
#### Abstract

Title of Document:<br>Directed By:<br>PHILIPPE ROGIER (c.1561-1596): MISSA INCLITA STIRPS JESSE. A CRITICAL AND PERFORMING EDITION WITH PERFORMANCE COMMENTARY.<br>Philip George Cave<br>Dr. Edward Maclary, Professor of Music, University of Maryland, College Park


## The Dissertation

The dissertation comprises two parts: (a) a musical edition and (b) a performance given on 3 July, 2008 of Philippe Rogier's Missa Inclita stirps Jesse. The dissertation explores some of the editorial decisions required, how the demands of performers and musicologists differ, and whether they can be reconciled in one single edition. The commentary explains the preparation and realization of the edition. A video recording of the concert performance is attached to the dissertation.

## The Mass

The Missa Inclita stirps Jesse was published in Madrid in 1598 in a collection entitled Missae Sex. The mass setting is for four voices, except the Agnus Dei, which is for five, and is based on musical material in the motet Inclita stirps Jesse by Jacobus

Clemens non Papa (c. 1510-15 - c.1556-6). Rogier's choice and use of musical material from the motet (published in 1549) are discussed in the dissertation.

## The Edition

The edition is made from a microfilm copy of the Missae Sex held in the Biblioteca del Conservatorio de Musica "Giuseppe Verdi" in Milan. The Missae Sex was originally dedicated to King Philip II of Spain (1527-1598, reg. 1556-1598), whom Rogier had served as chorister and then maestro de capilla. Both Rogier and King Philip died before the volume was ready for publication. One of Rogier's pupils, Géry de Ghersem, prepared the volume, which was printed in 1598, dedicated to King Philip III.

## The Performance

The mass was performed at a concert of Spanish Renaissance music in St. Matthew's Cathedral, Washington, DC, on 3 July 2008, sung by the ensemble Orpheus directed by Philip Cave as part of the Chorworks summer workshop entitled Kings and Conquistadors: Music of Old and New Spain.

# PHILIPPE ROGIER (c.1561-1596): MISSA INCLITA STIRPS JESSE. 

 A CRITICAL AND PERFORMING EDITION WITH PERFORMANCE COMMENTARY.By<br>Philip George Cave

Dissertation submitted to the Faculty of the Graduate School of the University of Maryland, College Park, in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Musical Arts

2008

Advisory Committee:
Professor Edward Maclary, Chair Professor Peter Beicken
Associate Professor Shelley G. Davis
Professor Barbara Haggh-Huglo
Professor Richard Wexler
© Copyright by
Philip George Cave
2008

## Acknowledgements

I am grateful to all those who have contributed their advice and encouragement towards this document, and to the many musicians whose skill and passion have shone light on my path; to Edward Maclary and the faculty of the choral and musicology departments at the University of Maryland, College Park, and to the Rectors of the Parishes of Immanuel Church-on-the-Hill, Alexandria, Virginia, and All Souls' Memorial Church, Washington, District of Columbia, for the time and opportunity to pursue these studies; to Sally Dunkley, whose love of early music is indefatigable, and whose energy and enthusiasm for the music of Philippe Rogier has been hugely inspiring; and to Peter Currie, without whose help and encouragement this document would still be in note form.

## Table of Contents

Acknowledgements ..... ii
Table of Contents ..... iii
Chapter 1: Philippus Rex and Philippe Rogier .....
Music at the Court of King Philip II ..... 1
Philippe Rogier ..... 6
Rogier's Musical Style ..... 9
Chapter 2: The Missae Sex ..... 12
Description ..... 12
The Masses and Models ..... 13
The Missa Inclita stirps Jesse ..... 15
Chapter 3: Editorial Issues ..... 24
Critical Edition versus Performing Edition ..... 24
Note Length and Barlines ..... 25
Pitch ..... 29
A Balanced Approach ..... 29
Chapter 4: Performance Issues ..... 32
The Early Music Movement and Issues for Vocalists: More Questions than
Answers. ..... 32
Bowing and Blowing ..... 34
Singing and Signing ..... 37
Blend versus Bland ..... 54
Chapter 5: Performance Matters ..... 59
Programming a Concert Performance of a Mass ..... 59
Performance Commentary ..... 62
Preparation ..... 63
Rehearsal ..... 64
Performance ..... 64
Post-Performance Commentary ..... 69
Missa Inclita Stirps Jesse by Philippe Rogier (c.1561-1596): A Critical and
Performing Edition ..... 76
Texts and Translations ..... 131
Appendix A ..... 132
Appendix B ..... 139
Appendix C ..... 142
Appendix D ..... 146
Modern Editions ..... 148
Bibliography ..... 149

## Chapter 1: Philippus Rex and Philippe Rogier

## Music at the Court of King Philip II

In 1588, Philippe Rogier was appointed maestro di capilla by King Philip II of Spain (1527-1598, reg. 1556-1598) and became a member of the long and distinguished succession of Flemish musicians who had served the royal court in Madrid. Philip's father, King Charles V, had lavished money on music at his court: first as king and then as Holy Roman Emperor, he maintained one of the largest and most important musical establishments in Christendom. Music had been supported at the Burgundian court since the reign of Philip the Bold, Duke of Burgundy in 1364, and it was as much an important tool of state as it was a vehicle for great creativity and exquisitely produced manuscripts. Philip the Good (reg. 1419-1467), the great-great-great-grandfather of Philip II, required polyphonic music be sung daily in his chapel, and music figured prominently at chivalric and state occasions, such as meetings of the Order of the Golden Fleece.

Charles established his court in Madrid and spent little time in the northern part of his realm, which was governed on his behalf by his aunt, Marguerite of Austria and then by his sister, Mary of Hungary, as regents. Growing up in the court of his aunt, Charles was surrounded by fine music, and it is not surprising that he should have chosen many Flemish musicians to serve in what became known as the Flemish Chapel, or capilla flamenca. The prestige and wealth of Charles's court attracted some of Europe's finest musicians, and the capilla boasted among its
members at various times Pierre de la Rue, Thomas Crecquillon, Nicholas Gombert and Philippe de Monte. ${ }^{1}$

Charles was not only a keen patron of the arts, but he also realized that music could be an effective symbol of his power and authority. As his predecessors had done, the Emperor traveled extensively accompanied by his court musicians, and, although the capilla's principal duties were in the court chapel, music was also prominent at state occasions. Since the chapel was almost constantly on the road traveling with the king, the composers of the capilla flamenca could expect to have their music printed and performed across much of Europe. ${ }^{2}$

## In 1556 , Charles V abdicated as Holy Roman Emperor because of ill health. ${ }^{3}$

His son, Philip II, also established his court in Madrid, where he continued his father's tradition of bringing Flemish musicians to serve. Philip maintained the two existing musical ensembles: the Chapel of the House of Burgundy, known as the capilla flamenca, comprised of Flemish composers, instrumentalists and singers, ${ }^{4}$ and the Chapel of the House of Castile (the capilla española), consisting of mostly

[^0]Spanish instrumentalists who had been in the service of Charles V's wife, Isabella of Portugal.

Like his father, Philip II is widely regarded as a great patron of music, and according to Robert Stevenson, possibly "the leading international music patron of his age." ${ }^{5}$ Philip's patronage extended to Spanish, Italian and Flemish composers: he is the dedicatee of two volumes of masses by Giovanni Pierluigi da Palestrina (in 1567 and 1570); Francisco Guerrero's volume of Magnificats of 1563 ; Tomás Luis de Victoria's Second Book of Masses of 1583; the Flemish composer George de la Hèle's Eight Masses (1578), and Philippe Rogier's posthumous collection, the Missae Sex of 1598.

