authors imagine the unexpected connections that exist amongst otherwise estranged city dwellers—shared national identity, family members lost to Macoute violence in Haiti, memories of migration or alienation in the city.

Part 1: Paris

At the end of his reign, Jean-Claude Duvalier and his family fled to Paris. I have chosen to begin this project in Paris with novels that imagine Duvalier's residency in the city of lights. The focus of this section is Évelyne Trouillot's *La mémoire aux bois* and Shay Youngblood's *Black Girl in Paris.* While *Black Girl in Paris* follows an African American girl in 1986 Paris who is just trying to become a writer and be free of racism, La *memoire aux bois* is an allegory about a young Haitian woman who must take care of a woman resembling Duvalier's wife. Since Trouillot does not use Haiti's name explicitly, but the imagined Quisequa, it is an allegory.[3] *Black Girl in Paris* contains a minor Haitian character who dreams of assassinating Jean-Claude Duvalier. Utilizing Pierre Nora's concept of *lieux de mémoire*, Henri Lefebvre's "right to the city" and Shoshana Felman's understanding of literature as witness, I argue that Jean-Claude Duvalier's exile in Paris makes Paris a memory generating space for the dictatorship. Paris and France are culpable in allowing Duvalier to stay while deporting multitudes of poor migrants. Paris violates Haitian migrants' right to the city by allowing Duvalier's amnesty. Both of these texts imagine Paris as a space of confrontation between perpetrators and victims. These novels grapple with the psychological wounds that come with inhabiting a city where you do not quite belong. I argue that Paris is a lieu de mémoire of the Duvalier dictatorship.

Part 2: Port-au-Prince

As mentioned earlier, Haiti is at the center of this dissertation. Although we started at the periphery, we have reached the center by section two. Taking a completely different theoretical route in this section, I focus on the body as a site of violence in Port-au-Prince. I read Lyonel Trouillot's *Street of Lost Footsteps* against Roxane Gay's *An Untamed State,* and divide my analysis into three parts. The first section provides background on authors Roxane Gay and Lyonel Trouillot while also laying the theoretical foundation for the analysis. I utilize Marie-Jose N'Zengou-Tayo's article "Imaginary City, Literary Spaces: Port-au-Prince in Some Recent Haitian Fiction" to discuss prominent themes in Haitian urban literature. From this article, I extend my theoretical analysis from her claims that the city has turned into an urban monster where authors represent it through a "poetics of the uncanny." I argue that Gay and Trouillot continue the 'poetics of the uncanny' in their representation of Port-au-Prince. Finally, I incorporate Alexander Weheliye's concept of *habeas viscus* and Hortense Spillers's "hieroglyphics of the flesh" to analyze how increasing occurrences of bodily violence in the city perpetuate disconnection amongst its residents.

In the second section of the Port-au-Prince segment, I provide close readings of *An Untamed State* and *Street of Lost Footsteps*. *An Untamed State* focuses on the kidnap and captivity of an upper class Haitian American woman. *Street of Lost Footsteps* chronicles a night of violence and factional fighting between supporters of François Duvalier and Jean Bertrand Aristide. I argue that Lyonel Trouillot and Roxane Gay depict the increasing vulnerability to violence that low-income and poor

city inhabitants suffer from the 1990's to the early 2000's. I use the concept of *habeas viscus* to analyze ways American business interests inflict violence on Black Haitian bodies even from afar, with the complicity of the Haitian elite.

In the third section of the Port-au-Prince segment, I discuss the relationship of the Duvalier dictatorships to the novels and violence in the city. Poor, working class bodies have always been the most unsafe and vulnerable to violence, but the Duvalier dictatorships increased their dire situation. François Duvalier transformed the military apparatus in Haiti with the inclusion of paramilitary groups. I link *Street of Lost Footsteps* and *An Untamed State* to the history of the military in Haiti. Military and paramilitary violence against citizens triggers drastic instability and endangerment for many communities, producing physical wounds. Finally, I close this section by considering how the lack of memorials for victims of political violence in Port-au-Prince connects to the ongoing adversarial position of the military.

Part 3: New York

In this section, we return to the periphery, to New York. New York is home to the largest Haitian diasporic community. Like Paris, that community is haunted by Duvalier's ghosts. However, these texts do not focus on imagined revenge as much as imagining New York as a place of complex, overlapping memories and identities that focus on what it means to be a witness and witnessing. Edwidge Danticat's *The Dew Breaker* is read against Teju Cole's *Open City*. *The Dew Breaker* is a collection of interconnected stories all about Haitian migrants, many of whom have a connection to the Duvalier dictatorship and Macoute violence. Many of these characters witnessed

the violence of the Duvalier dictatorship or had family members who did. *Open City* follows a Nigerian psychiatrist who wanders New York City and Brussels. The protagonist has a number of encounters that speak to oppression, systemic violence, immigration, identity and memory yet most of them do not provoke much reaction from the protagonist. Both Danticat and Cole's texts display disconnection and connection amongst New York City residents from migrant backgrounds. I argue that these texts signify on previous literary representations of alienation in New York. Many of Danticat's characters struggle to tell their stories and find someone to whom they can bear witness to their trauma, while the protagonist of *Open City* refuses to bear witness for others. Danticat and Cole ask what it means for perpetrators to bear witness and whether they can or should. I use Edwidge Danticat's term the "floating homeland" and Felman's definition of witness to consider New York as lieu de mémoire for the Duvalier dictatorship, as well as other migrant trauma.

Theoretical Frames

The Unhealed Wound: Contemporary Black Diasporic Literature and the Continuing Memory of the Duvalier Dictatorship attempts to locate fictions of contemporary, urban, Black and Haitian subjectivities within current conversations in trauma and African American studies. A key component of this project is my contemplation of how novels depict city space as a receptacle of traumatic memory. A guiding question for this project is how do histories of violence and oppression specific to Haiti cohere within current frames for understanding trauma and city space? How does the

coherence of Haitian narratives within those frames compare to other Black narratives? The theoretical foundation of this project is an amalgamation scholarship across fields including: Haitian, Black and Francophone studies; memory and trauma studies; and urban studies and history. Like much of the work done in Black studies, this project is concerned with Black communities and their continued resistance against violence and oppression. However, much of the recent scholarship in Black studies focuses heavily on the chattel slavery and its ongoing repercussions. This project imagines how Haiti's contemporary history can be analyzed through all of these lenses.

Historical Background

The subsequent history in this section is completely drawn from newspaper articles and select scholarship on this historical period. The novels I examine tell an alternative version of the history that is provided in this section. The novels expose the lives of characters who must exist and survive while political violence and oppression play out in the cities the characters inhabit. The novels also depict how this history interacts with other histories of violence and oppression specifically in New York, Port-au-Prince and Paris.

On October 22, 1957, François Duvalier (Papa Doc) was sworn into the presidency of Haiti, marking the beginning of a distinct chapter in Haitian political history. Duvalier had used fraud and violent tactics to strong-arm his way into the highest office in the land. He would continuously return to these tactics in order to maintain his power. Papa Doc wasted no time; within two weeks of beginning his

term in the National Palace, he arrested hundreds who had publicly contested his election.[4] By 1964 Papa Doc had named himself President-for-Life; when he passed away in 1971 he would be succeeded by his 19-year-old son Jean-Claude Duvalier. Jean-Claude (Baby Doc) would rule for another 15 years, until he was finally pushed out by mass protests. Although the father-son dictatorships ended over thirty years ago, in 1986, the memory continues to haunt the collective literary imaginations of both Haitians writing at home and those living abroad.

From aiding Haitian politicians to negotiating amnesty packages and development policies to launching full scale interventions, the United States has been deeply embroiled in the last 33 years of Haiti's political landscape. The U.S.'s involvement in contemporary Haitian politics and affairs is an incredibly complex topic, and its impact has not been lost on artists and other creatives. At times, the U.S.'s involvement reflects the perspectives of the Haitian diaspora present in the U.S. For instance, the U.S.'s decision to reinstall President Jean Bertrand Aristide was very much shaped by protests for action from the Haitian community in the U.S. Although the diaspora has used their voice to encourage the U.S. to aid Haiti, U.S. aid can and has been a doubled-edged sword. Perspectives from the diaspora can often be different and removed from those directly experiencing the tensions occurring in Haiti. There is often a tension between those still in Haiti and those in the diaspora. Both authors Roxane Gay and Edwidge Danticat are a part of the Haitian diaspora.

On February 7, 1986, Jean-Claude Duvalier, his wife, and advisors boarded a United States military plane in the middle of the night headed for France. Some argue his departure was far too well-planned, since he had time to hand over the

government to a "civilian-military junta" and the National Council of Government (CNG) to govern. Journalist Amy Wilentz, a long-time reporter stationed in Haiti, writes of the Duvalier's final night in her memoir, *The Rainy Season*: "the departing Duvaliers reportedly had a farewell party—champagne, cocaine, that kept a hundred members of the foreign press waiting until almost four in the morning at François Duvalier International airport."[5] In sharp contrast to the Duvalier's family glitzy send-off, chaos reigned in the streets. In Danticat's *The Dew Breaker*, the story "Monkey Tails" portrays the upheaval in Port-au-Prince after the departure of Jean-Claude Duvalier, particularly the violent vengeance that played out against Tonton Macoutes.

In the early days after the fall of the Duvalier regime, optimism for democracy was high. In August 1986, U.S. Secretary of State George Schulz visited Haiti, making the first visit of an U.S. secretary of state since 1912, just three years prior to the first American occupation. Schulz praised the "extraordinary progress Haiti made since Jean-Claude Duvalier's departure earlier that year."[6] Schultz supported the idea of providing the Haitian government with U.S. military aid. The Associated Press reported that Schultz felt that "modernization of the armed forces was necessary to ensure a stable environment as the nation makes a transition to democratic rule."[7] In retrospect, modernization of the Armed Forces was the last thing that Haiti needed. A year later, the United States Congress was calling for a suspension of military aid.

There were early signals that the arbiters of the 1986 putsch would not easily secede power. Increased violence began in late June of 1987. In June, the CNG had decreed that they would administer the elections, which sparked protests. Although the CNG backed down, anti-government protests continued. The CNG's credibility

with the people had been besmirched. The junta was composed of General Henri Namphy, General Williams Regala and Luc Honoré, a former president of the Supreme Court. The CNG had placed the newly formed electoral commission that would run the upcoming elections under their control and had abolished an important labor union. According to Daniel Williams, a correspondent in Haiti from the *Toronto Star*: "According to opposition leaders and protesters, the military wants to handpick a president, and former Duvalier supporters still in the army are pulling strings to keep themselves in power."[8] Former Duvalier supporters would continue to do this.

One of the Associated Press's sources from the Reagan administration claims that "the influence and importance of the U.S. in this situation can have catalytic effects, so the U.S. must demonstrate its solid support for a success."[9] The article notes that "the U.S. must try to avoid publicly pushing the interim regime or the Haitian military into a corner."[10] Despite increased protests and violence during the summer of 1987, the U.S. still firmly supported the belief of a smooth transition. Months before the 1987 election, Reagan administration officials were still emphasizing that the provisional National Council government led by General Henri Namphy was committed to relinquishing power come February 1988, when a new president and administration would be inaugurated.[11] The Reagan administration could have easily foreseen that a transition would not be as easy as they had hoped.

Determined to maintain the status quo, Duvalierist supporters, ex-Macoutes, and the military brought Haiti's first democratic elections to a screeching a halt. On November 29, 1987, the first scheduled election in Haiti in 30 years was cancelled by the Independent Electoral Council. The day of the election, 34 people had been killed;

many suspected Macoutes as the perpetrators. The junta then dissolved the IEC. In response, the U.S. canceled funds. Blame was placed on the Reagan administration and its larger handling of Latin American Affairs.[12] In December of 1987, the *New York Times* reported that rescinding Haiti's aid was a largely symbolic move because most of the $110 million given in fiscal year 1987 had already been disbursed.[13] However, aid for 1988 would also be suspended. This was the beginning a vicious cycle of many short-lived military governments.

In January 1988, Leslie Manigat would briefly hold the presidency until being ousted by the military in June of 1988. However, his election was widely considered rigged. By June of 1988, Manigat was replaced by the return of General Namphy, whose government would also fall—replaced on September 17 by General Avril. At this time there were concerns that Macoutes had not been sanctioned or fully purged from government institutions. A news article aptly describes the situation: "Factionalism—in the army, among politicians, even within the Haitian exile communities New York and Miami—makes Haitian politics nearly unfathomable."[14]

The ascension of the vehemently Anti-Duveralist priest Jean Bertrand Aristide would provide a brief pause in Haiti's cycle of ephemeral military autocracies. On December 16, 1990, elections were held and Jean Bertrand Aristide was elected. News outlets reported that the September 20, 1991, coup that ousted Aristide killed as many as 350 civilians. Aristide would then go into exile for the next three years, at first landing in Washington. D.C., then staying in Venezuela. Aristide's expulsion signaled the beginning of severe political persecution for his followers and members of the Lavalas political party. These events are significant for two of the

novels I address. Lyonel Trouillot's *Street of Lost Footsteps* is situated directly within this context, while Mireille's captor in *An Untamed State* likely lived and matured through these turbulent times.

This repression propelled a number of Haitians to flee the country. There was a dramatic influx of Haitian migrants traveling to the United States and seeking asylum. During George H.W. Bush's presidency, a 1992 policy called the Kennebunkport Order was issued to immediately return Haitians to Haiti without an immigration hearing. On January 13, 1993, the Canadian Press reported that "About 40,000 Haitians have fled the poor Caribbean country of 5.7 million since September 1991, when the military ousted Aristide."[15] Some argue that Aristide's attempts to separate the police and the military were the cause of his ouster. The Inter Press Service reported, "…his policies increasingly came into conflict with Haiti's entrenched ruling elite and military hierarchy, who both saw decades-old systems of privilege threatened."[16] Here we can understand the "entrenched ruling elite and military" to mean Duvalierists and Macoutes.

There are a few key events that occurred during Aristide's exile. These include the 1993 worldwide oil embargo against Haiti, the 1993 Governor's Island Agreement, the *Harlan County* incident, the 1994 UN Security Council embargo on all trade with Haiti, and the United Nations 1994 Security Resolution 940. In 1993 Aristide urged the United Nations to leverage a worldwide oil embargo against Haiti in order to pressure the coup leaders to leave.[17] On June 23, 1993, the U.N. would fulfil Aristide's request and issue the embargo. The embargo seemed to produce its intended effect as two weeks later Aristide and military leader General Raoul Cedras

agreed on the U.N.'s Governor Island Agreement.[18] This agreement outlined a transfer of power where Cedras would step down and Aristide would step back in to power. Since the coup leaders appeared to be cooperating, the U.N. Security Council suspended the embargo and the assets freeze in August. However, tensions would re-ignite with the October 11 *Harlan County* incident. The *U.S.S. Harlan County* had come to the port of Port-au-Prince with 225 U.S. and Canadian members of the U.N. who were there to help create a pathway for Aristide's return.[19] This did not come to fruition. The ship was never able to make it to the dock and instead watched a spectacle take place where FRAPH "surrounded her [U.S. embassy attaché Vicky Hudleston's] car, wielded machetes, chanted 'Remember Somalia' and molested embassy spokesman Stanly Shrager. TV crews were there to film this scene, as well as the *Harlan County* as it waited all day at sea for orders."[20] This event clearly foreshadows the imminent failure of the Governor's Island Agreement.

The U.N. prepared to "impose an oil and arms embargo and freeze selected Haitian assets overseas if the plan to return Aristide" did not go as intended by midnight of October 18.[21] October 18 arrived and the U.N. initiated the worldwide petroleum and arms embargo. By May of 1994, the U.N. placed an embargo on all trade with Haiti. In July, the military expelled U.N. Human Rights monitors and the U.N. took this as the necessary call for invasion. The U.S. House of Representatives asked then President Bill Clinton to garner Congressional support before committing troops to Haiti. As Peter Hallward explains in *Damming the Flood*,

> Unlike Bush, Clinton couldn't afford indefinitely to ignore Black voters. As thousands of people went on trying to escape FRAPH violence in Haiti only to

> be repatriated by the Coast Guard or incarcerated in the de-facto concentration camp that was Guantanamo Bay, relentless criticism of Clinton's hypocrisy from influential African-American leaders like Jesse Jackson, Randall Robinson and Maxine Waters (along with Hollywood supporters like Danny Glover and Jonathon Demme) finally started to have some significant political effect.[22]

Motivated by the embarrassment that was the *Harlan County* incident as well as the criticism from notable African American celebrities, Clinton was ready to take a strong stance on Haiti.[23]

Throughout Aristide's negotiations with the U.S., violence continued to befall the poor in Haiti. Hallward comments:

> In late 1993 and early 1994 Toto Constant's FRAPH led a series of increasingly brutal incursions into the pro-Lavalas slums. In Cité Soleil (the largest slum of Port-au-Prince) FRAPH assassins murdered their opponents more or less on a nightly basis.[24]

This is corroborated by the increasing number of refugees the U.S. was sending back to Haiti. Although the intention of the embargo was to defeat the military coup leaders, it also defeated many innocent Haitians. The embargo had decimated the little means many had for economic survival. Some of Aristide's critics hold him culpable for the loss created by the embargo. Haitian authors Lyonel Trouillot and Nadève Menard reinforce the fact that "the embargo [not only] rendered the poor even more impoverished [but also]… destroyed an already weak economy."[25] Imagine, people were struggling to survive insufferable financial strain, and then

might also fear rape or torture for their political affiliations. The combination of these two realities could plummet anyone into an irrevocable, downward spiral. Hallward highlighted that the

> U.S. Department of Justice noted in 1993 that Haiti's 'old guard' appears to have united behind the de-facto government to brutally punish not only those who work to return Aristide to power but also anyone engaging in even the most basic kinds of political activity.[26]

The powers that be in Haiti were still incredibly reluctant to vacate their positions. Ultimately, as Hallward and others argue, the coup government seemed to be very closely influenced by the U.S. "Even a superficial review of the 'negotiations' that eventually allowed Aristide to return is enough to show that the junta's own willingness to cooperate varied directly with the urgency of the U.S. military threat."[27]

On July 31, 1994 the U.N. Security Council passed Resolution 940 which promised to restore Aristide to Haiti and gather military forces from various member countries, including the U.S.:

> Chapter VII of the Charter of the United Nations authorizes Member States to form a multinational force under unified command and control and, in this framework, to use all necessary means to facilitate the departure from Haiti of the military leadership, consistent with the Governor's Island Agreement, the prompt return of the legitimately elected President and the restoration of the legitimate authorities of the Government of Haiti, and establish and maintain a secure and stable environment that will permit

> implementation of the Governor's Island Agreement, on the understanding that the cost of implementing this temporary operation will be borne by the participating Member States.[28]

The return of the U.S. Armed Forces was incredibly contentious as it directly recalled the 1915-1934 American Occupation. However, some were happy to see Aristide return even with American military. From a November 1994 interview with Cité Soleil residents: "The gringos didn't bring Aristide. Aristide brought the gringos to free us from Cedras and the Tonton Macoutes."[29] Unfortunately, Aristide's restoration did not provide the long-awaited democracy and peace that Haiti had long desired. U.S. negotiations had demanded that Aristide play nice with political opponents and ultimately promise amnesty for all the coup leaders.

> The U.S. thwarted every attempt by the new government to prosecute crimes committed during the Cedras regime, and made sure that the National Commission for Truth and Justice which Aristide established in 1995 was restricted to the mere documentation of cases—some 8,652 in total—of human rights abuse undertaken between 1991 and 1994.[30]

There were now thousands more dead whose families would not see justice for the violence inflicted by the coup leaders. In 1995, Aristide was able to disband the ungovernable military, but even that plan could not be fully realized: "The U.S. helped ensure that the most powerful units of the new police force—the 500 strong member Presidential Guard (USGPN) and two 60-80 member SWAT-style units (GIPNH and CIMO)--were all staffed largely by ex-army personnel."[31] Although the military had technically been disbanded, many were still able to find new jobs in the

newly formed police force. Additionally, the U.S. never made an effort to collect weapons from the former military members.[32] With weapons that were never collected and a new police force full of the same corrupt abusers, an increase in violence is not surprising.

Aristide was only able to serve 14 months of his five-year term and was succeeded by his Prime Minister and fellow Lavalas party member René Préval. It was generally understood that Aristide was the man behind the curtain orchestrating Préval's administration. The transition from Aristide to Préval was Haiti's first peaceful transfer of the presidency. Although the presidential transfer of power was peaceful, the rest of Haiti was still in chaos. A 1997 report from Human Rights Watch disclosed that the HNP (Police Nationale d'Haïti) had already killed 46 Haitians since it commenced in July 1995. The majority of these deaths were extrajudicial executions. Although prosecution had begun for some of these cases, the outlook for justice was still dim. "Haiti's dysfunctional judicial system has made meager progress on prosecuting police abuse cases. Not one policeman or woman has been convicted of any killing."[33] Yet again, at least six men had been killed from Cité Soleil. Cité Soleil is considered the root of where populist uprising stems from. These political killings sent a double message that political activity still would not be tolerated. Political killings continued and the Aristide's Lavalas splintered due to factionalism. As Hallward puts it, the old army "endured under a new 'civilian' guise"[34]

Amidst political violence, Haiti has other problems regarding its development and direction. Of course, the price for an American savior was not cheap. Unsurprisingly, the United States encouraged Haiti toward a capitalist route and

increasing privatization. Hallward, who has been criticized for his characterization of Aristide, argues that Aristide was pitted against the U.S. empire in order to fight for the socialist program he wanted to enact. Other critics believe that Aristide had long since dropped his socialist agenda in order to win over the U.N. and the U.S. to restore him to power. Either way, the decade from 1994-2004 would be a fight over Haiti's direction, whether it be towards privatizing the state and pushing it further into the arms of foreign influence or something else entirely. Continuing their longstanding allegiance, the elite and ex-military were staunchly in favor of catering to foreign business interests. Lyonel Trouillot's 1996 *Street of Lost Footsteps* imagines Port-au-Prince in the middle of the Cedras coup regime and deeply immersed in these tumultuous political events.

The assassination of one of Haiti's most infamous journalists at the end of the Préval presidency was a painful precursor for the continued political violence that was yet to come. On Monday, April 3, 2000, Jean Dominique was assassinated at the doorstep of his radio station. He was radio host and owner of Radio-Inter, the first independent radio station in Haiti. This was the same radio station that author Dany Laferrière worked at as a cultural reporter up until his exile in 1976.[35] Laferrière fled after his friend and fellow journalist Raymond Glasner was assassinated in 1976. Jean Dominique was owner of the radio station at the time of Glasner's assassination; he had owned the station since 1968. In her essay "I am not a Journalist," Edwidge Danticat recalls her friendship with Jean and how he had seemed "heroically invincible." She reflects: "After all, he had survived the Duvalier dictatorship

….Unlike his brother, Jean had survived several arrests and their resulting exiles, and had lived to return to Haiti to open and reopen his radio station."[36]

Despite various years of political instability, Jean and his wife Michèle Montas had returned again and again to reopen the radio station and continue their pursuit of truth. Yet, in 2003, three years after Jean's death, the increased repression and danger forced his wife to finally close the radio station permanently and return to New York. Danticat's essay closes on the words of Michèle: "We have lost three lives in three years. I was no longer willing to go to another funeral."[37] The final closure of Radio Haiti-Inter distinctly symbolizes the political climate of Aristide's second presidency. Previously the station had been closed in 1980 as Jean-Claude Duvalier's dictatorship began to unravel, re-opened in 1986 with Baby Doc's exile, closed again in 1990 during the Cedras regime coup in 1991, and re-opened again in 1994 after Aristide's return. Aristide's presidency was supposed to signal the long-awaited arrival of Haiti's democracy. Instead his presidency beckoned a renewed phase of violence, terror and oppression.

In 1999 President Préval suspended Congress and two-thirds of the Senate due to a dispute with the oppositional party. Préval finished out the rest of his presidency ruling by decree. In July of 1999 there were armed attacks on the Police Academy and the National Palace that "resulted in violent reprisals against the opposition groups loyal to Mr. Aristide." In May of 2000 the Fanmi Lavalas party won the majority of the parliamentary seats and the opposition, the Democratic Convergence, claimed the elections were fraudulent. In November 2000 Aristide won the presidential election unopposed. The Democratic Convergence refused to participate

as they were boycotting the elections due to their sustained concerns around the credibility of the parliamentary elections from May. There were again discrepancies around Aristide's election and the Democratic Alliance wished to create a provisional president while the poll outcome was sorted out. This dispute over elections caused aid to be withheld from Haiti yet again. By 2002 Aristide was holding on to control of the government by a thread. In 2004, various armed gangs that Henry Carey calls "neo-Duvalierists" such as the Cannibal army began occupying police stations. Again Haiti was at the precipice of a civil war, and the U.S. came in to carry off Aristide off to exile. Amidst this extreme turmoil, Roxane Gay's fictional protagonist Mirielle Duval is kidnapped.

In 2000 Jean Bertrand Aristide was re-elected to the presidency and expected to pick up where he left off in constructing a democratic vision of Haiti. Yet again, this vision would crumble before full realization. In the parliamentary elections of that year, Aristide's party won about half of the seats and so a power struggle ensued. In his synopsis of Aristide's second presidency, Lyonel Trouillot argues that "more and more isolated, the government and the party in power turned to corruption and organized crime as political weapons."[38] It would seem that Aristide, once a proponent of non-violent tactics, had capitulated to the old saying, "if you can't beat them, you might as well join them." Once returned to Haiti, Aristide was loath to lose power again. Aristide's government bore an incredible likeness to the repressive regimes that preceded him:

> Threats, intimidations. Totalitarian excess. An attorney general who had not studied law. A Lavalas spokesperson who declared that if members of the

> opposition were not happy, they could just swallow poison. Political assassinations. Visible destruction of the weakened state structures and public services.[39]

The list clearly delineates some of the hallmarks of the Duvalier dictatorship: violent scare tactics, zero sum politics, vengeance, cronyism, and absolute interference and domination of all institutions. To emphasize his point, Trouillot furnishes damning examples of Aristide's corruption. Trouillot reports claims that government officials were arrested for drug trafficking by U.S. police and that embezzlement of telephone company funds went to pay chimères and money siphoned into Aristide's own personal bank account.

It is worth reiterating some of the bare similarities between Jean Bertrand Aristide and François Duvalier. Although Aristide rose to prominence as a staunch critic of Jean-Claude "Baby Doc" Duvalier, his final political trajectory is very similar to Papa Doc. Like François Duvalier, Aristide began his political tenure as a populist figure who promised to empower the poor Black masses.[40] What noirisme was to Duvalier, as the leading framework he used to position his political identity, liberation theology was to Aristide: "Like Duvalier, Aristide did demand personal loyalty and is a firebrand speaker. Without criminal justice institutions, both have felt extreme insecurity."[41] By the end of Aristide's second tenure as president, from 2001-2004, it had become clear that his politics and how much he was "for" the people was questionable at best, and demonstrably false at worst. Political Science and International Relations scholar Henry F. Carey has claimed that Aristide and Duvalier are "two of the few Haitian leaders who have achieved lasting, mass support."[42]

Although Aristide is the not focus of this project, he is important to understanding Haiti's political landscape in the 1990's and early 2000's. There is much to be said about Jean Bertrand Aristide's likeness to François Duvalier.

While reading through this project. it will be very important to differentiate between various armed forces in Haiti. The Forces Armées d'Haiti (Fad'H) was Haiti's military which consisted of the Army, Navy, Airforce, Coast Guard and some police units. The Volontaires de la Sécurité nationale (VSN) were Papa and Baby Doc's personal militia nicknamed Tonton Macoutes after a Haitian bogey man who snatched naughty children. After Jean-Claude Duvalier's fall, the Macoutes were left to fend on their own and many were absorbed into the Fad'H. References to the military in the 1990's often included ex-Macoutes. In 1993 a new far-right paramilitary came onto the scene, the Front pour l'Avancement et le Progrès Haïtien (FRAPH). FRAPH was yet another offspring of the Tonton Macoutes. "To visit an office of the group, swarming with men whose pockets often bulge with guns, is to understand that its membership is mostly compromised of former army personnel and nostalgic Duvalierists."[43] FRAPH which phonetically sounds like frappe (to hit in French) was founded by Emmanuel "Toto" Constant who was the son of François Duvalier Army Chief of Staff. Constant also was a spy for the CIA. The historical section of chapter three will feature further context pertaining to Emmanuel Constant. Attachés were frequently used during the Cedras coup years (1991-1994); these were armed individuals in plain clothes who worked for the military. The Police Nationale d'Haïti were created in 1995. In the 1990's the Kreyol word "Zenglendo" was another word used to describe killers or paramilitary groups. Zenglendo could describe killers

from either party. By the 2000's. the word chimère became popular and referred solely to Aristide's armed supporters.[44]

Contemporary Haitian Politics

Several notable texts analyze the modern politics of the Haitian state and provide insightful commentary on the Duvalier and post-Duvalier administrations. Works by Robert Fatton Jr., Alex Dupuy, Michael Deibert, and Peter Hallward provide useful context for post-Duvalier politics. As coined by prolific Haitian scholar Michel-Rolph Trouillot, Haiti's current political paradigms, enmeshed in turmoil and foreign aid dependency, can be understood as "Duvalierism without Duvalier." In *Haiti: State Against Nation the Origins and Legacy of Duvalierism*, Trouillot argues that Duvalierism is rooted within Haitian society and not the aberration Haitian leaders often depict it as. Trouillot illuminates:

> …middle class political or religious leaders presented the Duvalier era as a monstrous phenomenon, a parenthesis after which Haitians could, presumably, pick up the reins of their history and proceed. On the basis of such a misunderstanding, they endorsed an article of the constitution that forbade known Duvalierists from running for office—as if a stroke of the pen could erase the Duvalierist nightmare and the crisis on which it fed. Yet only a distorted presentation of the Haitian past and present can sustain the illusion that the crisis will subside spontaneously if and when the dictatorship it nurtured disappeared.[45]

Published in 1990, only four years after the close of the Duvalier dictatorship, Trouillot's conclusion is incredibly salient. All the succeeding Haitian administrations, even at present, have faltered in providing democracy for the Haitian populace. Accusations of corruption and neglect sully the reputation of every government whether elected or installed. Trouillot argues that public discourse around the Duvalier dictatorships and their relationship to Haiti's political past have been a misfire. It has now been 29 years since the publication of Michel-Rolph Trouillot's *State Against Nation*. Given the vicious cycle of corrupt governments Haiti has endured, there is clearly a need for further trenchant analysis around Haiti's contemporary politics and the close of the Duvalier dictatorships.[46] *The Unhealed Wound* cannot completely fill that need, but does make a fledgling attempt at performing some of that work.

While little has been written on the Duvaliers' international connections, Jana Braziel's *Duvalier's Ghosts* provides a useful starting point for considering the global support of the Duvaliers' regime. Following from Trouillot's footprint, *Duvalier's Ghosts* contends that contemporary Haitian literature critiques the Duvalier regime, while simultaneously analyzing the present-day Lavalas administration's violence. Representation of state violence in Haiti comments on past and present administrations. Part of Braziel's project focuses on the work of Dany Laferrière and Edwidge Danticat, both writers whose oeuvres extensively address the dictatorship. *Duvalier's Ghosts* contends that Haiti's political and economic instability is a product of international and extraterritorial forces. Through analyzing scenes from Laferrière's *Le cri des oiseaux fous*, Braziel points out how Laferrière implicates

foreign entities in the horrors of Duvalierism, particularly the involvement of USAID. Braziel connects Jean Claudisme, Baby Doc's strategy for an economic revolution, to a historical entanglement with the United States and its interests. Haiti, like many other Caribbean nations, has struggled to develop within the current economic system. Braziel reminds us that Papa Doc did not want to be manipulated and oppressed by Americans, yet craved to manipulate and oppress like America: "although Duvalier espoused an anti-imperialist platform of 'black power,' the dictator's military and political structures, ironically, mirrored those imposed by the U.S. Marines during the early twentieth-century occupation of the country."[47] Further sections of Braziel's work contextualize the United States' tolerance of the Duvalier dictatorship in exchange for Haiti's role as a wall against Cuban communism. The Duvalier's relationship with the U.S. sets up an important foundation the U.S.' future interventions.

Braziel's analysis of the violence of the Duvalier regime in connection to foreign entities is supported by Deleuzian concepts of the "War apparatus" and "Empire."[48] While I can understand the utility of these frames, my dissertation departs from these concepts. Instead, I focus on how the memory of the Duvalier dictatorships escapes national boundaries and is interwoven in discourse around trauma, oppression and violence in other cities and nations. In examining texts set in New York, Port-au-Prince and Paris, I believe this dissertation will work to answer Braziel's call that

> we need to shift the theorization of terror from a national frame—that is, the idea that Haiti is a nation-state internally or pathologically prone to

> violence, terror and political instability…towards a transnational frame that underscores extraterritorial pressures creating poverty, political instability and violence in Haiti.[49]

As the United States and other western countries continue to intervene and debate about the fate of Haiti, it is important that we examine the ways Black authors use the memory of the Duvalier dictatorships to a shine a light on violence inflicted by and within western countries.

Black Studies

I was compelled to consider how I might incorporate a Black trauma theory into my analysis. I thought about whether Christina Sharpe's *The Wake* or Saidiya Hartman's idea of "the Afterlives of Slavery" might be useful for thinking through political violence and trauma in Haiti. Both of those tools relate to continued trauma in the Black/African American community and connections between the past and present. All of the novels I have selected are also invested in temporal linkages. Yet, at the core of Sharpe and Hartman's work is the legacy of the transatlantic slave trade and slavery in the United States.

Haiti was the first to cast off the chains of slavery; perhaps, Haiti is the best example of how oppression reconfigures itself even despite slavery's abolition. In many ways I wanted to say that 'afterlives of slavery' or 'the wake' could better frame this project than Holocaust or trauma studies, whose foundations originated out of study of trauma in the west. Much of Haiti's trauma is caused, in part, from the west. Haiti's political history does not conveniently fit into Holocaust Studies,

Trauma studies, Post-Colonial Studies or African American Studies, the latter being where Sharpe and Hartman are located.

However, I did select Alexander Weheliye's *Habeas Viscus* and Hortense Spiller's "hieroglyphics of the flesh" to frame the second section of this project which focuses on Port-au-Prince. Recently published in 2017, *Habeas Viscus* has had a large reception across the academy. Notably, the title *Habeas Viscus*, is a refashioning of the term *habeas corpus*. Connected to the invented meaning of the neologism, habeas viscus, "The flesh shall set you free," Weheliye envisions alternate forms of humanity and freedom that can be found amidst oppression. A major aspect of Weheliye's project is critiquing the exclusion of race from the school of thought that encompasses "biopolitics" and "bare life." Weheliye contends that Giorgio Agamben and Michel Foucault, two of his key interlocutors, "neglect and/or actively dispute the existence of alternative forms of life alongside violence, subjection, exploitation and racialization that define the modern human."[50] Aligning himself with Hortense Spillers and Sylvia Wynter, Weheliye critiques the historical conflation of humanity with Western man that allows for raced individuals, and those who have suffered oppression, to be relegated to sub-human non-human categories. It is what Weheliye terms as "racializing assemblages" that performs the work of separating out humanity; racializing assemblages "constru[e] race as not biological or cultural classification but as a set of sociopolitical processes that discipline humanity into full humans, not quite humans and non-humans."[51] Although Weheliye focuses on racial slavery as the epitome of racializing assemblages, he interprets other contemporary examples. In one chapter, Weheliye discusses the U.S. penal system as an example of

a racializing assemblage that actively devalues the lives of Black and Brown bodies. Weheliye provides a reorientation for reading subjection and violence in Haiti; ultimately, this is most useful for the Port-au-Prince where I think through the manifestation of physical wounds in *Street of Lost Footsteps* and *An Untamed State*. Weheliye allows for an interpretation of violence in Haiti and Port-au-Prince as kind of racializing assemblage that is tied to slavery in the past and western liberalism and imperialism in the present.

Hortense Spiller's now seminal " Mama's Baby, Papa's Maybe: An American Grammar Book" (1987), largely responds to the controversial 1965 Moynihan report. The Moynihan report pathologized the African American family due it its matriarchal structure. Spillers argues against this criticism, demanding that it be understood within the context of the history of the American slave trade. Spillers proclaims that "Moynihan's 'Negro Family' then borrows its narrative energies from the grid of associations, from the semantic and iconic folds buried deep in the collective past, that come to surround and signify the captive person."[52] Spillers goes on to unveil a larger Black feminist project: investigating the silences surrounding women, reproduction, and mothering in the public record on the enslaved. Building from Claude Meillassoux's arguments on slavery existing outside of the kinship system, Spillers contends that in this vein, "the female, like the male [slave] has been robbed of the parent right, the parental function."[53] Spillers provides useful language for thinking about the intersections of Black trauma and gender. She argues that "the captive female [enslaved body] locates precisely a moment of converging political and social vectors that make the flesh a prime commodity of exchange."[54] I wonder

what political and social vectors converge on the Haitian woman's body? What is written on her flesh that relates to both the memory of slavery and the political violence that has ensued since the conclusion of the Duvalier dynasty.

Memory Studies

Pierre Nora's notion of lieux de mémoire is also foundational for this project. On the one-year anniversary of the devastating 2010 earthquake, and twenty-five years after he had allegedly fled to Paris with thousands of U.S. dollars, Baby Doc returned to his native land. His penultimate years residing on the island, from 2011 to his passing in 2014, were surrounded with controversy. There were some who demanded atonement for the severe violence and trauma wrought by Jean-Claude and his family. Yet, there were others, many in power, who were fine with letting bygones be bygones, as the saying goes. Duvalier returned to Haiti with little to no interrogation, reconciliatory efforts, apologies, or even acknowledgement of the horrors of his regime.

Well known Haitian-American writer Edwidge Danticat called Baby Doc's return a "crisis of memory" or as Régine Jean-Charles suggests, it was "un lieu démémoiré, a charged and divided atmosphere of forgetting."[55] In the intervening years since Jean-Claude's death, this political amnesia has continued to accelerate. Now, Jean-Claude Duvalier's return was almost a decade ago, and his death five years ago. With the aid of time, the atrocities of the Duvalier dictatorships have slipped further into an atmosphere of forgetting—an ambient atmosphere for a young Duvalier to claim his political inheritance. Nicholas Duvalier, grandson of François

Duvalier, and son of Jean-Claude, has had some speaking engagements on reconstruction in Haiti. When asked about the crimes of his forefathers he said "he would not return with actions 'not recognized under international law' and that 'dictatorship no longer has a place.'"[56] Nicholas's answers suggest that he will not be initiating any deeper conversations on the trauma his family built their wealth and power upon. This continued context of political amnesia ignites questions of how the Duvalier regime has been memorialized, the importance of its memorialization and what kind of mark it has left on the world both inside and outside Haiti.

The idea of "un lieu démémoiré" is framed against Pierre Nora's now seminal concept of the lieux de mémoire. In his now monumental piece, "Memory and History: Les Lieux de Mémoire," Pierre Nora offers a schematic for comprehending the changing relationship between memory and history. As Nora asserts, "History… is the reconstruction, always problematic and incomplete, of what is no longer. Memory is perpetually actual phenomenon, a bond tying us to the eternal present; history is a representation of the past."[57] Thus, we must understand memory and collective memory as an organic function, a product manufactured by involuntary human action. History, however, in Nora's conceptualization, is the exact opposite. It is a structure, aggressively and voluntarily made by humans in place of memory: "History's goal and ambition is not to exalt but to annihilate what has in reality taken place."[58] Up until recently, the master narrative of history has remained largely unquestioned. The saying that history is the story of the victors seems quite apt here. Nora uses compelling imagery to describe *lieux de mémoire* as events in the past that have been forgotten by history. He says,

> if history did not besiege memory, deforming and transforming it, penetrating and petrifying it, there would be no *lieux de mémoire*. Indeed, it is this very push and pull that produces *lieux de mémoire*—moments of history torn away from the movement of history, then returned; no longer quite life, nor yet death, like shells on the shore when the sea of living memory has receded[59]

We might imagine that the lieux de mémoire are the remains of a battle against the actual past (memory) and the narrative of the past (history). Further, we might understand lieux de mémoire to have a ghostly, haunting presence. This language, "no longer quite life, not yet death," certainly warrants such an interpretation. The memory of the Duvalier dictatorships exists in a space somewhere between life and death, as it haunts the living and the literature they produce.

