ABSTRACT

Title of Dissertation: FROM IMITATION TO INNOVATION: A STUDY OF THE COMPLETE VIOLIN SONATAS BY GEORGE ENESCU, GABRIEL FAURÉ AND JOHANNES BRAHMS

Duo Shen, Doctor of Musical Arts, 2021

Dissertation Directed by: Professor James Stern School of Music

Each of George Enescu's three violin sonatas is in such a radically different style from the others that it is almost as though they had been written by three different composers. The first sonata is in a decidedly Germanic style, somewhat like Brahms. The second is even more decidedly in the style of Gabriel Fauré, with whom Enescu studied while at the Paris Conservatoire. In the third, he abandons tradition to a remarkable extent, going off on his own exploration of the Romanian folkloric style. This dissertation is a study of Enescu's violin sonatas in relation to those of the two older masters that he so clearly imitated.

By studying and performing the works of Enescu alongside those of Brahms and Fauré, one sees the subtle relationship between following tradition and looking to the future. This relationship is explored both within each composer's body of work, and by comparing the composers to one another. One can find that extraordinary innovation comes not from disconnection to the past but, rather, from firm rootedness in the past. This is a performance dissertation consisting of three recital programs and a written document. The three recitals were performed on the campus of the University of Maryland in the Gildenhorn Recital Hall and the Ulrich Recital Hall. Recordings of all three recitals can be found in the Digital Repository at the University of Maryland (DRUM).

FROM IMITATION TO INNOVATION: A STUDY OF THE COMPLETE VIOLIN SONATAS BY GEORGE ENESCU, GABRIEL FAURÉ AND JOHANNES BRAHMS

By

Duo Shen

Dissertation submitted to the Faculty of the Graduate School of the University of Maryland, College Park, in partial fulfillment Of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Musical Arts 2021

Advisory Committee:

Professor James Stern, Chair Professor Rita Slone Professor Irina Muresanu Professor Mark E. Wilson Professor Robert Hunt Sprinkle, Dean's Representative © Copyright by Duo Shen 2021 To all the musicians who are trying to make a difference.

Acknowledgements

This dissertation would not have been possible without the dedication and support of many individuals. I cannot begin to express my deepest gratitude and thanks to my dearest advisor, Dr. James Stern, whose guidance and endless support helps me through so many ups and downs while I was pursuing this degree. Without his help, this dissertation project would not have happened. Additional acknowledgment is due to the member of my committee, Professor Rita Slone, Dr. Irina Muresanu, Dr. Mark E. Wilson, and Dr. Robert Hunt Sprinkle. During such an extremely difficult time for all mankind, their courage and support helps me to continue my work.

I am forever in debt to two amazing friends and musicians who made my recital possible: Dr. Elizabeth Brown, and Dr. Alexei Ulitin. They not only inspire me with their incredible talent but also support me with their invaluable friendship. And I am eternally grateful to have met them during my time at Maryland. Additional thanks go to dear friends Kyle and Christopher Koelzer, who host me at their loving home whenever I visit Maryland for rehearsals. I would like also thank Antonino D'Urzo who recorded these performances with amazing skill and support.

I would love also to express my deepest gratitude to professor Xiang Gao who brought me to the United States to start my musical journey thirteen years ago, without him, I will not be here. I will not be who I am without the love and support from my family. I want to express my deepest love and thanks to my parents, who support and believe in me no matter what obstacles life throws at us. They are my forever role models and I am a better person because of their love.

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements	iii
Recital Programs Dissertation Recital #1 Dissertation Recital #2 Dissertation Recital #3	v vi vi
Recording track listing	viii
Table of Figures	xi
Introduction	1
Chapter 1: The School Life	2
Chapter 2: Enescu's Violin Sonatas	4
Chapter 3: Fauré's Violin Sonatas	33
Chapter 4: Brahms's Violin Sonatas	46
Chapter 5: Conclusion	65
Bibliography	67

RECITAL 1 PROGRAM

December 7, 2019. 8:00 pm

Joseph & Alma Gildenhorn Recital Hall, Clarice Smith Performing Arts Center, University of Maryland, College Park

Duo Shen, violin Elizabeth Brown, piano Alexei Ulitin, piano

Sonata in D major for Violin and Piano, Op. 2

George Enescu

- I. Allegro vivo
- II. Quasi adagio
- III. Allegro

Sonata in A major for Violin and Piano, Op. 13 Gabriel Fauré

- I. Allegro molto
- II. Andante
- III. Allegro vivo
- IV. Allegro quasi presto

INTERMISSION

Sonata in D minor for Violin and Piano, Op. 108

- I. Allegro
- II. Adagio
- III. Un poco presto e con sentiment
- IV. Presto agitato

Johannes Brahms

RECITAL 2 PROGRAM

November 1, 2020. 8:00 pm

Joseph & Alma Gildenhorn Recital Hall, Clarice Smith Performing Arts Center, University of Maryland, College Park

Duo Shen, violin Elizabeth Brown, piano Alexei Ulitin, piano

Sonata in E m	inor for Violin and Piano, Op. 108	Gabriel Fauré		
I.	Allegro non troppo			
II.	Andante			
III.	Allegro non troppo			
Sonata in A n	najor for Violin and Piano, Op. 100	Johannes Brahms		
I.	Allegro amabile			
II.	Andante tranquillo – Vivace – Andante – Vivace di più – Andante – Vivace			
III.	Allegretto grazioso (quasi andante)			
INTERMISSION				
Sonata in F m	inor for Violin and Piano, Op. 6	George Enescu		
I.	Assez mouvementé			
II.	Tranquillement			
III.	Vif			

RECITAL 3 PROGRAM

April 11, 2021. 2:00 pm

Ulrich Recital Hall, Clarice Smith Performing Arts Center, University of Maryland, College Park

Duo Shen, violin Elizabeth Brown, piano Alexei Ulitin, piano

lajor for Violin and Piano, Op. 78	Johannes Brahms
Vivace ma non troppo	
Adagio – Più andante – Adagio	
Allegro molto moderato	
minor (from F-A-E Sonata)	Johannes Brahms
ON	
in A minor for Violin and Piano, Op. 25 ctère populaire roumain"	George Enescu
Moderato malinconico	
Andante sostenuto e misterioso	
	 Iajor for Violin and Piano, Op. 78 Vivace ma non troppo Adagio – Più andante – Adagio Allegro molto moderato minor (from F-A-E Sonata) ON in A minor for Violin and Piano, Op. 25 ctère populaire roumain" Moderato malinconico Andante sostenuto e misterioso

III. Allegro con brio, ma non troppo mosso

Recording Track Listing

First Dissertation Recital – CD 1

George Enescu, Sonata in D major for Violin and Piano, Op. 2

[CD1, Track 1] Allegro vivo [CD1, Track 2] Quasi adagio [CD1, Track 3] Allegro non troppo

Gabriel Fauré, Sonata in A major for Violin and Piano, Op. 13

[CD1, Track 4] Allegro molto[CD1, Track 5] Andante[CD1, Track 6] Allegro vivo[CD1, Track 7] Allegro quasi presto

Johannes Brahms, Sonata in D minor for Violin and Piano, Op. 108

[CD1, Track 8] Allegro[CD1, Track 9] Adagio[CD1, Track 10] Un poco presto e con sentiment[CD1, Track 11] Presto agitato

Recording Track Listing

Second Dissertation Recital – CD 2

Gabriel Fauré, Sonata in E minor for Violin and Piano, Op. 108

[CD2, Track 1] Allegro non troppo [CD2, Track 2] Andante [CD2, Track 3] Allegro non troppo

Johannes Brahms, Sonata in A major for Violin and Piano, Op. 100

[CD2, Track 4] Allegro amabile
 [CD2, Track 5] Andante tranquillo – Vivace – Andante – Vivace di più – Andante – Vivace
 [CD2, Track 6] Allegretto grazioso (quasi andante)

George Enescu, Sonata in F minor for Violin and Piano, Op. 6

[CD2, Track 7] Assez mouvementé [CD2, Track 8] Tranquillement [CD2, Track 9] Vif

Recording Track Listing

Third Dissertation Recital - CD 3

Johannes Brahms, Sonata in G Major for Violin and Piano, Op. 78

[CD3, Track 1] Vivace ma non troppo [CD3, Track 2] Adagio – Più andante – Adagio [CD3, Track 3] Allegro molto moderato

Johannes Brahms, Scherzo in C minor (from F-A-E Sonata)

[CD3, Track 4]

George Enescu, Sonata No. 3 in A minor for Violin and Piano, Op. 25 "*dans le caractère populaire roumain*"