Various polyphonic choirbooks are to be found in the library of Philip II's great monastery and mausoleum at El Escorial, yet the question of precisely what type of music was sung there - and by whom - is not clear. Polyphonic music was outlawed in the statutes of the monastery's foundation:

And as for the other masses and hours and divine offices...we desire and expressly order that they be said and celebrated in plainsong and that there be no manner, neither in any day or feast, polyphony, and that for the remainder they be said and celebrated with the greatest devotion and calmness that would be possible. ${ }^{6}$

This ban may be a reflection of the fact that monastic houses tended to be more conservative than their "secular" brothers in the Cathedrals, where polyphonic

[^1]musical and lavish instrumental ensembles flourished. ${ }^{7}$ Nonetheless, El Escorial had three organs installed in the huge basilica in the late 1580 s, and the library contains the manuscript of Rogier's 12-part mass (Missa Domine Dominus noster). Each of its three choirs has a continuo part, and, looking at the Choir of the basilica, it is possible to imagine the three choruses of Rogier's 12-part music disposed around the large music desk, with at least two of the three organs being played. It is also tempting to speculate that Rogier's Missa Philippus Secundus Rex Hispaniae, with its musical tribute to the King running throughout, might have been performed at El Escorial. ${ }^{8}$

Although there is no indication that Rogier's music was sung in the basilica, and despite whatever light future research will shed on the status of polyphony there, it is clear that elaborate music was heard from time to time. In August of 1586, on the Feast of St. Lawrence, mass was celebrated in the newly completed basilica by the entire monastic community, the royal family and the capilla with "los ministriles, bajones e cornetas...con mucho canto de órgano e muy lindas voces con los órganos que sonaban celestialmente." ${ }^{9}$ However frequently the instrumentalists appeared in person, they were permanently in attendance on the painted ceiling of the Choir,

[^2]where a heavenly chorus and orchestra of great size, featuring a wide assortment of instruments, looks down on whatever music was being performed ${ }^{10}$

There is also evidence that some polyphony was sung by visiting musicians at the funeral of Philip II's half-brother, Don Juan de Austria. ${ }^{11}$ Interestingly, the visitors were reported to have sung canto de organo (i.e., composed polyphony) while the monks sang in plainsong (canto llano). Philip II's interdiction of 1567 against polyphony is quite unequivocal, and he restated it in 1592 , the reasons for which are not recorded. There is contradictory evidence from some archival material that suggests that canto de organo was indeed sung in the presence of the king in the basilica and that his prohibition was simply ignored. ${ }^{12}$ Given how precisely Philip dealt with the administrative details regarding the foundation of El Escorial, it is difficult to think this polyphony went unnoticed.

The apparent dichotomy between Philip's support of the capilla flamenca and its music on one hand, and the prohibition of polyphony at El Escorial on the other may simply be a reflection of the highly conservative nature of the monastery (and of their Hieronymite Order) and its iconic position with the King as its founder. Perhaps it was an acceptable compromise that members of the monastery community sang plainsong "en fabordón" - in some kind of simple chanted recitation - and that more able singers improvised around it. Michael Noone provides a reference to the monks singing polyphonic music (though admittedly, this takes place outside the monastery

[^3]itself). What is intriguing here is that the writer refers to this happening on July 26, 1575, St. Anne's day, the feast for which Clemens may have composed his motet and Rogier his Missa Inclita stirps Jesse. ${ }^{13}$

## Philippe Rogier

Little is known of Rogier's early life: he was born in Arras, now in Belgium, around 1561 and joined the Spanish court as a choirboy in June of 1572, when he would have been trained by the then maestro di capilla, the Flemish composer Gérard de Turnhout. ${ }^{14}$ It was the tradition that once boys' voices broke, they would then be given scholarships to return to Leuven for their university training and, usually, ordination to the priesthood. It is not known whether Rogier followed this path, or what university education he received, but he was certainly ordained and subsequently returned to the court in Madrid. His name appears in the dedication of a book of his motets in 1595 followed by the letter " $S$ " - the standard abbreviation for sacerdos or priest.

In 1584 , Rogier was appointed assistant chapelmaster (or teniente) to George de la Hèle, and the following year he took part in the court's trip to Zaragoza for the wedding of Philip II's daughter. De la Hèle died in 1586, and Philip II sent word to his agents in Belgium to recommend a replacement. Rogier, already in residence at the court, applied for the position, and although it was only after considerable delay,

[^4]in 1588, he was appointed maestro di capilla, in which role he led both the Spanish and Flemish chapels. ${ }^{15}$ Two years later, Rogier traveled to Belgium to find clergy, choristers and an assistant organist to replenish the chapel. ${ }^{16}$

There is little further biographical information about Rogier, but his reputation was sufficiently high for him to be awarded substantial benefices - honorary ecclesiastical positions which were in the gift of the King, and which provided additional income for the composer without any residential requirements. ${ }^{17}$ Rogier became ill early in 1596 and died on February 29 of that year. His influence lasted well into the seventeenth century through the work of many of his students; his compositions were still performed in the 1660s in Toledo, where copies of his music were bought in 1669. ${ }^{18}$

The prolific Spanish Baroque playwright and poet, Félix Lope de Vega de Carpio (1562-1635), wrote a tribute to many distinguished artistic figures in Spain, where he referred to Rogier as the "honor, light and glory of Flanders." ${ }^{19}$ The Flemish nobleman Jehan Lhermite was present at Philip II's court in 1590 and wrote "...

Philippe Rogier, maistre de chapelle qui fut un des premiers hommes de sa profession

[^5]de son temps. ${ }^{, 20}$ Examples of Rogier's compositional skill are cited repeatedly in the decades that followed his death by many musical theorists in Spain, Portugal and Italy. ${ }^{21}$

Although Rogier died at the age of only 35 years, a list of his compositions in the catalogue of King John IV of Portugal's library catalogue refers to some 233 works. Many of these pieces were destroyed during the great earthquake in Lisbon in 1755, and many more were lost in the great fire in Madrid in 1734. The extant pieces include only a fraction of his output. ${ }^{22}$ Copies of Rogier's music can be found throughout Spain, in Madrid, Valladolid, Valencia, Segovia, Zaragoza and Palma de Mallorca. He is also represented in instrumental collections in Lerma, in Florence, in Naples, and in the New World: in Puebla, Mexico. ${ }^{23}$

Géry de Ghersem, Rogier's pupil and the executor of his will, was overlooked as his successor and retired to the court in Belgium. Philip II appointed as his next maestro Martin Romero (nicknamed "Capitán"), another Flemish musician who had been among the choristers recruited by Rogier and a colleague of de Ghersem:

Romero was the last Netherlander to be maestro di capilla of the Spanish court.