Michael Rothberg's book *Multidirectional Memory: Remembering the Holocaust in the Age of Decolonization* is useful for considering the overlap between post-colonial, memory and Holocaust studies. His chapter "W.E.B. Du Bois in Warsaw: Holocaust Memory and the Colorline" provides a helpful analysis of Du Bois's "Negro and the Warsaw Ghetto," which discusses his journey to Poland in 1949. Rothberg argues that "Du Bois's encounter with the remains of the Warsaw Ghetto in 1949 confirms the need for a comparative approach to the multidirectionality of collective memory that considers questions of politics, aesthetics, and the public sphere in a nonreductive, transnational framework."[60] A comparative approach to collective memory is foundation for the analyses I create in this work. There is a collective memory of the Duvalier dictatorship that changes with geographic location. The memory of the Duvaliers and what their reign meant

change in relationship to location and current politics. In Paris, the Duvalier dictatorships mean something different for migrants facing deportation while Jean-Claude Duvalier resides in Paris. The memory of the dictatorships is obscured and fractured in Port-au-Prince and Haiti as reconfigured political threats take shape. The collective memory of the dictatorship means something else to the Haitian community in New York where perpetrators and victims might live side by side. What Rothberg highlights in his chapter on Du Bois is how the idea of double consciousness can be used for broader experience outside of African Americans in White American society. Rothberg writes:

> The 'unique' bifocal relationship of double consciousness that Du Bois charts in *The Souls of Black Folk* between African American subjects and dominant culture gets refigured in "The Negro and the Warsaw Ghetto" as a more general form for the expression of particular relationships between minority and majority culture and victimization and survival.[61]

The politics that exist in Haiti position the poor majority as a minority who are "othered" by the wealthy. Although double consciousness is not a term used in Haitian Studies, I think double consciousness can be interpreted as alienation and "othering." Returning to Weheliye, double consciousness would be a product of racializing assemblages. Double consciousness exists because those who have been racialized are read as non-human. Rothberg's attention to Du Bois's broadening of double consciousness allows an entry point to consider how sociopolitical processes can deem others as non-human even in societies that seem racially homogenous.

One would assume that because Haiti is an all-Black nation, racialized tensions should not exist. Yet, although Haiti is a Black nation, colorism, a vestige of white supremacy and slavery, has played a major role in the country's political power dynamics. Both Lyonel and Michel-Rolph Trouillot have referred to Haiti as an apartheid society, juxtaposing Haiti with South Africa. For a long time, South Africa had a white wealthy majority that ruled over the impoverished Black masses. There is a way in which darker, Blacker bodies in Haiti have continued to suffer because the class hierarchy in Haiti has largely remained unchanged since slavery. The specter of white supremacy and racialized assemblages continue to haunt Haiti due to their continued enmeshment in the United States' sphere of influence.

Combining Literary and Urban Studies: Literature and the City

For each city, I researched the history of critical attention to literary production in and literary representation of that city. There has been increased interest in literature and cities over the past decade. Scholars such as Sarah Nuttall, Madhu Dubey, and Dawn Fulton have written on the intersections of literature and urban space. Works such a John Ball's *Imagining London: Postcolonial Fiction and the Transnational Metropolis*, H. Murdoch's *Creolizing the Metropole: Migrant Caribbean Identities in Literature and Film*, Pascale de Souza and H. Adlai Murdoch's *Metropolitan Mosaics and Melting Pots: Paris and Montreal in Francophone Literatures*, contemplate the ways in which post-colonial narratives and migrants are shaped by and shape the western cities they move to inhabit. While western metropolises such as Paris, London, New York and others have long been

recognized as hubs for literary theorization, new scholarship has taken interest in cities in the Global South. Cities such as Nairobi, Bombay, and Johannesburg have entered into contemporary discussions on the literary urban. In "Literary City" Sara Nuttall's chapter in *Johannesburg, Elusive Metropolis,* she contends that "in contemporary literature, particularly fiction, the city [Johannesburg] emerges in an even more self-conscious way as an aesthetic, a political and an imaginary site, a vivid and explicit template for entire array of social fears and possibilities."[62] Nuttall queries how "literary infrastructures" mold the city's "imaginary shape." Nuttall analyzes specific locations—the street, the campus, and the café—within contemporary South African fiction set in Johannesburg. This move to understand everyday spaces as depicted in literature is a part of a growing interest to understand how imagined urban sites shed light on socio-political realities. *The Unhealed Wound* contributes to this conversation by using the city as a locus for interrogating Black migrants memories of violence and oppression.

For the Paris section, I utilize Henri Lefebvre's term the right to the city as well as his idea of social space to consider how fictional Haitian migrants are denied their right to Paris. France and Paris's absorption of Jean-Claude Duvalier causes psychic wounds to the Haitian community there; his refuge in Paris is a violation of Haitian's right to live safely in Paris.

Tin the Port-au-Prince section, I extend my analysis from scholar Marie Jose N'Zengou-Tayo's understanding of urban Haitian literature from the 1980's-1990's. The Port-au-Prince section utilizes the longstanding tradition of Haitian authors representing class inequality in the city as a point of departure for understanding the

connections between physical violence and alienation in recent literature set in the city.

In the New York section, I consider New York's literary history as an alienated space and how the memory of Duvalier dictatorship contributes to that representation. I cite scholar Farrah Griffith's work on the migration narrative and urbanism as a starting point.

Ultimately, this project attempts to consider how Black trauma intersects with narratives of these three different cities, in particular the memory of the Duvalier dictatorship and the political violence that directly linked to it.

Part 1. Paris

Imagined Encounters: Un Haitïen à Paris

Paris is frequently discussed and conceptualized as a place of exile for vulnerable marginalized communities—immigrants escaping persecution and various other kinds of unique people have fled to the perceived "safety" of Paris. Where does this perception of Paris as a safe haven originate ? Throughout the 19th and 20th century, France received many refugees, fleeing violence from their homelands.[63] Since the ratification of the 1793 Constitution, France's national identity has always incorporated providing shelter and a lending a hand to those seeking liberty. The 1793 constitution proclaims the necessity to give " asylum to foreigners who, in the name of liberty, are banished from their homelands, and refuse it to tyrants."[64] The current French constitution reaffirms these words, referencing the preamble from the 1946 constitution that states, "Any man persecuted in virtue of his actions in favor of liberty may claim asylum upon the territories of the republic."[65] (Tout homme persécuté en raison de son action en faveur de la liberté a droit d'asile sur les territoires de la République) In 1993, the Conseil Constitutionnel, France's highest court, confirmed that "asylum is a constitutional right for those who qualify for it."[66] Suffice to say, offering asylum has been an integral part of France's governing laws for over two centuries. Yet in the last several decades, particularly as the country's demographic makeup has shifted to include diverse constituents, France's stance on migration and asylum has wavered. Although promising to refuse asylum to tyrants,

France has a track record of doing quite the opposite. While the country has accepted corrupt individuals like Jean-Claude Duvalier, Ayatollah Khomeini, and Teodorin Obiang, thousands of marginalized immigrants have been denied access to France and its capital, Paris. For nearly three decades Jean-Claude Duvalier used France and Paris as a shield from his wrongdoing. How has his absorption into the fabric of Paris tainted the dynamics of the city?

In some regards, Paris could be considered the birthplace of the politics of the urban—politics that demand a critical stance toward modern societal structures. Politics that would reinforce France's commitment to liberté, égalité and fraternité. Urban and cultural theorists such as Henri Lefebvre, Manuel Castells, and Michel de Certeau all gained prominence from their scholarship on space, the urban, the homogenization of modern life and alienation. This outpouring of theoretical production was catalyzed by Paris's May 1968 protests.[67] Naturally, this makes Paris an integral part of conceptualizing what a city is, and what it could or should be. Paris has been a crucial location in the development of critical urban studies. In *Cities for People, Not for Profit*, current urban scholars define this field as one concerned with

> exposing the marginalizations, exclusion and injustices (whether of class, ethnicity, 'race,' gender, sexuality, nationality or otherwise) that are inscribed and naturalized within existing configurations… [as well as] decipher[ing] the contradictions, crisis tendencies, and lines of potential or actual conflict within contemporary cities."[68]

Despite the fact that Paris has been inspirational for forward thought on urban inclusion, the city itself continues to be incredibly exclusionary and isolating for immigrants, of low political status in particular.

Authors Shay Youngblood and Évelyne Trouillot utilize Paris as an imagined backdrop for the confrontation between imagined victims and their tormentors—more specifically between Haitians migrants and Jean-Claude Duvalier. These fictitious confrontations expose larger Parisian narratives that are often obscured by dominating narratives. In depicting the impact of Duvalier's presence on Haitian migrants, these authors also expose the contradictory and harmful nature of the Parisian and French government. France and the United States collaborated to help end Duvalier's rule due to the increasing unrest and violence against Haitian citizens, but France continued its own violence against Haitians and other Black migrants in the Hexagon. As Youngblood indicates through the inclusion of real events such as the police-inflicted death of Malik Oussekine and the brutal deportation of 101 Malians, one could be in Haiti, France, or the United States and still witness the brutalization of black bodies. The impunity France granted Duvalier while simultaneously cleansing itself of migrants is its own kind of psychic violence that betrays an individual's right to shape the city in which s/he resides. Trouillot's depiction of François Duvalier's decaying wife in a nursing home in Paris further speaks to the psychological damage inflicted on Haitian migrants who must co-exist and even serve the architects of their trauma.

Drawing from Henri Lefebvre's understanding of "social space," as well as his term "The right to the city" in conjunction with Pierre Nora's concept of les lieux

de mémoire, I will analyze how Shay Youngblood's *Black Girl in Paris* and Évelyne Trouillot's *La Mémoire aux abois*, two works of contemporary Black fiction, critique Paris and the ways it debilitates Black immigrants, particularly Haitian migrants. These novels portray the way in which immigrants are not only ostracized by the well-known channels of disenfranchisement, but how Haitian immigrants are rendered psychological harm by the city's amnesty for ex-dictator Jean-Claude Duvalier. I argue that migrants' memories of the Duvalier dictatorship make Paris a lieux de mémoire for the dictatorship. Paris serves as a crucial background for an imagined confrontation and possible reconciliation between tormentors and their victims.

Witnessing, Memory and the Right to Paris

Between Papa Doc and Baby Doc Duvalier, thousands were murdered, and millions sent into exile. From the 1990's into the present, there began a massive creative production to address the memory of the father-son dictatorship. A number of novels—Kettly Mars' *Saisons Sauvages* (*Savage Seasons*), Dany Laferrière's *Le cri des oiseaux fous* (*The Cry of Mad Birds*), Marie Vieux-Chauvet's *Colère, amour, folie* (*Anger, Love and Madness*) depict life under the dictatorship or fleeing from it. In this chapter, I am particularly interested in novels that imagine witnessing what comes after the dictatorship and exile— novels that grapple with the unreconciled trauma of the dictatorship and Jean-Claude Duvalier's impunity as he rested in exile in France.

Shoshana Felman's 1992 *Testimony: Crises of Witnessing in Literature, Psychoanalysis, and History* is a seminal text in the Holocaust and trauma theory canon. Felman considers how literature becomes a witness to the Holocaust, arguing that certain stylistic attributes of Camus's writing are

> …the indirect expressions of—or the belated testimonies to—the radical crisis of witnessing the Holocaust has been, and to the consequent, ongoing, as yet unresolved crisis of history, a crisis which in turn is translated into a *crisis of literature* insofar literature becomes a witness, and perhaps the only witness, to the crisis within history which precisely cannot be articulated, witnessed in the given categories of history itself.[69]

Through her reading of Albert Camus's, *The Plague*, Felman creates a framework for understanding how literature can both stand in the place of history but also provide nuance to the shape of it. Further Felman tells us that Camus offers an example of a new form of narrative testimony that exists not "merely to record, but to rethink and in the act of rethinking, in effect, transform history by bearing witness to the holocaust.[70]" I wonder how this context of literature bearing witness might translate to the Duvalier dictatorship and its memory? Ultimately, Jean-Claude Duvalier was never held accountable for the severe and vast number of human rights violations that he, his father, and their army of henchmen ravaged on the Haitian population. When Baby Doc returned to Haiti shortly after the 2010 earthquake, welcomed by many, professor and author Régine Jean-Charles called this moment "un lieu démémoiré, a charged and divided atmosphere of forgetting.[71]" I am curious how we might think of literature that bears witness to the reverberations of a traumatic incident, and the role

of geographic space in that witnessing. Felman tells us that this new mode of narrative testimony is a way of rethinking. In this chapter, I argue that Shay Youngblood's and Évelyne Trouillot's novels bear witness to the ongoing trauma of Duvalier's legacy which ultimately galvanizes readers to rethink Paris and narratives about Paris. As the home of Jean-Claude Duvalier's exile, Paris and France are inextricably linked to the legacy of the Duvalier dictatorship.

Throughout the dissertation, I utilize the term *les lieux de mémoire*, however I want to emphasize the special link between les lieux de mémoire and Paris. Nora's original project stems from a rigorous analysis of the construction of French history. To suggest that Haitian migrants' memories create les lieux de mémoire in Paris is quite important. Given the ways that Haitian immigrants have experienced erasure in the city of light, my suggestion that their memories reshape Paris's urban narrative is valuable for Francophone and Haitian Studies. This intervention is particularly important given the fact that a major criticism of Nora's seminal collection is its lacunae with respect to France's colonial empire.

A 2010 special issue of the *Yale French Studies* journal, "Nœuds de mémoire: Multidirectional Memory in Postwar French and Francophone Culture", is dedicated to reconfiguring Nora's lieux de mémoire. Michael Rothberg insists that Nora's "binary opposition between history and memory" does not offer the most fruitful understanding of "cultures of memory and transmission of the past."[72] Instead, Rothberg's project works to focus on the more fluid concept of memory where it "emerges from unexpected, multidirectional encounters—encounters between diverse pasts and a conflictual present, to be sure, but also different agents or catalysts of

memory."[73] Rothberg argues for understanding lieux de mémoire as kind of entangled web memory or nœud/knot. I largely agree with Rothberg's re-working of the lieux de mémoire into a knot. Strict binaries such as those constructed by Nora to contrast memory and history can be dangerous. Interpolating concepts of race through basic binaries is part of the reason why the myth of France's color-blindness endures. France's appreciation for talented African Americans in the early and mid-20th century has often been held as proof of France's color-blind mentality. This perception, that all people of African descent are treated the same regardless of national identity, connects back to the idea of a white/ black racial binary. A nuanced understanding of Blackness in France is necessary to understand how different ethnic groups of Black people are treated in the Hexagon. Although I appreciate the extra dimensions that the idea of a *nœud* brings to the "lieux de mémoire" concept, I have ultimately chosen to understand memory in this project as lieux or place, its English equivalent. The use of lieux really signifies the importance of physical place—more so than a nœud, which means a knot. The ways that Duvalier and the legacy of his and his family's violence reshape narratives of a city are better understood through frames of space and location.

We cannot rethink trauma and bearing witness to trauma without considering how they impact space. If the rules of public space frequently elide marginalized people who take part in public space, then the memories of marginalized people are forgotten in the narratives created about that same public space. How do we think about Paris as a lieux de mémoire for Jean-Claude Duvalier's dictatorship, full of

literal spaces that Duvalier touched during his exile? Places of memory, just like urban spaces, cohere due to the social relations that construct them. The preface of Pierre Nora's American edition, *Realms of Memory* tells us

> in essence, the act of remembering is always related to the repository of images and ideals that constitute the social relations of which we take. Places of memory are therefore determined by the mix of individuals that constitute the social group to which they relate.[74]

If certain social groups create places of memory, what are the memory spaces for Haitians who live and have lived in Paris? What might those places look like? They might be a church or restaurant within the Haitian community, but could they also be a place that bears the memory of Jean-Claude Duvalier's lengthy exile in France? Baby Doc's old apartment or a restaurant he visited, or even perhaps a covert place where he met with former Tonton Macoutes, could function as a lieu de mémoire. Both Shay Youngblood and Évelyne Trouillot create a fictionalized Paris, where they envision Jean-Claude Duvalier or another prominent member of the Duvalier family as a part of the fabric of post-1986 Paris. Both of these novels imagine protagonists who witness the trauma associated with Duvalier's presence in Paris.

Within critical urban studies, there has been a recent resurgence of interest in Henri Lefebvre's term "the right to the city." In the introduction to *Cities for People, Not for Profit*, the slogan is understood to represent "one important rallying cry and basis for transformative political mobilization in many contemporary cities, and… resonates with earlier calls to create 'cities for citizens.'"[75] The term does not only

appeal to academics studying the city, but also activists fighting for equal access and opportunities within their communities. For example, The Right to the City Alliance exemplifies the ways in which Lefebvre's idea has spread beyond the confines of theory and rooted itself within actual communities. "The right to the city" adds another dimension to conceptualizing the traumatic impact of Duvalier's exile in Paris. What is a Haitian's right to space in Paris?

Lefebvre's original conception of the term "the right to the city" developed as he imagined a future city that catered to the city's inhabitants. As late capitalism was fast encroaching upon the shape of modern European cities, Lefebvre envisioned what cities could become. He says

> The right to the city manifests itself as a superior form of rights: right to freedom, to individualization in socialization, to habitat and to inhabit. The right to the *oeuvre,* to participation and *appropriation* (clearly distinct from the right to property), are implied in the right to the city.[76]

The right to the city was a complex philosophy that Lefebvre had only just begun to articulate in his 1968 monograph of the same name, *Le droit à la ville* (The Right to the City). His idea of a future city, or ephemeral city as he termed it, originates from a discussion on the utility of science fiction for imagining future cities. Lefebvre argues for the importance of the imaginary as a means for conceiving solutions to social problems. He queries, "why should the imaginary enter only outside the real instead of nurturing reality?"[77] Ever perspicacious, he further explains that, "when there is a loss of thought in and by the imaginary, it is being manipulated."[78] The imaginary is the ultimate tool for altering the status quo. If the imaginary cannot fulfill this

function, those in power have succeeded in debilitating the imaginary and stymying it as threat. Beneficiaries of the current hierarchy deflate and deform the imaginary so that it no longer imagines successful new worlds and cities without them. By realigning Lefebvre with contemporary migrant fiction set in Paris, I highlight the ways in which Paris has further distanced itself from the rights of its vulnerable inhabitants.

The right to the city also overlaps with Lefebvre's thinking on social space. He realized that social space was highly political and, in his work, *The Production of Space*, he theorizes the networks that exist within social space. He says,

> Is space a social relationship? Certainly—but one which is inherent to property relationships (especially the ownership of the earth, of land) and closely bound up with the forces of production (which impose a form on that earth or land); here we see the polyvalence of social space, its 'reality' at once formal and material. Though a product to be used, to be consumed, it is also a means of production; networks of exchanges and flows of raw materials and energy fashion space and are determined by it.[79]

If space is a social relationship made of "networks of exchange and flows of raw material and energy", what kind of fraught networks of energy might exist between a tyrant and his dispossessed citizenry? Jean-Claude Duvalier lived in France for thirteen years before a formal complaint was filed concerning his presence in France. Even though a dictator, Baby Doc still was able to maintain power and influence while in exile in France.

What is a migrant's, and more specifically, a Haitian's right to Paris? The right to the city has taken on many new and unique interpretations in the last few decades. Many scholars seem to agree that Lefebvre's original conceptualization of the term exemplifies thinking more about the future, rather than the contemporary cities of the present. However, they have extended the right of the city to think about current cities. Lefebvre theorized a way of living and existing in social space that is useful for understanding the network of relations in current cities. The right to the city is a moral claim, founded on fundamental principles of justice. Urban studies scholar Peter Marcuse further elaborates on the right to the city in today's context in Los Angeles:

> "Right" is not meant as a legal claim enforceable through a judicial process today (although that may be part of the claim); rather, it is multiple rights that are incorporated here: not just one, not just a right to public space, or a right to information and transparency in government, or a right to this service or that, but the right to a totality, a complexity in which each of the parts is part of a single whole, to which the right is demanded. The homeless person in Los Angeles has not won the right to the city when he is allowed to sleep on a park bench in the center of the city. [80]

The image Marcuse provides of the homeless man and his right to the city is most compelling. Undeniably, the homeless man is a part of the city and his existence within the city is a part of the city's production of city space. Yet, he does not have the right to it, because he is marginalized socioeconomically and politically. Marcuse interprets the right of the city as a set of rights from which the homeless man is so

clearly precluded. If migrants are not given a right to the city, they therefore are not given a right to shaping the city's narrative or its memory.

Therefore, lieux de mémoire can be said to be created when migrant narratives are erased from a city's public memory. Haitians in Paris and the trauma surrounding the memory of the Duvalier dictatorship have been largely silenced. In another project, I might perform actual fieldwork and search for these literal spaces that are lieux de mémoire of the Duvalier dictatorship in Paris. Here in this chapter, I instead examine the fictionalized witnessing of these lieux de mémoire. Shay Youngblood and Évelyne Trouillot's novels bear witness to the violation of migrants' right to Paris as well as specifically the blatant disregard for the trauma surrounding the Duvalier dictatorship and Jean-Claude's impunity.

Duvalier and his over-extended stay in the land of asylum

Black Girl in Paris and *La Mémoire aux abois* were both published in the 2000's—an era that saw increased public discussion about global human rights violations and the rise of international human rights courts.[81] *Black Girl in Paris* (2000) and *La Mémoire aux abois* (2010) follow increased activism in the late 1990's and early 2000's to bring Jean-Claude Duvalier to justice. These novels reflect the dialogue concerning Duvalier's continued immunity and what it meant for local Haitian communities, larger global events, as well as other contemporary human rights legislation and tribunal proceedings deeply entangled in the vestiges of colonialism.

Felman remarks that "literature bears testimony not just to duplicate or record events, but to make history available to the imaginative act whose historical unavailability has prompted, and made possible, a holocaust."[82] For Felman, forgetting what fictions imagine is in part what contributed to a Holocaust. In the case of these novels, it is not that the violence (killings, torture, etc.) of the Holocaust that is imagined but the reconciliation after the Holocaust. Much like the Holocaust of World War II, in the early 2000's, the Duvalier dictatorship was still historically unavailable for study. The imaginative act, of envisioning Haitian migrants confronting a Duvalier, demands to make the Duvalier's history, or the memory of that history recognized and held accountable. There were, during the 1990's, failed attempts by activists to bring Jean-Claude Duvalier's illegal status to the attention of the French government. Ultimately, the government decided that Baby Docs's presence was of no harm to national security. It is fitting that these novels imagine what actual French judges could not—the kind of harm Baby Doc's presence signified for Haitian communities living in Paris.

In order to contextualize these novels' histories, it is necessary to start from the beginning, on February 7, 1986, when Jean-Claude Duvalier arrived in France. At first, his time in France was to be "temporary." Yet, somehow, it became his home for 25 years until he returned to Haiti. He arrived with what was rumored to be millions in wealth. There were whispers that he had $300 million inside his hotel—Hotel de l'Abbaye.[83] It seems that at first, the French government had earnest interest in trying to ship Duvalier elsewhere; "The French government, in concert, with the United States agreed to allow Duvalier to stay temporarily in France 'to facilitate a

transition to democracy' in Haiti."[84] Yet, by 1990, the government had seemed to accept Duvalier's existence as along as he remained discreet. In 1990, the Associated Press reported that Baby Doc had just become "a part of the luxurious landscape" in Southern France.[85] After verifying with President François Mitterrand's office and the Foreign Ministry, Associate Press reporter Mort Rosenblum concluded that, "The government's unofficial position is that authorities hope no one notices he is still here. The case falls into a zone known loosely in France as 'artistic vagueness.'"[86]

In an era during which France was tightening border controls and decreasing the influx of immigrants, it is contradictory that the French government allowed Jean-Claude Duvalier to reside in luxurious exile. This dissonance was not lost upon other Parisian citizens and exiled Haitians living in France. In December 1998, Jacques Samyn filed a residency complaint against Duvalier. Numerous news reports mention that Duvalier interviewed in various recent media of the time and claimed residency in France despite the fact that his refugee request had been denied in 1992. Since at least 1991, Duvalier had begun publicly re-engaging with politics. Through his lawyer, Duvalier issued a statement to the news agency l'AFP (Agence France Presse) responding to the September 29th military coup that overthrew President Jean-Bertrand Aristide in Haiti. He was quoted as saying,

> De tels affrontements [immixtion étrangère] sont criminels et suicidaires pour les pays…La solution de la crise actuelle doit résulter d'une concertation des grandes institutions de l'État avec tous les secteurs de la vie nationale, toutes les forces vives du pays, concertation qui devra avant tout assurer l'oubli de tous les différends du passé, empêcher que ne renaissent des affrontements et

> recréer, dans la réconciliation, une véritable unité nationale, sans laquelle Haïti n'a absolument aucun espoir de redressement ni même de survie. (Such clashes [foreign interference] are criminal and suicidal for the country…The solution to the current crisis must result from collaboration from the great institutions of the State with all of the sectors of national life, all of the country's forces, consulting together which must above all ensure forgetting all past disputes, avoiding the resurgence and recreation of conflicts, in reconciliation, a true national unity, without which Haiti has absolutely no hope of recovery or even survival) [87]

It is intriguing to say the least that Jean-Claude Duvalier, only five years after his own expulsion from Haiti was claiming to be invested in "une véritable unité nationale." He had so quickly forgotten his own collusions with foreign interests such as the United States and his violent repression of any oppositional groups. Where was this determination for unity across sectors when he was in power himself? To think that he was sitting somewhere safe and cozy in France, lamenting the ongoing violence in Haiti and declaring that all past differences must be forgotten, is quite galling. He stated that Haiti cannot move forward until these differences are forgotten, which implies that his own atrocities should be swept under the rug. Jean-Claude was likely aware that his own supporters were responsible for numerous violent incidences committed since his exile. In his speech, he did not denounce violence caused by his own followers.

On April 29th 1997, Duvalier made his first public speech from Paris, again requesting for Haitians to forgive each other and unite the country. He envisioned for

himself a role in “transforming the country.”[88] By the end of the 1990’s, a constituency of people, exhausted by Duvalier’s impunity and ability to make public appearances (although he did often do them by phone to keep his location secret), begins to be more vocal. Jacques Samyn cited the recent British authorities’ arrest of ex-dictator Pinochet as inspiration for demanding Duvalier’s deportation from France. He said, “The French authorities applauded the decision on Pinochet but have done nothing about Duvalier who has been left in impunity thanks to support from on high.”[89] News reports characterize Samyn as a “human rights activist” who worked for Amnesty International, while others have affiliated him with the French Independent Ecology Movement (MEI)[90] as well as a former member of the Picardy Regional Council and as a ”militant.” Samyn emphasized the French government’s hypocrisy; “We want to highlight that while the government tracks down poor and vulnerable immigrants, it has no such qualms about a villain like Baby Doc.”[91]

It is particularly alarming that France would allow Jean-Claude Duvalier to continue to reside in France while wading back into Haitian politics. In the years since Duvalier’s exile, Haiti’s politics have been incredibly turbulent. No government could retain power and democratic elections could not be held. Much of the violence occurring in the 1990’s was attributed to previous Duvalierists. The rise and fall of both General Namphy and President Jean Bertrand Aristide were emblematic of the Haitian power structure. Anyone, if they lined their pieces up correctly, could return to power. The ability of Aristide to persuade his way back to the presidency likely encouraged Duvalier that he too might return to power in Haiti if he could garner enough support.

The fact that Duvalierists in Haiti were not being held accountable for their past crimes and Jean-Claude Duvalier was allowed to rebuild a public platform on the state of the Haitian government while residing in France strongly indicated that the international community was lenient with Jean-Claude Duvalier. Ultimately, this sent a signal that Duvalier could very well be allowed to return to power. Given France's history of harboring fallen tyrants, it seemed very possible in the early 1990s that France might allow Duvalier to reclaim power.

It is easy to imagine, that for those who did not see themselves as Duvalierists, Duvalier's presence in Paris and elsewhere in France was incredibly disturbing. Although a deposed despot, he still maintained influence and power—clearly enough that the French government conveniently ignored his illegal status. Since many Haitian residents feared repercussions, Samyn took on Duvalier's case in their stead. He explained, "They fear for their lives. The dictator still has secret service people and mercenaries in our country. He still has many 'friends' at home."[92] If someone were to come forward against Duvalier in France, their families might be threatened back home by Duvalier's 'friends.'

The Associated Press reported that on May 11, 1999, Duvalier's residency hearing was thrown out because Jacques Samyn "had not personally suffered from Duvalier's presence in France for the past 13 years." It also cites "procedural problems."[93] The court could not move forward with the complaint because Jean-Claude Duvalier's address was not up-to-date, an incredible technicality on which to throw out a residency case. One might imagine that the Interior Ministry could intervene if Duvalier's residency was of interest to the French state. Historian of

French migration, Alec G. Hargreave contends that, "even if they [foreigners] have committed no criminal offence, foreigners are open to expulsion at any time if the Interior Minister judges them to be a 'threat to public order.'"[94] One might imagine that a minister judge would construe Duvalier's speeches as a "threat to public order," particularly if there was concern that he was organizing Macoutes within French borders. Yet there seemingly was no concern. Conversely, one must wonder if poorer migrants would have been? saved from deportation if their addresses could not be found. A 1988 news article from London's *The Guardian* cites the thousands of immigrants France expelled within the two years Duvalier arrived; "More than 13,000 were deported in 1986 and nearly 18,000 last year. More than 3,000 were expelled in January and February. Admission to France was refused to 71,000 visitors last year because it was though they wanted to settle illegally."[95] It is likely that the French government did not have an accurate address for many of those deported, but that did not hinder them from sending those migrants back to their home countries .

Jacques Samyn was not the only person vested in Duvalier's deportation; exiled Haitian photographer and revolutionist Gérald Bloncourt also attempted to have Duvalier brought to justice. Adept at capturing injustice, in more ways than one, Haitian communist, Gérald Bloncourt, created a committee to bring Duvalier to trial. Bloncourt was exiled from Haiti for over forty years. He is well known as a leader of the "cinq glorieuses,"[96] which catalyzed the end of President Antoine Louis Léocardie Élie Lescot's rule in Haiti. While in exile in France, Bloncourt became a well-known photographer with images focused on portraying immigrants as well as workers. His photos appeared in books such as *Le Paris Arabe* and *Paris Ouvrier.*[97] Bloncourt's

committee proves that counter to the judge's ruling, there were Haitians in Paris impacted by Duvalier's residence in France. All of this background informs the moments in which Shay Youngblood and Évelyne Trouillot create their novels that imagine what the French government refuses to acknowledge.

Paris Noir

Paris Noir can refer to African American writing about Paris in the early part of the 20th century; however, in recent years, simply *noir* has come to represent being Black in France. The introduction to the 2012 edited collection *Black France/ France Noire* explains that,

> the very emergence of the term "visible minorities" and the confrontational use of the nomenclature "Noir" instead of the pervasive English word "Black" by individuals and groups politically mobilizing in France represent a critical shift in French political culture on the terrains of race, identity, and other categories of recognition in the public space.[98]

The 2000's also see a rise in discussion focusing on what it means to be uniquely and specifically Black in the European and French contexts. Both *Black Girl in Paris* and *La mémoire aux abois* are a part of, and in dialogue with, these existing narratives.[99]

France and its capital have often been represented as the foil and antithesis of America and its race problem. From W.E. B. Du Bois, Josephine Baker, and Richard Wright to James Baldwin, many African American creative luminaries came to recharge their brilliance in the City of Light. Tyler Stovall's seminal *Paris Noir*

examines the history of African Americans in the interwar period, arguing that the "African American community in Paris symbolizes the potential of African American life in general once it is fully liberated from the shades or racism."[100] However, the mobility offered to African Americans in Paris was not experienced by all with darker complexions. Several critical works by scholars such as Dominic Thomas, Bennetta Jules-Rosette, and Brent Hayes Edwards as well as Francophone scholars Raphaël Confiant and Edouard Glissant consider African and Caribbean blackness within the Hexagon.

In "No More Eden: The Place of Diasporic Encounters in *Paris Noir* Fiction" Laila Amine argues that a key element of Paris Noir fiction is a recognition and mapping of racial hierarchies in Paris. Amine also analyzes how *Black Girl in Paris* also follows this trend. I agree with her assessment, but am also interested in considering how Haitians appear in this hierarchy. My contention is that they are rendered less visible than other racialized subjects.

There has also been increased critical attention focused on Franco-Arab or Maghrebi literature in Paris for the last four decades. One recent text, Laila Amine's *Post-Colonial Paris* argues that it is "the first cultural study of Paris that focuses on the colonial and post-colonial periphery."[101] Her work focuses on representations of Algerians and intimacy in France's capital. Her attention to the geographic location in Paris of these representations is important to the theoretical framework of this chapter. Amine acknowledges that, although "numerous studies have explored the varied communities and contestation of a postcolonial London, no comparable work has asked what it would mean to reimagine the equally if not more iconic city on the

other side of the channel."[102] This chapter also uses literature to reimagine the landscape of Paris and "the spatiality of power,"[103] with respect to Haitian migrants. Within the plethora of critical analysis on Black representation, identity and migration within and to Paris, there is very little focusing on Haitian migrants—particularly written in English.

Critical attention and interventions in Black Francophone literary studies almost exclusively focus on the DOM-TOMs (departments and territoires outre-mer) such as Martinique, Guadeloupe, and African ex-colonies like Algeria. In part, this is due to the fact that all of those nations and places are better interpolated through a post-colonial lens. When considering Haiti's earlier separation from France, the dynamic between Ayiti and France has unique aspects. Analysis of the social, political, cultural and economic factors related to Haiti's relationship to France does not cohere in a framework that works for somewhere like Senegal or Algeria. One might argue that the relationship between France and Haiti is even more tenuous and ambiguous. Regine Jackson's research on Haitians living in Paris further corroborates the increased invisibility of Haitian migrants in the capital.

In Geographies of the Haitian Diaspora, Jackson finds that the largest growth in the Haitian population residing in France occurred in the 1980's, but this population increase was dominated by Haitians who did not have French citizenship. The majority of the French Haitian diaspora is concentrated in metropolitan Paris (88% at the time of Jackson's study), yet they too had a very limited right to the city. Haitians have had particular difficulty obtaining citizenship and employment in France and the hexagon. This surely correlates with France and Haiti's tenuous

history.[104] Many Francophone communities originating from Africa or the Caribbean began with a generation of migrant workers during 20th century colonialism. These migrants came to Paris while they were technically still French citizens. This is not the case for Haitians who migrated to France during the 20th century. Jackson shrewdly points out the French citizenship paradox for immigrants, especially Haitian ones. The tenets of French Republicanism encourage immigrants to replace their identity with French values and culture, yet does not actually provide immigrants with the ability to become legal citizens.[105]

As Regine Jackson's research on Haitians in Paris and the French asylum system reports: "From 1996 to 2000, only 14 percent of Haitian asylum applicants were accepted, and from 2001 to 2006, only 8 percent were accepted."[106] This decline in acceptance rates does not correlate to a decline in applications. In fact, as the asylum applications increased, the acceptances continually decreased, particularly during the years 1996-2006. This plays into a larger conversation on France's increasing nativist and "bordering closing" immigrations policies. Dominic Thomas' chapter "Sarkozy's Law, National identity and the institutionalization of Xenophobia" traces a genealogy of contemporary France's "vocabulaire de menace" (vocabulary of menace) that stirred fear of the "other" in French citizens' hearts. He claims, "A vast discrepancy can be identified between the resources allocated to the fight against illegal immigration and those aimed at integration efforts; in reality, these procedures have been accompanied by a decline in the rights of foreigners and migrants."[107]

This chapter does work to acknowledge how Shay Youngblood's *Black Girl in Paris* and Évelyne Trouillot's *La mémoire aux abois* interject in the conversation

pertaining to the Black migrant experience in France. I argue that they both reinsert Haitians back into this larger conversation on France's growing xenophobia, particularly against Black migrants. Jean-Claude Duvalier's presence in France, particularly Paris, exacerbated the complex dynamic of Haitian identity in France. His presence in Paris symbolizes the trauma his family wrought in Haiti, a trauma that many of his countrymen must relive while co-existing in Paris with him. His presence exposes that contradictory nature of France's racism and favoritism.

Black Girl in Paris

The only Black immigrants who have a right to Paris are those with financial and social capital. For people of color, their labor is devoured while their concerns dismissed to the periphery, where they are left to engineer their own survival. Those who are shunned to the margins have their narratives ignored in public memory and national history. While following protagonist Eden's journey to and through Youngblood's Paris, *Black Girl in Paris* depicts the ways in which both Haitian and African American immigrants are made invisible, exploited and tormented in the city of light in the 1980s. The young 26-year-old African American, Eden, is in search of creative inspiration to begin her life as a writer. She also hopes to find and meet her literary forefather James Baldwin. Fully aware of the history of African American creatives in Paris, Eden is eager to follow in the footsteps of Richard Wright, James Baldwin and Josephine Baker. Eden, like many of the African Americans before her, yearns to abandon America's racism and find herself welcomed into the open arms of

Paris. For Eden France means freedom; her Aunt Vic is the first to plant this fledging idea in Eden's mind. While pointing out Paris on a map, Aunt Vic tells her, "Black people were free in Paris. Free to live where you wanted, work where you were qualified and love whom you pleased."[108] Once arriving, Eden realizes that freedom, as well as safety, is incredibly difficult for Black migrants in Paris.

Eden's narrative, as a Black girl in Paris, serves as both a how-to-guide and map for survival in Mitterrand's and Chirac's xenophobic 1986 Paris. In the beginning of Eden's story, she tells us that she is a mapmaker. Throughout her year or two adventure, she tries to survive in a city plagued by terrorism and fear. The prevalence of attacks and bombs are so omnipresent that Eden even begins to dream of explosions:

> The cinema shook and the lights dimmed for blocks around. When the smoke cleared we could see piles of broken glass and bits of clothing and flesh stuck to the interior walls of the building. A spray of blood had changed the color of my dress. Body parts were melted to floor like candle wax…The last thing I remember before waking up as the sound of a woman screaming. I drew a map of places to avoid during times of war.[109]

With this heightened fear of terrorism comes a heightened tension towards migrants. In many ways *Black Girl in Paris* operates as historical fiction. Although Eden and her peers are fictional, the events that surround their lives are not. Real events are interwoven into the text such as the police-afflicted death of student Malik Oussekine after the student protest of December 6, 1986, the deportation of 101 Malians in 1987,

and Jean-Claude Duvalier's residency in Paris. Eden is very much a witness to the xenophobia and violence that migrants face in 1980's France.

Set in 1986, *Black Girl in Paris* portrays how France's increasingly constrictive immigration policies were in direct contradiction with the idea that France and particularly Paris were safe havens for refugees and persecuted migrants. Preceded by La Loi de 1974[110], which officially closed France's borders to immigrants, the year 1986 was an extension of France's ongoing shift towards immigration restriction, or managed migration.[111] Jacques Chirac as the Prime Minister of Paris at the time increasingly focused on ridding France of unwanted guests. In an interview that appeared in the October 30, 1984, issue of the Paris daily, *Libération*, Chirac correlates France's unemployment problems with increased migration. He says, "Naturally, if there were fewer immigrants, there would be less unemployment, fewer tensions in certain towns and neighborhoods, a lower social cost."[112] Under his logic, immigrants are the direct cause of unemployment. His interviewer suggests that research has not proven that reason but Chirac is certain that there is a very clear, direct correlation between the two issues. He continues, stating:

> This means that we must not accept any new immigration and that we must severely curb illegal immigrants, rigorously apply the laws of the Republic, systematically expel those whose status is irregular and doubtless promote a policy of encouraging return migration…To finance this system, one must create a fund finance jointly by France, by the countries of origin, and by the foreign communities living in France, which are wealthier than one thinks.[113]

Here Chirac suggests marginalized migrants as well as their possibly corrupt and indebted homelands to France via neo-colonialism should help finance their own deportation. President Trump's campaign promise to develop a wall along the Mexico border and make the Mexican government pay for it echoes French politicians' plans at the time of Youngblood's novel. For Eden, who arrives two years after this Chirac interview, she is a part of a new migration that is explicitly unwanted.

A friend of Eden's first points out France's strict immigration policies, specifically noting that the flood of Haitian and Ethiopian immigrants were the government's prime targets for deportation. Within this context, Eden's experiences as an African American in Paris are contrasted against that of a young Haitian migrant named Olu-Christophe. Olu-Christophe has the profile of a typical Haitian immigrant in Paris—a medical student, who left for France to study abroad, but at the same time, is afraid to return during the Duvalier dictatorship. When Eden meets Olu in 1986, the Duvalier dictatorship has just ended, yet Olu is still wary of returning home—understandably so, as Olu-Christophe would return to severe political upheaval and withered resources. Although Olu's ability to speak French provides him certain advantages, ultimately his Haitian identity does not offer a better social status than Eden. They are both *l'étranger*. While telling Eden about his homesickness, Olu recalls,

> When I first arrived in Paris I was insulted and harassed when I said I was Haitian. People called me dirty, accusing all Haitians of having AIDS. Sometimes I pretended to be French or African. There was so much turmoil and

corruption and fear at home. I was trapped between two places and couldn't live in peace in either one.[114]

Here Youngblood articulates a hierarchy of Blackness within Paris. Olu-Christophe is received better as French or African rather than Haitian. This passage also reflects the political rhetoric of the era as it was shaped by the outbreak of AIDS in Haiti in the late 1980's and early 1990's.[115] Olu-Christophe says that he is "trapped between two places" and so he cannot find anywhere to belong. He experiences a double-edged alienation from both his current home in Paris and his native land. Dominic Thomas cites Salman Rushdie for terming this phenomenon as "double-unbelonging;" he notes that, "unable to fully integrate into French society, and considered outsiders by the countries from which their parents have migrated, [immigrants] find themselves in the unsettling experience of "double-unbelonging" evoked by Salman Rushdie. [This] is a problem to be constantly negotiated."[116]

Shay Youngblood uses Olu-Christophe as a mouthpiece to criticize France's hypocritical immigration policies that embrace the exile of corrupt ex-government officials and dictators while, at the same time, they dispel the innocent and vulnerable. She transforms Paris into a lieux de mémoire of the Duvalier dictatorship by representing the ways that Olu-Christophe grapples with his trauma. Although officially ignored by the French government, the memories of Duvalier's atrocities travel with Olu-Christophe, and his body becomes an arsenal of these counter-memories.