[CD3, Track 5] Moderato malinconico[CD3, Track 6] Andante sostenuto e misterioso[CD3, Track 7] Allegro con brio, ma non troppo mosso

TABLE OF FIGURES

Figure 1 6
Figure 27
Figure 3
Figure 49
Figure 510
Figure 611
Figure 711
Figure 813
Figure 913
Figure 1014
Figure 1115
Figure 1215
Figure 1316
Figure 1417
Figure 15
Figure 1619
Figure 1720
Figure 1820
Figure 1923
Figure 2024
Figure 2127
Figure 22

Figure 23
Figure 24
Figure 25
Figure 26
Figure 27
Figure 28
Figure 29
Figure 30
Figure 31
Figure 32
Figure 33
Figure 34
Figure 3540
Figure 3641
Figure 37
Figure 3842
Figure 3943
Figure 4043
Figure 4143
Figure 42
Figure 4344
Figure 4445
Figure 4547

Figure 4647
Figure 47
Figure 48
Figure 49
Figure 50
Figure 51
Figure 52
Figure 53
Figure 54
Figure 55
Figure 5653
Figure 57
Figure 58
Figure 5955
Figure 6055
Figure 61
Figure 62
Figure 63
Figure 64
Figure 65
Figure 66
Figure 6760
Figure 68

Figure	69	1
Figure	706	3
Figure	716	4

Introduction

Each of George Enescu's three violin sonatas is in such a radically different style from the others that it is almost as though they had been written by three different composers. The first sonata is in a decidedly Germanic style, somewhat like Brahms. The second is even more decidedly in the style of Gabriel Fauré, with whom Enescu studied while at the Paris Conservatoire. In the third, he abandons tradition to a remarkable extent, going off on his own exploration of the Romanian folkloric style. This dissertation is a study of Enescu's violin sonatas in relation to those of the two older masters that he so clearly imitated.

By studying the works of Enescu alongside those of Brahms and Fauré, one sees the subtle relationship between following tradition and looking to the future. This relationship is explored both within each composer's body of work, and by comparing the composers to one another. One can find that extraordinary innovation comes not from disconnection to the past but, rather, from firm rootedness in the past.

Chapter 1: School life

As a child prodigy, Enescu was admitted to the Vienna Conservatory at age 7. He was the second person ever admitted to this historical conservatory at such a young age. The first was Fritz Kreisler. Although he was primarily admitted as a violin student, his training as an all-around musician started at the conservatory. When he first arrived at the school, he was placed with violin teacher Sigmund Bachrich for a three-year preparatory course. Later he enrolled in a full secondary course for three years. Although his primary study during this period was violin, he also made the first steps into the realm of being the all-around musician for which he would later be recognized. He studied harmony with Robert Fuchs, counterpoint with Hans Fuchs, chamber music with Joseph Hellmesberger senior, the violin with Joseph Hellmesberger junior, and the piano with Ernest Ludwig.¹ During his study at the conservatory, Enescu also met with Johannes Brahms. While studying at the Vienna Conservatory, he stayed with Hellmesberger junior, who was a good friend of Brahms. When Brahms visited the conservatory, Enescu met with his idol in his teacher's apartment. He played for the German composer and received advice on the cadenzas he was practicing.²

In 1895 Enescu traveled to the Paris Conservatoire with his father to meet and study with Massenet, who was professor of composition there.³ This is a clear sign that Enescu had decided to pursue a composition career at this point. Massenet thought very

¹ Malcolm, Noel. George Enescu: His Life and Music (London: Toccata Press, 1990), P. 42

 ² Ibid, p. 37. Although the source of the story was clearly from Enescu himself, Malcolm was skeptical with the story as it is quite unlikely Brahms would give instruction to a student with his teacher present. However, Malcolm believes that Enescu did meet Brahms in Hellmesberger's apartment.
 ³ Ibid, p. 47

highly of Enescu early on. When he heard Enescu's first "school" symphony, Massenet commented: "very remarkable, extraordinary for his instinct for development".⁴ In 1895, Enescu had his first public concert consisting entirely of pieces by himself. In 1896, Massenet resigned from teaching at the Conservatoire and was replaced by Fauré. Enescu recognized that Fauré, in some ways, was the opposite of Massenet; he was not a born teacher, but "he was inspiring and we adored him", as Enescu said.⁵ Fauré also thought very highly of Enescu. What began as a mentorship became a strong friendship between the two composers.

Enescu's early success as a composer was his *Poéme Roumain* in 1897 which he composed while studying at the Paris Conservatoire. This work became his opus 1, the first of his mature, serious works. This symphonic suite was composed with a Romanian program, using folk materials in traditional harmonic languages.⁶ His opus 2 was his Violin Sonata number one.⁷ It was composed in 1897 and dedicated to Joseph Hellmesberger junior. A year later, he composed his Cello Sonata opus 26, No. 1.⁸ He also composed the Variations for Two Pianos on an Original Theme, and a few pieces for voice and piano during the same year. In 1899, he composed his second violin sonata, an octet for strings, and an Impromptu for piano among other works. The second violin sonata and the octet mark a turning point for the young composer, as these pieces show him on the path of settling into being a composer with his own individual character and style. He also became a highly sought-after performer in Europe in the meantime. Later

⁴ Ibid., p. 50

⁵ Ibid., p. 54

⁶ Ibid., p. 61

⁷ Malcolm stated that during Enescu's first public concert, there was a violin sonata that was never published.

⁸ Ibid., p. 72 The First Cello Sonata shares the later opus number of the Second Sonata.

in life, Enescu started to conduct and teach while performing and composing at the same time. Because of his multifaceted talent, Enescu's involvement with other aspects of music as a conductor, a violinist, and a pedagogue significantly reduced his time in composition. Because of this amazing yet unfortunate reason, Enescu left the world with only very few published compositions.

Chapter 2: Enescu's Violin Sonatas

George Enescu's first Violin Sonata (1897) is not a piece that represents his full maturity, but it showcases his great potential. One can see strong influences from his Romanian heritage, German style, and French style writing. The outer movements show a debt to German style such as Beethoven, Schumann, and Brahms. The inner movement shows a certain connection to the French style music especially with the "quasi una fantasia" movement from César Franck's Violin Sonata. Enescu showcases his style by writing involved and imaginative piano parts early on in this sonata. In this piece, the violin often acts as a secondary instrument to the piano. Enescu also frequently writes tremolo bowings, which are more normally associated with orchestral writing. This suggests that he was imagining orchestral timbres and seeking to bring orchestral grandeur to this medium. One might argue that the youthful composer perhaps relied on the tremolo effect too frequently, and that the device is most effective when creating an aura of mystery as in the opening of the slow movement. In this opinion, the haunting slow movement is the most successful of the three. When Enescu visited Joachim in Berlin in December 1899, they played the piece together. Joachim then commented: "Why, it's even more modern than César Franck!"9

It is evident from the very beginning of the first movement that Enescu is thinking orchestrally and, specifically, in the Germanic tradition. Violin and piano combine in an orchestral tutti declaiming emphatic, evenly-spaced chords in the same character and

⁹ Malcolm, George Enescu, 72

tempo as the opening of Beethoven's Eroica symphony, also serving to establish the harmonic progression that is the basis for the whole movement.



The hemiola (bracketed) at the end of this opening sequence forecasts the prominent use of that element in the movement's second theme, while also providing the first of many examples of Enescu imitating Beethoven's and Schumann's approach to rhythm. Immediately following this fanfare, the violin imitates horns, introducing the dotted rhythm that will be a prominent feature of the movement and sustaining the dominant while the piano imitates pizzicato strings. The second theme and the closing theme both show remarkable resemblances to themes in Beethoven's Symphony no. 8. Figure 2 shows the similarity between the themes that employ a dotted figure in hemiola (and are even in the same key!), and shows that both works employ a ländler-like theme with a running eighth-note accompaniment.



Later in the closing theme group, one can see a tribute to Brahms symphony No. 3. (Figure 3).



One can also see the use of double-notes throughout the piece. This type of bowing is extremely common for an orchestral string section but is less often scored for an individual player as in a sonata. This adds to the impression that Enescu was thinking orchestrally. Robert Schumann, a leading German composer during the early romantic period, uses the measured tremolo quite often. (Figure 4)



When the lyrical theme occurs for the final time before the development section, it is in the form of a canon between the two instruments, reflecting the Germanic preoccupation with imitative counterpoint. Brahms also made use of this kind of texture in his Sonata no. 1 (Figure 5).