[^6]
## Rogier's Musical Style

Rogier's music covers an astonishingly wide range, and his familiarity with and mastery of the various contemporaneous styles is as comprehensive as it is impressive. He is completely familiar with the seamless, cadence-less style established by Franco-Flemish composers, such as Josquin and Gombert. His music seems unusually poised for such a young composer, yet every now and again he breaks out of this sustained, controlled style into exuberant patterns, often in spiraling, descending musical sequences. This can be heard at the end of the Gloria of Missa Inclita stirps Jesse and is a major feature of another of his mass settings, Missa Ego sum qui sum, where Gombert's motet supplies Rogier with an abundance of material for exhilarating series of sequential repetitions. If this may be seen as linking to music of the past, Rogier also demonstrates he is familiar with the emerging styles of the early baroque. He wrote several polychoral works, including the 12-part Missa Domine Dominus noster and motets Verbum caro and Videntes stellam. Rogier's Laudate Dominum, an eight-part motet, might have come straight from the pen of a Gabrieli, with its alternating homophonic sections and strongly rhythmic figures. Several of these large-scale works have a basso continuo part for each of the choirs, and a part marked Guión (leader), that is essentially a basso seguente. ${ }^{24}$

Rogier was also a master of the motet, with an affinity for his texts and a keen awareness of how to make use of figurations that are both subtle and effective. His extant works include several funeral motets, setting words from the Office of the

[^7]Dead, and many of these pieces show Rogier at his most expressive, with an evident penchant for dissonance and unpredictable harmonic shifts. In the motet Heu mihi for example, Rogier sets the text quia peccavi ("by which I have sinned") with descending figures, illustrating the sinner's fall from grace; and at ubi fugiam ("whither shall I flee") he creates an effective sense of roaming by exploring a variety of scorings. Dominus regit me again displays Rogier as a master of both conservative and progressive styles, highlighting his ability to spin long passages without many primary cadences. The motet is in two sections: in the first Pars there is no real cadence until bar 29, and then the second is at the end. One of Rogier's best-known motets, Laboravi in gemitu, shows a mastery of subtle word-painting: the falling figure on gemitu (sighing); the streams of eighth-notes for lavabo (I wash); and the "drenching of the bed with tears" with almost constant patterns of eighth and sixteenth notes in the final section of the piece. ${ }^{25}$

Rogier's Latin music, with its sustained, controlled writing, makes for a musical experience that is demanding for both performer and listener, but also deeply engaging and satisfying. He was clearly also at ease composing both in Spanish (though all of his more than 70 villançicos mentioned in the catalogue of John IV's Library are lost) and in French (all but five of his 65 chanson settings have disappeared). ${ }^{26}$ Philippe Rogier undoubtedly had one foot clearly planted in the soil

[^8]of his Franco-Flemish predecessors - choosing Clemens non Papa as his model for the Missa Inclita stirps Jesse, and Gombert as another (in the Missa Ego sum qui sum) - but he also paid more than a nod to the more passionate outpourings of his adopted homeland, which one can hear in the music of Guerrero and Victoria. Rogier's interest in Italian music is revealed in his choice of a motet by Palestrina as his model for a more formal style of writing in the eight-part Missa In virtute tua. He was also clearly interested in the Venetian polychoral style of the Gabrielis, as demonstrated in his 12-part motets and Missa Domine Dominus noster and his ownership of copies of several works by Andrea Gabrieli. Douglas Kirk's recent publication, Music for the Duke of Lerma, contains transcriptions for the ministriles of several pieces by Rogier, which has added to the corpus of his extant music. ${ }^{27}$ One can remain optimistic that further discoveries may be made, which will further reinforce Rogier's position as a great master of late sixteenth-century polyphony.

[^9]
## Chapter 2: The Missae Sex

## Description

As noted above, both King Philip II and Philippe Rogier died before the Missae Sex could be produced. Two years after Rogier's death, his student, Géry de Ghersem, fulfilled the wishes expressed in Rogier's will and had the masses published. This took place in Madrid in 1598 at the press of the royal printer. De Ghersem took the opportunity to include a mass setting of his own and dedicated the complete volume to the new King, Philip III.

All the settings in this collection are based on motets by other composers, except Rogier's Missa Philippus Secundus, which has a soggetto cavato (see below). For the most part, Rogier used motets by Flemish composers as his models presumably works that were in the repertoire of the royal chapel. Rogier's mass settings contain the usual movements of the Ordinary of the Mass (Kyrie, Gloria, Credo, Sanctus and Benedictus, Agnus Dei), with some slight variants noted below. Over and above their intrinsically longer texts, the Gloria and Credo settings are quite extensive, whereas the Sanctus and Agnus Dei movements tend to be quite compact. Rogier rarely sets all three petitions of the Agnus Dei.

## The Masses and Models

The scoring, movements and models for the masses are as follows:

## i. Missa Philippus Secundus Rex Hispaniae

This setting for four voices is based on a melody derived from the solmization syllables in the tributary text Philippus Secundus, Rex Hispaniae. (Josquin employed a similar technique in his Missa Hercules dux Ferrarie.) This soggetto cavato is repeated 29 times in the tenor voice throughout the mass, replacing the text of the Ordinary throughout (except the Benedictus):


In the Agnus Dei, only the third petition, Agnus Dei qui tollis peccata mundi: dona nobis pacem, is set. Two additional voices (Cantus II and Contratenor II) are added to form a six-part texture.

## ii. Missa Inclita stirps Jesse

Based on the motet by Jacobus Clemens non Papa for four voices. Again, only the third invocation of the Agnus Dei is set, for five voices with an additional Cantus part.

## iii. Missa Dirige gressus meos

The mass is for five voices, based on a motet of the same name by Thomas Crecquillon. The Osanna is integral to the Sanctus, with overlapping text and musical texture, and no repeat or second Osanna is provided after the Benedictus. Rogier sets only the third petition of the Agnus Dei with an extra Cantus part.

## iv. Missa Ego sum qui sum

Nicolas Gombert's motet is the model for this six-part setting. Only the third Agnus Dei is set, though no extra voices are added.

## v. Missa Inclina Domine aurem tuam

This six-part mass is based on a motet by Cristóbal Morales. Rogier provides polyphony for the first and third petitions of the Agnus Dei.

## vi. Missa Ave virgo sanctissima

The sixth mass in the volume was the work of de Ghersem himself, his Missa Ave virgo sanctissima, a seven-voice setting based on the motet by Francisco Guerrero.

## The Missa Inclita stirps Jesse

The Missa Inclita stirps Jesse is the second work in the Missae Sex. The pages are numbered 36-69 in the print and are laid out in the traditional manner of four single voice parts (see fig.1a), except for the Agnus Dei, which has a second soprano part (fig. 1b). ${ }^{28}$


Fig. 1(a): Layout used for pages 36-67 - Kyrie, Gloria, Credo, Sanctus


Fig. 1(b): Layout of pages 68-69 - Agnus Dei

The mass takes its name from the four-voiced motet Inclita stirps Jesse by the Flemish composer Jacobus Clemens non Papa, which Rogier used as a model. The technique of borrowing motifs or whole contrapuntal ideas from a pre-existing source

[^10]is known as parody, and this was a popular method of composition in the sixteenth century. Some writers are uncomfortable with the more modern, derogatory associations of the word "parody" and use instead the name "imitation masses," derived from the designation Missa ad imitationem [name]. Another version would be Missa Super [name], or in the case of this setting, simply Missa Inclita stirps Jesse. Generally, the technique applied was a systematic use of the original material: movements of the new mass would be based on successive musical ideas in the model. The model could be from the work of the same or another composer; it might be a sacred or secular source.