Haitian literary scholar, Jana Braziel deploys lieux de mémoire in her reading of obscured revolutionary heroine Dédée Bazile or Défilée-la-folle (Défilée the

Madwoman). In trying to fuse Pierre Nora's term with a Haitian context, Braziel queries, "what of cultures in which memory and history co-exist, where memory, precisely through ritual, collects and differently interprets the remnants discarded by history proper.[117]" If Nora's conception of lieux de mémoire crystalizes when memory officially confronts tradition through written western history, the same process cannot be said for countries where formal history is not necessarily produced in that way. Braziel argues that historiography's blind spots do not simply or ineluctably disappear from historical consciousness or memory, *lieux de mémoire* are stored in embodied rituals, performatively expressed in dance, songs, folklore, oral traditions and stories passed down from generation to generation.[118]" In taking up Braziel's interpretation of performed rituals as sites of "alternative historical consciousness," I consider Olu-Christophe's retelling of the Duvalier's and their violence on Haiti as an embodied expression of memory.

Like Eden, Olu-Christophe is also an illegal immigrant. However, the stakes of being deported are far direr for him given Haiti's tumultuous political environment. Ving, Eden's lover, predicts that if Olu-Christophe is deported he will be immediately punished by the Haitian government for evading army service. Between Haiti and France, Olu-Christophe no longer has a place to call home. The marginalization Olu-Christophe feels is exacerbated by the arrival of the Duvaliers in Paris. It is unthinkable to imagine that one might flee persecution in his/her home country only to find its perpetrators happily settled in the same space of exile. Returning to Lefevbre, the narrative reflects what he notes is "a contradiction between the need to organize space according to the demands of society and private

property which is increasingly in conflict with collective interests."[119] Allowing culpable ex-dictators into the city does not serve the collective interests of Parisians but rather the political interests of the French state.

Eden and Olu-Christophe attend salons at the home of Professor May Day. This Black space functions as a repository of Black diasporic memory where visitors share their experiences and thoughts on current events. When Eden becomes homesick, Olu-Christophe takes her to Professor May Day's to "cure" her with some "soul food and black people," where "grits…were especially for the homesick Black Americans.[120]" When Eden asks Olu if he's homesick, Olu-Christophe avoids the question, instead indicting France for its reprieve for violent authoritarians. He tells Eden:

> The French are in it as deep as the Americans and a lot of other Western countries supporting dictatorships. They help create the mess, then don't want to clean it up. When the Ayatollah Khomeini left Iran with blood on his hands, where did he find a home? France. When the Duvalier's left Haiti with bags of blood soaked money, where did they go? The French Riviera.[121]

Olu-Christophe's metaphor of France's reluctance to clean up its messes alludes to the legacies of colonialism. In referencing both Ayatolloh Khomeini[122] and Duvalier he is making important commentary on how countries that do not technically fall into the same parameters of colonization still suffer from France's political influence.

By selecting to protect Duvalier, Parisian authorities privilege the historical narrative of Duvalier's innocence over Olu-Chistophe's memories of the regime's violence. Inherent in the right to the city is the idea of the right to justice. Denying

city inhabitants a voice in matters that concern their own justice not only ostracizes city-dwellers, but also militarizes them. If "exiles are cut off from their roots, their land, their past,"[123] then what is there to anchor them? If "they generally do not have armies or states, although they are often in search of them"[124] who ultimately will protect them other than themselves? Vigilante violence is Olu-Christophe's only solution as a means for justice. Neither Paris nor France give Olu-Christophe a voice with respect to the Duvaliers' exile in Paris. As an inhabitant of Paris who contributes to the production of the city, Olu-Christophe should have a say on the Duvaliers' integration into the city. Ultimately, because Olu-Christophe is an immigrant without capital, he does not. Unfortunately, within this current climate, as an illegal immigrant Olu-Christophe does not even have a right to continue living in Paris, let alone a say in political matters. Urban scholar Mark Purcell interprets that "instead of democratic deliberation being limited to just state decisions, Lefebvre imagines it to apply to *all* decisions that contribute to the production of the city. The right to the city stresses the need to restructure the power relations that underlie the production of urban space, fundamentally shifting control away from the capital and toward urban inhabitants."[125] Paris does not restructure power relations between the ex-dictator and his victims but instead reifies those structures. Unsurprisingly, Olu-Christophe fantasizes about seeking vengeance against the Duvalier family because neither the city nor state government are concerned with penalizing the Duvaliers. Given his social status and isolation, he has little to lose by attacking them. Eden informs readers that "Olu-Christophe had tried to find peace by becoming an assassin," going as far as watching the Duvalier's house on the far side of Paris, hoping for his chance

to “kill them all.”[126] These imaginings of enacting retribution for trauma caused in Haiti further shape Paris as a lieu du mémoire for Duvalier’s dictatorship.

Olu-Christophe never has his chance for vengeance because he is caught without his papers. While out with Ving and Eden, the Haitian is stopped by the police. Eden’s American passport keeps her safe from arrest, but Olu-Christophe’s student visa has long expired. Ving opines, “The French like their immigrants to come with degrees, money, and white skins if at all.”[127] Only those with a certain capital are afforded space within Paris’s narrative. The irony is that Olu-Christophe is forced to leave Paris, while Jean-Claude Duvalier and his family are allowed to stay. France and, by extension, Paris have granted legal citizenship to the culpable Duvalier, but rejected the innocent Olu-Christophe. If Paris was at all grounded in the radical urban thinking that manifested within its universities, it would provide vulnerable migrant’s an equal right to the city, one that is grounded in justice. Olu’s deportation and Duvalier’s clemency are both vicious violations of Olu’s right to the city.

Although Olu-Christophe has a small role in the larger plot of the novel, his impact on Eden is most important. Ultimately, Eden is witness to Olu’s deportation and the painful contradictions of France’s immigration policies. As she searches for the inspiration to produce her own creative work, the end of the novel suggests that her experiences in France will inspire her to write. Hopefully, Olu-Christophe’s injustice will not be forgotten but instead inscribed into the larger narrative of “witnessing” that Eden creates. Referring back to Camus and *The Plague*, Felman

says that “However ground-shaking, seeing leads to knowing that, in some ill-understood way, might be ground breaking.”[128]

La mémoire aux abois

La mémoire aux abois (Memory at Bay) written by well-known Haitian author Évelyne Trouillot similarly imagines a confrontation between an executor of state violence and his/her victim. The novel begins in a decrepit nursing home in Paris. The reader is soon introduced to Marie-Ange, a Quisqueyan—Trouillot’s pseudonym for a Haitian. Marie-Ange is a young nurse charged with caring for the elderly wife of the infamous Fabien Doréval (Papa Fab), the fictional parallel to Haiti’s François Duvalier (Papa Doc). Many of the memories of the Doréval dictatorship are replicated from Haitian historical moments under the 30-year reign of Duvalier père et fils. Although Marie-Ange did not experience the dictatorship firsthand, she is engulfed in her mother’s memories of it. The majority of the novel alternates between Marie-Ange’s introspective retelling of her mother’s stories in contrast to the memories of Odile Doréval’s. Often both women will reflect on the same event from their own perspective, such as the attempted kidnapping of the dictator’s children, Jean Paul’s (Doréval’s son, heir and parallel to Jean-Claude Duvalier who became President-for-Life after Papa Doc’s death) wedding and Papa Fab’s funeral. The titles of each of the four chapters emphasize the contrast of this pairing they include: L’héritière et la mère (The Survivor and the Mother), La première Dame et l’écolière

(The First Lady and the Schoolgirl), L'épouse et l'orpheline (The Wife and the Orphan) and La femme et l'héritière (The Woman and the Survivor).

The Paris imagined in *La mémoire aux abois* is different from the Paris of 1986 that we see in *Black Girl in Paris*. Published in 2010, *La mémoire aux abois* imagines a Paris without clear temporal boundaries. While Shay Youngblood envisions an encounter that occurs within the immediate after-effects of Jean-Claude Duvalier's exile, Trouillot depicts a traumatic rendez-vous without a temporal stamp. Here it is important to consider how these novels differ in genre. *Black Girl in Paris* is written in a mode of realism that positions the novel as clearly historical fiction. Although allegorical, *La mémoire aux abois* is heavily historical. In *Tropical Apocalypse: Haiti and the Caribbean End Times*, Martin Munro claims that *La mémoire aux abois* is more historically accurate than the other dictatorship novels his analyzes in that chapter.[129] Munro explains that "the novel is a medium through which historical facts and key, though in many cases little known, events are evoked, while the allegorical style saves it from being a straightforward narrative list of past events."[130] Trouillot reimagines facts and events of the Duvalier dictatorship tinted by the perspectives of survivor and perpetrator. Trouillot connects Paris to the Duvalier dictatorship through the plethora of reconfigured historical events that she places in the novel. Since the text closely mirrors the timeline of the Duvaliers, we can infer that the novel is set in the 2000's. It is set during period after the son's exile, likely decades afterward given the fact that his mother is considerably elderly.

Although at incredibly different ends of life's spectrum, Marie-Ange 23 and Odile 82 or 84, both co-exist in the same place. While physically present at the

nursing home, they both live more within the realm of memory than that of reality; it is as if they both are on the cusp of death. Trouillot describes Odile's life as slowly slipping away, like "a faucet that's wearing out, it's useless to turn it off more tightly, there's no stopping the slow drip that's so annoying to hear. In this establishment where death so often dislodged life, no one else was attending to the sounds of her life." (ces robinets qui ferment mal, on a beau les serrer, l'eau continue son égouttement agaçant à entendre. Dans ce hospice où évinçait si souvent la vie, nul n'entendait partir la sienne.)[131] Marie-Ange is also implicated in this nursing home ecosystem where death often overtakes life. She too is burdened by memory to the point of near physical deterioration; "When life brought too much hardship, I retreated into your memory, almost as if I wanted to return to your womb. You never understood how much I carried your country in my wounded expression, in my posture made sullen by misery." (Je rentrais dans ta mémoire comme j'aurais voulu parfois regagner tes entrailles quand la vie fait trop mal. Tu n'as jamais compris combien j'ai porté ton pays dans mon regard blessé, dans ma silhouette butée dans sa douleur)[132] The reader must wonder whether Marie-Ange, burdened by her mother's memories of the Doreval's treachery can survive caring for the dictator's wife.

Entrapped by her mother's memories of the dictatorship, Marie-Ange cannot live her own life fully in the present. Marie-Ange experiences what Marianne Hirsch has termed, "post-memory." "Post-memory" describes the relationship that the "generation after" bears to the personal, collective, and cultural trauma of those who came before—to experiences they "remember" only by means of stories, images, behaviors among which they grew up.[133] Hirsch's work on post-memory focuses

explicitly on the way Holocaust photographs evoke the thin balance between life and death much like Pierre Nora's "lieux de mémoire." Remembering that lieux de mémoire represent events in the past that have been forgotten by history, Hirsch expands this idea:

> If history did not besiege memory, deforming and transforming it, penetrating and petrifying it, there would be no *lieux de mémoire*. Indeed, it is this very push and pull that produces *lieux de mémoire*—moments of history torn away from the movement of history, then returned; no longer quite life, nor yet death, like shells on the shore when the sea of living memory has receded.[134]

Lieux de mémoire are the remains of a battle against the actual past (memory) and the narrative of the past (history). Nora's mammoth multi-volume project *Les lieux de mémoire* (Realms of Memory) constructed a counter memory against established French history. In a similar regard, Marie-Ange and Odile's narratives constantly subvert each other, putting their memories at war throughout Trouillot's novel. As Odile imagines it, "she and the caregiver [Marie-Ange] were playing hide-and-seek without knowing or wanting to." (…cette jeune femme et elle jouaient à colin-maillard sans le savoir ou sans le vouloir.)[135] We are left to wonder which memory represents the master narrative (history) and which is the insurgent counter memory. Historically, the Duvalier dictatorship escaped official indemnity. Therefore, in Trouillot's parallel world, Odile's memory and perception of Quisqueyan history might prevail as the dominant narrative. Yet, in the contested space of the nursing home, Odile is defenseless against Marie-Ange, who spends much of the novel contemplating committing Odile's murder.

If most of the novel takes places in memories, particularly set in their native land of Quisqueya, then what is Paris's role in the novel? The reader sees very little of Marie-Ange's interior thoughts about Paris or anything aside from the dictatorship. From the very first page it is made clear that just like her love life, Marie-Ange's relationship to Paris is besmirched by the dictatorship. From the second line of the novel, Marie-Ange claims, "The vision of her [Odile's] form sprawled limply on the bed like a nameless doll accompanies me through the streets of Paris." (L'image de cette forme vautrée sur le lit comme une poupée sans nom m'accompagne dans les rues de Paris.)[136]

Immediately, the conjured image of Parisian streets is paired with this odd visual of a nameless doll. The first line also emphasizes the ways in which Odile's presence follows Marie-Ange outside the confines of the nursing home. "I head home with the smell of the old woman's withered flesh on my fingers." (Je rentre chez moi avec l'odeur de la chair décrépite de la vieille sur mes doigts.)[137] The smell of Odile's body literally infuses into Marie-Ange's own, which she carries into her home. From the very beginning of the novel, the remnants of the dictatorship, be it corporeal smells, images or memories, envelop everything else.

Although the entire premise of the novel is focused on the tension of Marie-Ange and Odile's coexistence with the space of the nursing home, few scenes depict or discuss their present tense interactions. The idea of their confrontation and, by extension, what it symbolizes is incredibly important. Marie-Ange is tasked with caring for a woman who was directly responsible for deaths in her family. Naturally, the question of revenge is present for Marie-Ange. Why is Paris the site of

confrontation between the victim of the Doréval/Duvalier dictatorship and the perpetrator by proxy? Martinique, Guadeloupe, or even Quisqueya itself could have been the imagined location. For the sake of historical fiction, Paris provides a great imaginary setting in which to explore Jean-Claude Duvalier's exile to the city of lights in 1986. Ultimately, Trouillot's decision to set the novel in Paris, calls attention to Paris and France's culpability in housing Duvalier. Recall that by 2010, the novel's original publication date, Jean-Claude Duvalier had resided in France for 24 years, nearly as long as his tyrannical rule. Trouillot directs us to this central question: why does France allow a treacherous man like Jean-Claude Duvalier and his family to continue to reside within its borders? Further, why is permitted when it is in starkly contradicts the tenets of the French Constitution?

France's exoneration of corrupt government officials, fallen tyrants and their kin place people like the fictional Marie-Ange into precarious situations that challenge their right to the city. Her designation as caretaker to the dictator's wife positions her against her own compatriots. Marie-Ange is not the only Quisqueyan disturbed by the government's decision to stabilize the life of a perpetrator. The nursing home has to increase its security after an unexpected visitor makes his way to Odile's room. When Marie-Ange is charged by her supervisor to chase away the intruder, the man snarls at her and says, "So she, too, is going to die in her bed. Then there's no justice in this country." (…lança au visage: "Ainsi, elle aussi va mourir dans son lit! Il n'y a donc aucune justice ici-bas.")[138] Marie-Ange immediately begins to feel conflicted by her actions. Her job has positioned her as the protector of someone directly responsible for the death of both her father and uncle. Further yet,

Marie-Ange is standing in the way of the vengeful justice that others so clearly crave and perhaps deserve. She remarks, “I can’t forget his words; etched in my memory is the face of this man more ravaged by hurt and powerlessness than by anger. Do I have the right to ignore all those disfigured lives?” (Je ne peux oublier ses paroles et j’ai emporté avec moi le visage de cet homme plus ravagé par la détresse et l’impuissance que par la colère. Ai-je le droit d’ignorer tous ces destins mutilés?)[139] The man’s cry that Odile “will die in her bed” is jarring. Tens of thousands of Haitians died or disappeared under the Duvalier dictatorship.[140] Yet, the fictional wife and mother to the two men responsible for these thousands of deaths will die a quiet and benign death in her bed. More alarming yet, she might cross over while being paid for by taxpayer dollars, and cared for by the very people her family tortured .[141] This image parallels an all too realistic truth.

Immigrants, particularly from France’s former colonies, make up much of Paris’s menial labor work force.[142] It is not unrealistic to imagine a Haitian migrant working in a Parisian brasserie or cleaning the streets. What then might be the chances that they would come across the Duvalier family? Or really, what might be the chance that any migrant from a former colony, struggling in a low wage position might be confronted with a corrupt official from his/her native land? For many migrants in Paris, the Quisqueyan’s cry, “Il n’y a donc aucune justice ici-bas” (there is, thus, no justice here below) is a reflection of these migrant laborers’ invisibility in France as well as Paris. Lefebvre’s right to the city imagines that all inhabitants are seen, heard, and centralized in city decisions. Translator Paul Curtis Daw’s liberal decision to understand “ici-bas” as “in this country” instead of “over here,” “here on

earth,"[143] or another variant of "here below" (in the Biblical sense) , further reinforces the importance of national location. France and Paris allow the dictator's wife to live quietly out the rest of her years without retribution for the atrocities her family committed.

Oddly enough while Marie-Ange, unlike Olu-Christophe, does get a true opportunity to kill the emblem of her trauma, she decides against it. In fact, she actually saves Odile from dying. Although Marie-Ange had long fantasied about killing Odile, she ultimately admits that she never could have done so. With all of the death that surrounded her, she did not want to add anymore.[144] At the end of the novel, one last final time Marie-Ange contemplates the victims of the Dorevalist dictatorship and how those memories have been silenced. She thinks to herself: "Besides my father, how many others had perished? Anonymous, forgotten as the years go by. Perhaps still mourned by the tears of a close relative, but unnoticeable among all the other victims of the dictatorship." (Combien d'autres mon père avaient péri? Anonymes, oublié au fils des ans. Peut-être encores pleurés par le mémoire d'un proche, mais délaissés parmi toutes les autres victims de la dictature.) [145] Trouillot suggests that through saving Odile's life, Marie-Ange can finally leave behind the apparitions that haunt her. The last lines read, "The room seems to shrink, isolating us from all outside intrusions. Keeping the past and the ghosts at bay. Crowding out regrets and reproaches. Sitting very close to the emaciated body, I wait." (La chambre semble se rétrécir pour nous isoler de toute instrusion externe. Éloignant passé et fantômes. Regrets et reproches…Assisie tout près du corps amaigri, j'attends.)[146] Better then killing Odile, Marie-Ange is afforded the opportunity for some kind of

reconciliation. Martin Munro echoes this analysis in his book *Tropical Apocalypse,* noting:

> It is not therefore finally through revenge that Marie-Ange finds her own salvation. Rather, it is in resisting the urge to avenge the dead that she allows herself to live, freeing herself from the past and thereby creating a sense of a life to come that will not be wholly determined by the past.[147]

In my view, however, the conclusion is far more ambiguous than that. Yes, the ghosts are at bay for now. Who knows how the dynamic might change once Odile wakes up and the two characters finally have this long-awaited exchange? Ultimately, Trouillot provokes us to think about how necessary that exchange is, even for just the possibility of healing. The conversation may not turn out to be a panacea, but it is a start. It is more than Olu-Christophe received.

Marie-Ange and other Quisqueyans are already alienated by their positionality as others marginalized by their migrant identity. They are further isolated by the past trauma they must confront but imagine how much more this trauma could intensify by confronting the physical embodiment of their pain. Odile's presence is a trigger for all Quisqueyans who both see and know of her existence in Paris. Her proximity to families whom she has directly harmed is its own kind of terror. Both *Black Girl in Paris* and *La mémoire aux abois* imagine Paris as site of traumatic confrontation between victims and their persecutors. These confrontations are a criticism of France's historic and present predisposition to sacrificing the poor and weak for the corrupt and wealthy.

Politically, France has long developed this history of welcoming pariah dictators in order to negotiate for French political and economic interests in those countries. As May-Lee Change indicates in her article on ex-dictators and their favored exile locations, France has built a reputation as a safe haven for genuinely treacherous men:

> France is a master of this tactic, having negotiated dozens of secret defense agreements with its former colonies during the Cold War, guaranteeing the client states' national security in exchange for economic and political concessions. Successive French governments have frequently opened their arms to downtrodden leaders, including some from France's former colonies in Africa, who can benefit from living in Paris near their countries' diasporas and slowly rebuild their political fortunes. [148]

Men who have wreaked irreparable harm upon their own communities have been granted immunity and allowed to reconstitute their alliances. What is the psychological cost for those migrants who must literally live with their demons? We imagine someone like Olu-Christophe, or the unnamed Quisqueyan, whose existence is overcome with dreams for vengeance and retribution.

For the Haitian community residing in Paris, there are many unhealed wounds related to their existence in France. There is racial tension for being noir along with additional conflict related to being Haitian. In 2010, the same year of *La mémoire aux bois*' publication date and the devastating earthquake, France denied a petition to pay Haiti 17 billion francs in reparations. These reparations would have been compensation for the 90 million francs Haiti paid for France's loss of property and

slaves after winning its revolution. On top of these issues, France's amnesty for Duvalier was yet another wound. Trouillot and Younblood participate in a dialogue about the trauma Haitians face living in contemporary Paris. Paris becomes a lieu de mémoire of the dictatorship and the tense history between France and Haiti. These novels urge readers to think deeply about trauma, healing and bearing witness to other's trauma.

Part 2. Port-au-Prince

I.

While Jean-Claude Duvalier resided in France, tumultuous political violence continued to impact Haiti and Port-au-Prince from 1986 to the present. While Évelyne Trouillot and Shay Youngblood imagined Paris as a site of possible reconciliation or vengeance, authors Roxane Gay and Lyonel Trouillot portray Port-au-Prince as a site of cyclical violence and indifference. In these texts, Lyonl Trouillot's *Street of Lost Footsteps* and Roxane Gay's *An Untamed State*, we see that tormentors and victims co-exist in Port-au-Prince, but their roles and relationships are for more complex and nuanced. Ultimately, everyone is implicated in the eco-system of violence and corruption. While the novels set in Paris focused on psychic wounds forged by trauma, the novels set in Port-au-Prince address both psychological and physical wounds left by the dictatorship and the years of political turmoil that followed.

An Unlikely Pair: Roxane Gay and Lyonel Trouillot

In the preface to his best-known work, *Silencing the Past: Power and the Production of History,* anthropologist and historian Michel Rolph Trouillot writes, "I grew up in a family where history sat at the dinner table."[149] With a father who was a lawyer and a history teacher at a prestigious high school and an uncle who was the

Director of the National Archives and a public historian, it is no wonder that history was a regular dinner guest. Michel-Rolph Trouillot vividly compares his father's history lectures on Haitian TV compared to those he gave at Sunday dinner—the ones at home were always best. Unsurprisingly, Ernst Trouillot passed on his love for the past to his children. Michel-Rolph's siblings Èvelyne and Lyonel Trouillot have written several novels steeped in history.

Lyonel Trouillot, author of *Street of Lost Footsteps*, is a Haitian cultural force. He is a poet, essayist, novelist, journalist and Professor of Creole and French literature. He was born in Port-au-Prince in 1956, just one year prior to the rise of Françoise Duvalier. He has written 11 novels, and a book of poetry. In 2014, he collaborated with famous Haitian film maker Raoul Peck and French screenwriter and director Pascal Bonitzer to write the script for the film *Murder in Pacot.* Trouillot is also co-founder of the writers' organization Pre-Texte. He runs this organization with his sister Évelyne Trouillot and her daughter Nadève Ménard. All of the Trouillot siblings are novelists, essayists, scholars and educators.

The Duvalier dictatorships were an incredibly shaping force for the Trouillot family, which can be seen in the creative works produced by the family. Lyonel Trouillot grew up in Haiti during the tenure of Papa and Baby Doc's reign. At the age of 14 he moved to the United States with his mother, but then moved back to Haiti in 1975 at the age of 19. Lyonel is known for his political stances against the Duvaliers as well as Jean Bertrand Aristide's second presidency. He was a part of the Collective Non, which was a coalition of creatives that helped build momentum for the ouster of Aristide in 2004. In 1990, Lyonel's step-mother, Ertha Pascal-Trouillot, served as the

11-month provisional president of Haiti leading up the election of Jean Bertrand Aristide. The Trouillot family has been deeply entrenched in Haitian politics.

Roxane Gay, born in 1974, is a professor, writer, editor and commentator. Gay has written/published five books: her memoire, *Hunger*; a collection of essays, *Bad Feminist*; two collections of short stories called *Ayiti* and *Difficult Women* and the novel *An Untamed State*. Gay is a Haitian-American writer who grew up in Omaha, Nebraska, and taught for a few years at Purdue University. She is currently a visiting professor at Yale University. Since the early 2010's, Roxane Gay has become a powerhouse cultural critic.

Gay has emerged as one of our time's most outspoken critics of American rape culture and misogyny. It is perhaps both ironic yet fitting that in an upcoming interview with Jessica P. Ogilivie, for *Playboy Magazine*, Gay discusses her trajectory as prominent cultural critic.[150] It was her 2011 essay, "The Careless Language of Sexual Violence," in *The Rumpus* that first catalyzed her growing acclaim. The essay was a response to a *New York Times* article that had carelessly reported the rape of a young girl as a blight for the town and the perpetrators rather than for the victim. Gay explains, "The article was like, 'Oh, the poor town is reeling.'" And I was just like, 'Huh, really? I'm pretty sure the child is reeling.' I was just incensed, and so I wrote the essay in about two hours."[151]

The topic of rape and sexual violence reappears frequently in Gay's work. Her edited collection, *Not that Bad*: *Dispatches from Rape Culture,* as well as her memoir, *Hunger* that discusses how she used food as a coping mechanism in the wake of being raped at the age of 12, both exclusively engage the topic of rape and the trauma it

causes. Gay's novel, *An Untamed State,* fits very clearly in her corpus on rape and trauma. *Hunger*, *An Untamed State*, and *Unruly Bodies*, a month-long pop up magazine Gay edited through Medium, showcase Gay's intentional consideration of the human body. In an interview with John Freeman, she says that "there are experiences where you realize how fragile and insignificant the body can be made. As Miri faces her ordeal, she also faces everything she never fathomed not knowing."[152] Reckoning with the fragility of the human body is certainly at the core of *An Untamed State*. In her review of the novel, Francophone Studies Scholar and professor Régine Michelle Jean Charles identifies the novel as a part of a genre of writing that "privileges the perspective of the survivor and refuses to use rape as a symbol for something else."[153] *An Untamed State* brings attention to the trauma of rape while simultaneously couching the narrative in the intricacies of post-dictatorship Haiti.

Both Lyonel Trouillot and Roxane Gay draw attention to rape, trauma, and violence in contemporary Port-au-Prince. Each author approaches this topic from a different vantage point. *Street of Lost Footsteps* is a short novel, almost novella-length that rotates between three narrators. The text focuses on military violence that occurs for one day. *An Untamed State*, on the other hand, focuses on the capture, captivity, and rape of a Haitian-American woman for 13 days, followed by several months of tenuous recovery. Trouillot exposes the lived traumas of those who have remained in Port-au-Prince throughout ever-shifting regimes and political alliances. Gay shows us a starkly different viewpoint from someone in the diaspora who grapples with her identity and proximity to both Port-au-Prince and Haiti. The fact

that Trouillot's text is originally in French while Gay's text is in English also adds richness to this comparison. Comparing these two novels demonstrates how both Haitians from the diaspora and those who have never left Haiti remain alienated in Port-au-Prince. Mireille and Ducharmel (the only named narrator in *Street of Lost Footsteps*) experience indelible physical harm while in Port-au-Prince. For both these characters, the "hieroglyphics of their flesh" tell a story not just about them individually, but also the city and the nation. Both Trouillot and Gay push us to query what it means to live and possess a body in Port-au-Prince in these turbulent post-dictatorship years.

Imaginary Port-au-Prince: The Poetics of the Uncanny and Cynical Indifference

Marie-José N'Zengou-Tayo's 2003 article, "Imaginary City, Literary Spaces: Port-au-Prince in Some Recent Haitian Fiction," provides a useful foundation for understanding key themes in the literary representation of Port-au-Prince from the 19th century through to the 1990's. The article highlights the representation of immigration into the city from the countryside, which leads to increased overcrowding and inequality. One of N'Zengou-Tayo's major contentions is that Port-au-Prince's drastic population increase in the mid-20th century heavily contours how writers imagine the city. She claims, "most writers could hardly ignore the changes affecting the city and would try to capture its transformation in their own words."[154] This drastic population increase is intimately tied to the rise of the François Duvalier in the 1950's. Since he renamed himself as the nation, it behooved anyone in search of power or prosperity to be close within his circle. In *State Against*

Nation, Michel-Rolph Trouillot explains, “The Duvalierist Executive was distinguished by its replacement of the pyramidal structure of the traditional dictatorship with a centrifugal structure in which those who held power enjoyed it only on the basis of a direct link to the chief of state.”[155] If the only true path to power was a direct link to Duvalier that means that living in or close access to Port-au-Prince was absolutely necessary.

By the 1960’s Port-au-Prince’s representation shifts to reflect François Duvalier’s voracious consumption of the city. Prior to the 1960’s, 19th-century Haitian literature focused on how urban space was separated by gender and class.[156] N’Zengou-Tayo argues that historically, Haitian urban fiction often represented the exotifying gaze of the middle class onto the lower class. N’Zengou-Tayo contends that there is an important shift in perspective concerning the slums; “While writers of the pre-Occupation period described the various areas from the view point of the upper and middle class, the post-Occupation writers adopted the viewpoint of the disenfranchised in order to reinforce their social criticism.”[157] Although hailing from a highly educated family, much of Lyonel Trouillot’s work follows in this post-occupation vein.

In her article, "Port-au-Prince: images littéraires des quartiers-bidonvilles et de leurs habitants," Joëlle Vitiello also emphasizes the “fascination” of the upper class with those at the bottom of society:

> La ville s’impose sous plusieurs visages et quartiers, mais l’un des aspects les plus frappants dans les représentations haïtiennes de l’urbanité est la fascination qu’exerce le bas de la ville sur l’imaginaire de personnages

romanesques du haut de la ville et inversement." (The city imposes itself onto various faces and neighborhoods, but one of the most striking aspects of Haitian representation of urbanity is how the bottom of the city captures the fasciation and the imagination of romantic characters at the top of the city and vice versa.) [158]

Vitiello notices a reciprocal gaze between the classes as opposed to the one-way gaze that N'Zengou-Tayo describes. However, it is only the first novel that Vitiello examines, *Le Passage* by Paulette Poujol-Oriol, that does not exhibit a kind of exoticizing gaze toward the shantytowns of Port-au-Prince. She claims that in other novels, "le bidonville est représenté comme un lieu de fascination, peut-être à cause même de sa fonction de contre-exemple, de lieu ultime de chute, dont nul n'est exempt, que l'on évite, mais qui devient empreint d'un étonnant exotisme" (the slum is represented as a place of fascination, perhaps because of its counter-example function, the ultimate place of failure, of which no one is exempt, which one avoids, but which becomes imprinted with a surprising exoticism.) [159] The descent to the slum is seen as the ultimate failure—"de lieu ultime de chute."[160] It is interesting that the fall from financial privilege is actually the physical inverse. Many slums are built up around the city in the mountains. Thus, in order to live in the slums, one must physically ascend amidst their metaphorical descent. Even the idea that the rich and wealthy look down on the poor, is not quite true in literal terms.

The most important aspects of the N'Zengou-Tayo's article point us to Jacques Stephen Alexis's *Compère Général Soleil* (1955) as the demarcation for social commentary on Haiti. *Compère Général Soleil* sets the stage for future Haitian

urban fiction; N'Zengou-Tayo claims, "No doubt thanks in great part to its international success, *Compère Général Soleil* established a referential framework of features encountered again in all subsequent representations of Port-au-Prince."[161] This referential framework includes specific literary spaces, a lack of privacy for low-income neighborhoods, descriptive writing that portrays an emotional connection to the city and finally representation of the city as a female figure such as a young prostitute or working class woman.[162] Both N'Zengou-Tayo and Isabelle Choquet see Jacques Stephen Alexis as a dominant figure as themes in Port-au-Prince's literary representation shifted toward a critique of inequality. As N'Zengou-Tayo remarks:

> The Marxist [Jacques Stephen] Alexis interpreted working class migration as the sign of the failure of the political elite. Hilarion's [protagonist of Alexis' most well-known novel] migration to the Dominican Republic is set against his successive failures to earn a decent living and support his family. Alexis' interpretation establishes Port-au-Prince as the first step in the migratory process taking the peasant from the countryside to the capital city, thence to foreign countries.[163]

She contends, "although *Viejo* maybe the first urban novel of social criticism in Haiti, it is only twenty years later with Alexis' first novel, *Compère Général Soleil*, that we find the textual model for urban fiction, setting the tone for all literary representation of the city to come."[164] Alexis is recognized as a leading author for wedding urban fiction with commentary on social inequality. For this critical role, Alexis was captured by Tonton Macoutes and stoned to death in 1961.

Like Jacques Stephen Alexis, both Roxane Gay and Lyonel Trouillot incorporate the migratory process of Haitians in search of upward mobility in their novels. Although briefly discussed, both of Mireille's parents were born poor in Port-au-Prince, but later immigrated to the United States. In *Street of Lost Footsteps*, the taxi driver, Ducharmel, moved from the countryside to Port-au-Prince in search of employment opportunities. Combined together, both of these books give a slight glimpse into the migratory process that N'Zengou-Tayo claims are standard of urban fiction. Instead of portraying migration as the consequences of Haiti's failed government, these novels show how immigration does not necessarily help one escape the struggles of the city and the country. Someone like Mireille, "an American," as her family thought, should have been safe from the violence in Port-au-Prince. Mireille is the daughter of two migrants who had emigrated from the country and then made their prodigal return. Fabienne, Mireille's mothe,r exclaims, "this [Mireille's kdnapping] wasn't supposed to happen. Sebastien [Fabienne's husband and Mireille's father] had assured her that were safe. Mireille was an American, mostly."[165] Their capital, perhaps both social and financial, should have protected Mireille. Historically, upper class Haitians had been safe from randomized violence up until the 1995 disintegration of the military. Scholar Peter Hallward corroborates this point in his monograph on Jean Bertrand Aristide and Haiti's contemporary politics: "While actual levels of criminal and political violence remained 'inexplicably low,' nevertheless now that the rich had lost their military protection they had started to fall prey to criminality like everyone else."[166] Juxtaposing these *Street of Lost Footsteps* and *An Untamed State* helps us think

about the nuances of vulnerability in the city and whose body is at risk. N'Zengou-Tayo indicates a distinction in how novels from the 1980's and 1990's portray the city from its 1960's and 1970's predecessors. She argues that recent writings depict the city's metamorphosis into an "urban monster." She claims, "through representation, we observe among the writers of the late 1980's and the 1990s the development of a 'poetics of the uncanny', which is replacing the magical realism of the earlier generation."[167] What is the uncanny and why would it replace magical realism at this temporal juncture in Haitian literature?

Sigmund Freud is famously known for his attempt at deconstructing the "uncanny." In his titular essay, "The Uncanny," Freud argues that " animism, magic, sorcery, the omnipotence of thoughts, man's attitude toward death, involuntary repetition and the castration complex practically [are] all factors which turn something frightening into the uncanny."[168] Freud parses through various scenarios, both fictional and realistic, that could produce an uncanny feeling. Freud concludes that in observing the differences between the uncanny in reality versus fiction, the author has the power to drastically heighten the uncanny feeling. She or he can augment "his effect and multiply it far beyond what could happen in reality, by bringing about events which never or rarely happen in fact."[169] For Freud, authors can infuse the uncanny in their work by playing with the reader's superstitions.

What about the city creates this atmosphere of a 'poetics of the uncanny?' N'Zengou-Tayo claims that the city has become a "strange and unsettling place in recent writing."[170] What exactly drives this unsettling feeling? She discusses a number of short stories and a novel that fit into this macabre trend. N'Zengou-Tayo

examines three short stories by Gary Victor, all of them pessimistic about Port-au-Prince. “La dernière pluie” (The last rain) compares the slums to a cancer. “2004…Carrefour” imagines Port-au-Prince consumed by a dark and deathly, traffic and congestion. In “L’Utopie de l’envers du temps” (Utopia of the other side of time) Victor rewrites Haitian history after the death of Dessalines to create an alternative trajectory for the country and its capital. In this story Port-au-Prince experiences urban development paralleling that of a western nation. N’Zengou-Tayo’s analysis of Gary Victor’s “2004...Carrefour” best represents the idea of “the poetics of the uncanny.”

This “poetics of the uncanny” and the unsettling feeling that N’Zengou-Tayo continues to encounter in literature about the city are provoked by increased dehumanization in the streets of the city. N’Zengou-Tayo explains: “the inhuman conditions of transport lead to a dehumanization of human relationships. Commuters are prevented from boarding overcrowded buses. They risk losing their lives while trying to board. Cynical indifference greets the death of unlucky passengers.”[171] According to Freud, the uncanny can appear when something once familiar becomes foreign and anxiety-producing. This example from “2004…Carrefour” is the epitome of the alienation of the familiar— the act of daily transportation has become nightmarish and life-threatening. Further, Freud argues that “an uncanny effect is often and easily produced when the distinction between imagination and reality is effaced.”[172] Although Victor’s story is fiction, the narrative pulses with the reality of modern-day Port-au-Prince. N’Zengou-Tayo reaffirms that Victor’s “description [of

the city] scarcely differs from reality."[173] As reality blurs, it is not only the city that becomes unfamiliar but the people as well.

Cynical indifference permeates the city and is reflected in both Roxane Gay's novel and Lyonel Trouillot's larger oeuvre. In her catalog, N'Zengou-Tayo analyzes a different novel by Lyonel Trouillot, *Les Fous* de *Saint-Antoine* (1989). This novel tells of the life and death of a man in the neighborhood of St. Antoine, amidst the area's transformation from middle class to low-income. N'Zengou-Tayo argues that while Stephen-Alexis interpreted the close quarters of the bidonvilles to be productive for class solidarity, Trouillot does not see it the same way. Instead, he portrays a glaring lack of solidarity and alienation amongst the poor. Espoused by the brothel owner from *Street of Lost Footsteps*, this is a theme, what I am calling cynical indifference, that reoccurs alongside "the poetics of the uncanny" in *Street of Lost Footsteps*.

Communities devastated by frequent state violence produce indifferent citizens whose sense of community and solidarity have been obliterated. While Port-au-Prince has long been a city of extreme contradictions, the Duvalier dictatorships exacerbated this. Haitian author Yanick Lahens theorizes that the Duvalier dictatorship alienated both artists inside and outside of the country.

> By forcing a good number of writers and intellectuals into exile, the dictatorship years provoked the deepening of what I call the syndrome of inner exile, a syndrome doubling up upon itself and connected to their ambiguous status in society [artists] and their mounting social unease."[174]

Lahen's idea of the syndrome of inner exile connects back to the cynical indifference that N'Zengou-Tayo references. The mounting social unease is felt by all and reflected in the work of creatives. With political affiliations and power constantly shifting, urban dwellers constantly worried about how their actions or relationships were interpreted, lest they be quickly marked as traitors or dissidents. Everyone suffers from the syndrome of inner exile because they can no longer connect to their community. This is yet another example of the uncanny where the familiar has become unfamiliar and alienating.

N'Zengou-Tayo shows us how Gary Victor, Lyonel Trouillot and Yanick Lahens all depict Port-au-Prince's urban development as nightmarish degradation. She concludes,

> we might say that contemporary literary representations of Port-au-Prince focus on the "invasion" of the city by rural migrants and its controlled, chaotic expansion…The depiction of the city has in turn influenced the writers' style and determined the development of a new poetics articulating "hyper-realism" with the uncanny.[175]

Roxane Gay's *An Untamed State* and Lyonel Trouillot's *Street of Lost Footsteps* allude to some of the conventions that N'Zengou-Tayo discusses. Both draw attention to the stark schism between the classes. Both depict the city in terms of a hyperrealism, with intentional focus on the human body and its destruction. These novels place less attention to the city's overcrowding from rural migrants as opposed to the violence that happens within the city. In *Street of Lost Footsteps,* the violence is political and widespread. In *An Untamed State*, Mireille faces violence that is

incredibly localized and personal, but is still very deeply tied to sociopolitical paradigms that engulf the city and the country.