The second movement is, again, orchestrally conceived, this time with free tremolo by the muted violin providing a haunting atmosphere for the piano to introduce the main theme. Although this diaphanous texture suggests a French sound-world, the way Enescu develops motives is reminiscent of Brahms. For one example of Brahmsian motivic development in this movement, at mm. 25–26 the piano introduces a tragically espressivo motif. This gesture is soon borrowed by the violin, developing into a sighing gesture at measure 37. The same gesture is developed into the new theme at measure 45 by the piano. But at this point the mood has been transformed from tragic to heavenly. The violin line that soars above this is not motivically related to anything else in the movement, but this is what gives it its sense of coming from a place above (figure 6).



The opening theme of the third movement is derived from the espressivo theme of the second movement in a decidedly Brahmsian use of cyclical form and motivic development (Figure 7).



Enescu composed his Second Violin Sonata (1899) two years after the first one. At that time, Fauré had become Enescu's composition teacher after Massenet resigned in 1897. After dedicating his first Violin Sonata to his former violin teacher, Enescu swiftly merged his vocabulary with that of Fauré in his second Violin Sonata. Considering that the second sonata, with its remarkable change of style, was composed only two years after the first sonata, the stylistic change cannot be accounted for by the normal course of artistic evolution, and must have involved some conscious intention, carried out with admirable skill. As Malcolm elegantly put it:

At best one might say that Fauré's musical language gave Enescu resources which were suited to his needs: linear fluency, sonorous but delicate keyboard textures and an elliptical harmonic idiom in which hints of chromatic voluptuousness could suddenly be transformed, chastened or rendered poignant by modal progressions and cadences.¹⁰

Enescu, with exaggerated modesty, considered the second violin sonata as his first masterpiece.¹¹ This is also a piece in which he claimed to have found his voice. As he said to Gavoty: "I felt that I was developing rapidly, that I was becoming myself."¹² It is true that we can see Enescu's individuality emerging in the musical language. However, we can still see a significant influence from Fauré in many different ways. Of the three sonatas, this one is by far the most ambitious in terms of its imaginative use of cyclical, thematic connections between movements, often with the purpose of transforming the character of a theme. It is arguable whether this is evidence of outside influence on Enescu, but he did certainly have earlier models to follow, including Brahms and Franck.

¹⁰ Noel Malcolm, pp. 76-77

¹¹ Bentoiu, Pascal. *Masterworks of George Enescu: a detailed analysis* (Lanham, Toronto, Plymouth, UK: The Scarecrow Press, INC.). p. 1

¹² Noel Malcolm, p. 82

The mysterious pianissimo unison that opens the first movement, *Assez mouvementé*, provides motivic material for all three movements of this highly cyclic sonata. This type of monody plays an extremely important role in Enescu's compositions in general.



The legato quarters are metrically ambiguous to the listener until the accents in measure 2 establish the basic pulse. Measures 8 and 9 fully establish the compound triple meter. At the first climax (rehearsal [1]), Enescu uses one of Brahms's characteristic rhythmic devices, the hemiola, to amplify the tension. An accompanimental figure in the violin— double notes connected by syncopated slurs—may have been inspired by a similar passage in Fauré's first sonata, since it is such an unusual texture (Figure 9).



While Fauré uses it to create a novel accompaniment to one of the sonata's themes in the development section, Enescu uses it to combine two existing themes in surprising

counterpoint. Enescu also borrows a signature compositional style from his teacher Fauré: *moto perpetuo*. After the initial statement, the continuous running notes hardly ever stop until the coda where the beginning theme returns one last time. The constant running eighth and sixteenth notes create a sense of evolving texture in this movement as it achieves the same effect in both of Fauré's sonatas.

The second movement *Tranquillement* has several remarkable elements in itself. One of these is that it retains the same key as the first movement (F minor) where one would normally expect a contrasting key. What this accomplishes here is a sense of continuity, suggesting that the second movement is a mere continuation of the first. If we need proof that this is part of Enescu's overall concept, we need only look at the end of the movement, a sadly wandering violin cadenza, ending on a long A minor chord which is then precisely repeated as the energetic pick-up to the jaunty third movement (Figure 10).



The opening melody of the second movement seems to sing of agony and heaviness, with a distinctive Romanian folkloric element.



The melody finishes by quoting the haunting main theme of the first movement (Figure

12).



It is remarkable that this very same melody will appear in the left hand of the piano as part of a joyous hora in the third movement (Figure 13).



The inner section of the second movement's A-B-A form features a swinging motion in the piano accompaniment supporting a new theme in the violin part (Figure 14). This middle section builds an atmosphere of lush Romanticism and optimism in contrast to the desolate character of the outer sections. Nevertheless, the new theme is still haunted by a brief quotation of the music from the outer sections. If the second movement seems to depict irreconcilable conflict between the characters of these two themes, the third movement is revelatory in that it presents them together in counterpoint, as though demonstrating that they can be reconciled after all. The desolate and resigned music is transformed into determined and triumphant music in the third movement.



After a climax marked by intense chromaticism, this B-section calms down by means of a gesture in descending thirds that is directly quoted from the first movement. That this gesture is also quoted in the third movement is yet another example of the density of cyclical connections in this sonata.



While the first two movements show the most distinctive stamp of Fauré, it is in the third movement that Enescu's individual personality emerges the most. As one studies the movement, one can see a talented and mature composer emerging. Not only are the new themes of the third movement organically related to those of previous movements, but the form of the movement as a whole grows out of the themes. As with Fauré, Enescu's melodies help drive the plot of the drama and provide materials for the development. Even the conclusion of the piece relies on melodic development, a phenomenon we will later see in the examination of Fauré's second sonata. Enescu is particularly successful in his dramatic use of the unison texture. The way he employs this texture at the very end of the work, with unisons in quadruple piano circumvents the explosion of celebration one might have expected and instead brings great tension and

drama while, significantly, creating a sense of connection back to the beginning of the first movement.

After a long fermata, the third movement's joyfulness interrupts the loneliness that was generated by the second movement. Although the movement bears the key signature of F major, it actually begins in C major and evolves into F major by the end. It is in rondo form, full of contrasting materials that are tied together by means of the cyclic conception. Figure 16 shows how the primary theme is built out of transformed motives from previous movements.



The entire opening theme from the first movement reappears twice over the course of the third. The first time it appears as a grandiose declamation on the G-string of the violin, the formerly sinuous melody transformed into majestic whole notes. This is accompanied by staccato chords from the piano, four per bar (Figure 17).



At reh. 20, the piano breaks into a quick, eighth-note accompaniment, very much in the style of the popular Romanian song, *Ciocârlia*, about which more below. Above this, the violin presents another version of the unison theme from the first movement, very fast and in the major mode (Figure 18).



This pair of events occurs first in the key of C and then, much later in the movement, again in the key of F, employing the technique of sonata form that had been perfected by Haydn, Mozart, and Beethoven. Thus, the last movement not only provides a necessary
contrast to the first two, but also unites the entire piece neatly and beautifully. Seventeen years later, Enescu's teacher Fauré, in his second violin sonata, would use a similar technique, integrating elements from the first and second movements in the finale to create a synthesis. As Bentoiu said in his book analyzing Enescu's second sonata:

This finale, and actually the first movement as well, gave some useful ideas even to Enescu's venerated teacher (see Gabriel Fauré's Second Sonata for Violin and Piano, written seventeen years later in 1916).¹³

The third Violin Sonata (1926) is arguably George Enescu's best known work, apart from the Rhapsodies. However, the sonata goes far beyond even the Rhapsodies in its use of folkloric elements. As Enescu himself said in a biography: "I'm not a person for pretty successions of chords ... a piece deserves to be called a musical composition only if it has a line, a melody, or, even better, melodies superimposed on one another".¹⁴ The piece was named "*dans le caractère Populaire roumain*" which means with the Romanian character. Enescu himself said in an interview that he deliberately used the word character instead of style because he believed that the word style "implies something made or artificial, whereas 'character' suggests something given, existing from the beginning."¹⁵ This suggests that Enescu was merely giving voice to an existing folklore, rather than creating something original. However, it is important to know that unlike other composers who would use existing folk tunes in their music to create the folkloric

¹³ Pascal Bentoiu, p. 7

¹⁴ Malcolm, Noel. "Enescu, George." Grove Music Online. The Oxford Companion to Music. <u>https://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/grovemusic/view/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.001.0001/omo-9781561592630-e-0000008793?rskey=a80BWu</u>. (Accessed 5 June 2021)

¹⁵ Noel Malcom, George Enescu. P. 183

sense of character, Enescu used no quotation in this sonata. Furthermore, as Malcolm pointed out, Enescu invented not only the folk material, but also the entire language.¹⁶