The custom of writing masses based on pre-existing material was well established in Spain before Rogier: all of Morales' masses, for example, are based on earlier models, including motets by Franco-Flemish composers such as Mouton, Verdelot, Richafort and Gombert. Most of Guerrero's mass settings are based on earlier material, as are those of Victoria, who drew on motets, chansons and plainsong melodies in his mass settings. ${ }^{29}$ All of Clemens non Papa's masses, fourteen in number, are parody settings, as are eight of Willaert's nine masses; some fifty of Palestrina's masses are based on pre-existing material.

There is no extant evidence to indicate why Rogier chose Clemens' motet as a model. It may have been a tribute to the composer or merely a liking for the particular piece. Perhaps Rogier wrote his mass for the celebration of the Nativity of the Virgin,

[^11]for which the text is prescribed as part of the Office. ${ }^{30}$ We can but speculate that Clemens non Papa's motet for this feast might have been well known, so that Rogier's use of the melodies would have a connection his listeners could appreciate. ${ }^{31}$

One of the striking features of the motet Inclita stirps Jesse is the extraordinarily economical nature of the melodic material he employs. With the exception of the Alleluia at the end of each of the two partes, where he briefly uses a figure covering a range of a fifth, all the previous melodic ideas are contained within the interval of a fourth.

The Prima Pars contains four lines of text, set to melodies of quite limited range. The first phrase consists of two two-bar units, (a) and (b), where (b) is almost a mirror of (a):


Fig. 2. Clemens non Papa, Inclita stirps Jesse, Cantus, bars 1-3
The second line of text is, melodically, another version of (a):


Fig. 3. Clemens non Papa, Inclita stirps Jesse, Cantus, bars 21-23

[^12]The third and fourth ideas are again related to the melodic outlines already used:


Fig. 4. Clemens non Papa, Inclita stirps Jesse, Cantus, bars 29-31
and


Al - le - lu-ia

Fig. 5. Clemens non Papa, Inclita stirps Jesse, Cantus, bars 38-39

The Secunda pars employs similar melodic material. It begins with a slightly extended figure, using (a) and (b), preceded by a rocking motif, which Rogier uses repeatedly in his mass, see fig. 6. Perhaps Clemens' motif suggests the rocking of a cradle, which would be appropriate for a feast celebrating Nativity:


Fig. 6. Clemens non Papa, Inclita stirps Jesse, Secunda Pars, Bassus, bars 1-3

The next phrase again stays within the profile of a fourth:


Fig. 7. Clemens non Papa, Inclita stirps Jesse, Secunda Pars, Cantus, bars 24-25
and is followed by a repeat of the text and music of miro plenus odore and Alleluia, as above.

This limited melodic material clearly appealed to Rogier's love of compact motifs, and it is a tribute to his compositional skill that he is able to weave these short phrases together into a satisfying larger frame.

One of the hallmarks of Clemens' motet is the rocking figure (marked (x) in fig. 6 above), which opens the Secunda pars. The subject has its own rather curious profile, especially its third and fourth notes, G and B , where we might expect one or other to be an A . This sets up interesting melodic consequences: the answer, starting on a G in the alto and tenor voices, is tonal rather than real and produces a modal sound with an unsharpened leading-note, F natural. This figure is quite prominent in Rogier's mass setting, especially at the end of the Agnus Dei. In some places this sets up some unusual progressions with diminished fifths that may suggest adding accidentals as musica ficta (for example, see Agnus Dei, measures 45-50).

It was common practice to take the melodic material from the model and use it in the same order. Rogier follows this pattern and the first Kyrie uses the opening material from Clemens' motet:


Fig. 8. Rogier, Missa Inclita stirps Jesse, Kyrie, Tenor, bars 4-7

For the Christe eleison, Rogier creates a slightly more extended phrase, still with clear roots in the original material:


Fig. 9. Rogier, Missa Inclita stirps Jesse, Kyrie, Cantus, bars 36-38
and then in an inverted form:


Fig. 10. Rogier, Missa Inclita stirps Jesse, Kyrie, Contratenor, bars 39-42

The opening of the second Kyrie features the rocking motif, but Rogier skillfully adds to it a version of the Christe melody, with a new, dotted rhythm in both ascending and descending forms. This has the effect of simultaneously providing contrast and musical unity:


Fig. 11. Rogier, Missa Inclita stirps Jesse, Kyrie II, Cantus, bars 74-76

Rogier applies the same style of treatment to the setting of the longer movements of the Ordinary of the Mass, the Gloria and the Credo. The Gloria, for example, uses the same melodic material in its opening as the Kyrie:


Fig. 12. Rogier, Missa Inclita stirps Jesse, Gloria, Contratenor, bars 5-9
but Rogier introduces a melody with a stronger contour for laudamus te ("we praise thee"):


Fig. 13. Rogier, Missa Inclita stirps Jesse, Gloria, Bassus, bar 9
a gentler shape for benedicimus te ("we bless thee"):


Fig. 14. Rogier, Missa Inclita stirps Jesse, Gloria, Cantus, bar 13-15
and for adoramus te ("we adore thee"), the musical phrase contains a "genuflection" begins with a falling figure followed by a leap upwards - heavenwards, perhaps:


Fig. 15. Rogier, Missa Inclita stirps Jesse, Gloria, Bassus, bar 14-16

There are many further examples where the musical material of the model is infused with the subtleties of Rogier's inflection, such as:

- Falling figures for supplicatory phrases such as Qui sedes ... miserere nobis ... Jesu Christe, and a sudden change to upward, buoyant writing for cum sancto spiritu ... Amen (Gloria, measures 84-end).
- Where melismatic and rhythmic content are varied to provide contrast (e.g., Credo, measures 19-36).
- Where small changes in scoring have a great effect: in the Credo, measures 52-60, where the bass is omitted during the words Genitum, non factum, consubstantialem Patri - providing a more ethereal sound, and allowing Rogier a detail of word-painting when they re-enter with the text per omnia facta sunt.
- Similarly, for the words Et ascendit in coelum (Credo, bars 131-134) Rogier first sets them without basses to illustrate the height of the heavens.

The central portion of the Credo, the words Et incarnatus est de Spiritu Sancto ex Maria Virgine, was often singled out for special musical treatment, and Rogier draws our attention to this text by using a static compositional style. He exploits the simplicity of Clemens' melodic material, and this exquisite writing leads to a cadence that moves briefly into the chord of the flattened leading-note - a beautiful effect for the words et homo factus est.

There are frequent examples in sixteenth-century mass settings where the scoring changes for the text crucifixus pro nobis ... et sepultus est, often to a smaller number of voices, and this reduction provides an opportunity to use soloists or a semi-chorus for textural variety. Many settings revert to the fuller scoring and livelier setting for et resurrexit tertia die. Although Rogier does use a more disjunct musical figure here (in contrast to the stepwise writing at passus et sepultus est) he does not provide a clearly defined cadence until the end of measure 131. There is an additional
opportunity to provide contrast by using solo voices from measures 100-131, reintroducing the full choir at the words et ascendit in coelum at a point where all the voices start the new phrase simultaneously. In all of these examples, Rogier is subtly expressing the text of the mass with a fusion of independent and parodied material. Clemens' melodies are nearly always present, but often cloaked in a new guise.

## Chapter 3: Editorial Issues

## Critical Edition versus Performing Edition

The main staves of the edition present the Missa Inclita stirps Jesse in the style of a scholarly edition (including suggestions of musica ficta, but without performance suggestions). Added to this is a keyboard reduction, which provides an opportunity to suggest suitable markings of tempo and expression, though these are obviously dependent on the venue and nature of the performing space and forces. In addition to providing a forum for these suggestions, this reductio partes can also be used for rehearsal.