In Hortense Spillers' now seminal, "Mama's Baby, Papa's Maybe: An American Grammar Book," she argues that the atrocities endured by slaves become a "hieroglyphics of the flesh" that are passed on across generations. For Spillers the flesh is the primary document upon which its memory of trauma and violence are written in scars, lacerations, wounds and ruptures. It is in part from Spillers' theorization of the flesh that Alexander G. Weheliye constructs *habeas viscus*. The project of *habeas viscus,* which translates to "the flesh shall set you free, " imagines how humans maintain humanity despite "dehumanization." Weheliye dissents against the Western notion that violence can demote someone from humanity. Concluding his analysis of Mandigo, Weheliye explains how conquering and desiring can have different meanings outside of the Western world's interpretation. "The differently signified flesh is habeas viscus, for in the world of Man [Western Man], the hieroglyphics of the flesh are translated to the jargons of negativity, lack, the subhuman, and so on."[176] Scars, lesions, and other hieroglyphics of the flesh do not have the power to take away one's humanity. Through habeas viscus, Weheliye argues for seeing alternative humanities that exist after trauma. Both Spillers and Weheliye refer particularly to the violence inflicted on the enslaved. These frames, specifically "the hieroglyphics of the flesh" and "habeas viscus" can be used to interpolate the brutality and dehumanization that Roxane Gay and Lyonel Trouillot depict in Port-au-Prince in *An Untamed State* and *Street of Lost Footsteps*, respectively.

II.

Street of Lost Footsteps

Lyonel Trouillot's novel *The Street of Lost Footsteps* rotates between three narrators, two of whom remain unnamed. This novel originally published in 1996, chronicles a fictional night in Haiti's capital where violence and chaos consume the city. The violence erupts between two political factions, those who support the Deceased Forever-Immortal dictator and the Prophet—characters who clearly represent Haiti's deceased dictator Papa Doc Duvalier and successor Bertrand Aristide. The context of this violence closely mimics factional street violence that manifested in the post-Duvalier period, particularly in the 1990's. The narrators' class and work positions dictate their proximity to the violence that occurs. One of Trouillot's characters, Ducharmel the taxi driver, experiences the chaos most directly. Ducharmel tries frantically to escape the heart of the capital as a barrage of gunmen and their bullets swarm the streets. The other two characters are a brothel owner/ Madame and a postal worker whom I refer to as Laurence's lover.[177] They also recall their experience of this night, although far more removed from the violence than Ducharmel. This night imagined by Trouillot could easily be compared to one of many real nights of terror.

These characters are indelibly marred by the violence they experience both directly and indirectly. This night of violence furthers the dehumanization of those living in the city. Laurence's lover claims this night "forms the great reference point of [their] lives." (…mais qui constituerait désormais la grand reference de nos vies.)

[178] Perhaps even more horrifying is the fact that this night is but a repetition—a reflection of other nights past and future. Laurence's lover elaborates, "In fact, whatever our plans, our hopes, our illusions might have been, the main landmarks in our lives had always been similar horrors."[179] He then goes on to recant state violence that aligned with major points in a person's life such as birth, falling in love and death. Through these characters, Trouillot depicts how political instability and violence have seeped into every crevice of Haitians' lives, even those who do not experience violence directly. The memory of these moments does not only live with citizens but also in the city itself. They also imbue the city with 'poetics of the uncanny' while overexposure to these cycles of violence spawn cynical indifference for those who inhabit the city.

It would at first seem that the concept of the "hieroglyphics of the flesh" and "habeas viscus" would not cohere because they are deeply ensconced in the context of racial slavery. Spillers denotes a distinction between bodies and flesh. "Even though the European hegemonies stole bodies—some of them female—out of West African communities in concert with the African 'middleman,' we regard this human and social irreparability as high crimes against the flesh."[180] For Spillers the distinction between "flesh" and "body" parallels the difference between "captivity" and "freedom." How then might the concept of flesh translate in contemporary Haiti where everyone is free? Habeas viscus can bridge that gap for us.

Weheliye explains, "Once the flesh becomes a centrifugal factor in the theorization of political violence, racialization, and modern politics construed more broadly, we have the beginnings of habeas viscus."[181] The flesh is the primary text or

the primary actor upon the world stage where violence, racialization and modern politics are various productions. Therein we can imagine the flesh of Haitians is oft cast as a leading role in the world's plays of racism and violence. Habeas viscus points to the ways in which law has been used as the burden of proof for humanity. In Port-au-Prince, which has been ravaged by political violence, many citizens and artists alike question: what does it mean to be human in the city? Can one maintain his/her humanity amongst so much bloodshed and inequity?

Slavery is not completely erased from Haiti's present. Contemporary suffering in Haiti is very much linked to the past's colonial era. The introduction to the English translation of *Street of Lost Footsteps* provides a brief history of Haiti that immediately situates Trouillot's text in a longer conversation on Haitian class warfare and the exotifying gaze that N'Zengou-Tayo discusses in her article on imaginary Port-au-Prince. A crucial aspect of the *Street of Lost Footsteps* is its ability to create allusions to the past. The text often contextualizes the past's relation to the present. In order to alert readers to the importance of this portrayal, Coverdale's introduction echoes an often leveraged critique: in 200 years, racial politics in Haiti have changed little. Coverdale teleports the reader to Haiti's birth as a nation. Here she explains that when Toussaint L'Ouverture came to power in 1801, he was in control of "a land in ruins" and in order "to finance an army to repel the inevitable attack by Napoleon, Toussaint created an authoritarian state: blacks were forcibly returned to the plantations, while whites and mulattos filled military and governmental posts."[182] Coverdale concludes that those very same politics still bedevil Haiti today. Historically the light skinned elite, as well as the military, have lorded control over

the darker skinned masses. That dynamic continues into the present. This tension is alluded to in *Street of Lost Footsteps* by the postal worker (Laurence's lover) and seen in *An Untamed State* through the tension between Mireille (a light skinned woman) and her dark-skinned captor.

If the entrenched residue of racialized slavery incites and sustains class tension, what does that mean for the ancestors of chattel slaves in Haiti? According to Spillers they continue to carry this hieroglyphics of the flesh. Weheliye critiques Deleuze and Guattari's "celebration of racial impurity" because it reinforces race as a category when in fact phenotypic difference is a convenient pretext for exploitation and abuse. Therein as people of darker skin pigment reproduce so does this system of oppression. Weheliye argues: "As a result, the legal and extralegal fictions of skin color and other visual markers obscure, and therefore facilitate, the continued existence and intergenerational transmission of the hieroglyphics of the flesh."[183] In Haiti, class dynamics have been closely tied to race and so both these social dynamics perpetuate the transmission of hieroglyphics of the flesh.

Coverdale's introduction also situates the text in a conversation regarding Haitian literature's relationship to Haitian history. In a 2005 Small Axe roundtable with other prolific Haitian authors, Dany Laferrière explains, "literature in Haiti is completely tied to history, especially in the early post- revolution period, and even before that."[184] Toussaint L'Ouverture is Haiti's most known hero. The idea that "the racial caste was thus reinstituted on the very eve of independence,"[185] and by Haiti's most beloved hero, seems unthinkable and counterintuitive.

Laferrière compares global recognition of Toussaint L'Ouverture to the relatively little-known Dessalines. Laferrière explains that Dessalines is

> the strongest Haitian figure but the least known abroad. He's not exportable….Everyone loved Toussaint afterwards but with Dessalines, nobody wants to know. He is the appalling animal, the national monster. It is still rare to hear Dessalines spoken of outside of Haiti.[186]

For those who don't know Haitian history, Toussaint is this sanitized hero-martyr who helped set the nation free and Dessalines is like Toussaint's darker, antithesis. Technically, it was Dessalines who declared the end of slavery when he became the first ruler of Haiti after the revolution. Coverdale troubles the narrative that is known to the rest of the world of Toussaint as the purveyor of freedom. For those who do not know Haiti well, the idea of a racial hierarchy in the world's first Black nation might seem strikingly dissonant. Coverdale implicated Toussaint in the genesis of the Haitian elites' predatory behavior towards the Black masses.

Coverdale concludes her introduction with an acknowledgment of the fact that Lyonel Trouillot has penned this novel in French while the majority of Haitian citizens speak Kreyol. She queries on whose behalf Trouillot has written this work and then provides her own answer, noting that Trouillot is speaking up for those who are essentially speechless in their own society, who rage at their suffering, those "whose violence has coursed through Haiti's history like the lifeblood of the body politic, those who are, in a way, still trapped in the anger that is their birth right."[187] For those who have repeatedly suffered violence and oppression at the predatory hands of the state as well as foreign forces, Trouillot provides this text as a bridge to

the hieroglyphics of their flesh. While flesh does tell a story, few take the time to carefully read and translate its narrative.

Historically, power in Haiti has accumulated around the government and the military, and because of this both institutions have been rife with corruption. Each of the characters comment on the wide reaching, ubiquitous nature of the violence they witness. Trouillot privileges incredibly long sentences which could be both attributed to the original text in French, as well as the fact that it mimics storytelling. The brothel owner and Ducharmel, in particular, talk at length with heavily detailed sentences that seem incongruous at times. However, this writing style emotionally makes a point. The overwhelming sentences engulf the reader to reflect the intensity of the violence.

The novel begins with the brothel owner's voice. Her chapters largely speak to the cyclical nature of the violence in Port-au-Prince and Haiti. Trouillot utilizes the brothel owner to reflect on the relationship between time, memory and the political violence that occurs. She provides the most articulate and sustained critiques of the country's politics. Trouillot's use of this character again contextualizes the referential framework that N'Zengou-Tayo mentions in her article. She argues that urban literature often characterizes the city in the voice of a young working-class woman or prostitute. In *Street of Lost Footsteps*, the brothel-owner or Madame fits into that archetype. She has seen the city at various different stages and understands the similarities and differences of different generations. She speaks for the both the city and its history.

Cyclical History and Violence

After Jean-Claude Duvalier fled from Haiti, the country endured a number of military regimes and coups. These coups are representative of a larger trend in Haitian history in which the poor black messes have faced continuous political repression and a violation of their bodies. This repetition of violence connects back to the uncanny as well hieroglyphics of the flesh. In Spillers' "American Grammar Book," she argues that "the captive female [enslaved] body locates precisely a moment of converging political and social vectors that mark the flesh as a prime commodity of exchange."[188] If the scars of slavery are written on the flesh, then the bodies of poor Haitians carry not only the scars of slavery, but also markings of American imperialism. Reading hieroglyphics of the flesh as well as the uncanny within the text illuminates the complex mechanisms of dehumanization that happens in the city.

The novel opens with the brothel owner speaking to an unknown man she calls "sir," or "monsieur." Likely, the monsieur is a reporter or journalist. His presence symbolizes the voyeuristic, western gaze. The prologue commences with this lead character referring to Haiti as a "epic failure factory" as opposed to a country. Trouillot's choice of the word of factory alludes to Jean-Claude Duvalier's failed economic revolution in which he tried to urbanize Haiti and Port-au-Prince with increased foreign factories.[189] Ultimately, this economic revolution failed as only foreign interests benefited from using Haitians as cheap labor. Factories, in the end, intensified the capital's overcrowding. The country is not simply one failure but a place that mass produces failure. In terms of the country's history, each government

has failed the majority of its citizens. The brothel owner continues this critique by outlining the inherent irony of Port-au-Prince's modernization. She suggests that although the city may be changing there are some things that will stay the same. Girls will continue to carry pails on their heads, despite the fact that the water is almost gone. The city may be gaining new highways but there is still violence in the streets. She tells the monsieur about the "metropolitan areas, highways and tall buildings that reach too damn high for their own good." (Des zones métropolitain, des autoroutes, et des gros immeubles qui pètent trop haut.)[190] Her tone shows that she is unimpressed by these "big buildings that reach too damn high," and why should she be when "the water's almost gone, and the villages too." (Maintenant qu'il n'y a presque plus d'eau, plus de villages.)[191] Ultimately, the brothel owner is querying whom this modernization is for? Who benefits from the city's face-lift? We can infer that these attempts at modernization are empty, symbolic gestures meant to distract from the deep-seated ongoing issues that Haitians face such as violence and government corruption.

Trouillot paints a dark picture of Port-au-Prince through the words of the brothel owner. She mentions a girl happening on the protests from the previous day. The city is worn with bullets:

> they were shooting all over the place, in sewers, over roofs, bang in the belly, stage right, in court yards, under tonnelles, in waiting rooms of private clinics, in the hall of busts at the national palace, in municipal libraries, in whorehouses, even here stage left, in gardens, in the newsrooms of radio stations, in blocked-off alleys, into the water of ditches and gutters.

> (Tenez, y en a une qui est arrivé hier au beau milieu des événements politiques alors que ça tirait partout, dans les égouts, au-dessus des toits, en plein dans le ventre, côté cour, sous les tonnelles, dans la salle des bistes du Palais national, dans les bibliothèques municipales, dans les bordels, ici même, côté jardin, dans les salles de Nouvelles des stations de radio, dans les ruelles coincées, sur l'eau des rigolés.)[192]

Here the brothel owner has given us a long list of places where violence has traveled. Expansive and ubiquitous, the bloodshed appears inescapable. It is literally everywhere, with no stone left unturned. She mentions spaces that are both public and private. The bullets reach municipal libraries, private clinics, the national palace, and whorehouses. Even though the city is modernizing, what use does it do when there are bullets and violence everywhere? What good are the "too damn tall buildings," if they are riddled in bullet holes?

Trouillot utilizes the brothel owner to exemplify how past and present suffering can be the same. For her, the carnage and cruelty has become indecipherable. Here we see the poetics of the uncanny through the repetition of violence. Freud explains, "it is only this factor of involuntary repetition which surrounds what would otherwise be innocent enough with an uncanny atmosphere, and forces upon us the idea of something fateful and inescapable when other we should have spoken of 'chance.'"[193] While death is fated, when you die is supposed to be a matter of chance. Although not innocent, this incident of violence at the center of *Street of Lost Footsteps* should also be a matter of chance. Violence is often random and unexpected. When random and unexpected violence becomes the norm, it

becomes embedded into past, present and future. There is an aspect of involuntary repetition; those subject to witnessing these events are involuntarily repeating experiences of impending doom and thanatophobia.

After the brothel owner describes the shooting, she realizes she cannot even recall what day it occurred. The violence has become indistinguishable:

> So monsieur, perhaps she didn't arrive at that precise moment, during the reign of the great dictator Deceased Forever-Immortal, during the youth of the Prophet, or on the eventful day itself, but a bit earlier or later, when the street already smelled of charred flesh, when the bodies, metals, mud, fire, plastic and death mingled in a harsh, moist odor of filth, amalgam and heartbreak. (Alors, monsieur, peut-être qu'elle n'est pas arrivé à ce moment précis, mais des années avant sous le règne du grand dictateur Décédé Vivant-Eternellement, dans la jeunesse du Prophète, ou le jour même des événements, mais un peu plus tôt ou un peu plus tard, alors que la rue sentait déjà la chair brûlée, que les corps, la boue, le feu, le plastique, la mort, les métaux, se confondaient en une odeur sèche et mouillée de crève-cœur, de saloperie, d'amalgame.)[194]

Whether it is 1965, 1975, 1985 or 1995 the streets smell of charred bodies. During Duvalier's reign as well as Aristide's, the streets smelled of death--of charred bodies. In the streets hieroglyphics of the flesh lay scattered, melding into the pavement. The stories of those tortured bodies lost. She further reinforces this when she says:

> I remember everything all at the same time. Us old folks, can we ever mix up places and happenings and memories! We live in a long night with no need to see things in detail since words and actions are constantly melting into elusive colors and sounds. (Je me souviens de tout en même temps. Nous les vieux, ce que nous nous trompons facilement de lieu, d'action, de souvenir! Nous habitons une longue nuit qui ne fait point obligation de voir les choses dans leurs détails, les mots et les actes ne cessant de se métamorphoser en d'insaisissables bruits et couleurs.)[195]

There is no need to see things in detail because everything has become the same. They live in eternal night because of the continued injustice and poverty that prevails in the country. Although many talk about "improving the country," this proves to be empty rhetoric. That is why words and actions just simply melt away instead of actually illuminating the darkness.

Trouillot uses the brothel owner to not only critique the cycles of violence, but also positions her as someone who attempts to stop it. When the brothel owner finds a revenge list in the bedroom of a woman who works for her, she is rightfully upset. The list contains names of people from the Deceased Forever Immortal dictator's (Duvalier) administration. The owner of the list had her brother killed by the dead dictator's supporters (Duvalierists) and so she had volunteered to help the Prophet's men with the revenge lists. These revenge lists allude to Aristide's retaliation against Duvalierists. In 1991, Aristide made an infamous speech that encouraged necklacing of political opponents which was the first indicator that Aristide might not go "high" when they "went low" as the saying goes.[196] In order to keep the other women from

participating in this list making, the brothel owner slaps the woman and tells her to burn the list. She notes to the monsieur that she runs "a brothel, not a courtroom, and bloodshed isn't a virtue or a miracle, it's just plain bloodshed." (…Moi je tiens un bordel, pas un tribunal, et le sang qui coule c'est ni une vertu ni un miracle, c'est tout bonnement du sang qui coule.)[197] We could read her attempt to censor the woman as a self-interested move; she does not want her home associated with any political violence for fear that she might also receive retaliation. A more generous reading of this moment would focus on the brothel owner's determination to halt the unnecessary loss of life. She is making a small but important impact on her immediate community to end these cycles of violence. In the English translation, she essentially says that bloodshed is blood shed; in the original French Trouillot writes "le sang qui coule c'est ni une vertu ni un miracle, c'est tout bonnement du sang qui coule." A literal translation means that the blood that pours is neither a virtue nor a miracle, it's quite simply from blood that pours. The French "sang qui coule" evokes more imagery of flowing blood than the English word "bloodshed." As elder, the brothel owner has seen many swept up and killed in these tempests of revenge; perhaps she stops the woman from being involved because she does not want to see her killed either.

Sexual Violence and the Flesh

In "Mama's Baby, Papa's Maybe" Spillers discusses how the North American slave code forced slaves to "bear in person the marks of a cultural text whose inside has been turned outside."[198] Throughout *A Street of Lost Footsteps*, Trouillot implores

us to think about bodies that have been turned inside out, crushed into the ground, and mutilated in various ways. The stories that these bodies tell shift based on their gender. Spillers puts forth the example of a female body hung from a tree or bleeding from the breast as "add[ing] a lexical and living dimension to the narratives of women in culture and society." For Spillers this scene of the "unprotected female flesh—of female flesh 'ungendered'—offers a praxis and a theory, a text for living and for dying, a method for reading both through their diverse mediation."[199] If the enslaved female flesh can be read through this praxis, then we can also read the contemporary Haitian female body that endures rape, beatings on the breast and other inflictions as a text for living and dying. Trouillot offers insight into how the unprotected male and female flesh in 1990's Port-au-Prince is used as a cultural text—inscribed by military violence. Hieroglyphics of the flesh is not only the inside turned out, but the outside turned in.

Through the brothel owner, Trouillot exposes the gendered body's experience in Port-au-Prince during the Cedras coup regime (1991-1994). The text comments on the intermingling of sex and violence, pinpointing an elderly, retired prostitute as the pinnacle of knowledge of these overlaps. Political rape also suggests a continuity of earlier political violence; rape was utilized as a political tool during the Duvalier dictatorship. Haitian Studies scholar Jana Braziel analyzes the sexual sadism of the Duvalier dictatorship through an interrogation of Dany Laferrière's *Le cri des oiseaux fous*. The sexual sadism of the regime was not solely the jurisdiction of men; Braziel highlights that

> Vieux Os [Old Bones, the protagonist] affiliates the sexual sadism of political torture not only with Papa Doc Duvalier (and his dictatorial anxieties about sexual masculinity or virility) but also with Madame Max, the woman whose very name inspires fear in the hearts of most Haitians.[200]

Madame Max, head of both the Tonton Macoutes in Port-au-Prince as well as the notorious Forte Dimanche prison, was known for extremely grotesque sexual torment such as the mutilation of genitalia.

The brothel owner references this kind of gross mutilation while lamenting the real material and physical costs of the bodies disfigured, and the lives lost during the latest fight between the Prophet (Aristide) and The Great Dictator Deceased Forever Immortal (Duvalier). She implores the reporter, monsieur

> but the dead—what did they tell you? The ones I saw die out on this street, the one torn in two by the army's bullets, whose top half the soldiers put headfirst into the gutter to crush flat with their boots. Or another one of the Troops of the Prophet forced to swallow his own testicles." (…mais les morts qu'est-ce qu'ils vous diront? Ce que j'ai vous mourir dans cette rue, l'un que les balles de l'armée ont coupé en deux morceaux, puis les soldats ont placé la partie supérieure du corps la tête dans le caniveau et écrasé le crane à coups des bottes. Un autre auquel les Cohortes du Prophète avaient fait avaler ses testicules.)[201]

Trouillot uses visceral and overwhelming language to imagine a body divided into two, then stomped into the earth, left in the gutter. This imagery of bodies littered in the streets and the gutters certainly evoke the uncanny.

In the legal realm, rape cases in Haiti have focused more on the damage caused on a woman's moral worth rather than the physical and psychic harm done. Likely spawned from Haiti's deep Catholic roots,[202] the Human Rights report on rape in Haiti indicates:

> The investigation and prosecution of rape thus routinely stress not the physical harm done to woman, but rather the status of her honor or morals. Consequently, women who allege rape must endure public scrutiny of their "morality;" the rape of a non-virgin may be considered a less serious offense because her honor is perceived to be already compromised. [203]

The court system has been indifferent to women's suffering related to rape unless the woman was a chaste victim. It is intriguing that Trouillot chooses a prostitute for his critique of rape. As a brothel owner and once prostitute herself, this character is a professional sex worker whose clients often include military men. In the United States context, the sex work community often experiences unwanted sexual interaction but their concerns about rape are not taken seriously due to the stigma attached to their profession.[204] Someone like the brothel owner's thoughts and experiences on rape would be doubly discounted. Not only is she a non-virgin, she traffics in sexual favor as currency.

The brothel owner suggests that the military's use of rape further perpetuates the birth of angrier and violent individuals. The brothel owner notes how over time citizens are called to the military, and wonders if victims of rape, "give birth to shriveled children with hands like knives, with arms that end in garrotes. " (…les femmes ne faisant plus amour de leur plein gré les enfants naissant tout rides avec des

mains comme des couteaux, des étouffoirs au bout des bras.) [205] Here we are reminded of Coverdale's words in the introduction; Trouillot is speaking for individuals who are still "trapped in anger that is their birthright."[206] The visual of these babies with knife-like hand is incredibly jarring. The UN/ OAS Civil Mission documented "sixty-six rapes of a political nature committed by military and its auxiliaries" between the end of January 1994 and May 1994.[207] These statistics are only those reported. The 1994 Human Rights Watch report acknowledges the normalization of rape as a political tactic that went unreported in Haitian society; "the use of rape as a political weapon in against women is not a recent development in the Haiti conflict, but until recently, it has gone largely unreported."[208] The pervasiveness of rape meant that many feared retaliation if they reported their rape to anyone at all.

Within the Human Rights Watch report on rape in Haiti, two female interviewees expressed a similar self-accepted defeat regarding violence and reporting. One seventeen-year-old girl who was gang raped by attaché after coming home from a party in Port-au-Prince, told the UN/OAS Civilian Mission:

> Of course they were attachés, otherwise they would not have been armed and they would not have cared whether we were Lavalas. This has happened to a lot of girls. It just seems to be a common problem and…that is what attachés do at night.[209]

The report further reveals that MG, the seventeen-year girl, never went to the police or the doctor for fear of retaliation. She had a friend who had reported a rape to the police and was subsequently beaten and threatened. The brothel owner speaks for many women who have been terrorized into a silence so deep that they no longer

recognize themselves or their community. The physical and psychological trauma speaks to the cynical indifference that N'Zengou-Tayo describes in the work of Gary Victor.

The brothel owner further ruminates on this theme when she laments the grotesque shape of bodies destroyed by canons and the new closeness they form in death. She says,

> From the cannon's muzzle thundered horrible concrete music, goblets of flesh clung to the walls, the bodies they flung intro trucks took new shapes, a severed arm formed a sling for a skull, probably for the first time strangers were meeting, hugging passionately, haunting one another's company, best wishes post-mortem, sharing their death agony like bosom companions, actually, monsieur, got quite some time no one has been living companionably with anyone, how can you live with someone when you no longer even know what life is.[210]

She said that she knew fear but felt very differently during this last event because of how many people she knew who died. The brothel owner tries to express how the most recent political violence, the event that she originally thought took place the day before, scared her more than other events.

> Never, monsieur, in all my born days, had I felt such fear. Not for my life...but because they were mostly people I knew, my girls gave some of them free tricks, a boy whose school fees I paid for dix months, a kid from the countryside I knew as a recruit, then first sergeant, then guard commander...But on the night of the extermination I couldn't recognize a

single soul. (Jamais, monsieur, de mémoire de femme, je n'avais éprouvé une telle peur. Pas pour ma vie…—mais parce que c'étaient pour la plupart des gens que je connaisses, certains auxquels mes filles faissent des passes gratis, un adolescent dont j'avais assuré la scolarité pendant six mois, un gamin de province que j'avais connu enrôlé, puis premier sergent, puis officier de garde…Mais la nuit de l'extermination je n'ai pu reconnaître personne.) [211]

Her inability to recognize anyone can be taken in two different ways. We might interpret that she cannot recognize them in death because they are no longer alive. She perhaps cannot recognize them because their bodies have been so badly disfigured. Perhaps, most importantly she cannot recognize them because it would be dangerous for her to do so. Affiliation with the dead might bring violence to her own doorstep. Many of the rape accounts documented in the Human Rights Watch report occurred when military and police were searching the houses of family members of male activists. With the male family members in hiding, women are vulnerable to house invasions and violence; "Rape also functions as punishment for the political beliefs and activities of the victims' male relatives."[212]

The brothel owner watches these scenes of torture and torment—the complete obliteration of flesh. Again, the poetics of the uncanny are interwoven into this imagery of bodies littered in the streets and gutters. Freud explains that death naturally invokes the uncanny. He continues to argue that over the course of human history, little has changed in regards to humans' relationship to death; death still emotionally impacts us tremendously and we know little about it scientifically (in

terms of knowing what happens to human subjectivity after death). Although Freud wrote about these ideas roughly a century ago, these facts remain the same today and were certainly true in the 1990's when Trouillot penned *Street of Lost Footsteps*. According to Freud, it is not only death itself that conjures the uncanny, but also how death's presence threatens nearby life. He writes, "our fear still implies the old belief that the dead man becomes the enemy of his survivor and seeks to carry him off to share his new life with him."[213] The brothel owner cannot recognize the dead for fear that it will catalyze her own death. This could be taken literally, that military men may come after her or spiritually—that the dead themselves may come after her.

Through the brothel owner, we see the close linkage of the poetics of the uncanny and cynical indifference. N'Zengou-Tayo pinpointed these same attributes in the work of Gary Victor. The brothel owner further reflects on the idea that everyone has become complacent and accustomed to this violence:

> Something kept me from putting names to faces. A massive wall of jammed up energy blocked my view…A wall has to get built, it doesn't just jump up in a blink, I was scare monsieur, because when you get right down to it, I no longer knew who I was, where I was, I knew only that in my bad dream or my rude awakening I'd been as blind as the violence for a long, long time. (Quelque chose m'empêchait de mettre des noms sur des visages. Un grand mur de sourde énergie barrait la route à mon regard… Un mur ça se construit, ça ne s'invente pas d'un battement des cils, j'ai eu peur, monsieur, parce qu'en fin d'inventaire, je ne savais plus qui j'étais, où j'étais, je savais

seulement que dans mon mauvais rêve ou mon mauvais réveil j'avais été pendant longtemps aussi aveugle que la violence.)[214]

Her reflection on being just as blind as the violence emphasizes the parochial lens that such an atmosphere of political repression and terror creates. Terror and violence have the ability to alienate everyone from their sense of both individual and national identity.

Navigating the City and Juridical Humanity

The narrative Trouillot constructs around Ducharmel literally brings the body to the intersections of political violence and death in the city. Ducharmel's perspective depicts working class citizens' needs for survival while navigating the city streets. Throughout Durchamel's chapters, he constantly names streets and demonstrates his geographical knowledge of the city. As a taxi driver, he is incredibly familiar with the layout of the city. It is as if the chaotic violence of that night causes Ducharmel to become lost in a space that was once familiar. This is another example of the uncanny. The definition of the uncanny stems from the unfamiliar. Freud explains, "the uncanny is that class of the frightening which leads back to what is known of old and long familiar."[215] Factional violence disfigures Port-au-Prince such that it is always changing.

Ducharmel warns the "kid" he talks to throughout his narration:

Stay alert, kid. The streets kill quicker than you'd think. You never know what it's got in store for you. A soldier in civvies once threatened me with his weapon because he wanted to pay the regular fare for a double-rate trip. When he got out, he, slammed the rifle butt into my back window. An old

woman told me I got off lucky. It's true. Here, whenever you find you're still alive, you count yourself lucky

(Méfie-toi, petit. La rue, ça tue plus vite qu'on ne le pense. Tu ne sais jamais ce que ça te réserve. Une fois, un militaire en civil m'a menacé de son arme parce qu'il avait voulu payer le prix d'une course simple pour une course double. En descendant, il a donné un grand coup de crosse dans la vitre arrière. Une vieille m'a dit que j'avais de la chance. C'est vrai. Ici, dès qu'on se retrouve encoure en vie, on peut dire qu'on a de la chance.) [216]

Here, he highlights how the military, representing a state apparatus, threatens the body and livelihood of working-class citizens. He knows this and so does the old woman who told him he was lucky. He is preparing the next generation for the transmission of "hieroglyphics of the flesh" by warning the "kid" about how his flesh will be endangered while being out in the street. Endangerment of the flesh can both predictable and unpredictable. Its predictability stems from the connection to a history of socially prescribed violence; its unpredictability operates at an individual level. Your social status and proximity can vary the when and if you will experience violence from the military. At one moment Ducharmel is ferrying a passenger to his destination, and the next he is fleeing for his life.

Trouillot utilizes Ducharmel to imagine how one's mind and body recovers, if it can at all from surviving the factional violence that occurs in the streets. Ducharmel picks up a passenger, seemingly some kind of scholar, who is carrying maps of the city with him. The passenger is in search of Rue Morte, Dead Street, and rambles somewhat nonsensically about life and death. In driving to the center of the city,

Ducharmel finds that he is caught in the middle of the violence. He abandons his car and must jump into the Ravine des Innocents (which is highly ironic) to avoid the gunshots. The passenger does the same but drowns in the ravine; thus an innocent person is lost to violence. It is as this peak moment of chaos and violence that we see N'Zengou-Tayo's reference to recent urban literature as a poetics of the uncanny.

After Ducharmel's ordeal, he is left without a leg and without a car—disabled both bodily and from his main form of transportation and income. He also becomes mentally unstable after his incident**.** He begins hunting for his lost car and rambling much like the last passenger he had. He tells the "kid" that he is irreparably marked by his time in the ravine; he says, "No water can wash away that much muck. In July, when it's really hot, I reek of the ravine. By clambering up on stones and cooking pots I got out of there, but I'll never get out of there." (Aucune eau ne peut laver une telle quantité d'ordures. En juillet, quand il fait très chaud, je pue l'odeur de la ravine. En grimpant sur des pierres et des marmites j'en étais sorti, mais je n'en sortirai jamais.)[217]

With the progression of the book, each of Ducharmel's chapter reveals more about the actual events of what occurred to Ducharmel the night he was caught in the violence. However, much like someone suffering from post-traumatic stress disorder, Ducharmel does not tell the narrative in a linear way. Instead he keeps circling the event without really directly explaining it. Here he mentions the crazy passenger he had turning into a voice in his head. But at this point in the story it's not completely clear that that voice is from the last passenger he had before right before stumbled upon the violence.

> I was certain I knew that laughing voice, an acquaintance from another world, a mask that had already laughed in my face, stop talking behind my back, don't laugh like that, they'll hear us, shoot at us, don't laugh, just gather up all your fucking old papers, North Pole, South Pole, they'll think they're leaflets, while others kept on singing, screaming, the madman's voice bored into my ear, not a thing I could do, it was me hiding behind me, you've finally found the Rue des Pas-Perdus, basic rate, standard fare, all roads read to death. (J'étais sûr de connaître la voix qui riait, une connaissance d'une autre monde, un masque qui m'avait déjà ri au nez, arête de parler dans mon dos, ne ris pas, ramasse donc tes foutues paperasses, pôle Nord, pôle Sud, ils vont croire que ce sont des tracts, tandis que les autres continuaient de chanter, de hurler, la voix du fou me rentrait dans l'oreille, je ne pouvais rien contre elle, c'était moi cache derrière moi, tu as l'enfin trouvée la rue des Pas Perdus, course simple—tarif régulier, tous les chemins mènent à la mort.)[218]

This mammoth of a sentence is overwhelming and unbearable. Trouillot utilizes this form to represent the schizophrenic conditions under which people must live. The author provides context of the current, bloody situation through Ducharmel's inner monologue. Since all roads lead to death, it is an almost impossible and crazy-making task to try to stay alive.

La Salle de Pas Perdue or the Hall of Lost Footsteps is a hallway or antechamber where a lawyer and his client consult with each other. Trouillot cleverly imagines a Street of Lost Footsteps which could allude to Haiti's search for democracy and justice. Again, this street fits well into a poetics of the uncanny.

Taken literally, lost footsteps are steps that are wasted; they cannot be accounted for because they are lost. In searching for this street, Ducharmel literally loses a foot. This peculiar and mysterious street is a place where one cannot move forward. Or if we imagine the Street of Lost Footsteps to be parallel to Hall of Lost Footsteps, then this street is the precursor to a formal court hearing. In this interpretation, Ducharmel and his passenger's search for this street is likened to Haiti's search for a path to justice and reconciliation.

The poetics of the uncanny emerged in urban fiction as a response to the political climate of the Duvalier dictatorship. The uncanny can be produced by the blurring of the imaginary and reality. The dictatorship, with death squad, henchmen named after the Haitian folktale boogey men who kidnapped little children, was the epitome of the uncanny. The dictatorship operated in a mode of horror reminiscent of gruesome fairytales. As Michel Rolph Trouillot explains, violence under Duvalier seemed limitless and irrational;

> A tally of its casualties would count more scapegoats, more victims of sheer arbitrariness, of accidents of birth, or of presence at inopportune times and places than opponents who represented any real menace to the regime. But the very frequency of these accidents, the fact that they could just befall anyone at any moment, engendered what local observers called a "climate of terror."[219]

Even a little over a decade after Jean-Claude Duvalier's departure, this climate of terror endured in Port-au-Prince. Laurence's lover provides the most articulated description of what exactly happens during the night's political events. He overhears a communication while at his friend's house. It reports that:

> The army has machine-gunned the working class neighborhoods in accordance with the last wishes of the great dictator Deceased-Forever-Immortal, in the low-lying districts they have drowned their victims in canals, they have closed the gates, no one can leave the city, a communique is appealing to all doctors' sense of civic duty and advising them to remain in their homes, hospital personnel will be charged with terrorism if they give medical assistance to the wounded. (L'armée a mitraillé les quartiers populaires selon les dernières volontés du grand dictateur Décédé Vivante-Eternellement, au bas de la ville ils ont noyé les morts dans les canaux, ils ont fermé les deux portails, personne ne peut quitter la ville, un communiqué fait appel au sens civique des médecins et leur conseille de rester chez eux, le personnel des hôpitaux sera jugé pour terrorisme s'il accorde de soins aux blessés.)[220]

It is through the perspective of Laurence's lover that we understand what is happening to Ducharmel. He has accidentally driven into a part of the city where the military are killing Aristide supporters. Not only are the military executing people, but also intimidating doctors away from helping. The language of the communication returns us back to N'Zengou-Tayo's appeals to a "poetics of the uncanny." It is absurd to demand that doctors ignore severely wounded citizens' appeals for a "sense of civic duty." Should someone be shot, even accidentally, they still might die because they cannot find any medical help. Ducharmel is rightfully worried about being on the streets with a passenger carrying suspicious leaflets. Those papers might

be taken for pro-Aristide propaganda. Even the loosest affiliation with political activity could cost someone his or her life.

In the last chapter, Trouillot, who would later become a staunch critic of Aristide in the early 2000's, chastises the president's return to Haiti with the American military in tow. The author suggests that Aristide has bought into the problematic "juridical humanity" and liberal human rights politics of the west. The book ends with Ducharmel observing the incoming American troops; the prophet (Aristide) has returned with the aid of the American empire. The character voices his skepticism of the prophet's arrival: "That must be what politics is, trading homegrown policemen for foreign ones. They say the prophet knows what he's doing. That he can see what's coming. But all mothers say that about their children." (Ça doit être ça la politique, troquer les gendarmes d'ici pour des gendarmes étrangers. On dit que le Prophète sait ce qu'il fait. Qu'il a l'œil. Mais toutes les mères disent ça de leurs enfants.)[221] Trouillot queries the difference between homegrown and foreign police, stipulating that they are all arbiters of violence. From the first American Occupation, Haitians had learned about American soldiers' propensity for violence.

Ducharmel says that has been invited to a reception that the prophet is having for those who are disabled. He says: "But my missing leg isn't a war wound, it's a tool that I've lost. I don't want to wind up winning first prize at the beggars' ball." (Mais ma jambe perdue, c'est pas une blessure de guerre, c'est la perte d'un outil de travail.)[222] Ducharmel does not want to participate in the game to have his humanity restored nor "win the beggars ball." In order to be recognized as human, Ducharmel

would be required to bare the hieroglyphics of his flesh in exchange for resources that he should already have. Weheliye aptly explains,

> Liberal governing bodies, whether in the form of nation-states or supranational entities such as the United Nations or the International Criminal court make particular forms of wounding the precondition for entry into the hallowed halls of full personhood, only acknowledging certain types of physical violence.[223]

In Haiti, liberal governing bodies control Haiti's fate. That fate is determined by the wounds that Haiti displays for public attention and consumption.

Throughout the novel, Trouillot portrays how the city is shaped by the legacies of political violence and what that means for individuals navigating the city streets. As a migrant from the countryside, Ducharmel reflects on the uniqueness of each street in Port-au-Prince. He says, "Driving in the country, driving in the city, it's the same thing I told myself. I came to live in Port-au-Prince. Wasn't easy at first, I couldn't keep the streets straight…Each street is someone special, they're like children from the same family, they look alike, and they look nothing like." (Je me suis dit, conduire sur les routes ou conduire dans la ville, c'est pareil. Je suis venu vivre à Port-au-Prince. Au début, c'était pas facile, je n'arrivais pas à localiser les rues…Chaque rue c'est quelqu'un à part, c'est comme les enfants d'une même famille, ça se ressemble et ça se ressemble pas.)[224]

The brothel owner talks explicitly about how a public space is co-opted by the political agenda of those in power. At first, the fountain and square are created by the Deceased Forever-Immortal dictator, but then they are overtaken by the Prophet's

supporters and eventually torn down to be rebuilt by the Prophet when he gains power.

> In those days the great dictator Deceased Forever Immortal was inaugurating a new tourist cité. Everything there was named after him: the streets, squares, the fountain that cost a minister of public works his life, because after three months its jet of water illuminated by brightly colored bulbs had become thin reddish-brown trickle, a murky color between mud and blood. The minister paid for that color with his life when the square became a place of ironic pilgrimage for the opposition. (En ce temps-là le grand Dictateur Décédé Vivant-Eternellement inaugurait une nouvelle cite touristique. Tout y était à son nom: les rues, le places, la fontaine qui coûta la vie à minister des Travaux publics, parce qu'au bout de trois mois son jet illumine par des ampoules des couleur vive s'était change en un filet rouge-brun, une teinte indéfinie, comme entre sang et boue.)[225]

People's lives are drastically impacted by the erection of this public monument. A minister is killed when it is besieged by the opposition. The minister's death is emblematic of how quickly one can fall out of political favor, and the dangers of what falling out of that favor means. An insightful aspect of this passage is the policy that it later hints towards—the removal of the homeless from the public square. Trouillot depicts how individuals must navigate city spaces as the political landscapes continuously shift. Under the Deceased Forever-Immortal's tenure, beggars are banished from the public square, but there is no discussion of where they go or what happens to them. Homeless people in developed nations are often pushed out of

spaces and severely marginalized.[226] What might it mean to be homeless in a totalitarian state? If the ministers can be killed without recourse what then happens to those without occupation or community? What happens to those without family whose deaths will no longer be "mourned by the tears of a close relative?"[227] The majority of Haiti's population lives on the brink of homelessness. The way citizens navigate cities and public space is very much shaped by political and socio-economic constraints.