In order to capture the spirit of the Romanian character in this music, Enescu developed a very special way to compose for the violin: extremely detailed instructions were written down throughout the piece. As a brilliant violinist himself, Enescu always knew what to write in the score to help the violinist understand his intention. Throughout the piece, he not only dictated the phrasing, dynamics and tempi as expected. He also dictated bowings and fingerings. By following these indications precisely, the violinist automatically produces a great variety of colors that traditional notations would not have specified. Enescu also wrote instructions on the timbre of the sound and the method of how to achieve it in the violin part. In the second movement, for example, he wrote: "flautato sulla tastiera colla punta del arco" which means "flute-like sound, with the point (tip) of the bow". Enescu also distinguishes different degrees of vibrato and different types of glissandi in the sonata. All of these details, combined with complex rhythmic notation and changes of tempo, create a feeling of intimacy and an illusion of improvisation. A listener might have the impression that the performers are, in fact, improvising and be surprised to find that everything is carefully dictated. As composer Bruce Adolphe said: "It has this improvisatory quality but every little thing is noted, more so than in almost any piece you'd ever find."¹⁷ It is important to know that many of the techniques and characters Enescu wrote in the violin part were adapted from

¹⁶ Ibid. p. 183

¹⁷ Adolphe, Bruce. *Inside Chamber Music with Bruce Adolphe- Enescu Violin Sonata No. 3*. Chamber Music Society of Lincoln Center. <u>https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=IaIhV_pAGNc</u> (Accessd 10 June 2021)

Romanian fiddlers. The fact that the piano part frequently imitates the cimbalom and the kobza,¹⁸ further contributes to the Romanian folk character of this music.

Although the key relationships of the first movement are not what one would expect, it is nevertheless in a very clear sonata form. A recurring melismatic motive initiates each phrase of the first theme group, mm1–26.



The first 14 bars of the first theme group recur starting in m73. With material redistributed between the instruments, and changes of meter, rhythm and articulation, the material is almost unrecognizable. However, an examination of the melodic shapes and the harmonic sequence shows that this is really the same material as the beginning, and m73 is a very clear recapitulation. The second theme, introduced by the piano in m27 (reh. 4), quickly finds its way to the key of G-sharp minor which prevails until the end of the exposition (m48, reh. 8). To place the second theme group a half-step above the key of the first theme group is a highly innovative take on sonata form, yet Enescu makes it work with a clear sense of logic. One must, again, marvel that in a piece which sounds so free and improvisatory, there is such a Classical logic to the way Enescu constructs this sonata form. The motive from mm. 7–8 of the violin part—a rising and falling scale spanning a tritone—and the motive from m9 of the violin part—a simplified version of

¹⁸ Pascal Bentoiu, p. 286

the melisma with a distinct rhythmic profile—form the basis of the development section (Figure 20).



Bentoius addresses the unique and innovative form of the movement thus:

The composer accomplishes, therefore, a *kind of rhapsody*, consisting of a large expanse of *song*, rather soberly commented upon (the development), followed by a large area of *dance*, and concluding with the lyric reminder of the principal outlines. But, the rhapsody, instead of continuously introducing new melodies, proceeds on a limited stock of themes and within the perfect proportions of a sonata form. If I am not wrong, it is a unique case in the worldwide repertoire.

The second movement Andante sostenuto e misterioso employs two varieties of

Romanian folk styles, the doina and the musical style of the Lăutari musicians,

exemplified by the song Ciocârlia. The word Lăutar, whose plural is Lăutari, refers to

the professional folk musicians that were located in Moldova and Romania. Most *Lăutari* never received formal musical training. Their repertory is passed on through the oral tradition.¹⁹ The *doina* is a lyrical improvisation with melodic elements and recitatives. It shares some characteristics with ballads, including their melodic and scalic structure.²⁰ *Ciocâlie* (Skylark) is a tune that was specifically used by *Lăutari*. The title lark may explain the many violin figurations in the song that sound like birdsong, as well as the portion of the second movement of this sonata that imitates *Ciocârlia*.

The movement contains four sections: a singing section in the *doina* style, in which the violin plays entirely in artificial harmonics, a central section that is in the *Lăutari* style, the return of the *doina*, and a coda section. It is extremely rare for a violin piece to use artificial harmonics for such an extended period as this movement does. Overall, the complexity of the piece is not only in its violin writing but also in the piano writing and in the way it delves into the *Lăutar* idiom.

When Noel Malcolm examined the copy of the work used by pianist Céliny Chailley-Richez, who recorded it with Enescu, he found that she had written "*crapauds*" next to the second movement, *crapaud* being the French word for toad. ²¹ Anyone familiar with how toads sing on summer evenings will recall that they do a rapid stutter on a single high pitch. In her notes on the score, Chailley-Richez may have been comparing the repeated B in the piano part to a toad call. This gives us an insight into what the

¹⁹ Vladimir Axionov and Yaroslav Mironenko, "Moldova [Moldova, Bessarabia; formerly Moldavian Soviet Socialist Republic] (Rom. Republica Moldova)". *Grove Music Online. The Oxford Companion to Music.* <u>https://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/grovemusic/view/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.001.0001/omo-</u> 9781561592630-e-0000042274?rskey=2qCf94&result=4 (access July 6th 2021)

²⁰ Porter, James, "Europe, traditional music of." *Grove Music Online. The Oxford Companion to Music.* <u>https://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/grovemusic/view/10.1093/gmo/9781561592630.001.0001/omo-9781561592630-e-0000040684?rskey=34PQMm&result=27</u> (accessed July 6th 2021)

²¹ Malcolm, *George Enescu*, p183

musicians might have been discussing during rehearsals: a vision of a Romanian summer night with toads singing in the background as the movement starts. By notating the repeated B in quintuplet sixteenths, and even beginning the sequence not on the beat, Enescu ensures that no meter will be discernible to the listener. The texture is such that the performers are not required to line up perfectly and, indeed, Enescu's own recording of the work with pianist Dinu Lipatti takes a great deal of liberty with the score. All of this frees the music from the squareness that would have been imposed by the traditional rhythmic groupings, and helps the theme be more freely expressed. The tonal center oscillates between B and D. In the opening statement, the violin's artificial harmonics suggest a shepherd's flute, and the calmness associated with that sound. Furthermore, the piano's ostinato, or "toad song" also passes as a typical accompaniment for a *doina*.²²

The central section is in the style of *Lăutari* musicians. It does not have a very clear beginning, partly because the new tempo is approached by an accelerando, and partly because the oscillating accompaniment of the *doina* becomes the polka-like accompaniment of the *Ciocârlia* by change of articulation. These changes occur at rehearsal [24], which may be considered the beginning of the new section. At rehearsal [24], Enescu uses three different ways of invoking the birdsong—the harmonics, the rapid, high-register pitch repetition, and the tritone trills (Figure 21).

²² A good example of this style of playing can be found on YouTube by Cristian Fatu: <u>https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=LFVMqvWkRjg</u> (accessed June 5, 2021)



The character of the song *Ciocârlia* is found not only in the violin part but also in the piano, which plays like a cimbalom.



The entire beginning of the section sounded like a fiddle player warming up in the pub before his concert.²³ The music gets gradually more impassioned. Three bars before rehearsal [27] the piano part imitates the sound of a cimbalom(Figure 23).

²³ Renard, Stanislas. The Contribution of the Lautari to the Compositions of George Enescu:



However, the *doina* is dramatically transformed. It is now fortissimo, the melody cries out with the violin's octaves on top of the stormy cyclone of the piano. Except for certain etudes that are designed to focus on octaves, there are very few violin pieces that require playing in octaves for such an extended period.

Quotation and Assimilation of the doina. D.M.A. Diss. University of Connecticut, 2012

The relatively limpid coda (4th bar of rehearsal [29]), while it returns to the calmness of the original theme, is, in other ways, quite different from the beginning *doina*. The opening *doina* is mysterious and unharmonized, while the coda is richly harmonized, soothing, and redemptive. While the original *doina* employed an exotic model scale, the coda recasts it in a major mode. It is heard this way twice, once in the key of B, and once in the key of G (Figure 24).



Perhaps as compensation for the violin introducing the opening theme of the second movement, the piano is tasked with introducing the opening theme of the third movement. This movement is full of energy and rhythmic vitality. Although Enescu had already employed a few dance characters in the previous movements (the recapitulation of the first movement and the central part of the second movement), this is no doubt the most exciting movement of the three. It is imbued with the spirit of northern Moldavian dances both in its melodic shapes and its rhythms. Figure 9 is a folk melody that was recorded in the Moldavian region of Câmpulung. It shows a remarkable resemblance to the opening theme of the third movement. Quickly after the introduction of the theme, the violin joins in to reconfirm the primary theme before taking the piece to theme A¹ at rehearsal [33] (Figure 25).