At the outset of any editorial endeavor, it is critical to identify the role that the editor will play. According to Bruno Turner, the eminent scholar, editor and director of the early music ensemble Pro Cantione Antiqua, the role of the editor is "to enable the truest transmission of the substance of the music, letter and spirit., ${ }^{, 32}$ Turner draws a distinction between an editor and a casual transcriber, observing that the former has enough knowledge to put the music in its correct context, while the latter is doing a job "well within the capability of 'an intelligent plumber or gas fitter.","33

The editor, he says, "changes the shapes and usually the values of the notes, changes the clefs and puts the parts in score," which may have "implications of pitch and intervals, of tempo and tempo relationships, of phrasing, of text underlay,

[^13]spelling, pronunciation and punctuation. ${ }^{, 34}$ Turner poses the question of how far should one go in trying to recreate "historical accuracy" and suggests that one should be careful that our attempts to clarify the music of the past with modern notational devices do not create new layers, new obstacles, and obfuscate more than they reveal.

There has been a constantly evolving idea of what constitutes a "good" edition, especially of early music. It is helpful to see the original clefs and incipits to know the original pitch of the music and essential to see any mensural signs, and to have a clearly expressed ratio of old to new note values. Turner suggests that "the modern editor's greatest single problem is pitch," but for the performer coming to this music, the appearance and presentation of the notes - the note-lengths and barlines is of prime significance. ${ }^{35}$

## Note Length and Barlines

Between the thirteenth and fifteenth centuries, the note-length of the principal beat, or tactus, moved from longer to shorter values. What was once "long" became "breve," and semi-breve became "minimized." As notes lengths changed, so did the appearance of the music. The music of the Eton Choirbook, for example, looks very different in its original notation and in the edition of Musica Britannica. In the latter, the short note-values, with many eighth and sixteenth notes, combined with idiosyncratic beaming, give the appearance of very fast and complex music. ${ }^{36}$ My

[^14]own vocal experience is that this notation introduces an increased sense of musical difficulty: the music seems fast, whatever the conductor's actual tempo may be. Conversely, I have also been able to observe the influence on conductors of music written in predominantly white notes, which can sometimes send out a very different signal about tempo quite unrelated to the actual piece. Philip Brett suggests that it is because of the signals sent out by very long notes that editors increasingly chose to shorten them: "on the grounds that performers would be misled about tempo by the symbols chosen by early composers, notes were halved, then quartered., ${ }^{37}$


Fig. 16. Part of Walter Lambe's Salve Regina, from the Eton Choir Book, Musica Britannica, Vol. 10, p. xxvi (Reproduced by permission of the Provost and Fellows of Eton College.)

[^15]

Fig. 17. An extract from Walter Lambe's Salve Regina, transcribed by Frank LL. Harrison. (Copyright The Musica Britannica Trust. Reproduced from Musica Britannica Volume X by permission of Stainer \& Bell, London, England.)

Whether written in long or short notes, appearance matters, and as editors and performers, we need to be aware of what conventions are being followed: has the original note-length been preserved, halved, or even quartered? This information can be provided in prefatory staves or in the Editorial Commentary. As far back as the 1920s, the editors of the Das Chorwerk series offered some ideas concerning how to combine a sense of the original notation within the framework of a modern score. They preserved the original note-lengths and tried to avoid using regular barlines so that each voice part would read horizontally as close as possible to the appearance of the original source, without the need to add extra tied notes. Instead of regular barlines, they developed the Mensurstrich, which was essentially a division into uniformly long measures, but with the barline drawn between the staves and not through them. John Caldwell comments on this practice, noting that "the choice of bar-length has as great a bearing on legibility, and on the suggestion of appropriate character and tempo, as the choice of note-values., ${ }^{, 38}$ Caldwell's preference is for unbroken barlines through the whole score: he comments that with Mensurstriche, the

[^16]horizontal line indicating the prolongation of a final syllable can aggravate confusion with the staff lines.


Fig. 18. Jean Richafort, Requiem, bars 75-80. Das Chorwerk Series, Vol.124, p.9. (Reproduced by permission of Karl Heinrich Moeseler Verlag)

The series Das Chorwerk preserves the length of the original notes: the Mensurstriche allow the performer to see the metrical divisions while still singing from a part which does not require the introduction of extra ties across editorial barlines. It takes a while to get used to this style of notation, especially where the long notes (breves and longae) last through several Striche.

## Pitch

In addition to problems of note length, the question of transposition "is a minefield. ${ }^{39}$ By establishing the range of each part of the Missa Inclita stirps Jesse, it can be seen that a transposition of just a tone lower brings the piece into a comfortable range for an SATB choir. Closer inspection of the initial clefs however indicates that a much greater transposition may have been intended. The mass is written in the combination of clefs called either "high" clefs or chiavette. The use of G, C2, C3 and C4 clefs usually implies a downward transposition of a fourth, which would put the mass within the range of a male-voice ATBarB ensemble, which may well have suited the male voices of the capilla flamenca.

For purposes of a critical edition, the two preferable keys might be (a) the original, untransposed, or (b) down a fourth: but for the present combined scholarly and performing edition, the compromise is to provide the original clef and starting pitches and then a transposition down a tone to suit an SATB choir. The original clefs are modernized, using only G and F clefs. ${ }^{40}$

## A Balanced Approach

The levels of obvious intervention in the scholarly and performing editions differ, and my chosen format seeks to provide a satisfactory balance for the two different purposes. Above all, I have endeavored to keep the main staves of music

[^17]clear of too much interpretative detail: not to deprive subsequent performers of information, but to allow them a more workable canvas and not to impose particular opinions. Editions of early music - especially many from the early twentieth century - are often overwhelmed with intricate dynamic markings involving many layers of expression. They read as though the publishers felt that the music would be completely inaccessible without performance markings, and that the lack of interpretative assistance would close the door on many a prospective performance, as though "the text could not simply be left to speak for itself to the performer." ${ }^{, 41}$ The twenty-first century editor has the benefit of much hindsight and a much stronger and more widespread performance tradition on which to draw, but the decision of what to include and what to omit is still of great importance. Thurston Dart's classic text reminds editors that: "first of all we need to know the exact symbols used; then we must find out what these signified at the time they were written; and lastly we must express our conclusions in terms of our own age., ${ }^{42}$

The point, though, is that research, editions and performances are constantly evolving. An "ideal" printed edition, in the sense of the final word on a piece, may well not exist, but with the developments in electronic publishing, perhaps a "comprehensive" edition might be available. It is technically feasible even now to

[^18]develop a means of allowing performers to select various options and print out their preferred version. Here are some of the variables: ${ }^{43}$

- Pitch: original pitch, or transposed because of the implication of high clefs, or simply to achieve a comfortable tessitura for the singers
- Clefs: original or modern
- Note-lengths: original or halved (with subsequent attention to time-signature and mensuration marks); with or without ligature and coloration marks
- Expression: with or without editorial performance marks
- Musica ficta
- Score: with or without keyboard reduction
- With or without Editorial Commentary, Translations, etc.
- Facsimiles of the original could be included: singing from original sources can be rewarding in many ways. (This option could be used after familiarity with the piece is gained from the modern edition. It would enable singers and scholars to have a closer appreciation of how the appearance and sound of a score are inextricably linked.)
- Editorial markings could be easily distinguished from the original by the use of color printing. ${ }^{44}$

[^19]
## Chapter 4: Performance Issues

## The Early Music Movement and Issues for Vocalists: More Questions than Answers.

If we were to be asked when early music became popular, we would probably cite the nineteenth century - perhaps Mendelssohn's name would crop up early on in the discussion, because of his re-kindling of interest in Bach's music. Yet many years before nineteenth-century Germany's revival of interest in music of the Renaissance, Monteverdi had ordered copies of Josquin's masses for his singers, Bach had added instrumental and continuo parts to Palestrina's Missa Sine nomine, and Mozart had transcribed Allegri's Miserere. Interest in performing music of the past has increased exponentially in the last half century: the efforts of pioneers such as Arnold Dolmetsch, Noah Greenberg, David Munrow and others have blossomed into a firmly established early music movement.