Trouillot contributes to a canon of urban Haitian literature that depicts the nightmarish reality of daily life in Port-au-Prince. He, like other Haitian novelists, utilizes a "poetics of the uncanny" that conveys this reality of lacerated flesh. Here, bloodshed and fear is quotidian. However, Trouillot also depicts how this reality is part of a larger cycle that connects to the history of slavery and the global power dynamics that Haiti has been enveloped in since its birth.

Trouillot contributes to a canon of urban Haitian literature that depicts the nightmarish reality of daily life in contemporary Port-au-Prince. He, like other Haitian novelists, utilize a "poetics of the uncanny" to convey this reality. For poor Haitians, bloodshed and fear is quotidian. However, Trouillot also depicts how this is part of a larger cycle that connects to the history of slavery and the global power dynamics that Haiti has been enveloped in since its birth.

An Untamed State

In her debut novel, Roxane Gay poignantly raises questions across a broad spectrum of themes such as trauma and healing; familial, national and cultural

identity and belonging; and inequality, violence and its uniqueness to specific geographic spaces. *An Untamed State* follows the story of a Haitian-American woman, Mireille Duval Jameson, who is kidnapped on a family vacation to visit her wealthy parents in Port-au-Prince. The novel alternates perspectives between the first-person view of Mireille, as she endures captivity, and a third person omniscient narrator who offers brief glimpses into the thoughts and feelings of multiple, important secondary characters such as Mireille's White American husband Michael and her mother Fabienne Duval.

An Untamed State produces strong emotions for its readers as it deals with the overwhelming trauma that Mireille faces. Unsettling only barely begins to describe Mireille's situation as she waits for men to barter over the safety and value of her body and life. The most nerve-wrecking question is whether her stubborn father, bent on negotiating down the kidnappers' million-dollar ransom, will give in to save his youngest daughter. The narrator tell us, "He [Sebastian, Mireille's father] wasn't going to lose everything he had worked for to thieving losers, only to be left with nothing of a life again."[228] These thieving losers are "chimères" (ghosts), who are a part of gangs that have pledged allegiance to the Fanmi Lavalas political party. For a successful businessman like Sebastien Duval, one who has connections to American NGO's, men like the Commander and his army are always already losers.

Referring to the U.S. penal system, Weheliye argues that "the normal order is differentially and hierarchically structured and does not necessitate a legal state of exception in order to fabricate the mere life of those subjects already marked for violent exclusion; in fact, we might even say that this is its end goal."[229] The

normative mode of this system extends violence onto those who do not fit into the system's structure. Weheliye offers us the U.S. prison industrial complex as an example of a racializing assemblage that "dyselects Black and Latino subjects, branding them with hieroglyphics of the flesh."[230] How might this translate in a Haitian context? Even in Haiti, the U.S. white hegemony continues to brand Black bodies with hieroglyphics of the flesh; it is the Haitian elite who act as conduits.

According to the Borgen Project, the top twenty percent of households own sixty-four percent of the country's wealth.[231] A parallel example to the United States penal system would be the foreign export industry. Those Haitians lucky enough to find stable employment, such as work in a factory that produces exports destined for the United States are vulnerable to wage theft.[232] American businesses continue to buy cheap garments from factories that make up low sale costs on the backs of their workers. American businesses support factories that leave Haitians both physically (Like many factories in developing nations, safety conditions are often questionable at best and life-threatening at worst) and economically vulnerable. The hieroglyphics of Haitians flesh tell a narrative of strife connected to these American supported factories. Often, for poor Haitians, there are few employment options and who must take jobs in these factories.

Although Sebastien may not act as a direct bridge between American hegemony and the flesh of poor Haitians, he certainly does not protest the sacrifice of Haitian flesh for American business interests. I speculate that Sebastien purposefully misreads their flesh, instead projecting his own narrative onto their bodies. He imagines that had they (Mireille's kidnappers) worked as hard as he, they too could

have escaped poverty and depravity. Glimpsing inside Sebastien's psyche, the narrator tells us: "It galled [Sebastien] that men who had not worked an honest day in their lives would be so bold to ask for a lifetime fortune."[233] We see the assumptions that Sebastien has projected onto Mireille's kidnappers. One of the chimères, Ti-Pierre, who treats Mireille like a lover, grew up as a *restavek*. Restaveks are children who work as domestic servants in trade for food and housing; this arrangement is understood to be a form of child slavery. Ti-Pierre never learned to read or write because he was always working—"scrubbing marble floors and climbing ladders to polish a crystal chandelier and washing the beautiful German cars he would never sit in."[234] Sebastien is appalled that these men would steal for wealth, but does not recognize that illiteracy and poverty leave men like the chimères with few other options.

Roxane Gay depicts how the upper class in Port-au-Prince cultivates a willful cynical indifference to suffering and the physical and psychological wounds of poor Haitians. While Trouillot shows us the cynical indifference that festers amongst the working class, fearful that their neighbor's tragic fate might be their own—Gay portrays the pessimistic indifference the wealthy have towards the poor. Years of ignoring the flesh of the poor facilitates Sebastien Duval's ability to prolong his daughter's suffering.

Wealthy Indifference

Ultimately, the vitality of Mireille's flesh is dependent on her father's pride. Mireille's kidnapping occurs within the very first pages of the novel. In the first

paragraph, we learn that she was held hostage for thirteen days, so there is no question of whether Mireille will live or die. Yet, what will transpire during these thirteen, terror-filled days, and how Mireille ultimately manages to escape, are all a mystery for the reader. There is a definite feeling of unease as the reader endures feelings of abandonment, and hopefulness while waiting with Mireille to either be saved or save herself. As a descendant of free ancestors, her father has engrained in her a belief that "you can control your fate."[235]

A central question for both Haiti and Mireille is the extent to which one can control his/her fate. The slaves of Saint-Domingue took their fate into their own hands to rebel and deliver themselves to freedom. Despite that fact, Haiti continues to exist as a "failed democracy" and labeled the poorest country in the Western hemisphere. On the verge of the new millennium, scholars frequently talk about Haiti's predatory government. The international community mandated that the government be dismantled so that a new Haiti could be built. After the 2010 earthquake and the rise of NGO's in Haiti, it has become painfully evident that the country is very much beholden to the international community, particularly the United States, France and Canada. Political scholar Robert Fatton Jr. has referred to Haiti's present political state as a "trusteeship of the international community."[236] Mireille's free will and ability to control her situation are in the hands of her father and her captors. When the Commander, her captor, briefly sets her free this further proves that Mireille's free will is incredibly limited. Neither Haiti nor Mireille, while hostage, has real sovereignty.

Gay portrays Mireille's father, Sebastien Duval, as a steadfast man whose will cannot be broken. As Mireille attempts to endure her torture and captivity, she tries to evoke the stoic person her father always demanded. In a reflection on her parents' immigrant story, she says, "my father does not understand obstacles, doesn't believe they exist. He cannot see obstacles."[237] Mireille's abduction becomes yet another obstacle he refuses to fully see. For Sebastien, the million-dollar ransom for the return of Mireille's body is invisible.

Gay expertly depicts how continued trauma and subjugation wear away at mind, body and spirit; ultimately Mireille must trade her body and identity for her survival. Reflecting back Mireille says, "In the before, I took the sanctity of my body for granted. In the after, my body was nothing. It was a matter of time."[238] When Mireille is first kidnapped, before her father declined the million dollar ransom, Mireille repeats his words to herself: "There is nothing I cannot get through if I try hard enough."[239] As the days draw out, Mireille realizes that her father's rhetoric is not enough to protect her body. As the scars and bruises multiply, Mireille becomes enraged by this rhetoric that had at first motivated her. She says her father called her several times throughout her captivity. In the conversations that we see, he always tells her to "stay strong." However, he does not understand the psychic and material costs of "staying strong." She notes her father's ability to remain unwaveringly calm each time she speaks with him. As the physical and sexual abuse heightens, Mireille's ability to continue to be the resilient fighter-daughter her father imagines, dwindles. Three days in captivity, after having been raped and sadistically tortured, Mireille is still determined to not to be broken. "These men had kidnapped the daughter of

Sebastien Duval. Even as I became less and less that man's daughter, my ambition to survive was my only emotion."[240] Towards the end of her captivity, when she begins to believe that she will become the property of the Commander forever, she has little fight left. Right before asking for mercy, as the rain physically washes away her torment, she reflects, "If this was the rest of my life there was no reason to further fight."[241]

The Commander demands that Mireille perform her suffering so that her father will validate her humanity. This again parallels how Haiti must perform its suffering in order to receive financial aid and support from the western world. In the beginning, she holds out against playing the Commander's game; he wants her to expose her suffering to her father in order to compel him to pay. She does not do this at first, because she tries to resist but also, because she knows her father will not pay. Mireille capitulates to the Commander's demands when he presses a bruise on her shoulder while she is on the phone with her father. Her father is "going on and on about the futility of negotiating with men without morals."[242] Mireille exposes her pain to her father by gasping then later screaming—she is pained so badly that her bladder releases urine onto her tattered clothes. She says, "I begged my father to save what was left of me. Once again, I had an audience while I endured the humiliation, the threat of his indifference." There is a painful dissonance between the phrase "beg to save" and "threat of indifference." The reader can imagine Mireille pleading on the phone while a stoic father tells her that she must wait. There again, the word indifference returns to us. Why is her father indifferent to her suffering? When she screams and begs for him to save her, it is only Day 3. She has 10 more days to

endure. Sebastien's indifference to his daughter's suffering is entangled in the same kind of cynical indifference N'Zengou-Tayo discusses in her catalogue on urban Haitian fiction. His indifference to suffering and the hieroglyphics of the flesh of millions of poor Haitians sets up the indifference he demonstrates for the well-being of Mireille's body. Her flashbacks portray how her family has guiltily ignored the poor around them.

Frequently chapters with flashbacks are bookended by the present in Mireille's cage. The chapter begins with a few sentences about her bodily reality and then uses a specific object, such as her bikini bottoms or her hysterical laugh to transition to her memories of the past. Mireille reflects on her struggle to exist in Port-au-Prince amongst the extreme poverty. As she remembers the Haiti of her childhood, she recalls riding in the car, "mobbed at street corners by men and women and children, hungry and angry and yearning to know what it might feel like to sit in the leather seats of an air-conditioned luxury sedan."[243] She sees a man with one leg and a tumor beneath his eyes—his insides turned out. He is angry with them—he slams his hands against the window and hurls saliva at Mireille's image in the glass. She says that she "tried to forget how brightly the rage and frustration pulsed off of the man with the broken body on the corner."[244] His pulsing rage and frustration mirror the image from the introduction of *Street of Lost Footsteps*; Lyonel Trouillot speaks for—men and women "who rage at their suffering."[245] In an alternative universe, might this leg-less man be Ducharmel, enraged at the site of a car—a reminder of the leg and Toyota he lost in the chaos of random political violence? Gay has Mireille reflect on the memory of her father during her childhood when she took

the sanctity and safety of her body for granted. That safety was, in part, due to her class privilege.

Mireille's memory of her father's decision to permanently return to Port-au-Prince reflects his indifference to the suffering around him: "it was easy for my father to overlook the country's painful truths because they did not apply to him, to us. He left the island with nothing and returned with everything—a wife, children, wealth."[246] Yet her mother was more reluctant to return: "The oppressive heat and the promiscuity of the capital, so many people living together in such close quarters—it troubled her. She hated how everyone was always preoccupied with everyone else's lives."[247] Mireille's kidnapping is a direct challenge to her father's belief that "the country's painful truths… did not apply to [them]."[248] Here we see these familiar references to a lack of privacy and over-population that reflect the Duval's upper-class status that looks at the lower class with an other-ing gaze. Throughout the novel, it becomes clear that Mireille is suffering punishment for her family's wealth and indifference. The narrative explores Mireille's efforts to try to grapple with father's overt apathy toward Haiti's economic inequality. N'Zengou-Tayo reminds us that "radical writers always accuse the middle class of an inability to take sides and, worse, of shifting loyalties."[249] Through *An Untamed State,* Roxane Gay clearly aligns herself with this tradition.

Complicity

Gay includes several scenes that display where Mireille tries to appeal to gender solidarity but finds that class status divides them. When Mireille is allowed to

briefly escape, she runs through the slums hoping to find her way towards some kind of safety. It is a kind woman inside the Commander's house who sets her free, unlocking Mireille from the bed that she is chained too. As she runs through the Bel Air slums she thinks: "The slums are an endless maze of narrow streets and alleys lined with small concrete block homes… I ran through the streets and thought, 'This is a Haiti I have never seen or known.' It was a Haiti no one should have to know." [250] In this different part of the city, Mireille is lost and isolated. Even though she has been set free (which she does not know when she flees), ultimately, she is recaptured by her torturers because as the Commander tells her, "Don't look so disappointed. You were never going to get away. Your father may think he owns the city, but I own these streets."[251] Here we see the intense class tension of Haiti and how different parts of the city correlate with different kinds of knowing and possessing. In the slums, Mireille is out of her comfort zone. She is literally in the same exact city as her family and yet she cannot find her way home.

The scene of Mireille's false escape mirrors the scene of her capture. In both scenes, Gay weaves in jarring imagery of complicit bystanders. Mireille and the Commander sit in a café where *Judge Judy* is playing on a TV screen. The Commander accuses Mireille of complicity regarding Haiti's poverty. He asks her about the children who will only know life here in the slums. She responds that she and her family did not create the country's problems. He answers back, "People like you always choose to absolve yourselves. You are complicit even if you do not actively contribute to the problem because you do nothing."[252] This infuriates Mireille and shortly after this conversation she is dragged out of the café to be returned to her

cage. As she is hauled out of the building, Mireille stares at the woman who owns the coffee shop and who previously told the commander of Mireille's whereabouts. Mireille shouts to the woman, "How could you? We are both daughters of Dessalines."[253] The woman stares back at Mireille, straight into her eyes without blinking The captive attempts to appeal to both this woman's nationality and gender by saying they are both daughters of Dessalines.[254] However, the Commander has paid the woman off. Mireille is enraged by this inverted reflection of indifference and use of corrupted capital to manipulate and support violence. The Commander is probably an intimidating figure in the woman's community; what good would it serve her to align herself against him for the sake of Mireille—a woman she will likely never see again? In any other scenario, this woman—a small business owner in the slums—would be invisible to Mireille.

When Mireille is first taken, there are bystanders everywhere, but they do nothing:

> A small crowd gathered. I begged them to help. They did not. They stood and watched me screaming and fighting will all the muscle in my heart. I saw their faces and the indifference in their eyes, the relief that it was not yet their time; the wolves had not yet come for them.[255]

Immediately this scene reminds us of Trouillot's brothel owner lamenting that she had been as "blind as the violence." Here Gay depicts the result of decades of training where Haitian see something, but say nothing. These bystanders know that "the wolves have not yet come for them" and, therefore, interfering in Mireille's capture may provoke violence towards them. They know that survival demands indifference,

and Mireille is taken in broad daylight, in front of many witnesses, right outside the gate of her parents' home.

The Haitian Justice system is complicit in ignoring how hieroglyphics are unjustly branded onto the flesh of Haitian citizens. The court system is yet another remnant of the Duvalier era —filled with judges who are not properly trained or who can be bribed. Gay alludes to Haiti's feeble justice system. After the money has been paid for Mireille's return there is a mention of justice. As she prepares to return to Miami, she reflects on the fact that she can leave very quickly because there will be no trial. She thinks to herself,

> There were no authorities to notify about my release, not really. In the morning the police would visit, yes, but not much would come of it…There would be no evidence collected, no trial, no justice, and without justice there was no crime. It was almost a relief. I was no one, so nothing happened to me.[256]

It is notable that Mireille is relieved that there will be no trial, considering that she herself is a lawyer. She is not only deeply scarred in her sense of personal but also national identity. She is not interested or concerned by the fact that there will be no justice with respect to her case. She does not espouse any hope for justice or change, but rather accepts the situation in order to move forward as best she can.

Gay portrays the alternative justice that reigns in Haiti—mob rule. Mireille's cousin Victor takes her husband Michael out to enact vigilante justice. Victor brings Michael to the house of Ti Pierre; they had asked him earlier about Mireille's whereabouts and he had lied. Ti Pierre is one of The Commander's henchmen and

had treated Mireille like a lover when he attempted to rape her. They storm into Ti Pierre's house and then beat him savagely. Victor hands Michael a gun which he decides not to use to kill Ti Pierre when he notices a woman holding Ti Pierre's son. Michael is later haunted by the fact that he did not avenge Mireille and struggles to face her. Through this scene of flouted retribution, Gay portrays the cyclical violence and vengeance that occurs in Port-au-Prince. Michael decided not to retaliate, but others would have chosen differently. If Haiti had the resources for a stronger justice system, or more resources that men like the Commander would not need to steal or kidnap at all—how might things be different?

Haitian Literary Conventions and Migrant Narratives

Gay uses conventional tropes to describe Port-au-Prince. One such trope is seeing the city as place of departure. Mireille's memories of "the before" fluctuate across geographic space moving from the early years of her relationship with her husband in Lincoln, Nebraska, and other moments from her life in Miami with Michael. In one such memory, Mireille reflects on her family's customary return to Port-au-Prince every summer that mimics the trajectory of many diasporic families: "we waited in an endless customs line overwhelmed by the heat and the smell so many sweaty people in cramped quarters and then, outside the airport…it was like being thrown into the middle of a riot, everyone shouting, waving their hands wildly in the air, ignoring rules of polite conduct and personal space."[257] It is telling that she compares her airport experience to a riot. Likely, had she experienced an actual riot, with police shooting at students or burning tires, she would not have thought of the

two experiences as the same. Images of congestion and over-population at the airport foretell the nature of Port-au-Prince before one has fully entered the city. This perspective also signals Mireille's upper-class status; in all of her visits to and from the country, she has been shielded from experiencing a true riot.

Port-au-Prince is also linked to the imagery of Haitian refugees who flee the country in unsteady dingy boats. Sitting on the Gulf Gonaives, the capital's port has surely witnessed thousands of people in boats, disappearing in the night, in search of prosperity and safer tides. Yet, the reality is that many of these boats, if they did not capsize, were intercepted by the U.S. Coast Guard, and the runaways frequently returned to Haitian authorities in Port-au-Prince. "At the peak of the refugee crisis almost 45,000 refugees who had been intercepted by the U.S. Coast Guard at sea were detained at the Guantanamo naval base."[258]

Marie-José N'Zengou-Tayo article, "Unwelcome Neighbors: The Haitian Popular Migration in the Writings of Some Caribbean Writers", exemplifies how the image of Haitian boat people has traveled across Caribbean literature. Her work examines Haitian characters emigrating to neighboring Caribbean islands and the United States—all fleeing the violence and poor economic prospects in Jean-Claude Duvalier's Haiti of the 1970's and 1980's. N'Zengou-Tayo's article showcases at least four different Caribbean authors from varied nations engaging with the Haitian migrant trope; this article is a testament to both the necessity of migration for Haitians as well as the prevalence of Port-au-Prince as a point of departure. As emphasized by Laguerre, "during the François and Jean-Claude Duvalier administration [internal and

external migration] had become an economic and political necessity and affected the totality of Haitian society."[259]

For those creatives exiled during times of political upheaval, Port-au-Prince appears in their work as a fleeting memory or place of departure. The oeuvres of writers like Edwidge Danticat and Dany Laferrière especially focus on Port-au-Prince as a remembered place of identity, family and, at times, traumatic reckoning. As Lucienne Nicolas further explains :

> Parce qu'elle est désormais perdue, la ville du passé se révèle intensément à l'exile, au contact quotidien avec la grande ville nord-américaine ou européenne. Celui-ci [*l'écrivain*] revit le lieu de l'enfance ou de l'adolescence comme mémoire, comme une ville fantasmée, désirée. Désormais, l'exil et la mémoire nourrissent l'imaginaire des villes, et le thème de l'urbain devient aussi une composante du roman haïtien.[260] (Because it is now lost, the city of the past is intensely exiled, in daily contact with the big North American or European city. This one [the writer] relives the place of childhood or adolescence as memory, like a fantasized, desired city. From now on, exile and memory nourish the imagination of the cities, and the theme of the urban becomes also a component of the Haitian novel.)

Nicolas reinforces the fact that the urban is frequently a theme for exploration in Haitian novels. Writers of the diaspora often juxtapose their memories of Port-au-Prince against their new city, like Montreal, New York, Miami or Paris. For instance, in Edwidge Danticat's novel (based loosely on her own life) *Breath, Eyes, Memory*,

Danticat depicts a vivid image of violence at the airport right before Sophie's flight to New York:

> We stopped in front of the main entrance. The smoke had been coming across the street. Army trucks surrounded a car in flames. A group of students were standing on top of a hill, throwing rocks at the burning car. They scurried to avoid the tear gas and the round of bullets that the soldiers shot back at them[261]

This is the protagonist's last image of Port-au-Prince and Haiti before she leaves to embark on her journey to America. This image can translate to other periods in Haitian history. Sophie might be surrounded by the political chaos of the 1950's, 1980's, or 1990's. Her aunt asks if she sees what she is leaving, but Sophie replies that all she sees is her aunt.[262] This is a strikingly different airport scene than the one Mireille recalls; crowded, hot and chaotic does not necessarily make for a riot. Diaspora writers imagine Port-au-Prince as a remembered space to return to because it connects to family, identity and trauma.

Gay adds another complex lens to analyzing Haitian inequality through Michael, Mireille's husband. Using his character, Gay highlights American ignorance to the nuances of social hierarchy in in Haiti. When Mireille reflects back on their first trip to her homeland, she recalls Michael's first impressions of Haiti. Mireille describes this experience:

> For most of the trip, Michael was wide-eyed, trying to cope with the country and its startling contrasts—so much beauty, so much brutality. Everywhere we went, he stared, at the garbage in the streets, the complex webs of

> electrical wiring overhead, huge estates unbelievably high with walls around which *bindonvilles*, shantytowns, sprawled as far as the eye could see, and everywhere, so many people, desperate, angry, hungry, scratching. There was a promiscuity that was, when you spent too much time thinking about it, impossible to bear.[263]

Michael can't understand how Port-au-Prince exists where such inequality is visible. "How do your parents survive the guilt of living like this?" Michael queries.[264] There is a tense exchange that occurs between Michael and the Duvals once Mireille has finally been released and returned, after she survives multiple incidents of gang rape and torture. Michael angrily tells her mother, "You know Fabienne, being American is feeling pretty good right now. This never would have happened to us in Miami, or anywhere else in the States and don't you forget that."[265] Mireille's husband, speaking from white male privilege, feels reaffirmed by telling her mother that this could never happen in the United States. He must be aware that women are frequently kidnapped and murdered in the U.S., but chooses conveniently to forget this. Rather, there is an underlying assumption that a woman of Mireille's class status, a wealthy immigration lawyer and spouse of a successful white architect, would not be taken in Miami or the U.S. At home, Mireille is too close to power and privilege for something like this to happen, or at least this is what Michael wants to believe. In Port-au-Prince, it is literally Mireille's status that precipitates her abduction and her father's refusal to pay the money that prolongs her captivity.

An alternative reading of Michael and Mireille's union might recast him not as ignorant with respect to Haiti's social hierarchy, but decidedly aligned with

Haitian elites. Although Michael is largely portrayed as a good-hearted, loveable man, he still has an air of American superiority about him. This reflects the ways in which White American liberals or White saviors, "support brutal policies in the morning, founds charities in the afternoon, and receives awards in the evening."[266] *An Untamed State* does not directly divulge any character's political stance. However, Michael very clearly evokes implicit biases about Haiti as a "developing nation." The relationship between Michael and Mireille metaphorically represents American business interests' longstanding support of wealthy Haitians.

An Untamed State pushes readers to question the complex layers of criminality and justice in both Haiti and Port-au-Prince. Although the Commander and his men unequivocally commit heinous crimes against Mireille's body, at the beginning of the novel they are portrayed in a complex, almost positive light. In the first lines of the text, Gay writes in Mireille's voice: "Once upon a time, in a far-off land, I was kidnapped by a gang of fearless yet terrified young men with so much impossible hope beating inside their bodies it burned their very skin and strengthened their will right through their bones"[267] She describes the Commander and his men as fearless, with impossible hope. From reading solely this sentence, one might not recognize her kidnapping as a traumatic experience. Further in the novel, she says that they wanted to break her, it was not personal, and she was not broken. For many, this interpretation of her captivity is completely illegible. After multiple rapes, beatings and burnings how can she retrospectively think of her torturers as fearless? Weheliye can help us interpolate Mireille's description of her torturers.

In *Habeas Viscus*, Weheliye provides a re-reading of Agamben's Muselmann in Nazi concentration camps; for Agamben the Muselmann is the "final biopolitical substance to be isolated in the biological continuum."[268] As the example of final, complete dehumanization, Agamben argues that the Muselmann process of starvation and slow death, is an act of bare life which transcends race. Weheliye dissents against the idea of racial transcendence as well as the fact that Muselmann becomes a representation or metaphor for violence that forgets their materiality. He writes

> In both instances, the Muselmann becomes ciphers for factors that exceed their own condition: evil, testimony, ethics, the human, and so on, which obscures the flesh of these subjects in an attempt to give back to them a metaphysical body. How might we go about imagining not a disembodied ethics in which the Muselmann serves as template for the inhuman in the human, but the very process of becoming-Muslemann as a form of politics.[269]

Weheliye's desire to remember the human aspect of the Muselmänner is useful for understanding *An Untamed State*. This is essential to Weheliye's project of habeas viscus; "because to fully inhabit the flesh might lead to a different modality of existence."[270] How can we imagine that Mireille's captivity and her process of surviving generate new avenues for understanding what it means to be human, and imagine a life beyond suffering? Gay does not flatten Mireille's rape as simply a metaphor for class tension; it is far more complex than that. Her kidnapping and time in captivity completely shape whom Mireille has to fight to become in what she refers to as the "after." When Mireille encounters the Commander in Miami, five years after her traumatic experience, she says, "He was the architect of my fear. I wanted him to

see the woman he made, the steel of my body he helped forge"[271] Parts of Mireille may have died in the process of her torture and torment, but that allowed for to become a different, stronger person. When she sees the Commander again, she does attack him and beat him up. The violence she endured provides with a new kind of knowledge; the hieroglyphics of her flesh set her free.

III.

Military & Memorials

In *An Untamed State* and *Street of Lost Footsteps*, characters are traumatized by violence in Port-au-Prince that is both loosely and closely connected to the government. In *Street of Lost Footsteps,* violence is catalyzed by fighting between the military and Aristide supporters. In *An Untamed State*, Mireille is kidnapped by chimères, armed Aristide supporters. How do these texts and the suffering they describe relate to the Duvalier dictatorship? Of what importance is the memory of the Duvalier dictatorship to their story?

Both Roxane Gay and Lyonel Trouillot re-imagine working class, poor areas of Port-au-Prince. Gay and Trouillot both expose the vulnerability of the body in these communities. These communities, particularly Bel-Air, where Mireille is held captive, are often the first places to face political repression. It is no coincidence that Mireille's captor is called The Commander. He believes himself to be the head of an

army. Reading *Street of Lost Footsteps* against *An Untamed State*, we can see how Mireille's kidnapping is a part of the cyclical violence that Trouillot's brothel owner laments. In *The Wretched of the Earth*, Fanon warns that the native will reproduce the power structures of the colonists. After violence, "the first shall be last and the last shall be first."[272] Each time political parties in Haiti violently trade places, this statement rings true. The Commander kidnaps and tortures Mireille because he wants to punish her for her father's wealth, connections and his indifference to the political repression and violence that is inflicted upon his people. He tells her, "One day all of you will live like the rest of us. You will know what it's like to live the way the real people of this country do."[273] Although not explicitly detailed in the novel, as *Street of Lost Footsteps* the Duvalier dictatorships and the cycles of violence that continue after its end help shape the socio-political dynamics at work in this text.

François Duvalier came to power under the guise of Black empowerment but created a nation in which Black citizens feared and distrusted each other. If the hieroglyphics of the flesh from slavery are transmitted across generations what does that mean to have those scars written anew, but caused by someone who looks like you? What does one make of the continuum of subjugation from the memory of slavery compounded with the violence of an autocratic ruler like François? What does it mean to carry both these stories on the flesh?

Historically, any ruler that wanted to truly exercise power over Haiti had to gain control of the military or have his own strongmen to counteract threat of a military coup. François Duvalier quickly restructured the army in order to weaken leadership and free up space for his supporters.

> Duvalier made sure that all key positions—the chief of staff, the police chief, the commander of the Palace Guards and the *Cassernes Dessalines* barracks—were filled by people who were all totally loyal, under his direct control and reporting directly to him. Following President Vincent's model, they were purposefully chosen not to get along with each other, in order to prevent plots to overthrow the President.[274]

Duvalier also created his own militia, the Tonton Macoutes to have an armed force totally loyal to him and at odds with the military (Fad'H). In "The Third U.S. Intervention and Haiti's Paramilitary Predicament," Henry F. Carey argues that the Duvalier dictatorships were stabilized through paramilitary forces (Tonton Macoutes). The Paramilitary would continue to plague Haiti long into the 21st century. The Chimères can be considered a paramilitary group. The Duvalier dictatorship truly changed the relationship between the military and the rest of the population, as Michel Laguerre explains: "The military as a powerful institution instrument was being transformed into a docile instrument, which affected its relationship with the civilian population. The army passed from the assertive roles of mediator, guardian and ruler to a more passive role."[275] The military became passive, while Tonton Macoutes wantonly terrorized citizens. However, Jean Bertrand Aristide's 1995 disintegration of the military could be interpreted in two ways: either as a move in the best interest of the populace, or for the protection of his own power. Aristide claimed that the military he inherited was full of dangerous Macoutes who had to be disbanded, yet the HNP (Haitian police) carried on in the stead of the military. As well, Aristide had his own armed followers called Zinglendos and then

Chimères. The military has been one of the only institutions with power in Haiti, but it is incredibly volatile, and susceptible to division and fracture.

From the era of Duvalier into the present, the armed forces have been a central perpetrator of violence in the capital. The brothel owner from *Street of Lost Footsteps* illuminates the appeal of the military to accumulate power; "In my day you were born a sailor, tailor or an apprentice potter. Now they're born soldiers on guard, officers on duty, so greedy for epaulets that they work in human flesh." (De mon temps on naissant matelot, tailleur ou apprenti potier. Maintenant on naît soldat de la garde, officier du jour, on travaille dans le chair humaine par avarice d'épaulettes.)[276] Although not officially a part of the military, the Commander also works in human flesh.

The military's ability to terrorize citizens is closely connected to Duvalier's transformation of it as an institution and the beginning of Haiti's fraught relationship with paramilitary groups. François Duvalier's destruction of all other institutions created a society in which power only came through force. Both *Street of Lost Footsteps* and *An Untamed State* expose the painful intersections of class, violence and the flesh in post-Duvalier Port-au-Prince.

Memorials

Even today, 62 years after François Duvalier first ascended to the Haitian presidency, there still are no memorials for the victims of his war on dissidents. Neither is there a memorial for the continued violence that his son inflicted. Textbooks do not address the extreme violence of the father and son regime, and

much of the literature about these dictatorships has been published abroad. In 2018, Haiti's literacy rate was just 61%, considerably lower than its peer Caribbean countries with rates in the 90th percentile. Further, when high illiteracy is paired with the fact that "three-quarters of Haiti's population are too young to remember the dictatorship,"[277] it makes a lot of sense that the Duvaliers' atrocities are largely forgotten. When we think of Mireille's family and their wealth, who knows what kind of complicity it demanded—be it to the military, Macoutes, Duvalierests or other parts of the status quo. Mireille's father is an architect; he literally helps shape and build the city. Who does and will he shape the city for?

Memorials are incredibly important tools for galvanizing cultural memory. In "Memory, Identity, and a Painful Past", Aline Sierp explains that "memorials are cultural tools that influence the way the past is interpreted, offering signs for orientation and guidance,"[278] as well as "expressions of the current attributes, values and expectations within a given society."[279] If a memorial functions to help guide a society in terms of how to address a specific event or period in its history, what happens when there aren't any memorials? There are only individual memories of events, but they do not quite come together to make cultural memory. "Memorials are products of social and political struggles and… memory practices are strategies of power."[280] In the last few decades, we have witnessed the erection of numerous memorials and museums to recognize trauma and loss. Within this time we have also seen the compilation of many archives dedicated to black memory and experience.[281] Unfortunately, in the last half century, or even the last 30 years, we have witnessed memorialization for numerous traumatic, abhorrent events that cut short the lives of

thousands and millions—tragedies that garnered global attention. South African Apartheid and its subsequent civil war, the Algerian civil war of the 1990s-early 2000s, the Rwandan Genocide, 9/11 and the Holocaust. Our current era is obsessed with public memory and the archive. Referring to these "tidal waves of memory," in the 1998 introduction to volume three of *Realms of Memory*, Pierre Nora asserts that "No other era has ever been as much a prisoner of its memory, as subject to its empire and its law."[282] Yet oddly, both in 1992 and today, Haiti is not subject to the law of memory.[283] The country still does not have any public spaces that remember the violence and suffering endured during the country's last formal dictatorship.[284]

Aline Sierp's chapter in *Excavating Memory: Sites of Remembering and Forgetting* looks at length at the history behind the construction of the Dachau International Memorial recognizing the Dachau concentration camp in Germany. At the beginning of the chapter, Sierp notes that in the 1950's there was little interest commemorating the lives that were lost, and that this reflected a larger German zeitgeist: "to quickly forget the past and look to the future."[285] In discussing the political debates around the construction of this site, Sierp highlights the difficulty of representing diverse perspectives when constructing a memorial. Sierp explains that "Dachau's survivors were a heterogenous group ranging from high-ranked foreign politicians to members of the clergy, from party functionaries to members of different resistant movements, from Jews to Jehovah's Witnesses."[286] When perspectives range so diversely, it is often difficult to decide on how to tell a single narrative. Similarly, the victims of the Duvalier dictatorship were broad in scope.

François Duvalier's victims were so varied, it would be very difficult, particularly for a country like Haiti with such weakened institutions, to begin the work of identifying the thousands that he and his son harmed. The violence of the dictatorship was so erratic that anyone could be executed, even those who had pledged alliance to Duvalier. The story of Zeila Madombe is one example of this. Anne Fuller, a former U.N. Human Rights official who spent years in Haiti, interviewed Madombe, a woman who had lost over 40 family members to Macoute violence in 1964. Despite the fact that some younger members of the family had joined rural units of the Tonton Macoutes and participated in "annual compulsory pilgrimages to Port-au-Prince to cheer on the President…45 members of the Madombé family had been executed and buried in mass graves in a ruthless campaign to root out one suspected Duvalier critics and exterminate his entire family line."[287] Apparently, even just the suggestion of insurgence was enough to engender execution. Fuller reports that Duvalier suspected Madombe's second cousin, Enock, of colluding with the FARH guerillas. Although the family maintains that he was falsely accused, some others outside their circle believe he was a sympathizer. Anne notes that Enock was "arrested and brought back before Duvalier to be executed, according to legend, he said ' you may kill me, but my tail is long.'"[288] The long tail meant that he came from a large family that Duvalier would vehemently try to erase. Madombe's story is just one of thousands.

In Belle Anse, Mapou Village and Thiotte there are unmarked mass graves precipitated by Duvalierist paranoia that swept across Haiti's southeast region in the summer of 1964.[289] Unmarked mass graves appear in other public spaces: a town

square, a new school, a police station that was once an army headquarters and even a town cemetery. Numerous Haitians were buried in obscurity—many were poor farmers and traders. These men are among the forgotten others alongside the father that Évelyne Trouillot's fictional Marie-Ange imagined in *La Mémoire aux abois*. Beneath those unmarked graves are men and women, "anonymous, forgotten as the years go by. Perhaps still mourned by the tears of a close relative, but unnoticeable among all the other victims of the dictatorship."[290] What would it mean to recover these lost souls from obscurity? Further, these are not the only ones lost in the larger cycle of violence that has played out since the end of the dictatorship. Those silenced and killed by Macoutes, even after Jean-Claude Duvalier's exile should be recognized as well.

In the English version of *Les Lieux de Mémoire*, *Realms of Memory*, there is a chapter by Antoine Prost that analyzes France's monuments to the dead. Prost explains how monuments proliferated after World War I—thirty-eight thousands of them, to be exact.

> To be sure, the Great War was the "greatest" of all French wars. Eight million men—one fifth of the population served in the military; 1, 450,000 died…The proliferation of monuments reflected the depth of the nation's trauma, and it is doubtful that so many villages would not have erected monuments if they had not been obliged to mourn several of their sons[291]

Prost seeks to contemplate the dynamics behind the construction of these edifices. The chapter analyzes: types of monuments, ceremonials and war memorials, and ceremonial speeches. He sheds light on the synergy that existed between government

and citizenry to produce these narratives of remembrance. "The decision to honor the war dead was taken not by a citizens' groups or by the national government but by individual communes, that is, by citizens in their most fundamental civic cell."[292] The government provided the resources by way of funds and materials for memorialization while the citizens provided the original demand. As Prost explains: "This established a precise relationship among three terms: the commune, which asserted its collective initiative; the dead citizens, the recipients of the people's homage; and France, which received and justified sacrifice of its soldiers."[293] Prost indicates the ways in which remembering the dead, particularly those lost at war serves as an exercise of nationalism—bonding state with citizen. In the case of World War I monuments, there had been equal investment from citizens and government alike. By the time of this work's publication the citizenry no longer felt that same spirit. Prost concludes:

> A Republic that does not teach itself and does not celebrate itself is a dead Republic, that is, a Republic for which people are no longer willing to die…But if the Republic is not already alive in the hearts of its citizens, then teaching is sterile and celebration artificial. Under those conditions one can sustain memory of the past, but it no longer has any impact on the present or meaning for the future. This has happened to the monuments to the dead and the Armistice Day ceremonies. Today abandoned by the popular fervor that created them, they are merely war memorials, and it is easy to forget that barely half a century ago the confident French Republic invited all its citizens

to gather around them as celebrants and objects of their own republican cult.[294]

In 1997, Prost argues that the memorials of France's past which were once symbols of nationalism no longer connect to any person's memory and ergo no longer inspire genuine feeling in the masses. They have lost their relevance. What do these lost French symbols mean for Haiti? Prost's survey of monuments to the dead reflect what Haiti has yet to achieve, "the egalitarian ends of planning,"[295] which Harley Étienne expresses in *The Idea of Haiti*. Haiti has yet to attain enough government stability to reach a place where there is a precise relationship between the community, their dead and Haiti (as the government and nation). Historically, the only precise relationship between these three factors has been one of terror. In a totalitarian government such as Duvalier's, communities feared their government's ability to expedite their death.

Europe and the United States, largely due to their longstanding hegemonies over the rest of the globe, have long had the resources to build and maintain strong governments that could synthesize a more symbiotic relationship between community and state.[296] Étienne explains that "the roots of modern European and American planning stem from Progressive era and attempts to contain poverty and create order in chaotic urban spaces."[297] Haiti's infrastructure is so weak there is no system in place to arbitrate skirmishes over land and property. Haiti needs an updated cadaster system that tracks land use and its ownership.[298] At the time of Étienne's publication, 2013, Haiti's system was very localized. Each community had its own record keeping practices and, although it might send titles to the central office, the central office's

principal purpose was for tax collection rather than analysis and planning. When we think about what Haiti has lost in over two centuries of dictatorships and governments controlled by foreign interests—it is not just life, liberty and the pursuit of happiness, but the infrastructure—literally and figuratively, to create those things. These setbacks have kept Haitians from a central government that could provide a secure environment that might better withstand an earthquake like the one that hit in 2010. With a strong central government. there would be stronger debates about public versus private interests. As Étienne explains,

> The battles over Haussmann's and Le Corbusier's plans for Paris and the urban renewal and the abuse of eminent domain in the United States were tied to directly strong central government regimes and laws that favored central command over land—either nationally or locally—over the rights and interests of community-level interests and property rights.[299]

Haiti and Port-au-Prince have not had these battles. That is to say, if land was taken for private use, then there would be a formal court process. The Haitian judicial system is so weakened, and the impoverished are so poor, there really isn't a marginal chance that communities could win a court case. It is telling that Cité Soleil, one of the capital's most infamous shanty towns originally began as a community created in name of François Duvalier's wife, Simone Duvalier. In Port-au-Prince, projects are created by those in power and then they quickly fall into disrepair as power shifts. These circumstances produce men like the Commander, vengefully searching for flesh to erect their own justice. This is in part why there are no public memorials for those extinguished by Duvalierest violence. These are absent because of the political

history behind those deaths, and because this same political history continues to haunt and deteriorate the government's capacity to carry out public works.