At this point, the violin starts to dominate the piece for a while before theme A returns so that the first section of the piece has the form A-A¹-A. In theme A², introduced at rehearsal [35], the piano becomes more active with extended sixteenth-note gestures while the violin sustains long, non-vibrato pitches (including a sustained "out-of-tune" pitch, halfway between C-sharp and D) punctuated with imitations of birds chirping that recall the Romanian tune "*Pe ulita armenească*" ("On the Armenian Street").²⁴

Everything up through reh. [40] is in the same tempo and texture, with the Moldavian dance periodically reappearing, which is why it makes sense to subsume all of it under the label "A". At rehearsal [40], the change is dramatic enough to warrant calling the ensuing section "B." The violin presents a theme in the form of a four-line stanza, each

²⁴ Poascal Bentoiu, p. 296

line punctuated by echoes of the piano's syncopations from the A section. Three variations follow the exotic pitch-field for this theme is shown in Figure 26.



The pitch B-natural forms the central resting point for this mode, which not only includes the exotic augmented second (from C-natural to D-sharp) but also divides the interval from A to C into two equal intervals by means of a non-western pitch that is halfway between B-natural and B-flat. This is but one example of the incredibly complex harmonic language that Enescu uses throughout this piece. He employs the Dorian and Phrygian modes when they suit his needs, but also combines and even invents scales when necessary to create the character he has in mind.

A complete recapitulation of the A section (reh. 44–51) is disguised with multiple variations on the original material, emphasizing moto-perpetuo-type virtuosity. All of the different themes of the A section return one by one, in the same order, but with increased drama and energy. Particularly memorable are the whistling harmonics added to motive A¹ which vividly call to mind a jovial, rural setting in which a *Lăutari* fiddler is performing. A wild coda, combines fragments of the various motives from the A section, presents a complete final statement of the B theme, and finally finishes the entire sonata with a thundering statement of a new theme, never before heard, that integrates elements of the A and the B music.

The entire piece shows the innovative ways that Enescu incorporates folkloric elements into his own language without any direct quotation. His way of making

30

traditional classical instruments imitate *Lăutari* and their music creates a new realm of sound to explore. The way he uses Dorian and Phrygian modes freely while sometimes combining modes shows a refreshing direction for tonality that he generates in his music. The way he generates his last movement in an A-B-A-Coda form is also departure from the Brahms's and Fauré's traditional classical forms.

Chapter 3: Fauré's Violin Sonatas

Gabriel Fauré's two violin sonatas almost bookended his career. The drastic differences in musical language between the two sonatas speak to his evolution as a composer. The first sonata uses traditional harmonic language of the Romantic era, within a Classical, four-movement, symphonic format. The second sonata, however, departs from that Romantic harmonic language. Although it remains tonal, it pushes the boundaries of tonality with extreme chromaticism, and fluent switching between tonal centers and modes, making an overall tonal center less evident to the ear.

The first sonata, in A major, op. 13, is an early work of the composer. Completed in 1876, it was his first published instrumental composition.²⁵ The score was not quickly circulated after being issued. By the time it became widely circulated, ten years later, Franck's Sonata in A was published and Brahms's Sonata in A, op. 100 was published a year after that. Although Fauré's op. 13 shares the four-movement symphonic format with many violin sonatas, it has many original details and subtleties.

The first movement, an Allegro molto, has a spontaneous, natural melodic flow. Despite its very fast, continuously running eighth-notes, it actually retains a relaxed, flowing feeling. The first theme is presented by the piano alone. It is immediately transformed and developed by the violin upon its entry, and the violin does not actually play the theme in its canonical form until the recapitulation, at which point it declaims it triumphantly as though it had been waiting for this fulfillment. This shows an interesting innovation of form, using the distribution of melodic lines between the two instruments to

²⁵ Beechey, Gwilym. *The Violin Sonatas of Gabriel Fauré*. The Strad 86, no. 1028 (December 1975): 559

create a layer of tension and expectation. This movement employs Fauré's trademark moto perpetuo texture. The constant flow of the eighth-notes creates the sense of an evolving texture, and also generates a cool and easy charm that underlines his long, effortless phrases.

The second movement is in the key of D minor, the minor subdominant of A major. One cannot find too many examples of this key relationship between the first movement and slow movement of a Classical or Romantic work in this form, and the relationship creates a distinctively tragic mood. This and the heartbeat rhythm produced by the piano combine to generate an unsettling atmosphere. Fauré shows his chromaticism and harmonic language beautifully in this movement. He combines the traditional classical ideas with his unique chromaticism language together to show the world it is possible to be innovative while following the traditional ideas. A good example of this is a chord progression from the second theme, mm. 35–42 (Figure 27).

but: $35 3,b 37$ b 4 - 0 - 0 + 0 4 - 0 + 0	38 0 0 0 0 0 0	39 (b)	40 40 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4} 10^{4}
Reduced harmonic progression (mm. 35–42)			
Figure 27			

Like any number of Classical phrases, this one accomplishes a motion from I to V. Instead of a direct motion between these closely related harmonies, Fauré takes a circuitous route. Chords that are distantly related, meaning that their roots are separated by many steps around the circle of fifths, are nevertheless smoothly connected to one another by means of chromatic motion. In measure 39, for example, the roots A and F are separated by four steps around the circle of fifths, while the root F is even more distantly related to the following root B, in measure 40, requiring six steps. Although these consecutive chords are harmonically distant from one another, Fauré has arrange the voice-leading so as to get from one chord to the next very smoothly by means of chromaticism. The overall emotional effect is as though we are experiencing a revelation, because each new chord has the element of surprise combined with the element of inevitability. Consistent with the feeling of revelation, the outer voices (mm. 39–41) move apart from one another, in chromatic, contrary motion, literally illustrating a space opening up and becoming wider, as though our vision is being broadened.

The third movement, Allegro vivo, is a true scherzo, with its quick tempo, humorous spirit, and A-B-A form. The unusual time signature of 2/8 or the parenthetical alternative "(1)" makes sense when one realizes these short bars sometimes occur in groups of three and sometimes in groups of two. Fauré's choice of notation saves him from having to constantly change the time signature back and forth. At the same time, the constant de facto changes of time signature contribute to the whimsical spirit of this scherzo. Fauré does notate in ³/₄ time from m98 to m109, where the violin's legato melody in quarternotes would look particularly absurd if it were notated one note per bar. This section, which makes a sudden turn to the remote key of D-flat, seems to place the instruments in two different worlds with piano continuing the quick motives and different groupings of beats, while the violin soars above in a relaxed and consistent ³/₄. The conflicting treatments of rhythm create a chaotic world that anticipates the contrast between the outer sections of the scherzo and the much calmer trio. In fact the outer section finishes in Dflat major while the trio is in F-sharp minor creates a beautifully seamless transition because the tonic of D-flat major becomes the fifth scale degree of F-sharp minor. This is

another example of Fauré's highly personal way of bringing the music from one key area to another.



The last movement, Allegro quasi presto, makes exuberant use of the moto-perpetuo element. This and other elements could have provided models for Enescu. The uninterrupted flow of eighth notes create an ever-evolving texture, while the violin melody floats on top. Figure 29 compares Fauré's use of this texture in the last movement of his first sonata, with Enescu's use of it in the first movement of his second sonata.



The passing of the torch from Fauré to Enescu can also be seen in the treatment of arpeggiated accompanimental figures, as shown in Figure 30.



Last but not least, the incredible chromatic passage in the development section of this movement (mm175–208) could also have provided a model for Enescu's second sonata.



Fauré's Second Violin Sonata in E minor, Op. 108 (1917) was the first of a series of chamber works that he composed in his last seven years of life.²⁶ The violin sonata was dedicated to Queen Elisabeth of Belgium.²⁷ The work displays a complex treatment of modality, as well as rhythmic language, the latter especially in the compound triple meter of the first movement. It also features a unique melodic style that pairs stepwise motion with wide leaps. Despite these modernist features, it contains some reminiscences of his earlier violin sonata.

The first movement, *Allegro non troppo*, is mostly in 9/8 meter. It contains five motives that Fauré uses to build the entire movement. The first motive comes with a marcato and rhythmic character, with a challenging the sense of triple meter by obscuring beats two and three with a hemiola (Figure 32).



This motive, introduced in a mysterious character by the piano playing in octaves, is reminiscent of the beginning of Enescu's second sonata, composed 17 years prior.

While motive 1 is emotionally contained, motive 2 gives way to an outburst of energy (Figure 33).