We can nowadays hear live or recorded performances of music of diverse composers and periods, ranging from the almost constant re-recording, or re-issuing of popular classics, to the rediscovery of some more or less obscure composer whose works have suffered neglect. For the big recording companies, obscure composers are not always a secure investment, and as the number of traditional recording retail outlets has shrunk, the recording industry has had to reexamine its product and marketing. There may no longer be a large record store in the local mall, but the range and quality of recordings now available is nonetheless huge. Some of these recordings may feature lesser-known composers or pieces, but many incorporate
historically informed preparation and presentation. The necessity of research into the context and sources of early music has grown alongside an enormous development in the number and diversity of ensembles working in this area. A plethora of both professional and amateur ensembles, singers and instrumentalists has become interested in the music of the past, and these performers have increasingly good editions and recordings to consult. Just as the late nineteenth century saw a surge of interest in large-scale Handel Commemorations and publishers discovered a new and significant public demand for scores of Messiah and Israel in Egypt, so the second half of the twentieth century saw an enormous increase of interest in (and the marketability of) "old" music in printed editions, recordings and replicas of "period instruments."

Different approaches to the performance of early music have generated a spirit of inquiry: "The twentieth century, and especially the second half of it, has revived more forgotten music of the past than any other era. ... The idea of historically informed performance could hardly have arisen without this infusion of music from the past, which prompted questions. ${ }^{, 45}$ Though even after half a century or more of curiosity, investigation and a fair measure of speculation, we find ourselves still coming up against some of the same questions. As choral conductors, we have to ask what "early music" means, and what issues concern us most, for they may affect the music we choose, the notation we read - and if not the actual air we breathe, then definitely how we use the breath we have taken. This chapter seeks to raise some of those issues, though the questions are sometimes easier to find than the answers.

[^20]
## Bowing and Blowing

"Early" music is a flexible term, as is the related concept of "authentic" performance. ${ }^{46}$ At the last count, the concepts of early and authentic have reached as far forward as the nineteenth century, at least in orchestral performance. ${ }^{47}$ Whatever the period in question, there is currently the expectation that those seriously interested in performing "early" repertory should do so from as informed a position as possible. Conductors of early music need to be historically aware of, even if not zealous converts to, performance traditions and musicological evidence.

Evidence is not equally distributed, however, and it frequently favors instrumental over choral music. There is no shortage of examples of excellent replica or "period" instruments. For example, there is a wealth of wonderful contemporary harpsichords, which displays the subtle tonal varieties of their Flemish, French or Italian models. Opportunities abound for hearing distinguished performances on them, complete with authentic tunings, temperaments and ornamentation. Certainly, the replication of original instruments and the study of theoretical and didactic documents can help us create a close likeness of historically accurate instrumental style. We know that if we put gut strings on our violins, use a "period" bow with an appropriate grip, and follow the "Italian" or the "French" schools of bowing, then we will produce something different from the sound and style of a modern player. String players may have other

[^21]questions that need to be considered before they can fully realize their performance, for example:

- At what pitch are we playing?
- What temperament are we using?
- How many players are there per part?
- How am I holding my instrument? Do I use a chin rest or a shoulder pad?
- Do I play in low fingering positions and use open strings freely?
- What about vibrato?
- What sort of bow and bowing style should I use - and who is marking up the parts? Has the conductor done it personally, or delegated the job to the concertmaster: are they both equally expert and experienced in period bowing techniques and the subtle differences of articulation? ${ }^{48}$

There is growing evidence of significant instrumental participation in European Renaissance polyphony, and this was particularly prevalent in Spanish cathedrals, which favored the use of instruments in addition to the organ, and where shawms and sackbuts participated in many liturgies. ${ }^{49}$ Like our violinists, above, the wind players will have questions about pitch and temperament. The musicians of the royal court traveled extensively under both Charles V and Philip II, and some kind of agreement

[^22]would have been necessary about pitch and tuning if they interacted with instruments (such as organs) and other musicians. With whom did the shawms play? They were part of the alta music (meaning not high, but loud) and they often performed at outdoor events, ceremonies and celebrations. Shawms can make a dramatic impact, certainly, and if they play alongside singers, then their presence raises significant issues of balance. The evidence as to whether the "loud" instruments played with the singers or alternated with them is not entirely clear: practical experience suggests the latter, especially if the group of singers was small. ${ }^{50}$

To an extent, the same holds true of the cornett. In the hands of the expert it is a most effective match in two directions, blending with both its traditional instrumental partners, the sackbuts, and also with the human voice. With its small mouthpiece and highly sensitive embouchure, the cornett responds immediately and intimately to the player's breath. It is the Renaissance instrument that is closest in expressive ability to the human voice.

Violins, shawms and cornetts are all represented in the thriving industry of historical instrument replication. Their originals can tell us a lot about such issues as performing pitch and they offer enormous possibilities for enriching the performance of music of the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries.

In one of only a few such passages written by a composer, Francisco Guerrero provides useful detail about instrumental activity at Seville Cathedral. In 1586, he wrote an "order that must be observed by the instrumentalists in playing" which

[^23]anticipates the ornamentation by the players and suggests varieties of scoring to provide greater variety for the listeners:

First, Rojas and Lopez shall always play the treble parts; ordinarily on shawms. They must carefully observe some order when they improvise passages both as to places and to times... Second, the same Rojas and Lopez when they at appropriate moments play on cornetts must again observe the same moderation in embellishing: the one deferring to the other... As for Juan de Medina, he shall ordinarily play the contralto part, not obscuring the trebles nor disturbing them by exceeding the passages that belong to the contralto. When on the other hand his part becomes the top above the sackbuts, then he is left an open field in which to glory and is free to add all the passages that he desires and knows so well how to execute on his instrument. As for Alvanchez, he shall play tenors and the dulcian. ${ }^{51}$

## Singing and Signing

By contrast, vocalists have no historical laryngeal replicas, and there are no choral recordings for comparative listening prior to the early twentieth century. Some information about pitch and the number of performers can be gleaned from archival records and iconographical evidence, but performance material (especially with any kind of interpretive detail) is almost non-existent. Descriptions of sixteenth-century choral music making are few, and they tend to be low on facts and high on descriptive language. More often than not, music is mentioned when things are going wrong rather than right. ${ }^{52}$ Peter Phillips, director of the Tallis Scholars, comments that based

[^24]on the kind of descriptions that are available, we would be better off not even trying to emulate early singers. "We can guess at the type of sound produced by sixteenthcentury choirs, and the evidence suggests that imitation of them would be highly undesirable." ${ }^{53}$ We may not know what sort of sound they made, but we can suggest some questions the late sixteenth-century vocalist might need to ask:

- Which part am I singing? What is the part called?
- What sort of music am I using - choirbook, partbook, modern score?
- What style of notation am I reading? What are the note lengths and the mensural signs that explain how different sections relate to each other?
- What clef am I reading? - if I see the so-called "high" clefs, do I transpose the music down? And how far?
- What kind of pitch standard are we using? Is there accompaniment? If not, who sets the performance pitch?
- How many others are singing my part and the other parts?