Prost's chapter returns us to the role of the military. Haiti, unlike France, is plagued by a fractured military that has resulted in the genesis of multiple paramilitary units. "By relying on paramilitary forces, which lack supervision and accountability, stability is achieved at the cost of the rule of law."[300] Since the exile of Jean-Claude Duvalier, Haiti's paramilitary problem has worsened.

Ultimately, memorials for citizens killed by their own military and police do not inspire nationalism. Prost's chapter on France's World War I memorials also brings up another notable contrast between France and Haiti. The World War I memorial recognizes French soldiers' fight against foreign threats. The Haitian military has largely worked for foreign interests and treated poor citizens as a threat. Haiti's military did not go to war to protect Haitians from outside forces as much as it went to war to protect the rich from the poor. The elites were stirred with fear when the military was "abolished" in 1995. Hallward explains, that "Since the army had been the only thing standing between Haiti's system of socioeconomic apartheid and open revolution, its elimination by Aristide over the course of 1995 provoked something close to panic within the ranks of the ruling class."[301] Although the Duvaliers were gone, the military continued its quest to suppress any political activity. Human Rights Watch reported in July of 1994 "according to many activists, members fear attending meetings given the violence with which the military regime has targeted any exercise of the rights to freedom of association or expression."[302]

Part 3. New York

Literary New York--The Lonely, Big Apple

With the largest Haitian diasporic population of 60,000, it is unsurprising that New York appears in many works of Haitian fiction. The connections between New York and Haiti have been discussed in several academic works.[303] Like Paris, New York too, has long been a part of conversations around Black literary and cultural production. Scholar Farrah Jasmine Griffin outlined integral components of the Black migration narrative in African American literature, articulating the marriage between migration and the exploration of urbanism.[304] New York has been a pivotal city for Griffin's work and the study of black urbanism at large. During the Harlem Renaissance, Harlem was a hub for African American literary production and figured as its own character in many texts.[305] As scholarship shows, cultural networks shared by the Black diaspora have existed in Paris and Harlem and have been infused by movements and genres such as Negritude and the Harlem Renaissance since the early twentieth century.[306] There has been little scholarship that discusses New York as a Haitian literary space. The Harlem Renaissance has long dominated academic conversations around New York as a Black literary space. Similar to how Francophones from the DOM-TOM and African countries dominate the conversation around Paris Noir, African American experience dominates discussions around literary New York.

Particularly during the era of the Haitian refugee crisis, New York and Miami become key places for those fleeing Haiti's constant political instability. If Port-au-Prince often symbolizes a space of fleeting memory for Haitian migrants, then New

York might also be interpreted as a second "floating homeland." In *Create Dangerously: The Immigrant Artist at Work*, Edwidge Danticat says that "the tenth [department] was the floating homeland, the ideological one, which joined all Haitians living outside of Haiti, in the diaspora."[307] In certain ways, because New York is the second home of migrants, it also becomes a "floating homeland." New York can never become the homeland because it is their country of origin. The theoretical liberties that America offers, further make it an "ideological homeland" rather than a real one. Ideologically the United States is the land of the free, but many people, especially marginalized communities soon realize that it is not. "Freedom" comes with a hefty price tag. Journalist Jean Dominique and his wife, Michèle's oscillation between New York and Port-au-Prince exemplifies this "floating homeland" dynamic.

As an ideological "floating homeland," New York inspires a kind of alienation for migrants. Similar to Olu-Christophe in *Black Girl in Paris*, Haitian migrants can also feel a sense of "double-unbelonging" in New York. Within Black literary fiction, not only is New York generally conceptualized as a place of alienation, but this alienation persists within contemporary narratives representing specific communities in New York. Looking historically, Joyce Durham tells us across racial representations there is a sense of the American city as a place of estrangement: "the black account of the city have roughly paralleled those white authors…conceiving of their characters as powerless figures in an amoral world."[308] Here Durham is thinking of early 20th century authors such as Paul Laurence Dunbar, James Weldon Johnson and Theodore Dreiser, all of whom have important texts set in

New York. If African Americans have experienced isolation and alienation in New York City since the Great Migration, Haitian migrants do not fare much better in the 1980's to early 2000's.

The first section of this project considered immigrants "right to the city" in Paris and the violation of that right by the French government's amnesty for Jean-Claude Duvalier. I argued that Shay Youngblood and Évelyne Trouillot reimagined Paris as lieu de mémoire of the Duvalier dictatorships and a place of confrontation for both perpetrators and victims of Duvalier's violence. In that first section, I explored unhealed psychic wounds for those approximate to Duvalier's violence, who lad left Haiti only to find Duvalier haunting them in France.

In the second section, we moved from the periphery to the center. This second section examined Haitian and Haitian-Americans experience of violence in Haiti's capital in the post-Duvalier years. Here, I paid close attention to physical wounds and the body. This section focused on how literature about Port-au-Prince was imbued with a "poetics of the uncanny" as it represented the degradation of human connection in the city. My analysis considered the role of the military in perpetuating violence in the city and class differences shaped exposure to violence.

This section focuses on novels set in New York and returns to a focus on psychic wounds to create alienation and the power of witnessing to heal those wounds. Like in Paris, in New York, victims of Duvalier violence co-exist with perpetrators. The novels in this section instead pays special attention to the complexity of the culpable. Arguably, Évelyne Trouillot's *Mémoire aux bois* also portrays the perspective of a perpetrator through her Trouillot's rendering of the

dictator's wife, Odile Doreval. Whereas Trouillot focused solely on the interiority of her two characters (the dictator's wife and daughter of a victim), Edwidge Danticat's *The Dew Breaker* really considers the community surrounding the perpetrator. I read The Dew Breaker against Teju Cole's *Open City*. Teju Cole's *Open City* is about a Nigerian man who seems like a witness, but is also a perpetrator of sexual violence. There is a question about how do we read characters who do not fit neatly into the good versus evil or victim versus perpetrator boundaries.

Edwidge Danticat and Teju Cole

Edwidge Danticat was born in Port-au-Prince in 1969 and remained there until she was twelve. She migrated to the United States to live with her parents who had left a few years prior. Edwidge Danticat is one of the best-known Anglophone Haitian writers. She is author of several books of many genres. To date, she has published a short story collection, *Krik Krak*; two memoirs *Brother*, *I'm Dying* and *Breathe, Eyes, Memory*; three novels, *The Dew Breaker*, *The Farming of Bones* and *Claire of the Sea Light*; two essay collections, *Create Dangerously: The Immigrant Artist at Work,* and *The Art of Death*. The story of Danticat's divided upbringing in Brooklyn and Port-au-Prince is explored in her memoir, *Brother, I'm Dying.* Danticat spent the rest of her years growing up in Brooklyn and later attended Barnard College and Brown University, where she completed her MFA. Danticat's experiences adjusting to American life in New York are explored in the partially autobiographical, *Breath, Eyes, Memory*. Her work addresses themes such as memory, violence, history, and

trauma particularly related to the Haitian Diaspora. Danticat's work, particularly remembering the Duvalier dictatorship period puts her in conversation with Francophone Haitian writers such as Dany Laferrière and Kettly Mars.

Teju Cole is a photography critic for the *New York Times* and a Professor of Creative Writing at Harvard. He was born in the U.S., but later moved to Lagos where he was raised. Teju Cole is author of four books: a novella, *Every Day is for the Thief*; a novel, *Open City*; an essay collection, *Known and Strange Things*; and a photobook, *Punto D'Ombra*. Both of Cole's fictional novels feature a young man living in New York City who briefly and unexpectedly leaves there to travel abroad. Cole lived in New York for several years before relocating to Cambridge, MA; his photographer's eye for the city is well reflected in his writing.

Edwidge Danticat and Teju Cole both portray New York City from the perspective of immigrants or children of immigrants. Both authors works' discuss traumas and wounds connected to migration. Teju Cole like Shay Youngblood, depicts how Haitian narratives can be interwoven into the stories of other Black migrants. Ultimately the trauma that Haitians experience through political violence and repression has some informative capacity for thinking about other Black migrants' experiences. Like Évelyne Trouillot and Shay Youngblood, Teju Cole and Edwidge Danticat imagine a confrontation between victims and their aggressors.

Witnessing in New York: Hunter or Prey

In *Testimony: Crises of Witnessing in Literature, Psychoanalysis and History*, Felman and Laub assert that based on their research with Holocaust survivors, "not

telling" a story can serve to perpetuate tyranny. The traumatic events become more and more distorted in their ongoing silence.[309] In heterogenous spaces that have several ethnic, national, racial and linguistic identities co-existing, there are also a multitudes of diverse memories co-existing in these kinds of spaces. If perpetrators and victims also co-exist representing both of their narratives becomes a complex task. Authors Edwidge Danticat and Teju Cole challenge us to think about the complexity of articulating trauma and witnessing. In their respective texts, *The Dew Breaker* and *Open City,* New York City is imagined as a space haunted by specters of traumas past and present. Both authors position New York as a lieu de mémoire for various traumas, but the memory of political violence appears in both texts.

The Dew Breaker

Danticat's *The Dew Breaker* is a book of interconnected short stories, also known as a story cycle. Each chapter functions as a stand-alone short story, but all the chapters can be understood as forming a cohesive unit. In *The Dew Breaker,* each chapter has a slight, almost unnoticeable reference or connection to a character from another story within the book. All of the stories have focal characters that are Haitians or Haitian Americans living in New York, Florida or Haiti. Quite a few of the stories feature characters reflecting on their exile from Haiti, while they live in the diaspora, or contemplate their return to their native land. Many of the stories connect Brooklyn and Port-au-Prince through memories or travel. The timelines of the stories range from the middle point of François Duvalier's dictatorship in the 1960's to the 2004-present.

Danticat expertly depicts how the Haitian community in Brooklyn is fractured by numerous connections and disconnections that trace back to political violence and tension in Haiti. Throughout the stories in this collection, we see people struggle to confront and speak about their traumas. In the first story, titled “Book of the Dead,” we are introduced to an adult artist Ka who has made a statue of her father. Her parents live an isolated life in Brooklyn that seems oddly cut off from the rest of their Haitian community. On a journey to Florida to sell Ka’s statue to a famous Haitian actress, her father disappears. When he returns, he confesses that he has thrown Ka’s statue into a lake. This is the catalyst that leads him to unveil the history he has long kept hidden from her. He tells her, “Ka I don’t deserve a statue…not a whole one at least. You see Ka, your father was the hunter, he was not the prey.”[310] Her whole life Ka thought her father had been a prisoner in Haiti and this is why he has a long scar on his face, but in fact he was a prison guard, a Tonton Macoute. In the final story of the book, also titled “The Dew Breaker,” we discover how Ka’s father became a Macoute who had reveled in his power and masochism. The final chapter also depicts his escape, after killing a pastor that he should not have and running off with the pastor’s sister, without revealing his identity to her. The woman he deceives, and runs off with, will later become Ka’s mother. He and his family are at the center of this book and appear in three stories. They live within a Haitian diasporic community in East Flatbush, yet they remain on its peripheries for fear of the father being recognized.

Like Gay, Danticat portrays how trauma and violence can nuance family dynamics. Through the story of Ka and her father, Danticat troubles the neat binary

between good versus evil. Similar to *An Untamed State*, fatherhood is an important theme in this work. Mireille's father, likely was not a Macoute but he made what he calls an "impossible choice" which resulted in the destruction of his daughter's body. Ka's father also makes complex choices—like his decision to withhold his violent past from his wife and his daughter. In particular, the fact that he waited to confess to murdering his wife's brother is especially egregious.

The stories in between the first and last chapters feature a range of characters who all struggle with their own memories and traumas that can be connected back to political issues in Haiti. Upon first reading this novel, all of these characters seem completely unrelated, but they are connected by a sort of six degrees of separation. In a very roundabout way, the reader discovers that while living in East Flatbush Brooklyn, Ka's father, the Dew Breaker, Mr. Bienaime, rents out his basement to three young Haitian men. One renter, Dany, believes, but is not entirely sure. that his landlord, Ka's father, is the murderer responsible for the death of his parents in Port-au-Prince years before. Danticat, like Èvelyne Trouillot in *Mémoire aux abois*, imagines what it must be like for victims to live in close proximity to their personal demons.

Family Affairs

Danticat as well Lyonel Trouillot and Roxane Gay push us to question whether family must pay for the trespasses of their relatives. This is seen through Ka and her father—ultimately her statue is destroyed because of her father's guilt. "The legacy of Mr. Bienaime's guilt, including bearing witness to his confession, falls on

those close to him. The second-generation of his crimes are thus tasked with carrying the burden of truth and the burden of reconciliation."[311]

In the story "Monkey Tails", another roommate, Michel, recounts his experience as a young 12-year-old boy, living in Port-au-Prince at the fall of Jean-Claude Duvalier's dictatorship; unbeknownst to him he goes on one last adventure with his closest friend, Romain, to search for Romain's father, a Macoute. With various scenes of violence unfolding around him in the shifts of power, he realizes how the innocent are implicated by the guilty. The insinuation of this is a theme that is touched on in *Street of Lost Footsteps* as well as *An Untamed State.* No one is safe from these cycles of vengeance, even the seemingly innocent.

With Macoutes being hunted down and tortured, it is not safe for Romain to stay in case someone should want him to pay for his father's sins. The narrator vividly describes the chaos of the political transition and how insignificant his adventure seem in the face of current events:

> Given all that was happening—the looting of homes and businesses of former government allies, the lynching, burning and stoning of Macoutes, the thousands of bodies that were suddenly being discovered in secret rooms in city morgues and in mass graves on the outskirts of the capital—it would have been heartless for my mother to punish me [for running off].[312]

The chaos he discusses in 1986 is incredibly similar to the chaos that the brothel owner describes at the beginning of *Street of Lost Footsteps*. In just a few short years, the lynching and burning would continue but instead it would be for Aristide supporters. Michel narrates this childhood memory into a tape recorder; the

recording is for his soon-to-be born child who he will be named after his childhood friend, Romain. Again we see a character in the present of New York, struggling to articulate and pass on memories of the past in Port-au-Prince. The theme of fatherhood once again emerges. Romain's father abandoned him, and Michel's father does not claim him. It seems as though this experience with neglectful and absent fathers is the exact reason for why Michel makes his recording. He is determined to protect and stay with his future child.

Talking Trauma

In his story, "Night Talkers," Dany journeys back to Haiti to speak with the aunt who raised him after his parent's death. Struggling to navigate the path back to his aunt's home in the mountains, Dany eventually returns to tell her that he believes he has found his parents' killer. Once he finally tells her this information, she dies very suddenly in her sleep. Before her death, he had tried discussing this pressing revelation with her when he first arrived, but she delayed their conversation. When they do finally talk, she is agitated by his questions. She does not know all her brother's secrets and whether or not he was in politics. She thinks he may have been mistaken for someone else. In reference to continuing their conversation about his parents, she offers this metaphor "It's like walking up these mountains and losing something precious halfway. For you, it would be no problem walking back to find it because you're still young and strong, but for me it would take a lot of time and effort."[313]Dany tries to query her about the context of his parents' death, if they had political affiliations or who they might have been mistaken for but for his aunt

journeying backwards into her memory is too much for her spirit to bear and so she passes away in her sleep. As Rebecca Fuch and other critics have noted in this text: “language repeatedly fails to come terms with trauma and pain.”[314]

After the passing of his aunt, Dany becomes less sure that the barber is his parents’ murderer. Prior to returning to Haiti to visit his aunt, he dreams of enacting vengeance on the barber (Ka’s father). Two nights prior to booking a flight to Port-au-Prince, he stands in the barber’s room while he is asleep, tempted to kill him, tempted to choke him like the political prisoners he had heard about as a boy.[315] Fear overcomes him, and he cannot kill. Instead, he leaves to visit his aunt. While visiting Haiti, he is haunted by the barber and his parents’ death. While at his aunt’s house he dreams again of his parents;

> He was still back there, on the burning porch, hoping that his mother and father would rise and put out the fire. He was in the yard, watching the barber’s car speed away and his Aunt crawling off the porch, on her belly, like a blind snake. He was in that room in Brooklyn, with the barber watching him sleep.[316]

Through this dream, Danticat creates a continuum that connects Dany’s present in Brooklyn with the horrific deaths in Port-au-Prince. Ultimately, he decides that perhaps the barber was “just a phantom who’d shown up to escort him back here.”[317]

Body Double

In the final chapter, Danticat transports us to Bel Air during Mr. Bienaime's reign as a Macoute. Danticat tells us the entire story of how Mr. Bienaime became a "Milicien," the earlier title for Duvalier's volunteer army. At just 19 years old, Mr. Bienaime was swept up in a presidential rally at the capital. After gazing up on the "ashen, spectacle-adorned face" of the future "Sovereign One," he realizes that "he would never go back home."[318] At that moment, he could feel his destiny manifest; the one his father always imagined for him—the "oft-repeated declaration that his son would never work the land, never carry a knapsack on his shoulders or a machete in his hand."[319] Danticat depicts the country to city narrative and allure of Macoutism as a means for upward mobility. Enlisting for Duvalier's volunteer army provided prestige and an alternative future from the work of laboring on the land. Through his power, Mr. Bienaime was even able to get back some of the land his father had lost. Mr. Bienaime's story has traces that echo Zeila Madombe from "A Young Duvalier and Haiti's Unremembered Past." Forty-six of her family members were killed by Macoutes, despite the fact that a few of her male family members were rural Macoutes themselves. Mr. Bienaime flees Haiti because he fears that the Macoutes will turn against him, much like how they turned against Madombe's family.

As a member of Duvalier's Boogey Men, sadism was a regular part of his duties. As time wore on, the suffering he inflicted on others became "like any other job."[320] Imagine, paddling prisoners with braided cowhide, and "stand[ing] on their backs and jump[ing] up and down like a drunk on a trampoline as a normative function of one's day, like answering the phone or sending out mail. Mr. Bienaime is

characterized as someone who enjoyed his job. A woman interviewed by a human rights organization reflects on his torture style: “He would wound you, then try to soothe you with words, then he’d wound you again. He thought he was God.”[321] Mr. Bienaime is responsible for wounding the flesh of his countrymen. While in New York, he must live with the memory of the tears, ruptures and bruises that he inflicted on fellow sons and daughters of Dessalines.

In the final chapter, we also discover the true origin of Mr. Bienaime’s scar. It turns out that the “ropelike scar that runs from [his] rich cheek down to the corner of his mouth” is not only “the only visible reminder the year he spent in prison.”[322] Instead, it is a reminder of his final prisoner and his subsequent departure from Port-au-Prince. His last prisoner was his wife’s brother. The brother was known for his fiery sermons that criticized the government. Mr. Bienaime had received orders to assassinate the preacher. The preacher, certain that these were his last moments decides to attack. He misses his mark: ”The wound on the fat man’s face wasn’t what he had hoped; he hadn’t blinded him or removed his teeth, but at least he’d left a mark on him, a brand that would carry for the rest of life.”[323] This physical scar is not the only reminder of his treachery. Mr. Bienaime’s wife, Anne serves as a living reminder of the brother he killed. Neither of them directly acknowledge this fact.

We might imagine this final chapter as the moment where Mr. Bienaime finally tells his daughter Ka and she acts as witness for him. In the first story, when he first tries to explain his rationale for disposing of her statue, Mr. Bienaime reminds Ka of her name’s origins. Derived from Egyptian, “Ka is a double of the body…[it is] the body’s companion through life and after it guides the body through the kingdom

of the dead."[324] Ka is her father's "good angel" and assumedly will guide him through the kingdom of the dead when his time comes to confront the souls he extinguished as a Tonton Macoute.

Mapping Memory and Trauma

Shortly after the Haitian earthquake, In her op-ed article for *Social Text*, Haitian-American anthropologist Gina Ulysse writes about the fracture and dehumanization of Haitians in the aftermath of the quake. Poetic yet haunting, Ulysse tells her readers: "the body—a reservoir discursive, physiological psychological and social memories—function as an archive. Deposits were made on January 12 just before 5pm that will have impacts for years to come."[325] A predecessor to the earthquake, the dictatorship made deposits and left psychological and physiological scars with impacts for years to come. Danticat implores us to think about what it means for the Haitian diaspora in New York specifically to share collective memory from that period. New York, like Paris becomes a lieu de mémoire for the Duvalier dictatorship.

In *The Dew Breaker*, Danticat takes readers from the edge of Brooklyn and New York City to the slums of Port-au-Prince and even up into the hills. The text is constantly shifting across geographic spaces as it changes terrains. At one moment the reader is in the basement with Dany, and at the next we are deep in the Haitian countryside. For Danticat, experiences and memories are tied to very specific locations. Dany travels directly from the very low, underground of his basement dwelling in Brooklyn to very high up in the countryside of Haiti. What can be made of his physical ascension in the text? His movement upward is parallel to the change

of heart he has about Mr. Bienaime, the barber. He shifts from vengeful to merciful, just as he transits from contemplating the execution of death to mourning his aunt's passing.

For Danticat, below ground spaces represent the burden of memory and trauma. In the very first chapter, Mr. Bienaime puts Ka's statue in the lake where it will descend to the bottom. There are a number of other ways he could have destroyed the statue. He could have placed it in a dumpster, set it on fire or literally taken a mallet to its surface. Instead, he decides to drive it out to the lake and then physically drag it into the lake's bottom. These items are buried like the masses of people in unmarked graves in Haiti and the memories of trauma in a country that still has not told all its stories or revealed all its secrets.

When we think about Ka's family, their movements within New York are limited for fear of Mr.Bienaime's identity being discovered. In "The Bridal Seamstress", Danticat focuses on an older Haitian seamstress who is haunted by apparitions of a Haitian prison guard who abused her. She tells a young Haitian American girl who is interviewing her for a newspaper article that the prison guard follows her everywhere she goes, hiding out in abandoned buildings, waiting for her. The seamstress is in constant motion, trying to flee her trauma. Several characters in the text are also in constant movement, as if trying to outrun their traumas. Further, it is interesting to think about these characters and the Haitian diasporic community on the edges and outskirts of New York City. In New York and Port-au-Prince working class communities are relegated to the margins.

All three male characters—Michel, Dany and Mr. Bienaime—are haunted by memories of their connections to violence from the Duvalier dictatorship as they live in the same house in East Flatbush, Brooklyn. This house, thus, becomes a lieu de mémoire for the Duvalier dictatorship. Each of these characters carries these memories, propelling them forward in time. The house not only holds their physical bodies but also their memories. In the foreword to the American version of *Les Lieux de mémoire*, *Realms of Memory,* Pierre Nora explains that:

> In essence, the act of remembering is always related to the repository of images and ideals that constitute the social relations of which we partake. Places of memory are therefore determined by the mix of individuals that constitute the social group to which they relate.[326]

At the time of Danticat's publication, 2004, Haiti is on the precipice of a civil war. The book aligns with the imagined year of Mireille's captivity. The memory and trauma of the Duvalier dictatorships have been put aside as other catastrophes take place. Danticat's publication suggests that the 2004 political moment is very much informed by memories of the Duvaliers that have been harbored away. Danticat imagines these spaces in New York, where a counter memory exists. If lieux de mémoire are essentially memories that constructed history has forgotten, what does it mean for us to reimagine them in? New York; a second floating homeland conceived of as a space filled with memories of Duvalier violence?. Each of these characters, Mr. Bienaime, his wife, Dany, and Michel, all have memories that transport the reader back to Port-au-Prince. While these characters' bodies physically inhabit spaces in New York, these memories create a clear link between political violence

that occurs in the streets of Port-au-Prince and New York. These memories are used as a juxtaposition against contemporary politics in New York.

Police Brutality in New York City

Danticat mentions two important events of police brutality in the chapter that focuses on the third roommate, Eric. "Seven," which directly follows the first chapter, "The Book of the Dead", trails a man who is eagerly waiting to be reunited with his wife after seven years of separation. Eric, the third roommate of Michel and Dany, is only connected to the Dew Breaker in that he is his landlord. We are told very little about Eric's life in Haiti. However, it is in his story that Eric mentions that he no longer goes to the night club Rendez-Vous after Abner Louima was arrested from there and sodomized in the nearby police station. On May 26, 1999, police officer Justin A. Volpe pleaded guilty to having "rammed a stick into Abner Louima's rectum and then thrust[ing] it in his face."[327] Volpe had assaulted and sodomized Louima after misidentifying him as the person who punched him in a melee at the night club. Louima emigrated from Port-au-Prince in 1991, escaping the cataclysmic violence of the Cedras regime only to be assaulted and violated by an NYPD cop.

Further along in the story "Seven," when his wife finally arrives, she hears people on the radio talking about Patrick Dorismond who was shot by a policeman in Manhattan. Further along in the chapter, the wife listens to the protests focused on Dorismond's death; "not far from where she was, people were in the streets, marching, protesting. Dorismond's death, their outrage made even greater by the fact that the Dorismond boy was the American-born son of a well-known singer."[328]

Abner Louima and Patrick Dorismond are real cases of police brutality against Haitians. It is notable that this chapter makes no references to the violence of the Duvalier era, but is instead contextualized by the violence of Rudy Giuliani's New York City. Danticat implicitly creates a contrast between the Tonton Macoutes and the NYPD.

Danticat's work offers commentary on the constructed mythos and national history of New York and its institutions. America as "land of the free," and New York as a place where anybody can make it if they try, are besmirched by these images of recent immigrants and their children being unfairly brutalized. Eric's wife believes that Dorismond's death is even worse because he is "American-born," which should theoretically protect him from such violations, but they do not. Like Mireille's mother, Eric's wife is mistaken in believing that an American identity can shield one from violence.

The activist Haitian community was not only battling police brutality in New York but other demands for justice connected directly to the Duvalier dictatorship. In 2000 there would be marches in Manhattan held by Human Rights Watch for the deportation of ex-Fraph member Emmanuel "Toto" Constant. Although he had been a part of violent crimes in Haiti, Constant was able to evade trial. He had applied for asylum in the United States. His previous contract with the CIA likely had helped him evade deportation. Constant levered a $50 million lawsuit for illegal detention when he was held in a Maryland facility in 1995. Ultimately Constant would not see jail time until he was arrested for defrauding a bank for nearly $1 million dollars in 2004. Edwide Danticat's *The Dew Breaker* makes reference to Toto's presence in New

York City. Ka reflects back on a moment in childhood where she believed that she had spotted Toto Constant while in church. In light of learning her father's true story, Ka now thinks about this incident differently. Toto, while a perpetrator of heinous crimes, could now be someone's father, husband or uncle. Similar to Jean-Claude Duvalier's exile in Paris, Danticat's 2004 novel implores us to further think about ex-military and Macoutes who haunt Haitian communities in the United States.

In an 2001 interview with Renée H. Shea, Edwidge Danticat discussed her role as a writer. She explains that "while what I do pales in comparison [to this work of non-fiction interviews about women surviving the Cedras coup years]. But that does not mean I should give up writing. Each of us has a story to tell and each of us bears witness in our own way."[329] Each of Danticat's characters in *The Dew Breaker* had their own story to tell that was intertwined with the stories of others. Danticat shows us that collective memory and those narratives interwoven into collective memory are complex, much like a web. In order to better understand the memory and the aftermath of the Duvalier dictatorship on the Haitan diasporic community, it is critical to acknowledge the bevy of confusing and conflicting relationships—perpetrators, victims, family members of both, neighbors, etc.

Open City

In Teju Cole's *Open City*, protagonist Julius wanders across different neighborhoods in New York City as a therapeutic exercise that allows him to ruminate on issues of identity, memory, and belonging. Julius has recently broken up with his girlfriend, Nadège, who moved to California. He is in the last year of a

psychiatry residency when he spontaneously decides to take a trip to Brussels to look for his estranged grandmother, Oma. He does not find her, but the trip helps trigger memories of his childhood in Nigeria. Julius's memories and movements are in constant juxtaposition to various cultural texts—music, people, art, and literature—that he encounters. Throughout the narrative, as he wanders, although he encounters and interacts with a variety of people and their stories, he feels a frequent deathly alienation within the city.

Strolling across the various New York City boroughs, while commenting on sites of degradation, capitalism, art and culture, Julius embodies a contemporary *flâneur*. The figure of the flâneur has been heralded as an archetype of modernity while also critiqued as emblematic of class privilege. Scholar Gregory Shaya explains the flâneur "was a figure of the modern artist-poet, a figure keenly aware of the bustle of modern life, an amateur detective and investigator of the city, but also a sign of the alienation of the city and capitalism."[330] Julius is not quite an artist-poet. Although he enjoys high culture music and art, he is also a man of the sciences. In the article "Flights of Memory, Teju Cole's *Open City* and the Limits of Aesthetic Cosmopolitanism," Peter Vermeulen argues that rather than embodying the flâneur, Julius's movements across the city better represent the fugue. Vermeulen claims that the text can be read "as a catalogue of failed attempts to live up to expectation of achieved polyphonic form. Instead of a cosmopolitan connectedness, the novel's main figures of transport—walking, memory, art—at best provide experiences of shared isolation."[331] Extending from Vermeulen's reading of Julius's failed attempts at connection, I argue that Julius is an anti-witness.

In *Testimony*, Shoshana Felman and Dori Laub argue for understanding the Holocaust as an event without a witness. The text offer three kinds of witnesses: witness to oneself, witness to others' testimonies, and witness to the process of witnessing. Felman and Laub argue that the annihilation of the self as witness destroys the possibility of all witnessing.

> ….It was also the very circumstance of *being inside the event* that made unthinkable the very notion that a witness could exist, that is, someone who could step outside of the coercively totalitarian and dehumanizing frame of reference in which the event was taking place, and provide an independent frame of reference through which the event could be observed. One might say that there was, thus, historically no witness to the Holocaust, neither outside nor inside.[332]

Felman and Laub suggest that the Nazi regime not only exterminated witnesses by physically destroying their bodies, but they also eradicated witnesses through the psychological structure that surrounded the event. In fact, they further argue that the interviewer or listener to the Holocaust survivor's story is reliving the event as the first witness, even before the narrator. This is because the Nazi regime had "convinced its victims, potential witnesses from the inside, that what was confirmed about their 'otherness' and their inhumanity was correct and that their experiences were no longer communicable even to themselves, and therefore perhaps never took place."[333] If it is possible for traumatic genocides like the Holocaust to produce no witnesses, might that be the case for other events?

As Julius wanders New York City, he is constantly in conversation with people who wish to make him witness to their trauma. As a psychiatrist, Julius should be the ultimate witness. His profession demands that he listen to his patients' deepest traumas and fears and then present them with tools to cope with the demons that haunt them. Julius repels affect and provides no insight to the reader about any of the traumas to which he is privy. Many strangers and patients confide in him, but it is incredibly unclear whether anything productive comes from these confidences. Julius appears as an anti-witness, where individuals share their suffering and nothing transformative comes from the process. It is as though Julius likes to mime and perform the act of witnessing but does not actually take part in witnessing. Teju Cole reveals the history of the city's violent past, through Julius's encounters in various locations where he demonstrates a blunted ability to fully bear witness to others' trauma.

Julius experiences extreme isolation and alienation; often it is unclear how much emotion Julius feels for those he knows. He struggles with empathizing with others, and completely understanding the human-ness of those around him. At the beginning of the book, after one of the many long walks he takes, he replays the encounters he had that day. He "rehearses the numerous incidents and sights [he] had encountered while roaming, sorting each encounter like a child playing with wooden blocks."[334] This metaphor, "playing with wooden blocks." is rather strange. He has transformed the people he has encountered into inanimate objects; recalling these interactions as toys with which he plays and rearranges to his liking. He has removed their subjectivity and flattened them into objects.

When he does consider the subjectivity of these strangers, he seems to only think of their traumas. On the subway, he imagines fellow passengers re-enacting their traumas:

> The sight of large masses of people hurrying down into the underground chambers were perpetually strange to me, and I felt that all of the human race was rushing, pushed by a counter instinctive death drive, into movable catacombs. Above-ground I was with thousands of others in their solitude, but in the subway, standing close to strangers, jostling them and being jostled by them for space and breathing room, all of us reenacting unacknowledged traumas, the solitude intensified.[335]

This macabre association between the city and its masses of isolated inhabitants is one that repeats throughout the text. There is an extreme dissonance in the novel between the human connections Julius makes and the text's disinterested monotone voice. He claims that everyone in the subway is "reenacting unacknowledged trauma," but who is to witness to these reenactments?

For someone whose influence could greatly impact life or death, Julius is alarmingly apathetic towards his patients. The reader first encounters his patient V as Julius searches for her book *The Monster of New Amsterdam* in a book shop. Her identity is fixed to her book. He tells us that the book "made for grim reading."[336] V is haunted by the horrors her Native American ancestors faced at the hands of white settlers. This sentiment is further reinforced when she tells Julius, "it's not in the past, it is still with us today; at least it's still with me."[337] Yet, when he recalls this conversation with her, he does not mention his response to her. When the reader then

learns of V's death, a likely suicide, Julius's offhand manner is jarring. He begins, "The *Times* said in the obituary I read that day, V. wrote of atrocity without flinching. They might have said, without flinching visibly, for it had all affected her far more deeply than anyone's ability to guess."[338] There is a cynical irony about the phrase "more deeply than anyone could guess." As the psychiatrist V was seeing for her depression, if anyone was qualified to guess how deeply she was affected to the point of suicide, it should have been Julius. Yet, he acts as if he does not know her.

Julius's reaction to V's death is pointedly indifferent. He conveys no emotion when learning of her death. It seems as if he had met V only once rather than regularly in a professional capacity. In a gesture towards empathy, Julius contemplates how terrible her family must feel; "I could hardly imagine the kind of raw pain her family—her husband, her parents—would be experiencing."[339] Yet again, as someone who works with people with mental illness, one might imagine that the loss of a patient—someone you had hoped to help keep from their demise, would place Julius in some kind of pain or affect. He cannot imagine pain because he is so completely disassociated from it. The fact that he places himself at such a distance from V's family reinforces the idea that he did not know her at all. Earlier Julius admits that he completely forgot about his patients in between visits; "he needed the chart to recall even the basics about a particular case."[340] Perhaps without his chart, V and her death are completely illegible. Was Julius a useful psychiatrist for V? Based on his brief thoughts about her, one would not think so.

Julius performs an identity of witness - listener, but that is not his actual identity. On a trip to a detention center, he recalls listening to the story of a Liberian

man who traveled far and risked his life just to get to America. Yet, as soon as he arrives, he is detained and spent over two years in a detention center. Julius says that he was absorbed in Saidu's story, listening up until visiting hours were over. "I encouraged him, asked him to clarify details, gave as best I could, a sympathetic ear to a story that, for too long, he had been forced to keep to himself."[341] This is a rare moment where Julius portrays himself with empathy and feeling. Yet, by the end of this section, he reveals that both he and Nadège enjoyed this image of him as a sympathetic listener, which calls into question the reality of the image. Saidu asks Julius to come back to visit him if he's not deported and Julius says he would, but never does. This action could be considered a merciful white lie, but it seems to further support the fact that his empathy is an illusion. He contemplates that perhaps Nadège "fell in love with idea of myself that I presented in that story. I was the listener, the compassionate African who paid attention to the details of someone else's life and struggle. I had fallen in love with that idea myself." [342]

This provides an important contrast to *The Dew Breaker.* The alienation that Danticat creates has its origins from the blurred lines between perpetrator and victim within the Haitian community. Julius's alienation is partially due to the city, its catalogue of traumas that re-enact themselves in front of him. Across multiple chapters, the text shows how people living within the community are not certain of each other's true identities. After Ka learns that her father was a prison guard as opposed to a prisoner under the Tonton Macoutes, she wonders: "Is he going to explain why he and my mother have no close friends, why they've never had anyone over to the house, why they never speak of any relatives in Haiti or anywhere else."[343]

In this moment Ka realizes the reason for their isolation within the Haitian community in Brooklyn. In order to hide her father's past, they must be alienated. Intriguingly at the conclusion of *Open City*, a friend Julius has not seen in years accuses him of sexual assault. His reaction is yet again blunted.

While in Penn Station, he stops to have his shoes shined and comes across a bootblack named Pierre from Haiti. While shining Julius's shoes he recounts his story. He tells him:

> I came here from Haiti, when things got bad there, when so many people were killed, blacks, whites. The killings were endless, there were bodies in the streets; my cousin, the son of my mother's sister, and his entire family were slaughtered. We had to leave because the future was uncertain. [344]

Thinking about Pierre in contrast to Michel, Dany or Mr. Bienaime reinforces thinking about New York as a lieu de mémoire for Haitian trauma and the Duvalier dictatorship. Julius's encounter with Pierre is contrasted against a number of other experiences of deportation, systemic violence and repression. Julius's encounter with Pierre is situated right after his ruminations on his time at the detention center in Queens. This is not coincidental. Set in 2006, we are to understand that Pierre's experience is in direct conversation with the second exile of Jean Bertrand Aristide and the Haitian boat people crisis. One might imagine that Pierre easily could have been the person Julius spoke to at the immigration center.

Cole's inclusion of Pierre is crucial for his rendering of a Post-9/11 New York City where xenophobia is rampant. Almost everyone Julius encounters is a migrant who must deal with this unfortunate reality. One would assume that Julius would be

able to conjure more empathy and relatability to these individuals. In a detached manner, Julius is aware of how his is distanced from others. When he realizes that his neighbor's wife passed away prior to his realization, he thinks: "A woman died on the other side of the wall I was leaning against and I had known nothing of it."[345] He continues, "that was the worst of it. I had noticed neither her absence nor the change—there must have been a change—in his spirit."[346] Perhaps Julius's stunted empathy stems from his inability to process his own past trauma. Hurt people hurt others. As Robyn Kelley explained, indifference does hurt others. Much like how we think about the indifference that consumes Port-au-Prince, Danticat and Cole show us, from a different vantage point, how perpetrators are also caught in a cycle of unaddressed violence and trauma that only begets more wounds.

Part 4. New Directions

This project has attempted to consider different approaches for reading narratives of Black trauma in different cities. For Port-au-Prince specifically, the rise in studies of noir fiction might be a new place to begin thinking how literature positions the unsolved mystery that is neo-colonialism. Neo-colonialism and the current global order harm and hurt the lives of Black individuals everyday, across the globe. There are ways in which the built environment in Haiti, continuously points the history of the nation and its struggle for stability. I argue that a new term, the Haitian noir aesthetic could be used to think through some of the unique aspects of Haitian urban literature. Potentially, urban literature that continues this "poetics of the uncanny" could be understood as a part of a "Haitian Noir Aesthetic."

The topography of Port-au-Prince reflects the country's tumultuous political history. Remnants of colonialism, imperialism and fascism haunt the city's infrastructure. Although Haiti has been independent since 1804, the country has been drastically hindered by dictatorships, factional violence and economic sanctions from global institutions and western countries. Naturally, a house cannot be built when all of its construction workers are fighting amongst themselves and neither can a democracy prosper under similar conditions. Scholar Harley Étienne explains that for Haiti, "vigorous public action has not been sustained for long periods of time without violence and political repression. That is to say, the egalitarian ends of planning have eluded the Haitian state."[347] The majority of Haiti's public structures such as roads, and administrative buildings are vestiges of colonialism and imperialism. The seat of

the government, the national palace, was constructed during the United States' first occupation.[348] Many of the roads that connect Port-au-Prince to other Haitian cities were also developed during the American occupation from 1915-1934. On the cusp of the new millennium, critical parts of Haiti's infrastructure still looked as if they had been created centuries earlier. In the introduction to the 1997 collection of essays *Haiti Renewed*, Jennifer McCoy offers a synopsis of various sectors of Haitian society; in regards to the country's justice system she calls the physical conditions of court houses, prisons and administrative buildings "deplorable;"[349] "Prisons date from the 18th century and lack running water, toilets, and electricity."[350] Literary representations of the capital further reaffirm Port-au-Prince as a symbol of Haiti's failed democracy.

This symbolism can be interpreted through the lens of the literary genre noir. *Haiti Noir*, edited by Haitian luminary Edwidge Danticat, brings Haiti's distinctly Caribbean and Creole influence to the ever-expanding world of Noir. The author points out in the collection's introduction, that *Haiti Noir* is an apt title for these "dark tales." While noir means black in French, it also "refers to any Haitian citizen regardless of race."[351] Noirisme, a Haitian ideology that grew from indigenism after the American occupation, is closely associated with Haitian dictator François Duvalier. Scholar Martin Munro refers to it as a "classic nationalist, anti-colonial program designed to assert the value of the local and the indigenous in the face of the foreign and the colonial, to "empower" Haiti."[352] Although based in a rhetoric of Blackness, and Haitian empowerment, the movement under the helm of Duvalier was incredibly repressive. With frequent disappearances and political torture abound, dark

times prevailed through both François Duvalier and his son Jean-Claude's 29-year reign. Infamously, when François Duvalier named himself Haiti's president for life he proclaimed, "I have conquered the country. I have conquered power. I am the new Haiti. To wish to destroy me is to wish to destroy Haiti itself. It is to thanks me that it breathes, thanks to me that it even exists."[353] François Duvalier declared as the absolute embodiment of the nation. Even long after his death, and the formal end of his dynasty, Haiti's capital continues to stand in place as a metonym for the violence and political instability he caused the nation at large. Due to its connection to Duvalier as well as its name for Haitians, the word *noir* has many reverberations for the history of Haiti. Noir, in a literary sense, is a genre historically married to the urban detective story which further makes it a generative frame for contemplating Haiti's capital city, Port- au-Prince.