²⁶ Ibid. p. 569

²⁷ Kolb, Fabian. *Preface, Fauré Sonata No. 2 in E minor for Violin and Piano, Op. 108* (Germany: G. Henle Verlag). V



Motive 2 features scale-wise motion, converging in contrary motion, while the rhythmic displacement of the upper line translates to a feeling of being emotionally off-balance. The contrast between motives 1 and 2 propels the movement forward.

Motive 3 first appears at rehearsal [1] as a lyrical, melodic element (Figure 34).



Motives 4 and 5 are the first ones that Fauré develops over a long musical span that one may call them themes. They also both contrast memorably with everything that preceded them by containing moments of very simple diatonic sound, presenting scale degrees one through five of a major scale (Figure 35).



These motives also showcase Fauré's unique harmonic language. In m21, one can see a dominant chord in the key of B minor, which one expects to resolve to a B minor chord, with the A-sharp leading tone rising to B on the downbeat of m22 in the violin part. Instead, it does a surprising side-step into B-flat major, with the A-sharp changing enharmonically to B-flat as the harmonies change underneath it. The same treatment happens again at measure m24 where Fauré uses the common tone D to side-step into D major. These harmonic surprises are similar in spirit to what we discussed in the Andante of the First Sonata, but they are much less attached to traditional harmony, and feel as though they wander much more freely and whimsically.

In mapping this movement onto the conventional idea of sonata form, the pacing of the movement strongly suggests that m44, where motive 5 first occurs, should be called the "second theme." It fills this role in traditional ways by being in the key of the relative major, and by establishing a contrasting mood—*dolce tranquillo*—which is supported by the simpler texture and simpler diatonic harmony.



While the contrast of a first and second theme group suggest a sonata form, the traditional terms, "exposition," "development," and "recapitulation" do not truly apply here. One can however find four sections, labeled below as A, B, C, and D. The beginnings of B, C, and D are each marked by a return of motive 1. However, only A, B, and D present all five motives in order, and one can see that C is much shorter than the other sections. None of these can be given the traditional label of a "development" section, as development of the basic motives seems to occur throughout the movement.

A: mm. 1–56	B: mm. 57–122	C: mm. 123–146	D: m147–end

A highly unusual feature of this movement is the fact that the meter changes from 9/8 to 12/8, beginning at four measures before rehearsal [7], and remains that way to the end, basically constituting the entire D section.



It is possible that adding this extra beat to each bar provides more room for the composer to combine motives in ways that were not possible with only three beats.

Material for the second movement, Andante, is taken from Fauré's very early symphony in D minor. Written before the first violin sonata, the symphony was never published because some aspects of it did not meet Fauré's standard. The melody must have truly touched him though because, forty years later, he finally brought it to light in the medium of this sonata for violin and piano. While the steady eighth-notes of the piano accompaniment provide a sense of stability and calm, the surprising harmonic swerves, leading to the relative minor key of C-sharp minor, imbue the melody with tension and darkness. These contradictory elements give the movement a unique atmosphere.



In the second theme (Figure 39), marked *espressivo*, the piano retains its stabilizing role but with more activity, and the music begins to surge with passionate chromaticism.



The finale is a magnificent climb to joyous summits. It is as complex as the first movement in both texture and harmonic language, but it commences with a deceptively innocent and ingenuous theme:



The movement contains two additional themes:



The two returns to Theme A, first at m76 and then at m168, are both in the original key and character, suggestive of a rondo form for the movement. However, rather than introducing new thematic material between the A sections as one would find in a normal rondo, Fauré uses the same basic thematic material, themes B and C, and only varies his treatment of them. This is an interesting innovation on the rondo form.

Overall, the movement can be seen as being in three parts, the second and third parts delineated by the returns to Theme A. In the third part, Fauré brings back references to the first movement of the sonata. So an overall map of the movement would appear thus:

ABC - ABC - A (with elements from first movement) AB

A total of three motives from the first movement are brought back and combined with the third movement's primary motive. First there are the two opposing motives from the beginning of the first movement: the marcato motive (Figure 42, in the left hand of the piano):



and the contrary motion scales (Figure 43):



Then there is a triumphant return of the diatonic second theme from the first movement (Figure 44).



The way Fauré creates cyclical recurrences of elements from the first movement is highly reminiscent of what Enescu did in his second sonata. Both teacher and the pupil transform themes by bringing them into a new context and combining them. Only this time, the student was 17 years ahead of his teacher!

Chapter 4: Brahms's Violin Sonatas

When one compares Brahms's three violin sonatas, a few similarities emerge between his first two sonatas in G and in A. Both incorporate Brahms's own lieder either through direct quotation or recomposing of similar material. Both emphasize melodic or song-like material in favor of technically flashy writing. Major keys and a relaxed atmosphere predominate in both. Despite Brahms having begun work on the third sonata right after completing the second, the third sonata breaks away from the style of the first two with darker, stormier moods, a virtuosic style, and some innovations of form and motivic development. All three sonatas feature some of Brahms's trademarks, including moments of orchestral-style writing, rhythmic complexity, and cyclic treatment of motives. With regard to this last item, one can find many similarities between Brahms and Enescu.

Brahms violin sonata in G major was composed at Pörtschach in the summer of 1879. Part of the piece was a recasting of his two op. 59 songs *Regenlied* and *Nachklang*. Especially in the *Allegro molto moderato* the primary theme is a direct quotation of the *Nachklang* as shown in Figure 45. This close relationship between song material and sonata suggests Brahms's interest in writing an instrumental work that is, at heart, lyrical in core and transcendent through the piece.



Although the piece has borrowed materials from lieder, the sonata in G major really shines with its usage of cyclic materials. Brahms uses a simple rhythm of three repeated notes to develop not only a movement but also the entire sonata. This is in a very similar spirit to the way Beethoven used four notes to developed the entire first movement of his fifth symphony.



In the first movement the motive is presented in the opening, and even the second theme uses the same rhythm as that motive with the rests filled in.



In conventional sonata allegro form, the harmonic objective of a development section is to return to the home key. The thematic objective is to fragment and recombine themes. This development defies convention by immediately restating the opening theme in the home key, as though the exposition had a conventional repeat. The only way one can tell it is not the start of a repeat of the exposition is that it has been reorchestrated with the instrumental roles reversed.



The second movement is in ABA form. The B section, *più andante*, is brought back at the end, transformed in some interesting ways, to serve as a coda. In the Andante section, the

motive makes a drastic mood change, and turns into the funeral march starting from

measure 25.

Second movement funeral-march passage (B section) (mm. 25–28)	più andante pm.v. b t t t t t t t t t t t t t	
Figure 49		

In this movement, the half-step shift between the tonal centers (Figure 50) is a typical harmonic treatment for Brahms, and was later adopted by his admirers like Antonín Dvořák.

Second beat in D minor	Second beat in E-flat	Second beat in E minor
(m48)	minor (m50)	(m52)
Figure 50		

The transformation of the funeral march at m91 is an interesting innovation of form. It is no longer *più andante* which means that it is like a heartbeat slowed down to almost the point of death. At the same time, it is now in a major key and expresses fulfilment rather than unrest. To make this effect even more vivid, the violin line from mm. 32–34 has been slowed down to less than half-tempo (Figure 51).



Third movement begins with the same motive that was used in the first movement. With the endless sixteenth notes running underneath of the melody, generates an evolving energy.



The texture Brahms uses here illustrates the texts of his songs (Figure 53).

Distant echo	Rain Song	
Raindrops from the trees Fall into the green grass, Tears from my sad eyes Moisten my cheeks. When the sun shines again, The grass gleams twice as green: Twice as ardently on my cheeks My scalding tears will glow. ²⁸	Cascade, rain, cascade down, Wake for me those dreams again, That I dreamed in childhood, When water foamed on the sand! When oppressive summer heat Contended idly with cool freshness, And shiny leaves dripped with dew And crops turned a darker blue, How blissful then it was to stand With naked feet in the flow! Or to brush against the grass Or grasp the foam in both hands. ²⁹ Etc.	
English Translation of Nachklang	English Translation of Regenlied	
Figure 53		

In both cases, the uninterrupted sixteenth-notes in the piano part (eighth-notes in the original songs), and especially the texture created by the repeated notes, are illustrating the pattering of rain. The texts of the songs are worth studying because they illustrate the mood of this movement.

This movement is in rondo form:

A 1–28 B 29–60 A 61–83 C 84–123 A 124–139 CODA 140–end

The entire C section is a re-working of the main theme of the second movement.