[^25]- Who is keeping time and how?
- What is the role of the music, where is it being sung, and in what space?
- How does this affect me?
- What sort of vocal production am I using?
- What dynamic range? Do I use any expression by way of volume, tone or vibrato?

What sets the singer somewhat apart from the player may be the next questions:

- What is the text of the piece? What does it mean? Am I expected to characterize the meaning of the words?

Contemporary performers may also need to ask:

- In what language am I singing, what style of pronunciation is being used?

In keeping with most composers up to the mid-eighteenth century, Rogier's music appears relatively unadorned: there are no indications as to performance. The musical score is like a road map, which may give us directions, but we do not get the view from the car window until we do the drive.


Fig. 19. The location of the Sears Tower, Chicago, IL (Google Maps)

This map (fig. 19) tells us the location of the Sears Tower in Chicago, but it says nothing about the view from the top of the tower. In a similar way, Rogier's score tells us what notes to sing, but not what the effect of the whole will be:


Fig. 20 - Rogier: Missa Inclita stirps Jesse, opening of Christe eleison, tenor part

The Missae Sex manuscript is clear and legible: once the clefs and noteheads are explained, many modern singers could make a reasonably successful attempt at singing from the original. If one were to get lost on the road to the Sears Tower, comparing a map with the road names or numbers may help: it is a much more intriguing question to know how Renaissance singers found their way back in if they got lost in their music. How were these pieces rehearsed? How does one restart in the middle of a polyphonic piece, when there are no bar numbers or rehearsal letters and even attempting to restart where a particular text begins will not work in imitative polyphonic music. Did the singers always go back to the beginning?

We assign this role to the conductor, and if the conductor and composer are the same person, helping the singers negotiate the music would be an easier matter because of greater familiarity with it. But as to how a conductor might prepare a piece composed by somebody else without a score, we can only speculate. We do not have a stream of examples of hand-written "miniature scores" or any evidence of how the maestro di capilla practiced his art. This is especially intriguing when one learns that even one of the most distinguished choirs, that of the Sistine Chapel, rarely rehearsed. ${ }^{54}$

According contemporaneous accounts, the monks at El Escorial did not sing polyphony, only plainsong. Given the evidence of the complaints they made, pleading to have the number of daily services moderated, they may not have had time to

[^26]rehearse even if they had so wished. ${ }^{55}$ We do not know much about Philippe Rogier's or his singers' workloads, about how and how often new music was learned, nor the frequency with which music was sung and repeated. ${ }^{56}$

The routine of daily services teaches both style and content - one accumulates a large repertoire and a sense of how to sing it. Music for a particular Feast may only crop up once a year - Ascension Day, for example - but if the music is repeated for a few years, it can be retrieved from the memory quite quickly. A big part of this process is related to the texts: one becomes aware of the same verses and can have a sense of how they are likely to be set, and how the piece is to be sung. Like the Sears Tower compared with other towers, there is bound to be some similarity between motets by different sixteenth-century composers setting the same words.

Rogier's musicians would almost certainly not have needed translations to be written in their copies. The text of the Ordinary of the Mass, the varying, seasonal texts called the Propers, and the texts of various motets would have been part of their education since childhood. One might speculate that although the singers did not have to go through the rigors of monastic training and commit the whole Psalter to memory, they would be familiar with many of the texts. Choristers had to learn Latin as part of their training, and would have been able to translate most of the texts for

[^27]themselves. They would certainly understand enough to be able to give the texts their proper character and accentuation.

The ability to parse correctly (to identify the strong and weak accents of words and phrases) is a skill that belongs as much on the contemporary concert platform as it does in the Latin or Greek classroom, and it is an issue close to the heart of those conductors who wish to bring life and energy to the performance of Renaissance repertoire. Even if not fluent in a language such as Latin, many modern musicians can accrue a general awareness of and response to certain words and moods - and the role of the conductor is obviously to remind or instruct them appropriately. We are probably all familiar with the phrase "the tyranny of the barline" where passages of imitative music in particular require phrasing and accentuation that do not always fit the division of the music into regular metrical units. The representation of long, flowing lines of music was much more easily notated in the partbook than the score. Like the modern reader, the contemporary performer likes to be well informed about what everybody else is doing. We like the security of seeing other parts and to be able to use surrounding material to help us sing our own, and to do this we have a score, with barlines and, perhaps, marks of expression.

If instrumentalists are involved, then both players and singers need to be aware of proper accentuation so that they can phrase, tongue or bow effectively to articulate the text. Modern technology can assist the process here. A decided advantage of recent score-writing computer software is the ease with which parts can be printed from a score. For early music, these programs offer great facility of being
able to change clefs and transpose at the touch of a mouse, but equally desirable is the possibility of printing instrumental parts with text. What the player gets is similar in appearance to the "partbook" - a single voice part, complete with the words. Whether the player is sharing a part or a music stand with a singer - whether playing colla parte or independent parts - the conductor can reasonably expect the player to be aware of, and respond to, the text both in terms of structure and meaning. ${ }^{57}$

Players do not, however, have to worry about pronunciation and regional or historical accents, but singers do. If John Caldwell regards transposition as a "minefield" for the editor, pronunciation of historical texts is surely quicksand for the vocal performer. ${ }^{58}$ For Rogier's singers, performing Latin in the capilla flamenca in Spain, would this be Spanish-based Latin or some kind of Northern European/Netherlandish style? Some ensembles that specialize in a particular repertory may be fortunate to be led by someone with appropriate linguistic expertise, or they may even employ language coaches. ${ }^{59}$ Several excellent guides are available, but conductors will often have to make decisions in an area where they may not be experts, and the question of what sort of pronunciation to use can de daunting. We may be quite used to making the shift to a Germanic pronunciation of Latin in Bach, Schütz or Mozart, and we may be brave enough to attempt French-Latin in Faurés or Duruflé's Requiems, but often these can sometimes be somewhat token gestures - we

[^28]may master the consonants, but modifying our accustomed vowels requires significant concentration. When we add to this the vowel modification that we - or our singers - may have learned in voice lessons, pronunciation can be a complex activity. ${ }^{60}$

It has become the vogue, especially in some British choirs, to use early English consonants in Renaissance, Latin-texted pieces. The opening of Tallis's Lamentations, for example, Incipit lamentatio Jeremiae prophetae avoids the Italianate "in-chip-it" and the "J" pronounced as "I," and it becomes "in-see-pit lah-men-tah-see-o Jer-[as in the English name Jeremy]-ray-mee-ay pro-feh-tay." The Hilliard Ensemble avoided this "minefield of infinite possible varieties of medieval and Renaissance Latin...by using what the group calls 'Hilliard Latin,' a pronunciation based on early English consonants and fairly bright "RP" vowels." ${ }^{\prime 1}$

Perhaps this is a nod in the direction of authenticity and linguistic scholarship just enough to let our listeners know we are aware of the issues, but not enough to swamp them (or entangle us). One might call it "coffee table" authenticity something left out for occasional reference, further thought, and to entertain visitors. Our hesitation to commit wholeheartedly to this idea may be hampered by (a) a lack of knowledge, especially of regional dialects, (b) a lack of courage, in case we are savaged in a review by some "expert," and (c) because the end result may produce

[^29]something which can be a real barrier to one's audience. Groups such as the Tallis Scholars have eschewed such linguistic efforts, following instead something close to a standard "Received Pronunciation" in both English and Anglo-Italianate Latin.