Since the 1980's there has been increasing literary production and scholarly interest in noir aspects of post-colonial literature, illuminating the genre's connection to colonial empire. Such essay collections as *Diversity and Detective Fiction*, *Detective Fiction in a Postcolonial and Transnational World*, *Mysteries of Africa*, *Post-Colonial Post Mortems: Crime Fiction and a Transcultural Perspective* and *The Post-Colonial Detective* immediately come to mind. Noir has a history that is both embedded in the histories of imperial conquest as well as the rise of the "urban jungle." Scholar Dawn Fulton explains "twentieth-century noir emphasizes the harsh unpredictability, the camouflaged violence and grittiness of dark city streets. The term 'urban jungle' connotes the mix of familiar and the exotic in which noir flourished."[354] The epoch in which the crime novel, which we might consider as the

British predecessor of American-originated noir, has close links to travel narratives and colonial fascination with exoticized others. Developing in the mid-19th century, with the first detective crime fiction often attributed to Edgar Allan Poe, the naissance of the crime novel aligns with the peak of the British colonial empire and industrialization.[355] Fulton further emphasizes the cohesion between noir and post-colonial narratives. She states,

> As a corollary to its connotative urbanism, noir has inherent intersections with the trope of migrancy, especially in the postcolonial context: the legacy of violence and the vestiges of yet unresolved moral injustices, the hierarchical social structures reproduced within the borders of former colonial powers and the trafficking and corruption embedded in the underground world of clandestine immigration offer settings and an ethos that lend themselves fluently to noir writing.[356]

The ongoing "unsolved mystery" that is colonialism and the extent to which it has undermined and continues to covertly undermine new, developing nations, is the ultimate crime novel, where post-colonial subjects and theorists all serve as detectives in their own right.

Pim Higginson's *The Noir Atlantic* traces the connection between the first Francophone African crime novelists and often overlooked African American writer, Chester Himes. Most importantly through analyzing the genealogy of noir and the hard-boiled crime novel, Higginson contemplates the genres' relationship to realism and its distinction as low-level literature. He contends, "…American crime fiction broadly speaking guards the crossroads between "high" and "low" literatures. Rather

than simply representing an exclusively popular genre to which one would one would oppose the high literary, the crime novel is both embedded in and distinct from the canonical."[357] If the crime novel, often set within the urban jungle, is inherently situated between high and low literature, urban novels that contemplate class inequality are also located between high and low culture.

Despite the fact that Haiti's narrative does not perfectly align with the term post-colonial, recent urban fiction imagines Port-au-Prince as a monstrous place that reflects the noir aesthetic. In the Haitian literary imaginary, Port-au-Prince is frequently conceptualized as a symbol of the country's severe socioeconomic inequality, a space of migrancy and an emblem of the government. Ultimately both the country's extreme inequality and migrancy are afflictions of the government's instability.

Recent Haitian fiction that combines a mixture of narrative suspense and ambiguity with Haiti's complex relationship to histories of colonization and occupation, is at the foundation of what I am calling the Haitian noir aesthetic. Like Fulton suggests with respect to post-colonial noir, the Haitian noir aesthetic shares a connection to corruption, and legacies of violence that often go unexplained. MJ Fievre, a contributor to the *Haiti Noir* collection, defines the traditional noir genre in part as "a story with a feeling that not everything is all right. It's a feeling that creeps up on you."[358] She affirms that, "Haiti Noir introduced unique elements to the genre—magic, spirituality, a dark political background. Haiti definitely offers different elements that can keep you on the edge of your seat and that add to the definition of noir."[359] These additional aspects of noir also reflect N'Zengou-Tayo's

categorization of recent contemporary Haitian literature set in Port-au-Prince as the 'poetics of the uncanny." She too uses the word "unsettling" to describe Haitian fiction particularly those of the city, explaining that, "the transformation of the city into an 'urban monster' has an impact on the writers' descriptions. The city has become a strange and unsettling space in recent writings."[360] Of course, while unique in its own history, Port-au-Prince is not the only city that unsettles its inhabitants.

Within larger, global conversations on the intersections of the literary and urban, analyses of Port-au-Prince also remain strangely absent. Deviating from western metropolises, recent scholarship has taken interest in cities in the Global South as hubs for literary theorization. Cities such as Nairobi, Bombay, and Johannesburg have entered into contemporary discussions on the literary urban. Johannesburg, South Africa has received an incredible amount of literary attention in the past years, as an entry point for understanding the tense politics of South Africa pre and post-apartheid. Rearticulating an idea by scholar Liz Gunner, Sarah Nuttall who writes frequently on the literariness of Johannesburg remarks: "In contemporary literature, particularly fiction, the city emerges in an even more self-conscious way as an aesthetic, a political and an imaginary site, a vivid and explicit template for an entire array of social fears and possibilities.[361]

Western media often sensationalizes and essentializes violence in Haiti. Literary representations of Haiti not only depict violence but also allude to the complex historical, political, and social mechanisms that catalyze violence on the island. In her interview with M.J. Fievre and Marie Ketsia Theodore-Pharel, Carolina Villalba asks these contributors to the *Haiti Noir* collection to consider how "noir has

the potential to both enhance and trouble literary representations of Haiti."[362] It is a worthwhile endeavor to understand the representation of Port-au-Prince as its own mystery to be solved. As Dawn Fulton notes, urban and noir can be seen as mutually constitutive, "each guaranteeing the other's force as a portal to the extreme instances of human behavior."[363] We must always remember that Port-au-Prince is far from the only city that witnesses the extremes of human behavior.

Afterword

Stereotypes, Sensationalizing Violence, and Ethical Scholarship

"The stench of burning tires is hard to escape. Haiti's capital, Port-au-Prince, is again littered with smoldering barricades." [364] Since July 2018, another wave of anti-government and anti-corruption protests have washed over Port-au-Prince and Haiti. Protestors are demanding for current President Jovenel Moise to resign. The strain between protestors and the government has become so deleterious that some Haitian cities, including Port-au-Prince cancelled Carnival. As the capital, Port-au-Prince always has the largest festivities. As a festival, renowned in the Caribbean, the cancellation of Carnival truly speaks to the severity of the socio-political climate. Carnival is not only a celebration but a time when musicians are given a large platform to share their political critiques through their art form. Carel Pedre, creator of PleziKanaval, a website that tracks Carnival songs throughout the year, pointed out that this year's songs were more political than ever with PetroCaribe trending in most songs. A political year indeed, Carel admits, "This is the first year where all of the Carnival songs, or most of them, talk about the president himself. How he's incompetent, how he's a liar, how he's making a bad move, how he's not fit for the job."[365] This is not the first time that a Haitian president has been distrusted. This is the first it has been quantifiably proven through the Carnival song catalogue.

PetroCaribe has been at the center of the protests of the nearly yearlong, ongoing protests. The protests originally began in response to fuel hikes that were

connected to an IMF plan to end subsidies on fuel. Any increase in the cost of living is a drastic attack on the average Haitian's cost of living. Two years ago the cost of a bag of the basic staples cost $10 and that cost has since risen to $19.60. For a population that lives on less than $2, that is a absorptive price. Imagine then, a bag of basic goods would cost the average person more than a week's salary. This does not consider other costs of living such as school fees or transportation. Under those conditions, one can understand the impulse to protest such price increases.

The PetroCaribe challenge is an anti-corruption campaign demanding receipts for the money that should have been garnered from the decade that Haiti participated in the PetroCaribe program. This program was supposed to lower fuel costs, yet a November 2017 report exposed that "1.7 billion from the Petro Caribe development fund had been lost or stolen."[366] For millions of people who do not even make $1000 in a year, the loss or theft of 1.7billion dollars must be unimaginably painful. Greg Beckett, professor of Anthropology, argues that the Haitian population is at a new breaking point. He likens these protests to those in the 1980's that terminated the Duvalier dynasty and ended Haiti's last dictatorship. Instead of overthrowing a dictator, the Haitian people are ready to overthrow the neoliberal world order that continues to leave them penniless. Beckett tells us:

> Indeed, the prevailing situation in Haiti—energy dependence, debt, trade liberalization, neoliberal reforms, a weak government, low wages, and high prices—is the result of a series of programs and policies put in place by a series of governments propped up by or beholden to international institutions and hegemonic countries.[367]

Considering these conditions, what do they Haitian people have to lose? Beckett points out that after three decades of the dictatorship, Haiti has not fared that much better under “democracy.” Beckett queries, for Haiti, what comes after democracy? The question of democracy isn’t just crucial for Haiti, but the United States as well.

In a recent opinion piece, scholar Marlene Daut reminds us of the similarities that the U.S. and Haiti share. From a history of voter suppression, recent foreign interference, and police brutality the United States’ democracy could also use some work. As scholars of Haiti, it is important to recognize our own complex relationship to Haiti. We are part of a nation that has historically denigrated Haiti, while practicing many of the same undemocratic habits. While *The Unhealed Wound* intervenes in studies of Black diaspora, Francophone Studies and Haitian/Haitian diasporic literature. I have tried to tread carefully while interpreting and analyzing a literature, community and space that I do not belong to. It’s important to recognize recent critiques regarding the representation of Haiti. Specifically, I am thinking of Gina Ulysse’s *Why Haiti Needs New Narratives: A Post-Quake Chronicle* and Nadève Ménard’s *Écrits d’Haiti, Perspectives sur la littérature haïtienne contemporaire (1986-2006*). Both works call for scholars and artists to move away from overemphasized tropes in Haitian literature and scholarship. Ménard’s collection specifically aims to highlights diverse themes within Haitian literature aside from exile. The collection also works to privilege texts and authors living and publishing in Haiti. Ménard argues that for the west, the only Haitian literature that receives attention are narratives of migration and exile: “La critique étrangère considère l’exil comme le thème dominant de la littérature haïtienne.”[368] Ménard argues that no one

theme dominates Haitian literature from the period of 1986-2006, although the end of the Duvaliers' respective dictatorships has had a natural impact on literary production during these periods. In consideration of the concerns Ménard raises, I recognize this project re-prioritizes exile, migration, and dictatorship—themes, for Ménard, that have been overstated. I hope the interdisciplinary threads I have tried to pull together produce new connections and useful dialogue. Again, I want to acknowledge this project's own genesis in spaces outside of Haiti and Port-au-Prince. Although this project is focused on the memory of the Duvalier dictatorship, trauma, and alienation across borders, I do not want to replicate harmful discourses that imagine Haiti as synonymous with violence or strife.

I also do not want this project to fall into the easy mistake of sensationalizing violence within Haiti or generalizing the memory of the Duvaliers as simply that of violence. As Michael J. Dash and other scholars have indicated, Haiti, like Africa, has long been stereotyped as a place of chaotic violence and savagery. I believe through having chapters set in New York and Paris, I highlight the ways that France and the United States have been culpable in Duvalierist violence. I also want to privilege the voices of Haitian and Haitian scholars as much as possible with the resources I have.

To that end, I want to talk about my use of Peter Hallward's *Damming the Flood*. I hesitantly quoted Hallward in the historical background section of the introduction to provide contextualization around the violence occurring in Haiti during the Cedras regime from 1991-1994 and President Jean Betrand Aristide's return around 1994-1997. Peter Hallward's *Damming the Flood*, Michael Deibert's

Notes From the Last Testament and Alex Dupuy's *The Prophet and Power* are the three most engaged, lengthy analyses of Jean Bertrand Aristide and his presidencies in Haiti. I am attentive to the fact that Hallward characterizes Aristide as a messianic savior figure up against the American empire. Or, as Jana Braziel simply puts it, Peter Hallward's text is pro-Aristide. Notable Haitian scholars interpret Aristide very differently, particularly during his second term from 2000-2004. Critics of Aristide see him as an establishment of American Empire. Lyonel Trouillot and Nadève Ménard leverage an important critique against Hallward in their 2009 Small Axe article titled "Hallward, or the Hidden Face of Racism."

> I finally understand that Peter Hallward's book is not a book on Haiti, but a book on Peter Hallward. A book on those intellectuals well (or uneasily) installed in their careers in the bosom of the empire, incapable of acting upon the social realities of their countries and societies, who go looking elsewhere for outlets to ease their consciences. Hallward found in Aristide his black saint, his Haitian rooster to defend his conscience in a cockfight where Hallward had nothing to lose, apart from his fantasies.[369]

For Trouillot and Ménard, Hallward's defense of Aristide, particularly during his second term is incomprehensible. Hallward trivializes the violence caused by Aristide and his chimères in order to continue his argument that leftist leaning Aristide was pushed out by U.S. empire. I am not invested in romanticizing Jean Bertrand Aristide. I have chosen to cite Hallward to help briefly contextualize Aristide's 2000-2004 term. The real deviation seems to occur around Aristide's second term. I have largely quoted Hallward to cite facts about the violence during the Cedras regime after

Aristide's first exile. I believe the places where I have chosen to cite Hallward should not stir controversy. However, if given the opportunity to turn this dissertation project into a monograph, I would likely look for alternative sources to replace Hallward's citations.

I want to emphasize that this project is not interested in debating the extent of Aristide's culpability for violence enacted by his followers and personal strong men (chimères). However, the debate around Aristide generates helpful discussions around Western liberalism, Empire and the relationship between Western scholarship and the communities it produces work on such as Haiti. It is my perspective that Aristide cannot be absolved of murders that occurred in his name. The question of Aristide's second presidency is exceedingly complex. I appreciate scholar Valerie Kaussen's concern that "easy dismissal of mass popular movements as totalitarian is indeed the (accidental) corollary of neoliberal foreign policies and development strategies that are deepening Haiti's marginalization and poverty and undermining the possibilities for true democracy."[370] Kaussen implores us to think deeply about whether the grammar of neoliberal democracy and government can adequately fit a country like Haiti who has a starkly different historical and socio-economic reality then western countries where these ideas originate. I have similar concerns in thinking about whether trauma theory or the western scholars I cite are applicable in the context of Haiti. She says

> Such rhetoric uncritically deploys charged terms such as *dictator, communist, macoute, chime* and then appeals to "universal laws" (human rights, good

versus evil) to discourage questions that would complicate the easy truth that these terms are meant to convey.[371]

Kaussen's argument seems to implicitly assume that Western nations have mastered the idea of democracy themselves. They do often fall into ambiguous grey areas that are neither totally good or evil, but simultaneously both. Scholar Marlene Daut article, "Haiti's Recent Protests Expose the Lie of Democracy," addresses the ways in which Haiti's failed democracy reflects the United States' own failures.

Kaussen argument takes direct aim at an argument at the center of *The Unhealed Wound*. This project attempts to understand how the memory of Duvalier is represented in literatures that cross national boundaries. Most of the novels that I examine indicate that the memory of the dictatorships inevitably implicates current politics in Haiti and abroad. Novels like Lyonel Trouillot's *Street of Lost Footsteps* clearly implicate Aristide as a provocateur of political violence and interpret his administration as an extension of previous authoritarian violence. Kaussen claims that she finds "the charge that he [Aristide] is another Papa Doc more problematic because it fits all too neatly into the narrative of Haitian political history current in much Caribbean cultural criticism."[372] Doesn't the move to "problematize" bring forth its own contentions? Is it possible that certain incidents do neatly fit into patterns? While there are always nuanced differences, specific conditions can breed like results. Kaussen argues that there are stark differences between Françoise Duvalier and Jean Bertrand Aristide. She says:

But even if Aristide's presidencies had witnessed the amount of violence perpetrated, during, say, ten average years of Duvalerian rule (they did not),

> there is a huge qualitative difference between a Duvalier and an Aristide. Duvalier was a fascist dictator whose anticommunist rhetoric earned him enormous amounts of US aid money and full impunity for the systematic murdering of thousands of people. Aristide was a democratically elected socialist liberation theologian who never had the full support of the United States. He disbanded the army that had overthrown him, and tried (albeit imperfectly) to democratically govern a largely destitute and illiterate population. He received almost no international aid between 2000 and 2004, all the while trying to resist his own overthrow by a variety of players, including former military and US funded and supported opposition [373]

The distinctions that Kaussen makes between Duvalier and Aristide seem to be very simplified. First, Kaussen does not account for the difference in years between the Duvalier dictatorships and Aristide. Aristide was president for eight months, a year and half, and then finally another three years before being exiled for the final time. One must wonder if Aristide was granted the means to maintain Duvalier-like absolute power, would his regime's violence have escalated to the same level as Duvalier's? We cannot fully know the answer to this question but it surely seems possible. Empirically, yes, more people died during the thirty years of Duvalier dictatorships then the five-ish years of Aristide's off again, on again presidencies. Thirty years versus five years does not seem like a reasonable comparison. Kaussen does not consider the fact that repressive measures can replicate, multiply and strengthen over time.

A second distinction Kaussen draws is that Duvalier was able to manipulate rhetoric in order to acquire money from the U.S. whereas Aristide spent much of his time in office without foreign aid. Kaussen seems to characterize Duvalier as an opportunist while portraying Aristide as a thwarted visionary. Again, a number of contextual details are missing from this comparison. Prior to his rule, Duvalier had also been characterized as a visionary, a noiriste scholar and doctor who also wanted to empower the Black masses. Throughout Duvalier's reign he created this façade that Haiti was a "paladin of liberty" and "at the vanguard of the struggle for Black and third world liberation."[374] Given the oppression of the Duvalier state, the idea that Haiti was a "paladin of liberty" was an elaborate illusion. However, it is important to recognize that Duvalier had long been committed to noirisme and black liberation, even before he gained the power that corrupted him. It is very easy to draw parallels between Aristide's liberation theology and Duvalier's noirisme and argue that power corrupted them both. In particular, one historian, Elizabeth Abbott, notes that the peak of Duvalier's terror occurred after an assassination attempt on his children. After that he was senselessly lashing out against anyone as reprisal. Aristide also seemingly support vengeance himself, it seems difficult to definitively argue that violence would not have further escalated under his leadership.

Duvalier maturation was shaped by the oppression of the American occupation while Aristide had matured during the oppression of the Duvalier dictatorships. Both Duvalier and Aristide's politics subscribe to a Fanon-like belief in absolute violence that desire a time when "the first shall be last and the last shall be first."[375] This is further corroborated by both regimes' history of violence and

extrajudicial killing of political opponents. Although Aristide had originally believed in non-violence as a priest, his position changed drastically as a political figure.

Both Duvalier and Aristide capitulated to the U.S. in order to get what they wanted. It is also important to note the different historical periods that Aristide and Duvalier operated within. Aristide came to power in a time of peak interest and concern around human rights. The U.S. could no longer continue to turn a blind eye to human rights abuses or sweep them under the rug. Perhaps had Aristide come to power in the 1950's and Duvalier in the 1990's, Aristide could have maintained a long-standing authoritarian state and Duvalier would have been toppled by numerous opponents including the U.S.

Kaussen extends her argument stating that "the specter of Duvalier is inevitably identified as lurking within any engaged discourse coming out of Haiti, and so called totalizing, essentialist, nationalist discourses are automatically deemed to be political *totalitarianism*."[376] Given Haiti's history of dictatorships, it makes sense that "totalizing, essentialist, national discourses" could easily trigger some people's senses and spark concern or fear. Kaussen's criticism would be strengthened by the inclusion of Haitian scholars and creatives living in Haiti. Who might know better whether Aristide's tenure was just as repressive as a Duvalier's than someone who lived through both eras? It has been over 60 years since Papa Doc's first "election" and over 30 years since Baby Doc's exile and yet there are still Duvalierists clamoring for the bygone years of Duvalier rule. Given this context, it seems that a specter of Duvalierism must haunt Haitian political discourse.

Further in the article, Kaussen argues that Hallward's distance from Haiti makes him an ideal candidate to "objectively" analyze its contemporary politics. In responding to Haitian journalist Michael Deibert's critique of Hallward as a non-specialist, Kaussen leverages that, "perhaps precisely because Hallward is an 'outsider' that he is in a position to interrogate some of the common sense notions about Haiti that circulate unquestioned in the international mainstream media, and too often, among European and U.S. academics.[377] Kaussen does have a point in her claims that Hallward is not beholden to the same disciplinary "boundaries, assumptions and categories." Yet this idea that Hallward might study Haiti objectively and untethered from political or even professional ties, smacks of the inherent racism that originated in the field of anthropology. Ultimately Haiti's politics is not a philosophical problem set. Real people's lives are implicated in this work. Only in theory would Hallward's outsider perspective make him the ideal candidate. I will agree with Kaussen's conclusion that "as citizens of the nations that have repeatedly aborted Haiti's attempts to become a democracy, our work is, to say at the least, problematically situated."[378] I conclude, hoping that I have done Haiti, Haitians and Haitianists justice in my work.

Bibliography

Abbott, Elizabeth Haiti*, A Shattered Nation* New York: Overlook Duckworth, Peter Mayer Publishers, Inc. 2011.

Abu-Lughod, Janet L. *Race, space, and riots in Chicago, New York, and Los Angeles*. OUP USA, 2007.

Agence France Presse. "L'ex président haïtien Jean-Claude Duvalier lance un appel à l'unité nationale" October 10, 1991

Allen, Peter. "African dictators we fund are now buying up Paris." *Express*. July 29, 2011. https://www.express.co.uk/news/world/261799/African-dictators-we-fund-are-now- buying-up-Paris

Alterpresse. "Haïti-France : Décès du photographe, dessinateur et écrivain Gérald Bloncourt."http://www.alterpresse.org/spip.php?article23716#.W94qRhNKg0Q

Amin, Ash, and Nigel Thrift. *Cities: reimagining the urban*. Polity Press, 2002.

"Aristide Creating Haiti Even He Can't Control." *Palm Beach Post (Florida)* December 1, 1995.

Arthur, Charles, and J. Michael Dash, eds. *A Haiti Anthology: Libète*. Markus Wiener Publishers, 1999.

Associated Press. "French court throws out residency complaint against Duvalier." May 11, 1999.

Ball, John Clement. *Imagining London: Postcolonial fiction and the transnational metropolis*. University of Toronto Press, 2004.

Baer, Susan. "Aristide called psychopath, savior of hope." *The Baltimore Sun*. October 21, 1993.

Barrot, Oliver. "Glimpse of hell in Haiti." *Guardian Weekly*. August 16, 1986.

Barstow, David "The Louima Case: The Overview; Officer, Seeking Some Mercy Admits to Louima's Torture" The New York Times. May 26, 1999. https://www.nytimes.com/1999/05/26/nyregion/louima-case-overview-officer-seeking- some-mercy-admits-louima-s-torture.html

BBC Summary of World Broadcasts. “Politicians react to former President Jean-Claude Duvalier’s speech” May 2, 1997.

Becket, Greg “Haiti at the Crossroads” *Nacla* March 6, 2019. https://nacla.org/news/2019/03/06/haiti-crossroads

Bellamy, Maria Rice. "More than hunter or prey: duality and traumatic memory in Edwidge Danticat's The Dew Breaker." *MELUS: Multi-Ethnic Literature of the US* 37.1 (2012): 177-197.

Bender, Thomas. *The unfinished city: New York and the metropolitan idea*. NYU Press, 2007

Bilodeau, Sarah. "Un-silencing Resistance: A Trilogy of Dictatorship Novels by Évelyne Trouillot, Kettly Mars, and Marie-Célie Agnant." *Journal of Haitian Studies* 19.2 (2013): 227-230.

Bloncourt, Gerald. *Journal d’un révolutionnaire: chronique*, Mémoire D’encrier 2013

Bloncourt, Gérald *Le regard engagé: mémoires d’un franc-tireur de l’image*, Bourin Editeur. 2004

Bogdanich, Walt and Janny Nordberg. “Mixed U.S. Signals Helped Tilt Haiti Towards Chaos.” *The New York Times*. January 29, 2006.

Boinet, Thierry. “Jean-Claude Duvalier Waits It Out in Gilded Cage.” *The Associated Press*. February 15, 1986.

Boring, Nicolas. “*Refugee Law and Policy: France*. “ Library of Congress Legal Report. March 2016. https://www.loc.gov/law/help/refugee-law/france.php/?loclr=bloglaw

Boswell, Eric (Assistant Secretary of State), Joseph Sullivan (Assistant Secretary of State), Benjamin Gilman (U.S. Ambassador to Haiti Swing Chairman). “House International Relations Committee Hearing Topic: Haiti. *Federal News Service*. September 27 1996.

Bourdon, William. “The Legal Right to Fight Corruption in France.” *Transparency International*. Spetember 9, 2016. https://www.transparency.org/news/feature/the_legal_right_to_fight_corruption_in_france

Braziel, Jana Evans. *Duvalier's Ghosts: Race, Diaspora, and US Imperialism in Haitian Literatures*. University Press of Florida, 2010.

Braziel, Jana Evans. "From Port-au-Prince to Montreal to Miami: Trans-American Nomads in Dany Laferriere's Migratory Texts." *Callaloo* 26.1 (2003): 235-251.

Braziel, Jana Evans. "Re-membering Défilée: Dédée Bazile as Revolutionary Lieu de Mémoire." *Small Axe* 9, no. 2 (2005): 57-85.

Brenner, Neil, Peter Marcuse, and Margit Mayer. *Cities for people, not for profit*. London: Routledge, 2011.

Brison, Susan J., Susan Brison, and Susan J. Brison. *Aftermath: Violence and the Remaking of a Self*. Princeton University Press, 2002.

Brush, Kaitlin." Special Coverage of the 141st Period of Sessions of the Inter-American Commission on Huma Rights: Impunity for Human Rights Violations During the Duvalier Dictatorship in Haiti." *18 Human Rights Brief 39* Spring 2011

Burman, Jenny. *Transnational yearnings: tourism, migration, and the diasporic city*. UBC Press, 2011

Byrd, Brandon, "François Duvalier and the Muse of Martin Luther King Jr." *Black Perspectives.* January 15, 2018.https://www.aaihs.org/francois-duvalier-and-the-misuse-of-martin- luther-king-jr/

Carey, Henry F. "The Third U.S. Intervention and Haiti's Paramilitary Predicament." *The Journal of Haitian Studies*, Vol 11 No 1. 2005

Caruth, Cathy. *Unclaimed experience: Trauma, narrative, and history*. JHU Press, 2016.

Casmir, Leslie. "March Targets Haiti Suspect." Daily News New York. December 13, 2000.

Cassata, Donna. "Non-Humanitiarian U.S. Aid to Haiti Being Cut Off, State Department Says," *The Associated Press*. November 29, 1987.

Chancy, Myriam JA. *Framing silence: Revolutionary novels by Haitian women*. Rutgers University Press, 1997.

Chang, May-Lee. " What destination for ex-dictators in exile?" *Young Diplomats*. March 09, 2016. http://www.young-diplomats.com/countries-dictators-prefers-go-exile/

Chrisafis, Angelique. "France has finally got tough on corruption by seizing a dictator's Paris mansion." *The Guardian*. August 6, 2012.

https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2012/aug/06/france-tough-corruption-dictators-mansion

Cole, Teju. *Open city: A novel*. Random House Incorporated, 2012.

Cole, Teju "The White Savior Industrial Complex" *The Atlantic* March 21, 2012 https://www.theatlantic.com/international/archive/2012/03/the-white-savior-industrial-complex/254843/

Conseil-Constituionel. *La Constitution*. https://www.conseil-constitutionnel.fr/les-constitutions-dans-l-histoire/constitution-de-1946-ive-republique.

"Constitution of 1793." *Liberty, Equality.* http://chnm.gmu.edu/revolution/d/430.

Darwish, Mahmoud. *In the presence of absence*. Translated by Sinan Antoon. Archipelago, 2012

Dash, J. Michael. "The Art of Writing Darkness: Writing during the Duvalier Years," *Haiti and the United States: National Stereotypes and the Literary Imagination.* 2nd ed. New York: St. Martin's P (1997).

De Bleeker, Liesbeth. "Urban space in the French Caribbean crime novel: confiant and Chamoiseau." *The Caribbean city*. Ian Randle Publishers, 2008. 303-323.

Deibert, Michael. *Notes from the Last Testament : The Struggle for Haiti*. A Seven Stories Press 1st ed. New York: Seven Stories Press, 2005.

Deutsche Presse-Agentur. "Ex-Haitian dictator to be tried as illegal alien" December 24, 1998.

Donnelly, John. "Waiting for Aristide. The Public Silence of Jean-Bertrand Aristide, Haiti's shadow president and political godfather, is making his countrymen very, very uneasy." The Globe and Mail (Canada). December 21, 19991.

Dupuy, Alex. *The prophet and power: Jean-Bertrand Aristide, the international community, and Haiti*. Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, 2006.

Durham, Joyce R. "The City in Recent American Fiction: Listening to Black Urban Voices." *College English* 52, no. 7 (1990): 764-775.

Edwards, Brent Hayes. *The practice of diaspora: Literature, translation, and the rise of black internationalism.* Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2003.

Etienne, Harly F. “Urban Planning and the Rebuilding of Port-au-Prince. In *The Idea of Haiti: Rethinking Crisis and Development.* Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press. 2013.

Fanon, Frantz. *The wretched of the earth: The handbook for the black revolution that is changing the shape of the world*. Grove Press, 1964.

Fanning, Sara. *Caribbean Crossing: African Americans and the Haitian Emigration Movement*. NYU Press, 2015.

Fatton, Robert. *Haiti's Predatory Republic: The unending transition to democracy*. Lynne Rienner Publishers, 2002.

Fatton, Robert. *Haiti: Trapped in the outer periphery*. Lynne Rienner Publishers, Incorporated, 2014.

Felman, Shoshana, and Dori Laub. *Testimony: Crises of witnessing in literature, psychoanalysis, and history*. Taylor & Francis, 1992.

Freeman, John. “Roxane Gay” Bomb Magazine. July 1, 2014. https://bombmagazine.org/articles/roxane-gay/

French, Howard W. “Gonaives Journal; The Bogeyman’s Back, Striking Fear Into Haitians” *The New York Times*. Jan 21. 1994

Freud, Sigmund. “‘The Uncanny’” in *The Standard Edition of the Complete Psychological works of Sigmund Freud*. Translated by James Strachey. Volume XVII. London: The Hogarth Press, 1919.

Fuchs, Rebecca. “Hiding and Exposing Violence: Euphemisms in Edwidge Danticat’s *The Dew Breaker*. L’Érudit Franco-Espangol, Volume 7, Spring 2015. 51- 65

Fuller, Anne “A Young Duvalier and Haiti’s Unremembered Past” *NACLA* February 12, 2019 https://nacla.org/news/2019/02/12/young-duvalier-and-haiti%E2%80%99s-unremembered-past-available-french

Ganley, Elaine “Khomeini launched a revolution from a sleepy French village.” *APnews.* February 1, 2019. https://www.apnews.com/d154664bcfed47e49b0ae0ff3648779c

Gay, Roxane. *An Untamed State*. No. 16. Grove Press, 2014.

Gedda, George. “Shultz Praises Haiti’s ‘Extraordinary Progress.” *The Associated Press*. August 16, 1986

Glass, Pierre-Yves. " Anti-U.S. Sentiment On the Rise in Haiti." *The Associated Press.* October 1, 1987

Girard, Philippe. R. "Operation Restore Democracy." *Journal of Haitian Studies*, 8. No. 2. (2002) 70-85.

Gollner, Adam Leith "Dany Laferrière, The Art of Fiction" *The Paris Review* No. 237, Issue 22, Fall 2017 https://www.theparisreview.org/interviews/7040/dany-laferriere-the-art-of-fiction-no-237-dany-laferriere

Greenblatt, Alan. " A dictators Choice: Cushy Exile or Go Underground." *NPR.* August 26, 2011. https://www.npr.org/2011/08/26/139952385/a-dictators-choice-cushy-exile-or-go-underground

Griffin, Farah Jasmine. *" Who Set You Flowin'?": The African-American Migration Narrative*. Oxford University Press, 1996. 3

"Haiti-Aristide, Bgt." *The Canadian Press*. January 12, 1993.

"Haiti-Aristide." *The Canadian Press*. January 8, 1992.

Haiti/Aristide: 'Titide' Ends Long Exile with Kiss." *IPS-Inter Press Service*. October 15, 1994.

Haiti: Clinton, Aristide Hold 'Constructive' Talks on Accord" IPS-Inter Press Service. July 22, 1993.

Hallward, Peter. *Damming the flood: Haiti, Aristide, and the politics of containment*. Verso, 2007.

Hirsch, Marianne. "Family pictures: Maus, mourning, and post-memory." *Discourse* 15, no. 2 (1992): 3-29.

Hirsch, Marianne. *The Generation of Postmemory: Writing and Visual Culture After the Holocaust*. Gender and Culture. New York: Columbia University Press, 2012

Hockstader, Lee. "U.S. Weighs Hopes and Fears About Haiti." *The Washington Post*. December 19, 1990.

Hopwood, Stephanie. "Port-au-Prince as Microcosm of the Americas: Américanité Meets Haitianisation in Dany Laferrière's La Chair du maître." *Australian Journal of French Studies* 52.1 (2015): 65-72.

Hopwood, Stephanie. "Subverting the Dictatorship in Dany Laferrière's" Le Goût des jeunes filles." *The French Review*(2011): 531-540.

Howell, Ron. "Haiti's Outspoken Pirest: 'The more they think they can intimidate us, by killing us and sacrificing us…the more quickly will come the hour of the revolution,' the Rev. Jean-Bertran Aristide said in New York last week." *News Day (New York).* May 14, 1990.

Human Rights Watch and National Coalition for Haitian Refugees, "Rape in Haiti: A Weapon of Terror" July 1994

Human Rights Watch, Americas Coalition for Haitian Rights, and Washington Office on Latin America "Haiti The Human Rights Record of the Haitian National Police" Vol 9. No. 1 (B) January 1997

Jackson, Regine O., *Geographies of the Haitian diaspora*. Routledge, 2011.

Jaffe, Rivke Katrien, A. de Bruijne, and Aart Schalkwijk. "The Caribbean city: an introduction." (2008): 1.

Jaffe, Rivke, and Anouk De Koning. *Introducing urban anthropology*. Routledge, 2015.

"Jean-Bertrand Aristide; Opinions Differ on Aristide and His Future in Haiti." *CBS News Transcripts* Sunday Morning. September 25, 1994.

Jean-Charles, Régine. "Beyond Truth and Reconciliation in "La Mémoire Aux Abois" and "Un Alligator Nommé Rosa." *French Forum* 38, no. 3 (2013): 148

Joseph, Raymond. "Troubled Island/ Would the return of its exiled president restore democracy to Haiti or plunge it even deeper into repression? What's the best course for Haiti? Aristide would bring chaos." The Globe and Mail (Canada). April 8, 1994

Jules-Rosette, Bennetta. *Black Paris: The African Writers' Landscape*. University of Illinois Press, 2000.

Kandalaft, Abla. "The Growing Problem of elderly care in France" The Guardian. January 11, 2012. https://www.theguardian.com/social-care-network/2012/jan/11/growing-problem- elderly-care-france

Karas, Tania. "With no Carnival, Haitian Musicians lose more than their stage." *PRI.* March 06, 2019. https://www.pri.org/stories/2019-03-06/no-carnival-haiti- s-musicians-lose-more- their-stage

Katz, Jonathon M., "Jean-Claude Duvalier is Dead, But He Will Haunt Haiti for Years to Come." *New Republic*, 6 October 2014. https://newrepublic.com/article/119715/jean-claude-duvalier-dies-will-haunt-haiti-years-come

Kaussen, Valerie. "Violence and Methodology. Reading Aristide in the Aftermath of 2004." *Small Axe*. Number 30 (Volume 13, Number 3) November 2009

Keaton, Trica Danielle, T. Denean Sharpley-Whiting, and Tyler Stovall. *Black France/France Noire: The History and Politics of Blackness*. Duke University Press, 2012.

Kofman, Eleonore, Madalina Rogoz, and Florence Lévy. "Family migration policies in France." *New Orientations for Democracy in Europe.* (2010).

Kolbe, Athene and Robert Muggah. "Opinion: Haiti's Troubles Must Not Be Forgotten." *NPR*. March 4, 2019. https://www.npr.org/2019/03/04/699001166/opinion-haitis-troubles-must-not-be-forgotten

Kovats-Bernat, Christopher. *Sleeping rough in Port-au-Prince: An ethnography of street children and violence in Haiti*. University of Florida, 2006.

Laguerre, Michel S. *Diasporic Citizenship: Haitian Americans in Transnational America.* St. Martin's Press. 1998.

Laguerre, Michel S. *Military and Society in Haiti* Knoxville: University of Tennessee Press, 1993

Laurens, Sylvain. "«1974» et la fermeture des frontières." *Politix* 2 (2008): 69-94.

Lefebvre, Henri. *The production of space*. Donald Nicholson Smith (trans). Vol. 142. Oxford: Blackwell, 1991.

Lefebvre, Henri, Eleonore Kofman, and Elizabeth Lebas. *Writings on cities*. Vol. 63, no. 2. Oxford: Blackwell, 1996.

Lem, Winnie. "Citizenship, migration and formations of class in urban France." *Dialectical anthropology* 37, no. 3-4 (2013): 443-461.

Magnier, Bernard. "Haïti de Port-au-Prince, de Jérémie, de Paris ou de Miami." *Présence francophone* 58 (2002): 85-95.

"Major Dates in the Haitian Crisis with Haiti-Aristide." *Associated Press Worldstream*. July 21, 1994.

Margolies, Edward. *New York and the literary imagination: the city in twentieth century fiction and drama*. McFarland, 2007.

"Massacre reported in Haiti; Aristide Appeals to U.N." *Palm Beach* Post (Florida). October 4, 1991.

McCalpin, Jermaine O. "Truth and Freedom in Haiti: An Exmanination of the Haitian Truth Commission" The Global South 6. No. 1 (Spring 2012). 138-155

McCoy, Jennifer "Introduction: Dismantling the Predatory State—The Conference Report" In *Haiti Renewed: Political and Economic Prospects*. Washington D.C.: Brookings Institution Press. 1997.

McKay, Nellie M. "The Journals of Charlotte L. Forten-Grimké: *Les Lieux de Mémoire* in African American Women's Autobiography" History & Memory in African American Culture Ed. Geneviève Fabre & Robert O'Meally. New York: Oxford University Press. 1994

McKittrick, Katherine and Clyde Woods, Eds. Black Geographies and the Politics of Space. Cambridge: South End Press, 2007

Ménard, Nadève. *Ecrits d'Haïti: perspectives sur la littérature haïtienne contemporaine (1986-2006)*. KARTHALA Editions, 2011.

Merrifield, Andy. *Henri Lefebvre: A critical introduction*. Taylor & Francis, 2006.

Miller, Stephen. *Walking New York: Reflections of American Writers from Walt Whitman to Teju Cole*. Oxford University Press, 2016.

Miranda, Carlos Ortiz. " Haiti and the United States During the 1980's and 1990's:Refugees, Immigration and Foreign Policy. *32 San Diego Law Review 673*. Summer 1995.

Munro, Martin. *Tropical Apocalypse: Haiti and the Caribbean End Times*. University of Virginia Press, 2015.

Murdoch, H. Adlai. *Creolizing the Metropole : Migrant Caribbean Identities in Literature and Film*. Blacks in the Diaspora. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2012.

'National Press Club Luncheon with: Jean Bertrand Aristide, Exiled President of Haiti. Moderator: Gil Kein, National Press Club, Washington D.C." Federal News Service. June 28, 1994

Nesbitt, Nick. *Voicing memory: history and subjectivity in french caribbean literature*. Rutgers University Press, 2003.

Newsday New York. " Haitian Rebel lives in Queens fighting deportation for Alleged Crimes." July 15, 1997.

Nicolas, Lucienne. *Espaces urbains dans le roman de la diaspora haïtienne*. Editions L'Harmattan, 2002.

Nora, Pierre. "Between Memory and History: Les Lieux De Mémoire." *Representations*, no.26 (1989): 12.. doi:10.2307/2928520.

Nuttall, Sarah, and Joseph-Achille Mbembe, eds. *Johannesburg: the elusive metropolis*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2008.

N'Zengou-Tayo, Marie-José. "Unwelcome Neighbors: The Haitian Popular Migration in the Writings of Some Caribbean Writers." *Journal of Caribbean Literatures* 3.1 (2001): 129- 142.

Ogilvie, Jessica P."Roxane Gay is not Sorry." *Play Boy.* January 27, 2019. https://www.playboy.com/read/roxane-gay-is-not-sorry?utm_source=twitter&utm_medium=social&utm_campaign=native&utm_content=article

Orizio, Riccardo. *Talk of the Devil: Encounters with Seven Dictators.* Walker & Company, 2002.

Pamphile, Léon Dénius. *Haitians and African Americans: A heritage of tragedy and hope*. University Press of Florida, 2001.