²⁸ Translation © Richard Stokes, author of The Book of Lieder, published by Faber, provided courtesy of Oxford Lieder (www.oxfordlieder.co.uk)



The boundaries between sections are delineated by harmonic arrival, but motivic material spills over between one and another. In figure 55, m27 anticipates the primary motive of the B section. And mm. 53–60 motivically anticipate the return of the rondo theme.



Brahms's Violin Sonata No. 2 in A major resembles his first violin sonata in structure and in lyrical character. In addition, it too borrows some of its material from Brahms's own lieder of the same period, as he himself acknowledged. The second theme of the first movement is taken from the lied *Wie Melodien zieht es mir*, on text of Klaus Groth and later published as op. 105, no. 1.



Even apart from this borrowed material, large portions of the second sonata are song-like in both melodic and accompanimental figures.

In the first movement, *Allegro amabile*, Brahms introduces an original and innovative phrase structure by having the violin interrupt the piano at the end of its four-bar phrase. In addition to reinforcing the question that the piano seems to ask in its fourth measure, this creates a metrically asymmetrical five-bar phrase. The instruments then switch roles, and the lied-style writing escalates into the same kind of imitation of symphonic tutti that we earlier observed in Enescu's sonata no. 1. The second theme follows suit by building to a climax whose scoring and rhythmic incisiveness also suggests a symphonic tutti.



This figure becomes one of the predominant figures of the development section, and a source of driving energy and tension throughout the movement.

Although the material of the second theme is derived from a source outside of the sonata, it is nevertheless beautifully integrated with its new environment. Looking at the second bar of this theme, we can see that it is both rhythmically and melodically identical to the violin's "echo" in bar five (Figure 58).



This means that bar five not only served to respond to and emphasize the piano's phrase, but also to subtly anticipated the second theme.

Many works of this medium, including all of the ones treated in this study, follow either the four-movement symphonic format, consisting of sonata-allegro, slow movement, scherzo, and finale; or the three-movement concerto format, which omits the scherzo. In this second violin sonata by Brahms, a three-movement work, he introduces an innovation of form by alternating slow movement material with scherzo material in a single movement. This work is thus a hybrid of the symphonic and concerto formats.

The second movement *Andante tranquillo* has two elements that requires special attention. It has a rocking or lilting rhythm. The dotted figure with the 64th notes always occurs on a weak beat (Figure 59).



It has a distinctively pastoral quality. In mm. 2–3, mm. 5–8, and mm. 13–15, the use of drones is a universal symbolism for the peacefulness of a country scene (Figure 60).



The first two Vivace sections both have D as their tonic. The Andante sections that follow these respond by starting out in the key of D, but both return to the key of F. The final Vivace section is in the key of F. It is as though the Andante is trying to pull the Vivace back to the key of F and finally succeeds at the end. This is an example of using form to express reconciliation between two opposing characters.

The movement is also built on motivic relationship. The two themes from the beginning and the vivace are retrogrades of one another (Figure 61).



The Vivace also begins by echoing the intervals at the end of the Andante (Figure 62).


The extremely particular tempo marking of the third movement Allegretto grazioso (quasi Andante) perhaps reflects Brahms's desire to make sure the performers recognize both sides of its complex, dualistic character: on the one hand flowing and gracious, but with the parenthetical caution to make sure it is played slowly enough to do justice to its deep feeling. The movement is in a rondo form:

A (mm. 1–30) B (mm. 31–62) A (mm. 63–77) C (mm. 78–111) A (mm. 112–122) (truncated and in the key of the subdominant) B (mm. 123–136) A (mm. 137–end)

The low register of the violin's melody at the beginning matches the weightiness suggested by the parenthetical "quasi Andante," as well as typifying the dark, rich colors of Brahms's music. The first "B" episode of the rondo uses this same register of the violin to create a pianissimo, mysterioso quality, consistent with the rippling diminishedseventh arpeggios in the piano. The "C" section brings the highest level of drama and conflict of the movement. So much so, in fact, that the drama seems to spill over into the return of the "B" music, which has been transformed from pianissimo-mysterioso to forte-appassionato. Even the calm, final statement of the "A" theme is still haunted by the panting figure that was used to transition from the "C" section back to the "A" music.



Brahms started to compose his third violin sonata, op. 108 in D minor, during the same summer in which he completed the second (1886). However, he didn't finish the piece until 1888. It was dedicated to the conductor Hans von Bülow. In a departure from the first two sonatas, in both of which the major mode predominates and the three-movement format is used, the third sonata is in four movements and primarily uses the minor mode, making it in some ways share the solemnity and the storminess of the C minor trio, op. 101, also begun in 1886. Brahms's development of motives, and his use of

them to cyclically connect the movements, reflects the kind of creativity later to be found in Enescu's first two sonatas.

The first movement *Allegro* provides an interesting take on the expected sonata form. The combination of the violin's *sotto voce ma espressivo* and the syncopated right hand of the piano creates an atmosphere of instability and a mood of suppressed passion. The entire piece can be seen to grow out of motives presented within the first three measures (Figure 64).



Some of the motivic cyclical use examples can be shown in Figure 65 as well.



A pedal-point on the pitch A is sustained throughout the 46-bar development section, making the entire development function as an extended dominant preparation of the recapitulation. The development section also introduces new and memorable textures and figurations, especially the *bariolage* figure shown in figure 66, so that it is immediately recognizable when it is brought back at the end of the movement as a coda, this time with a pedal-point on D (Figure 66).



While bringing back the second theme group in the tonic key is the traditional basis of sonata form, to treat the whole development section as a kind "additional second theme," and bring it back in the tonic key, is truly innovative.

The second movement, in the parallel major key, is the shortest and formally simplest in Brahms's three sonatas. Its simplicity is part of its beauty as is the serenity which is so deeply needed after the anxiousness of the first movement. The first movement primary motive as well as the very end of the first movement both settle on the fifth scale degree rather than the tonic.



The second movement melodic line brings us down to the tonic at the beginning. Thus the second movement resolves what was unresolved by the first movement, which provides the sense of serenity.



Figure 68 shows how the opening motive in the piano is derived from the first

movement's primary motive (A) by means of inversion. In measure 25, this is placed in

the top voice, its role changing from accompaniment to primary voice.

Motive A from the first movement	Allegro.
Beginning of the second movement	espres.
Theme becomes melody (mm. 25–26)	
Theme continues to evolve through violin (mm. 29–30)	
Figure 69	

The third movement makes a clean break from the tightly knit unity of movements one, two and four, which are clearly related through their motives and sharing the same tonic. The movement is in the very distant key of F-sharp minor, separating it in spirit from the other movements. With its whimsical theme, and its A-B-A form, it clearly plays the role of a scherzo. Yet Brahms's qualifying the tempo marking with "*con sentimento*" shows his desire to express a dual character, possibly even a contradictory character. Somehow, the movement must be light-hearted yet also sentimental.

According to Malcolm MacDonald, the fourth movement, *Presto agitato*, is almost the last time Brahms ever effectively creates a *Sturm und Drang* atmosphere in his instrumental works.³⁰ This is the most extroverted writing among all Brahms's violin sonatas. The storm begins with the thundering crash of the piano's opening chords, and continues with the howling wind of the violin's expansion upon that opening motive (beginning m5) along with the pounding rain of the accompanimental figure (the violin's double-stops at the beginning, taken over by the piano in m5).

Right from the beginning, Brahms already starts recalling his materials from the first movement. The piano uses the inverted motive A with the rhythmic character of motive C in sequence. Immediately after the initial storm, the piano plays the motive B from the first movement as indicated in figure 70.

³⁰ MacDonald, Malcolm. Brahms (New York: Schirmer Books, A Division of Macmillan Inc., 1990), 336



This movement is a sonata rondo:

A: 1–38 B: 39–72 (in C major) C: 73–113 (in A minor) A: 114–133 D: 134–193 A: 194–217 B: 218–251 (in F major) C: 252–292 (This time in tonic key D minor) A: 293–end

Just as Brahms introduced the development section of the first movement with a set of syncopated chords (mm82–83 in the first movement), he uses the same idea to introduce the "D" section of this sonata rondo (mm129–133). In both cases, the technique lends a searching and uncertain quality to the beginning of the section. The "D" section of the last movement functions somewhat as a development by fashioning new themes out of fragments of old ones.