Pierre, Hyppolite. *Haiti, rising flames from burning ashes: Haiti the phoenix*. University Press of America, 2006.

Pierre, Tevanian. "La République du mépris: Les métamorphoses du racisme dans la France des années Sarkozy." *Paris, La Découverte* (2007).

Polyné, Millery, ed. *The Idea of Haiti: Rethinking Crisis and Development*. U of Minnesota Press, 2013.

Prost, Antoine. "Monuments to the Dead" in Realms of Memory. V2. New York: Columbia University Press. 1997

Puig, Steve. "Quelques romans de l'exil post-duvaliéristes: le retour impossible." *Journal of Haitian Studies* (2005): 57-72.

Purcell, Mark. "Excavating Lefebvre: The right to the city and its urban politics of the inhabitant." *GeoJournal* 58, no. 2-3 (2002): 99-108.

"Reprend et Complete, Haiti-opposants et Haiti-amnistie." *La Presse Canadienne*. February 7, 1990.

Rhein, Catherine. "Globalisation, social change and minorities in metropolitan Paris: the emergence of new class patterns." *Urban studies* 35, no. 3 (1998): 429-447.

Rhein, Catherine. "The working class, minorities and housing in Paris, the rise of fragmentations." *GeoJournal* 46, no. 1 (1998): 51.

Richburg, Keith. "Haiti in Economic Morass; New Government Faces Legacy of Poverty and Despair." *The Washington Post.* February 18, 1986.

Richman, Kathy. "Militant Cosmopolitan in a Creole City: The Paradoxes of Jacques Roumain." *Biography* 35.2 (2012): 303-317

Rody, Caroline. *The Daughter's Return: African-American and Caribbean Women's Fictions of History*. Oxford University Press on Demand, 2001.

Rosenblum, Mort. "After 3 Years, Haiti's Jean-Claude Duvalier Blends into France. *Associated Press.* January 20, 1990.

Rotberg, Robert I., ed. *Haiti Renewed: Political and Economic Prospects*. Brookings Institution Press, 2001.

Rothberg, Michael. "Introduction: between memory and memory: from lieux de mémoire to noeuds de mémoire." *Yale French Studies* 118/119 (2010): 3-12.

Rothberg, Michael. *Multidirectional memory: Remembering the Holocaust in the age of decolonization*. Stanford University Press, 2009.

Rubin, Alisa J. "May 1968: A Month of Revolution Pushed France into the Modern World." *New York Times*. May 5, 2018. https://www.nytimes.com/2018/05/05/world/europe/france-may-1968-revolution.html

Said, Edward W. *Reflections on Exile and Other Essays*. Convergences. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 2000.

Schulz, Donald. "Haiti Update" *Strategic Studies Institute*. January 29, 1997.

Sciolino, Elaine. "U.S. Seeks Wedge in Haiti, Tying New Aid to Elections." *The New York Times.* December 1, 1987.

Shea, Renée H., and Edwidge Danticat. "Bearing Witness and Beyond: Edwidge Danticat Talks about Her Latest Work." *Journal of Haitian Studies* 7, no. 2

(2001): 6-20. http://www.jstor.org.proxy-um.researchport.umd.edu/stable/41715097.

Sierp, Aline. "Memory, Identity and a Painful Past: Contesting the Former Dachau Concentration Camp." In *Excavating Memory: Sites of Remembering and Forgetting*. University Press of Florida, 2016. 316-335.

Soja, Edward W. *Thirdspace : Journeys to Los Angeles and Other Real-And-Imagined Places*. Cambridge, Mass.: Blackwell, 1996.

“Sokol, Marlene.”In Haiti, nothing seems to work,” St. *Petersburg Times (Florida).* December 18, 1988.

Sokol, Marlene. “New Leaders met with mixed emotions in Haiti.” *St. Petersburg Times (Florida).* October 2, 1988.

Soyinka, Wole. *The burden of memory, the muse of forgiveness*. Oxford University Press, 1998.

Soyinka, Wole. “Voices from the Frontier.” *The Guardian*. July 3, 2002. https://www.theguardian.com/boks/2002/jul/13/poetry.wolesoyinka

Spargo, R. Clifton. *Vigilant memory: Emmanuel Levinas, the holocaust, and the unjust death*. JHU Press, 2006.

Stovall, Tyler Edward. *Paris noir: African Americans in the city of light*. Vol. 16. Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1996.

Suárez, Lucía M. "Breath, Eyes, Memory: Rape, Memory, and Denunciation." *Journal of Haitian Studies* (2003): 111-125.

Suarez, Lucia M. *The Tears of Hispaniola*. University Press of Florida. 2006.

Sutton, Jane. “Aristide urges worldwide oil embargo against Haiti.” *United Press International*. June 9, 1993.

Sutton, Michael. “Chirac’s Foreign Policy: Continuity-with Adjustment.” *The World Today*. Vol. 51. No. 7 (Jul 1995) 135-138.

The Atlantic “Medieval disease are infecting California’s homeless population” March 8, 2019 https://www.theatlantic.com/health/archive/2019/03/typhus-tuberculosis-medieval-diseases-spreading-homeless/584380/

Tearse, Graham. “Bid to Expel Baby Doc from Paris”. *Scotland on Sunday*. May 9, 1999.

"The Crisis in Haiti," *Department of State Dispatch*. September 19, 1994.

Thomas, Dominic. *Black France: Colonialism, Immigration, and Transnationalism*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2007.

Thomas, Dominic. *Africa and France*: *Postcolonial* Cultures*, Migraations and Racism* Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2013.

Tomlinson, Alan. "Stunned Haiti Finds Namphy back in command overnight; General Henri Namphy; Coup in Haiti." The Times (London). June 21, 1988.

Treaster, Joseph B. "Congress Plans Sanctions to Force Change in Haiti. *The New York Times.* May 15, 1988.

Trouillot, Évelyne. Mémoire aux bois. Paris: Hoëbeke, 2010

Trouillot, Évelyne, and Jason Herbeck. *Memory at Bay*. Translated by Paul Curtis Daw. Caraf Books: Caribbean and African Literature Translated from French. Charlottesville: University of Virginia Press, 2015

Trouillot, Lyonel and Nadève Ménard "Hallward, or the Hidden Face of Racism" *Small Axe*. Number 30 (Volume 13, Number 3), November 2009, 128-136

Trouillot, Lyonel. *Street of Lost Footsteps.* University of Nebraska Press, 2003.

Trouillot, Lyonel, *Rue des Pas-Perdus*. Actes Sud, 1998.

Trouillot, Michel-Rolph. *Haiti: State against nation*. NYU Press, 1990.

Trouillot, Michel-Rolph. *Silencing the past: Power and the production of history*. Beacon Press, 1995.

Ulysse, Gina Athena. *Why Haiti Needs New Narratives: A Post-quake Chronicle*. Wesleyan University Press, 2015.

United Nations Security Council. "Resolution 940" S/RES/ 940 July 31, 1994. https://www.securitycouncilreport.org/atf/cf/%7B65BFCF9B-6D27-4E9C-8CD3- CF6E4FF96FF9%7D/Chap%20VII%20SRES%20940.pdf

Vitiello, Joëlle. "Port-au-Prince: images littéraires des quartiers-bidonvilles et de leurs habitants." *Ponti/Ponts. Langues littératures civilisations des Pays francophones* 11 (2011): 91-107.

Wayne, E. A. "Haiti's calm could not mask explosive situation." *Christian Science Monitor*. June 5, 1988

Wayne, E. A. "U.S. debates nudging Haiti towards democracy." *Christian Science Monitor.* March 29, 1988

Wayne, E.A. " U.S. Takes firm line on Haiti." *Christian Science Monitor.* August 7, 1987

Webster, Paul " Le Pen looks to office with Chirac." The Guardian (London). April 21, 1988

Whitney, Kathleen Marie "Sin, Fraph, and the CIA: U.S. Covert Action in Haiti." 3 sw. J.L & Trade Am 303 Fall 1996.

Wilentz, Amy. *The Rainy Season: Haiti since Duvalier.* Simon &Schuster Paperbacks. (1989)

Williams, Dan "Haiti, bloody Haiti Violence feed violence in streets of Port-Au-Prince." *The Toronto Star*. August 9, 1987.

Williams, Daniel. "U.S. Looks for Moderation in Aristide's Mixed Signals." *The Washington. Post*. July 18, 1994.

Youngblood, Shay. *Black Girl in Paris*. Riverhead Trade (Paperbacks), 2001.

Zephir, Flore. *Haitian immigrants in Black America: A sociological and sociolinguistic portrait*. Greenwood Publishing Group, 1996.

Zimra, Clarisse. "Haitian literature after Duvalier: an interview with Yanick Lahens." *Callaloo* 16.1 (1993): 77-93

Notes

[1] Zimra, Clarisse. "Haitian literature after Duvalier: an interview with Yanick Lahens." *Callaloo* 16.1 (1993): 78

[2] Zimra, Clarisse 78

[3] " The expression by means of symbolic fictional figures and actions or truths or generalizations about the human experience" See Mirriam-Webster entry on Allegory

[4] Abbott, Elizabeth Haiti*, A Shattered Nation* New York: Overlook Duckworh, Peter Mayer Publishers, Inc. 2011. 92

[5] Wilentz, Amy. *The Rainy Season: Haiti since Duvalier.* Simon &Schuster Paperbacks. (1989). 83

[6] Gedda, George. "Shultz Praises Haiti's 'Extraordinary Progress." *The Associated Press*. August 16, 1986

[7] Gedda, George. "Shultz Praises Haiti's 'Extraordinary Progress." *The Associated Press*. August 16, 1986

[8] Williams, Dan "Haiti, bloody Haiti Violence feed violence in streets of Port-Au-Prince." *The Toronto Star*. August 9, 1987.

[9] Associated Press

[10] Associated Press

[11] Wayne, E.A. " U.S. Takes firm line on Haiti." *Christian Science Monitor.* August 7.

[12] For more on Reagan administration's Latin American policy consult Grace Livingstone's chapter "Reagan and the Central American Tragedy" in her book America's Back Yard: The United States & Latin America from the Monroe Doctrine

to the War on Terror. Also consider Greg Grandin's *Empire's Workshop: Latin America, the United States and the Rise of New Imperialism*

13 Sciolino, Elaine. "U.S. Seeks Wedge in Haiti, Tying New Aid to Elections." *The New York Times.* December 1, 1987.

14 "Sokol, Marlene. "In Haiti, nothing seems to work," St. *Petersburg Times (Florida).* December 18, 1988.

15 "Haiti-Aristide, Bgt." *The Canadian Press*. January 12, 1993.

16 "Haiti/Aristide: 'Titide' Ends Long Exile with Kiss." *IPS-Inter Press Service*. October 15, 1994

17 Sutton, Jane. "Aristide urges worldwide oil embargo against Haiti." *United Press International*. June 9, 1993.

18 "Major Dates in the Haitian Crisis with Haiti-Aristide." *Associated Press Worldstream*. July 21, 1994.

19 Girard, Philippe. R. "Operation Restore Democracy." *Journal of Haitian Studies*, 8. No. 2. (2002) 70-85. 72

20 Girard, Phillipe 72

21 "Major dates in the Haitian Crisis with Haitit-Aristide

22 Hallward, Peter 50

23 It is worth mentioning that this right around the time of Clinton's 1994 Violent Crime Control and Law Enforcement Act that provided millions to militarized local and state police. At this time Bill Clinton portray that although he was a Democrat he could be just as tough as any Republican when it came to maintaining law and order

and being tough on crime. There are definitely some interesting parallels between Clinton's international policy and rhetoric with his domestic policy around crime.

24 Hallward, Peter 42

25 Trouillot, Lyonel and Nadève Menard "Hallward, or The Hidden Face of Racism" *Small Axe* Number 30, Volume 13, Number 3 November 2009, p 128-136

26 Hallward, Peter 43

27 Hallward, Peter 47

28 United Nations Security Council. "Resolution 940" S/RES/ 940 July 31, 1994. https://www.securitycouncilreport.org/atf/cf/%7B65BFCF9B-6D27-4E9C-8CD3-CF6E4FF96FF9%7D/Chap%20VII%20SRES%20940.pdf

29 Hallward, Peter 53

30 Hallward, Peter 66

31 Hallward, Peter 67

32 Hallward, Peter 69

33 "Haiti: Human Rights Record of the Haitian National Police"

34 Hallward, Peter 54

35 Gollner, Adam Leith "Dany Laferrière, The Art of Fiction" *The Paris Review* No. 237, Issue 22, Fall 2017 https://www.theparisreview.org/interviews/7040/dany-laferriere-the-art-of-fiction-no-237-dany-laferriere

36 Danticat, Edwidge. "I am not a Journalist." *Create dangerously: The immigrant artist at work*. Vintage, 2011. 42

37 Danticat, Edwidge "I am not a Journalist" 58

38 Trouillot, Lyonel and Nadève Ménard 131

[39] Trouillot, Lyonel and Nadève Ménard 131

[40] Historically, being light skinned in Haiti is associated with being a part of the elite class.

[41] Carey, Henry F. 105

[42] Carey, Henry F. 105

[43] French, Howard W. "Gonaives Journal; The Bogeyman's Back, Striking Fear Into Haitians" *The New York Times*. Jan 21. 1994

[44] Asger Leth's 2004 documentary "Ghosts of Cité Soleil" follows rivalrous brothers Billy and 2pac, two Chimère leaders of opposing gangs. This film is mandatory viewing for a better understanding of the gang violence and politics of 2004.

[45] Trouillot, Michel- Rolph State Against Nation 228

[46] There are of course recent political texts that address Haiti's contemporary politics post-1986 and make occasional references to the Duvalier dictatorships. A monograph length text focused solely on the connections between Duvalier and the present does not exist. I am thinking of a book that would compare Duvalier, Aristide, and Martelly or Moise of the Tèt Kale Party (THK)

[47] Braziel 28

[48] Braziel 4-14

[49] Braziel 38

[50] Weheliye, Alexander 1-2

[51] Weheliye, Alexander

[52] Spillers, Hortense 69

[53] Spillers, Hortense 78

[54] Spillers, Hortense 75

[55] Regine Charles 148

[56] Fuller, Anne F.

[57] Nora, Pierre 8

[58] Nora, Pierre 9

[59] Nora, Pierre 12

[60] Rothberg, Michael 113

[61] Rothberg, Michael 131

[62] Nuttall, Sarah *Johannesburg: Elusive Metropolis* 197

[63] Boring, Nicolas. "*Refugee Law and Policy: France*. " Library of Congress Legal Report. March 2016. https://www.loc.gov/law/help/refugee-law/france.php/?loclr=bloglaw

[64] "Constitution of 1793." *Liberty, Equality.* http://chnm.gmu.edu/revolution/d/430.

[65] Conseil-Constituionel. *La Constitution*. https://www.conseil-constitutionnel.fr/les-constitutions-dans-l-histoire/constitution-de-1946-ive-republique. Original text: Tout homme persécuté en raison de son action en faveur de la liberté a droit d'asile sur les territoires de la République.

[66] Boring, Nicolas

[67] Rubin, Alisa J. "May 1968: A Month of Revolution Pushed France into the Modern World." *New York Times*. May 5, 2018. https://www.nytimes.com/2018/05/05/world/europe/france-may-1968-revolution.html

[68] Neil Brenner, Peter Marcuse, and Margit Mayer, Eds., *Cities for People, Not for Profit: Critical Urban Theory and the Right to the City* (London: Routledge, 2012), 5.

[69] Felman xviii

[70] Felman xviii

[71]Jean-Charles, Régine. "Beyond Truth and Reconciliation in "La Mémoire Aux Abois" and "Un Alligator Nommé Rosa." *French Forum* 38, no. 3 (2013): 148

[72] Rothberg, Michael "Between Memory and Memory: From Lieux de mèmoire. *Yale French Studies*. No. 118/19. Nœds de Mémoire: Multidirectional Memory in Postwar French and Francophone Culture (2010). 4

[73] Rothberg, Michael "Between Memory and Memory" 9

[74] Nora, Pierre Introduction *Realms of Memory* XI

[75]Brenner et al., *Cities for people, not for profit,* 5.

[76] Henri Lefebvre, Eleonore Kofman, and Elizabeth Lebas, *Writings on Cities* (Vol. 63, no. 2. Oxford: Blackwell, 1996.

[77] Lefebvre et al., *Writings on Cities,* 67.

[78] Lefebvre et al., *Writings on Cities,*167.

[79] Henri Lefebvre, *The Production of Space* (Oxford, UK: Blackwell, 1991), 85.

[80] Lefebvre et al., *Writings on Cities*, 34.

[81] Taubira law recognizing slavery as human right's violation introduced in 1998 and passed in 2001

[82] Felman 108

[83] Boinet, Thierry. "Jean-Claude Duvalier Waits It Out in Gilded Cage." *The Associated Press*. February 15, 1986.

[84] Boinet, Theirry

[85] Rosenblum, Mort. “After 3 Years, Haiti’s Jean-Claude Duvalier Blends into France. *Associated Press.* January 20, 1990.

[86] Rosenblum, Mort

[87] Agence France Presse. “L’ex président haïtien Jean-Claude Duvalier lance un appel à l’unité nationale” October 10, 1991. Translation: Such confrontations (foreign interference) are criminal and suicidal for the country. The solution to the current crisis must result from a concerted effort of the great institutions of the state with all sectors of national life, all forces seen in the country, a synchronization that must above all else ensure the erasure of all past differences, preventing the resurgence of confrontations and restoring, in reconciliation, a true national unity, without which Haiti has absolutely no hope for recovery or even survival.

[88] BBC Summary of World Broadcasts. “Politicians react to former President Jean-Claude Duvalier’s speech” May 2, 1997.

[89] Deutsche Presse-Agentur. “Ex-Haitian dictator to be tried as illegal alien”

[90] French political party founded by Antoine Waechter

[91] Tearse, Graham. “Bid to Expel Baby Doc from Paris”. *Scotland on Sunday*. May 9, 1999.

[92] Deutsche Presse-Agentur. “Ex-Haitian dictator to be tried as illegal alien” December 24, 1998.

[93] Associated Press. “French court throws out residency complaint against Duvalier.” May 11, 1999.

[94] Hargreave, Alex G. “The political mobilization of the North African immigrant community in France.” *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 14, no.3 (1991) 351

[95] Webster, Paul. “Le Pen looks to office with Chirac.” The Guardian (London). April 21, 1988.

[96] Alterpresse. “ Haïti-France : Décès du photographe, dessinateur et écrivain Gérald Bloncourt.”http://www.alterpresse.org/spip.php?article23716#.W94qRhNKg0Q

[97] Bloncourt, Gérald *Le regard engagé: mémoires d’un franc-tireur de l’image*, Bourin Editeur 2004

[98] Keaton, Trica Danielle, T. Denean Sharpley-Whiting, and Tyler Stovall. *Black France/France Noire: The History and Politics of Blackness*. Duke University Press, 2012. 3

[99] It is important to note that much of the scholarship around Paris Noir and Noir has been produced outside of France, inside the United States

[100] Stovall, Tyler XVI

[101] Amine, Laila. *Postcolonial Paris: Fictions of Intimacy in the City of Light*. University of Wisconsin Pres, 2018. 16.

[102] Amine, Laila. *Postcolonial Paris* 12

[103] Amine, Laila. *Postcolonial Paris* 5

[104] The Haitian Revolution. Haiti overthrew its white colonial masters a century earlier than other nations of African descent and ultimately had to pay the price for it.

[105] Jackson, Regine O. *Geographies of the Haitian Diaspora* (NY: Routledge Studies on African and Black Diaspora, 3, 2011, 122

[106] Jackson, Regine O., 123.

[107] Thomas, Dominic, *Africa and France*, 63

[108] Shay Youngblood, *Black Girl in Paris* (NY: Riverhead Trade, 2001), 17.

109 Shay Youngblood, *Black Girl in Paris* 78

110 Sylvain Laurens, "«1974» et la fermeture des frontières", *Politix* 2 (2008): 69-94.

111 "maitrise du flux d'immigration or immigration choisie," consult Kofman, Eleonore, Madalina Rogoz, and Florence Lévy. "Family migration policies in France", *New Orientations for Democracy in Europe* (2010). And Winnie Lem, "Citizenship, migration and formations of class in urban France", *Dialectical anthropology* 37, no. 3-4 (2013): 443-461.

112 Chirac, Jacques. "Jacques Chirac on French Population Issues." *Population and Development Review* 11, no. 1 (1985): 163-64.

113 Sutton, Michael. "Chirac's Foreign Policy: Continuity-with Adjustment." *The World Today*. Vol. 51. No. 7 (Jul 1995) 135-138.

114 Youngblood, *Black Girl in Paris*, 168.

115 Kandalaft, Abla. "The Growing Problem of elderly care in France" The Guardian. January 11, 2012. https://www.theguardian.com/social-care-network/2012/jan/11/growing-problem-elderly-care-france

116 Thomas, Dominic. *Black France*, 12

117 Braziel, Jana, Remembering Défilée: Dédée Bazile as revolutionary Lieu de Mémoire 76

118 Braziel, Jana Remembering Défilée 76

119 Lefebvre, *Writings on Cities,* 211.

120 Youngblood, Shay. *Black Girl in Paris*, 170

121 Youngblood, Shay. *Black Girl in Paris*, 175.

[122] Ayatollah Khomeini stayed in exile in a village outside of Paris while he planned to overthrow the Iranian Shah. Khomeini would return to Iran. Khomeini then set up his own dictatorship. Ganley, Elaine "Khomeini launched a revolution from a sleepy French village." *APnews.* February 1, 2019. https://www.apnews.com/d154664bcfed47e49b0ae0ff3648779c

[123] Edward Said, *Reflections on Exile and Other Essays* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 2000), 177.

[124]Said, Edward. *Reflections on Exile,* 177.

[125] Purcell, Mark. "Excavating Lefebvre: The Right to the City and Its Urban Politics of the Inhabitant", *Geojournal : An International Journal on Human Geography and Environmental Sciences* 58, no. 2-3 (2002): 99-108, 101.

[126] Youngblood, Shay. *Black Girl in Paris*, 169.

[127] Youngblood, Shay. *Black Girl in Paris*, 182.

[128] Felman 11

[129] Munro, Martin. *Tropical Apocalypse.* 72

[130] Munro, Martin. *Tropical Apocalypse* 72.

[131] Évelyne Trouillot, and Jason Herbeck. *Memory at Bay*. Translated by Paul Curtis Daw (Charlottesville: University of Virginia Press, 2015), 103.; Évelyne Trouillot. *Mémoire aux abois* (Paris : Hoëbeke, 2010), 153-154;

[132] Trouillot, Évelyne. *Memory at Bay,* 15 ; Trouillot*,* Original text : 22

[133] Marianne Hirsch, *The Generation of Postmemory: Writing and Visual Culture After the Holocaust*. *Gender and Culture* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2012), 5.

[134] Pierre Nora. "Between Memory and History: Les Lieux de mémoire", *Representations*, no.26 (1989): 12.

[135]Trouillot, Évelyne. *Memory at Bay*, 67. Original text 100

[136] Trouillot, Évelyne. *Memory at Bay*, 5; Original text: 7

[137] Trouillot, Évelyne. *Memory at Bay*, 5; Original text: 7

[138] Trouillot, Évelyne. *Memory at Bay,* 76. Original text : 113

[139] Trouillot, Évelyne. *Memory at Bay,* 76 ; Original text : 113

[140] Jason Herbeck, Afterword to *Memory at Bay* (Charlottesville: University of Virginia Press, 2015).

[141] It is perhaps not a stretch to imagine that the fictional dictator's wife would be in a publicly funded nursing home, given that 77% of elderly care in France was covered by the public sector in 2012 [Kandalaft, Abla. "The Growing Problem of elderly care in France" The Guardian. January 11, 2012. https://www.theguardian.com/social-care-network/2012/jan/11/growing-problem-elderly-care-france]

[142] Rhein, Catherine."The working class, minorities and housing in Paris, the rise of fragmentations", *GeoJournal* 46, no. 1 (1998): 51.

[143] Reading *ici-bas* more traditionally as here below [heaven] or here on earth would underscore a biblical allusion and connections to human sin that are also fitting.

[144] Trouillot, Évelyne. *Memory at Bay.*122

[145] Trouillot, Évelyne. *Memory at Bay.* 122; Original text: 182

[146] Trouillot, Évelyne. *Memory at Bay.*122; Original text: 182

[147] Martin Munro, *Tropical Apocalypse*. 77

[148] Chang, May Lee

149 Trouillot, Michelle-Rolph

150 Ogilvie, Jessica P."Roxane Gay is not Sorry." *Play Boy.* January 27, 2019. https://www.playboy.com/read/roxane-gay-is-not-sorry?utm_source=twitter&utm_medium=social&utm_campaign=native&utm_content=article

151 Ogilvie, Jessica P.

152 Freeman, John. "Roxane Gay" Bomb Magazine. July 1, 2014. https://bombmagazine.org/articles/roxane-gay/

153 Regine, Jean-Charles

154 N'Zengou-Tayo, Marie-José 376

155 Trouillot 1990, 171

156 N'Zengou-Tayo, Marie-José

157 N'Zengou-Tayo, Marie-José 381

158 Vitiello, Joëlle 94

159 Vitiello, Joëlle 97

160 Vitiello, Joëlle 97

161 N'Zengou-Tayo, Marie-José 384

162 N'Zengou-Tayo, Marie-José 384

163 N'Zenghou-Tayo, Marie-José 384

164 N'Zenghou-Tayo, Marie-José 381

165 Gay, Roxane An Untamed State 143

166 Hallward, Peter 65

167 N'Zengou-Tayo, Marie-José 389

[168] Freud, Sigmund. "'The Uncanny'" in *The Standard Edition of the Complete Psychological works of Sigmund Freud*, 243

[169] Freud, Sigmund 250

[170] N'Zengou-Tayo, Marie-José 389

[171] N'Zengou-Tayo, Marie-José 389

[172] Freud, Sigmund 244

[173] N'Zengou-Tayo, Marie-José

[174] Zimra, Clarisse 82

[175] N'Zengou-Tayo, Marie-José 394

[176] Weheliye Alexander 111

[177] The most defining characteristic for this character is the fact that he is infatuated with this co-worker named Laurence. His storyline follows him spending the night with Laurence during the political events and how the events short circuited their romantic chemistry

[178] Trouillot, Lyonel 53; Original text: 77

[179] Trouillot, Lyonel 53; Original text: 77

[180] Spillers, Hortense "Mama's Baby, Papa's Maybe: An American Grammar Book" Diacritics, Vol 17. No 2. Summer 1987. 67.

[181] Weheliye, Alexander *Habeas Viscus: Racializing Assemblages, Biopolitics, and Black Feminist Theories of the Human* 52

[182] Coverdale, Linda xii

[183] Weheliye, Alexander 50

[184] Roundtable: Writing, History and Revolution

[185] Coverdale, Linda xii

[186] Roundtable Writing, History and Revolution

[187] Coverdale, Linda xxiii

[188] Spillers, Hortense 75

[189] Fatton, Robert Jr. *Haiti's Predatory Republic*

[190] Trouillot, Lyonel 5; Original text: 16

[191] Trouilllot, Lyonel 5; Original text: 16

[192] Trouillot, Lyonel 6; Original text: 16

[193] Freud, Sigmund 237

[194] Trouillot, Lyonel 6; Original text: 17

[195] Trouillot, Lyonel 6; Original text: 16

[196] Necklacing is a form of torture where a burning tire is put around someone's neck. This moment was referenced many times by American politicians who were uneasy about reinstalling Aristide to power and frequently mentioned the practice in news articles that discussed Haiti and Aristide in the 1990s. Here is an example of an article from *The Baltimore Sun,* https://www.baltimoresun.com/news/bs-xpm-1993-10-21-1993294025-story.html

[197] Trouillot, Lyonel 25; Original text: 41

[198] Spillers, Hortense 67

[199] Spillers, Hortense 68

[200] Braziel, Jana *Duvalier's Ghosts 183*

[201] Trouillot, Lyonel 15; Original text: 27

202 The Catholic church is said to be the longest standing institution besides the military

203 Human Rights Watch, "Rape in Haiti: A Weapon of Terror" 21

204 World Health Organization, "Addressing Violence against Sex Workers" *Implementing comprehensive HIV/STI programmes with sex workers: pratical approaches from collaborative interventions* October 2013.

205 Trouillot, Lyonel 10; Original text: 22

206 Coverdale, Linda xxiii

207 Human Rights Watch, "Rape in Haiti: A Weapon of Terror" 11

208 Human Rights Watch, "Rape in Haiti: A Weapon of Terror" 7

209 Human Rights Watch, "Rape in Haiti: A Weapon of Terror" 12

210 Trouillot, Lyonel 33 ; Original text : 53

211 Trouillot, Lyonel 15-16; Original text: 28

212 Human Rights Watch, "Rape in Haiti: A Weapon of Terror" 3

213 Freud, Sigmund 242

214 Trouillot, Lyonel 16; Original text: 29

215 Freud, Sigmund 220

216 Trouillot Lyonel, 106; Original Text: 140

217 Trouillot, Lyonel 51; Original text: 75

218 Trouillot, Lyonel 31; Original text: 50

219 Trouillot, Michel Rolph State Against Nation 169.

220 Trouillot, Lyonel 35; Original text: 55-56

221 Trouillot, Lyonel 107; Original text 142

[222] Trouillot, Lyonel 106; Original text 140

[223] Weheliye, Alexander 76

[224] Trouillot, Lyonel, 20; Original text: 34

[225] Trouillot, Lyonel 79; Original text: 108

[226] The Atlantic "Medieval disease are infecting California's homeless population" March 8, 2019 https://www.theatlantic.com/health/archive/2019/03/typhus-tuberculosis-medieval-diseases-spreading-homeless/584380/

[227] Trouillot, Évelyne 122

[228] Gay, Roxane 48

[229] Weheliye, Alexander 86

[230] Weheliye, Alexander 87

[231] https://borgenproject.org/tag/income-inequality-in-haiti/

[232] https://www.accountabilitycounsel.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/08/WRC-Haiti-Minimum-Wage-Report-10-15-13.pdf

[233] Gay, Roxane 48

[234] Gay, Roxane 149

[235] Gay, Roxane 35

[236] Polyné, Millery, ed. *The Idea of Haiti: Rethinking Crisis and Development*. U of Minnesota Press, 2013. 260

[237] Gay, Roxane 32

[238] Gay, Roxane 43

[239] Gay, Roxane 34

[240] Gay, Roxane 106

241 Gay, Roxane 202

242 Gay, Roxane 106

243 Gay, Roxane 54

244 Gay, Roxane 55

245 Coverdale, Linda xxiii

246 Gay, Roxane 36-37

247 Gay, Roxane 37

248 Gay, Roxane 36-37

249 N'Zenghou-Tayo, Marie-José 387

250 Gay, Roxane 134

251 Gay, Roxane 136

252 Gay, Roxane 137

253 Gay, Roxane 138

254 Dessalines is an army general and important figure in Haiti's revolution.

255 Gay, Roxane 6

256 Gay, Roxane 234

257 Gay, Roxane 51

258 Braziel, Jana *Duvalier's Ghosts*, 58

259 Laguerre, Michel 120

260 Nicolas, Lucienne. *Espaces urbains dans le roman de la diaspora haïtienne*. Editions L'Harmattan, 2002. 20

261 Danticat, Edwidge *Breath, Eyes, Memory*, 34

262 Danticat Edwidge, *Breath, Eyes, Memory* 34

[263] Gay, Roxane 97

[264] Gay, Roxane 99

[265] Gay, Roxane 244

[266] Cole, Teju "The White Savior Industrial Complex" *The Atlantic* March 21, 2012 https://www.theatlantic.com/international/archive/2012/03/the-white-savior-industrial-complex/254843/

[267] Gay, Roxane 3

[268] Weheliye, Alexander

[269] Weheliy, Aexander 119

[270] Weheliye, Alexander 112

[271] Gay, Roxane 358

[272] Fanon, Franz. 37.

[273] Gay, Roxane 131

[274] Carey, Henry F. 107

[275] Laguerre, Michel S. *Military and Society in Haiti* Knoxville: University of Tennesee Press, 1993 p105

[276] Trouillot, Lyonel 10-11; Original text: 22

[277] Fuller, Anne "A Young Duvalier and Haiti's Unremembered Past" *NACLA* February 12, 2019. https://nacla.org/news/2019/02/12/young-duvalier-and-haiti%E2%80%99s-unremembered-past-available-french

[278] Sierp, Aline. "Memory, Identity and a Painful Past: Contesting the Former Dachau Concentration Camp." In *Excavating Memory: Sites of Remembering and Forgetting*. University Press of Florida, 2016. 319

[279] Sierp, Aline 319

[280] Sierp, Aline 319

[281] Such as the National Museum of African American History and Culture, The Legacy Museum accompanied with the National Memorial for Peace and Justice,[281] Senegal's new Museum of Black Civilizations, South Africa's Apartheid Museum and Gaudeloupe's Memorial ACTe.

[282] Nora, Pierre. Realms of Memory, Volume III p.XII

[283] This is not to suggest that Haiti's amnesia extends to all of its history. The history of its revolution are constantly in circulation. To some extent, the memory of the first American occupation also reverberates within different discourses. Due to it proximity to the present, some of the more recent internal, factionalized violence has been forgotten.

[284] A future project might explore the most recent memorials that do exist in Haiti or Port-au-Prince. Since the country has difficulty erecting structures due to its constant instability, it would be intriguing to survey what public works have reached completion in the last 33 years since Jean-Claude Duvalier's exile. Another project might also consider memorialization around the 2010 earthquake. Likely memorialization for those killed by natural disaster is not as politically fraught as memorialization for those exterminated by their own government.

[285] Sierp, Aline 31

[286] Sierp Aline 325

[287] Fuller, Anne "A Young Duvalier and Haiti's Unremembered Past"

[288] Fuller, Anne "A Young Duvalier and Haiti's Unremembered Past"

289 Fuller, Anne "A Young Duvalier and Haiti's Unremembered Past"

290 Trouillot, Évelyne, *Memory at Bay*,122; Original text: Anonymes, oublié au fils des ans. Peut-être encores pleurés par le mémoire d'un proche, mais délaissés parmi toutes les autres victims de la dictature 182

291 Prost, Antoine. "Monuments to the Dead" In *Realms of Memory*. V2. New York: Columbia University Press. 1997. 308

292 Prost, Antoine. 309

293 Prost, Antoine. 309

294 Prost, Antoine 330

295 Etienne, Harly 169

296 This of course only applies to *some* communities. Marginalized communities have always existed, even within some of the most egalitarian seeming societies. For those communities government has been often been both predatory and neglectful. One only has to turn to the history of disabilities studies or ethnic studies to see this.

297 Etienne, Harly 169

298 Etienne, Harly

299 Etienne, Harly 174

300 Carey, Henry F. "The Third U.S. Intervention and Haiti's Paramilitary Predicament." *The Journal of Haitian Studies*, Vol 11 No 1. 2005

301 Hallward, Peter. *Damming the flood: Haiti, Aristide, and the politics of containment*. Verso, 2007. 65

302 Human Rights Watch and National Coalition for Haitian Refugees, "Rape in Haiti: A Weapon of Terror" July 1994

303 Consult Michael J. Dash's *Haiti and the United States: National Stereotypes and the Literary Imagination*, Charles Arthur and Michael Dash's *A Haiti Anthology: Libète*, Regine Jackson's *Geographies of the Haitian diaspora* and Flore Zephir's *Haitian Immigrants in Black America: A Sociological and Sociolinguistic Portrait*. Most of these weigh heavier on the historical and sociological side rather than the literary.

304 Griffin, Farah Jasmine. *" Who Set You Flowin'?": The African-American Migration Narrative*. Oxford University Press, 1996. 3

305 Claude McKay's *Home to Harlem*, Jesse Faussett's *Plum Bun,* Nella Larsen's *Passing*

306 Michel Fabre's *From Harlem to Paris, Black American Writers in France 1840-1980*

307 Danticat Edwidge, *Create Dangerously* 49

308 Durham, Joyce R. "The City in Recent American Fiction: Listening to Black Urban Voices." *College English* 52, no. 7 (1990): 765

309 Felman and Laub, 79

310 Danticat, *The Dew Breaker* 20

311 Waisvisz, Sarah G. "Remembering Perpetrators: The Kuntslerroman and the Second-Generation Witnessing in Edwidge Danticat's *The Dew Breaker*

312 Danticat, Edwidge *The Dew Breaker* 162

313 Danticat, *The Dew Breaker* 109

314 Fuchs, Rebecca. "Hiding and Exposing Violence: Euphemisms in Edwidge Danticat's *The Dew Breaker*. L'Érudit Franco-Espangol, Volume 7, Spring 2015. 52

[315] Danticat, Edwidge 107

[316] Danticat, Edwidge 108

[317] Danticat, Edwidge 116

[318] Danticat, *The Dew Breaker 193*

[319] Danticat, *The Dew Breaker 193*

[320] Danticat, *The Dew Breaker 193*

[321] Danticat, *The Dew Breaker 199*

[322] Danticat, *The Dew Breaker* 5

[323] Danticat, The Dew Breaker

[324] Danticat, *The Dew Breaker* 17

[325] Ulysse, Gina 11

[326] Nora, Pierre Foreward

[327] Barstow, David "The Louima Case: The Overview; Officer, Seeking Some Mercy Admits to Louima's Torture" The New York Times. May 26, 1999. https://www.nytimes.com/1999/05/26/nyregion/louima-case-overview-officer-seeking-some-mercy-admits-louima-s-torture.html

[328] Danticat, Edwidge *The Dew Breaker* 47

[329] Shea, Renée H., and Edwidge Danticat. "Bearing Witness and Beyond: Edwidge Danticat Talks about Her Latest Work." *Journal of Haitian Studies* 7, no. 2 (2001): 18-19. http://www.jstor.org.proxy-um.researchport.umd.edu/stable/41715097.

[330] Shaya, George 47

[331] Vermeulen, Pieter 47

[332] Felman and Laub 81

[333] Felman and Laub 82

[334] Cole, Teju, Open City 6

[336] Cole, Teju 26

[337] Cole, Teju 26

[338] Cole, Teju 165

[339] Cole, Teju 165

[340] Cole, Teju, 44

[341] Cole, Teju 64

[342] Cole, Teju 70

[343] Danticat, Edwidge *The Dew Breaker* 21

[344] Cole, Teju, *Open City* 72

[345] Cole, Teju, *Open City* 21

[346] Cole, Teju, *Open City* 21

[347] Etienne, Harley 166

[348] Etienne, Harley 171

[349] Etienne, Harley 171

[350] McCoy, 16

[351] Danticat, Edwidge, *Haiti Noir* 12

[352] Munro, Martin 37

[353] qtd in Dubois 328 qtd in Munro, 37

[354] Fulton, Dawn 83

[355] Pearson and Singer, 3.

[356] Fulton, Dawn 83

[357] Higginson, 19

[358] Villalba, 5

[359] Villalba, 5

[360] N'Zengou-Tayo, Marie-José 389

[361] Nuttall 2008, 197

[362] Villalba, Marie-José 1

[363] Fulton. Dawn 2014, 83

[364] Kolbe, Athene and Robert Muggah. "Opinion: Haiti's Troubles Must Not Be Forgotten." *NPR*. March 4, 2019. https://www.npr.org/2019/03/04/699001166/opinion-haitis-troubles-must-not-be-forgotten

[365] Karas, Tania. "With no Carnival, Haitian Musicians lose more than their stage." *PRI.* March 06, 2019. https://www.pri.org/stories/2019-03-06/no-carnival-haiti-s-musicians-lose-more-their-stage

[366] Beckett, Greg "Haiti at the Crossroads" *Nacla* March 6, 2019. https://nacla.org/news/2019/03/06/haiti-crossroads

[367] Beckett, Greg

[368] Ménard 8; Translation: "Foreign criticism considers exile as the dominant theme of Haitian literature"

[369] Trouillot, Lyonel and Nadève Ménard, "Hallward or the Hidden Face of Racism" *Small Axe*, Number 30 (Volume 13, Number 3), November 2009 128-136

[370] Kaussen, Valerie. "Violence and Methodology. Reading Aristide in the Aftermath of 2004." *Small Axe*. Number 30 (Volume 13, Number 3) November 2009. 149.

[371] Kaussen, Valerie 150

[372] Kaussen, Valerie 149

[373] Kaussen, Valerie 154-155

[374] Byrd, Brandon, "François Duvalier and the Muse of Martin Luther King Jr." *Black Perspectives.* January 15, 2018.https://www.aaihs.org/francois-duvalier-and-the-misuse-of-martin-luther-king-jr/

[375] Fanon, Frantz. *The wretched of the earth: The handbook for the black revolution that is changing the shape of the world*. Grove Press, 1964. 37.

[376] Kaussen, Valerie 157

[377] Kaussen, Valerie 155

[378] Kaussen, Valerie 160