Chapter 5: Conclusion

After carefully studying Enescu's violin sonatas alongside those of Brahms and Fauré, we can clearly see a developmental trajectory in which Enescu traveled from imitation of the masters to innovation and the creation of his own style. His second sonata, though composed within only two years of the first, already shows a significant growth in maturity, and a drastically changed style due to his study with Fauré. The third sonata, which he composed at age of 45, shows a giant leap forward towards to a completely new style, emphasizing stylistic nationalism, and for which he invented his own Romanian folkloric materials based on the traditional character of Romanian folk music. When it comes to innovation, in the third sonata, he went further than both of his predecessors in terms of introducing folkloric elements into his music. This includes melodies, modes, harmonies, timbres, glissandi and other extended techniques, microtones, and unusual musical pacing. He went further than Brahms did in terms of a modernist approach to harmony. Enescu went further than Fauré in terms of motivic transformation and cyclical forms. But he did not go further in these aspects than Brahms, nor did he equal Brahms's formal perfection. Looking at Enescu's predecessors, we can see that Brahms never tried to adopt that distinctively French sensuousness that characterizes Fauré's music, and Fauré, although wonderfully free and intuitive about allowing motives to evolve, never seems to have tried to express things through the transformation of motives to the extent that Brahms did. That is to say, Enescu imitated both of them far more than they imitated one another, if at all, and it is in that particular dimension that he surpasses them.

Just as Enescu's evolution as a composer can be vividly observed over the course of his three violin sonatas, so Fauré exhibits considerable transformation in the 40 years between his two sonatas. The first, while it shows the bold originality of the young composer, remains firmly grounded in Romanticism both in harmony and in form. The second, by contrast, pushes the boundaries of tonality to such an extreme that, based on this facet alone, one might think one is hearing a different composer. However, the two works can be seen to show very much the same spirit in terms of texture, treatment of motives, sensuousness, and Fauré's distinctive moto-perpetuo style.

Johannes Brahms, as a true Beethovenian, considered by some contemporaries to be a conservative, showed his admiration for Beethoven by using many of the composition styles that Beethoven developed. However, as we see in his three violin sonatas, Brahms was not satisfied to merely imitate the master. In his music, he explored different ways of using and developing motifs, as well as innovative harmonic and rhythmic languages.

Sir Isaac Newton famously acknowledged his intellectual indebtedness to Robert Hooke by telling the fellow scientist, "If I have seen further, it is by standing on the shoulders of giants." All three composers that were explored in this dissertation grew out of a great tradition. The music of composers before them can be said to have allowed them to "hear further by standing on the shoulders of giants." Each developed a unique style over the course of their work. The eight violin sonatas that comprise this study make clear the process by which extraordinary innovation comes not from disconnection to the past but, rather, from firm rootedness in the past.

65

Bibliography

Axionov, V., & Mironenko, Y. Moldova. Grove Music Online. Retrieved 20 Jul. 2021, from https://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/grovemusic/view/10.1093/gmo/978156159 2630.001.0001/omo-9781561592630-e-0000042274.

This is a thorough description of Moldova with its musical culture. It contains two large sections: Art music and Traditional music. In the traditional music section, the author gave a detailed description of "*lăutari*" and the "*doina*". This article includes multiple lists of bibliography for each topic.

Beechey, Gwilym, "The Violin Sonatas of Gabriel Fauré." The Strad 86, no. 1028 (December 1975): 559–77

A movement-by-movement description of the sonatas dealing principally with their various themes which, in the author's view, are derived from each other or from the works of Bach, Beethoven, Brahms, Elgar, Franck, Mendelssohn, Mozart, Ravel, and Tchaikovsky.

Bentoiu, Pascal, "Masterworks of George Enescu: a detailed analysis" (Lanham, Toronto, Plymouth, UK: The Scarecrow Press, INC.).

This book presents formal analyses of George Enescu's significant works including his *Violin Sonata No. 2, Op. 6* and *Violin Sonata No. 3, Op. 25* with musical examples.

Brahms, Johannes, Sonaten für Klavier und Violine (Germany: G. Henle Verlag)

This is a volume of scores with separate violin parts of the Brahms complete violin sonatas as well as the scherzo movement of the F.A.E. sonata. The volume also includes a preface by Hans Otto Hiekel.

Enescu, George, Sonata No. 1 for Violin and Piano, Op. 2 (Boca Raton, Florida: Ludwig Master Music Publications, n.d.)

This is the printed score with a separate violin part for the George Enescu first violin sonata.

-----, Sonata No. 2 for Violin and Piano, Op. 6 (Boca Raton, Florida: Ludwig Master Music Publications, n.d.)

This is the printed score with a separate violin part for the George Enescu second violin sonata.

-----, Sonata No. 3 for Violin and Piano, Op. 25 (Enoch & Cie 193, bld Péreire 75017, Paris)

This is the printed score with a separate violin part for the George Enescu third violin sonata.

Fauré, Gabriel, Fauré Sonata No. 1 in A major for Violin and Piano, Op. 13 (Germany: G. Henle Verlag)

This is a printed score with a separate violin part for Gabriel Fauré's Sonata No. 1 in A major for Violin and Piano, Op. 13. The score also included a preface written by Fabian Kolb talking briefly about the history of the piece.

-----, Fauré Sonata No. 2 in E minor for Violin and Piano, Op. 108 (Germany: G. Henle Verlag)

This is a printed score with a separate violin part for Gabriel Fauré's Sonata No. 2 in E minor for Violin and Piano, Op. 108. The score also included a preface written by Fabian Kolb talking briefly about the history of the piece.

Hirsu, Vladimir Laurenti, "East Meets West in Enescu's Second Sonata for Piano and Violin, Op. 6." D.M.A. Diss., Louisiana State University, 1995

This dissertation split into three chapters: Enescu's life and work, the second sonata, and the conclusion. In the second sonata chapter, the dissertation focuses on formal analysis, discusses the Romanian folkloric characters, as well as the uses of cyclicism in the sonata.

Koechlin, Charles. "Gabriel Fauré" (London: Dennis Dobson Limited, 1946)

This is a book discusses Fauré's music in details. The book divided by the genre of Fauré's compositions: Songs, Church Music, Symphonic Music, Piano Music, Chamber Music, Miscellaneous Instrumental Pieces, and the Stage.

MacDonald, Malcolm. "Brahms" (New York: Schirmer Books, A Division of Macmillan Inc., 1990)

A detailed book follows Brahms's entire life and selectively analysis some of his work in detail to support the author's argument. The book includes some formal analysis of all Brahms's violin sonatas. The book also includes Appendices of the list of works and personalia of Brahms.

Malcolm, Noel, "Enescu, George." Grove Music Online. The Oxford Companion to Music.

This article outlines the life and works of George Enescu, with specific focus on the evolution of his compositional writing.

-----, "George Enescu: His Life and Music" (London: Toccata Press, 1990)

A book follows Enescu's entire life and his works. With both detailed historical background and analysis of each piece. This book also contains a chronological list of all Enescu's works with and without opus number.

Noh, Yuri, "a performance guide to George Enescu's violin sonata no. 3 in a minor, op. 25, emphasizing its use of Romanian *Lăutari* violin techniques and style" D.M.A. Diss., University of North Texas, 2020

This dissertation focuses on Enescu's third sonata and special characters and techniques that was used to build the sonata. It also has chapters dedicating to discuss the *Lăutari* and classical western violin playing and the specific bow techniques that was used in the sonata.

Orledge, Robert, "Gabriel Fauré". (London: Ernst Eulenburg Ltd, 1979)

This book discusses Fauré's life and composition in detail. The author divides Faure's life into three periods to talk about Fauré's compositions. Orledge also dedicates a chapter to specifically talk about Fauré's musical techniques which includes his uses of Harmony, Melody, Rhythm, Counterpoint, Texture, Orchestration, as well as form.

Rădulescu, S., -Sandu-Dediu, V., Şirli, A., & Moisil, C. Romania. Grove Music Online. Retrieved 20 Jul. 2021, from https://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/grovemusic/view/10.1093/gmo/9781561592 630.001.0001/omo-9781561592630-e-0000023736.

This is a thorough description of Romania with its musical culture. This article includes multiple lists of bibliography for each topic.

Renard, Stanislas, "The Contribution of the *Lăutari* to the Compositions of George Enescu: Quotation and Assimilation of the *doina*" D.M.A. Diss., University of

Connecticut, 2012

This dissertation focuses on the nationalism in music of Enescu. It also dedicates a chapter to discuss the identity of the *Lăutari* with their origins, history, oral and written traditions, Romani Folk Music as well as the Role of the Romani Musicians. The dissertation also provides analysis for several of Enescu's composition including his third sonata.

Zlateva, Maria, "Romanian Folkloric Influences on George Enescu's Artistic and Musical Development as Exemplified by His Third Violin Sonata." D.M.A. Diss., University of Texas at Austin, 2003.

This dissertation discusses George Enescu's life and work especially on how Romanian folk music influences his Violin Sonata No. 3 through a thorough analysis of the piece.