A recent recording by an Oxford college choir containing verse anthems by Orlando Gibbons featured some "authentic" pronunciation, which, however well it is done, may sound artificial and may distract from the other positive qualities of the performance. The ensemble Red Byrd has consistently sung using modern regional accents (actually to promote a "classlessness" in their performances), which is often assumed to be "Elizabethan." Quite what foreign audiences make of it is unclear, but "unlike singing in a foreign language, a reconstructed pronunciation of one's own language can appear to the RP-speaking listener as quaint, comical or perversely obstructive., ${ }^{, 62}$

The singers of the capilla flamenca were Netherlanders, a part of Europe where native tongues and accents are widely varied. In other large, international musical centers - such as the Sistine Chapel - there must have been much linguistic diversity, and presumably some kind of imposition of uniformity. Latin was still the lingua franca of the Church, and most of the performers of sacred music at this time were professionals or members of a religious community, not amateur musicians. The texts of the mass would be second nature to them - and many of the less common

[^30]motet texts (such as Inclita stirps Jesse) would have a familiarity that we cannot hope to replicate.

The concept of a unified style of pronunciation leads us to consider how the singers interpreted the music they were given. The Missae Sex print, in common with most if not all its contemporary documents, contains no interpretative information, such as dynamic or tempo markings. Did Rogier then intend it to be sung monodynamically with an unvarying tempo? Do we take the absence of such instructions to be a prohibition against introducing any? We can assume that Rogier intended his music to edify and uplift those involved in the liturgy. In many ways we know more now about this music, these composers and their times than ever before. We have access to more sources and editions, more treatises and a vast array of early music recordings, but we are still left to make many decisions without the composer's guidance. On paper, we can see what Rogier wrote - and it is a relatively simple thing to have (at least) four singers get together to sing this piece. But how much of what is not written down is implied or needs to be understood?

Rogier's musicians were singing services several times a day, every day, and they were not singing repertoire from four different centuries. They were also in the presence of the composer, which must have had some impact on their performance. Kenyon raises the question: "Are we more likely to understand a composer's piece of music by restricting ourselves to the means he had available when he wrote it, or does such a restriction inhibit our full expression of the piece?,"63

[^31]We may not have visited or ascended the Sears Tower, but, we may say, we are familiar with other towers, and we can infer from one the view from another. To a large extent, vocal and choral performances from the second half of the twentieth century to the present have been somewhat speculative in matters of scoring, pitch, tempo and expression. A number of early music ensembles have developed manners and sounds which have become their "house" style: they have created sound worlds which have become familiar for both performer and listener. With the growth and availability of recording opportunities, regular broadcasts and sustained efforts on the ensemble's part, these sounds and performance styles have sometimes become benchmarks. Indeed, some ensembles have been so successful that they are afforded an almost reverential appreciation and much emulation.

Historical evidence continues to accumulate, and each generation of conductors has a little more information on which to base decisions about interpretation and performance. Musical editions have also continued to offer greater clarity and access to what original materials contained. Still, there are no dynamic markings in Rogier's music, nor for the most part in anybody else's for decades on either side. Does the lack of piano or forte in the score mean that there should be no piano or forte in performance? Sadly, some conductors take this to be the case.

To my mind, and I hope represented in my performance of the Missa Inclita stirps Jesse, the implied dynamics are present and quite clearly perceivable from (a) the text and (b) the melodic and harmonic material. The text of the mass may not offer as many opportunities for wordpainting as, say, a penitential motet, but there are still both broad and specific indications of variety:

- The Kyrie is a supplicatory text - and its position in the mass makes it expository both liturgically and musically. It is the "slow introduction" to:
- The Gloria, an expansive canticle of praise, includes clear indicators of musical approach: the text adoramus te, benedicimus te, glorificamus te has a obvious crescendo of language. ${ }^{64}$
- The Credo offers statement of faith that would have been central to Rogier's life and work. It is difficult to believe that the combination of powerful doctrine and dramatic narrative would have left composer and performer unmoved.
- The Sanctus - and especially the Osanna with its exuberant rhythmic vitality - could hardly be given an unvaried mono-dynamic rendition.
- The Agnus Dei can be taken as either a prayerful request, or a statement of optimism: either way it would be hard to imagine this movement being sung in the same manner as the Gloria, for example.

We then come to the question of tempo. Again there are no markings in the score, and nothing in the time signature or in the appearance of the notation to indicate a difference between, say, the Kyrie and the Gloria. Given the nature of the texts, their length and position in the liturgy, we might expect some difference of

[^32]approach in performance. ${ }^{65}$ Several early writers, including Praetorius, tell us that tempo is not a fixture, but should be flexible according to the mood and nature of the music and the solemnity of the feast. ${ }^{66}$ As far back as Sebald Heyden in 1540, there are instructions to slow or quicken the speed of chant to suit the liturgical circumstances. ${ }^{67}$ One example of instructions to vary the speed of polyphony are found in the Sistine Chapel, where the maestro di cappella was required to speed up or slow down the music to coincide with liturgical ceremonial.

It is worth our while to stay in the Sistine Chapel for a little longer, to consider chanting and other singing in an interesting case where modern tastes have fashioned the editing and interpretation of one of the great classics of "early music," Allegri's setting of Psalm 51, Miserere mei. Sometimes we read accounts of singing, and imagine the sounds of the singers: like Peter Phillips, we may react against attempting to recreate the effects described. One such example concerns the chanting of the plainsong verses in performances of Allegri's Miserere in the Sistine Chapel. We read that they were sung quickly and at full voice. How does this fit with the aural picture we have come to know from the renowned, one might say, venerable, exquisite, but altogether rather fragile performances of this piece by English collegiate chapel choirs? Many ensembles perform this beautiful piece with an almost

[^33]religious attachment to the sound of the early King's or St. John's College,
Cambridge, recordings - made famous by the broadcasts of the BBC. The work has a mystique, which almost excludes the possibility of such a thing as loud (and therefore potentially grating) chanting.

Setting aside the completely spurious nature of these beguiling top notes (which should be top Gs, not Cs), there is the problem that no autograph of Allegri's music has come down to us - and even if it had, it would almost certainly not have included the chant verses. Allegri would have assumed that his colleagues in the Sistine Chapel Choir would know what psalm tone to use, so its inclusion would have been unnecessary.

If we wish to be "authentic" with this piece, then we need to find at least one (castrato) singer who is experienced with the techniques of improvised polyphony. ${ }^{68}$ Given the impossibility of the first hurdle we would face here, we might never reach the next part of the challenge - for this technique of improvised polyphonic singing is not familiar to us now. The very use of the word "improvised" also leaves us in a difficult spot - how can we speak about an "authentic" performance or try and present a printed edition of something that changed each time it was sung?

The increase in the number and range of recordings of such pieces as Allegri's Miserere gives us the opportunity to hear and contrast various performing ideas. A significant role has been played by the development of recording technologies. Compact discs are simultaneously more and more numerous - bringing to light ever more obscure compositions - yet less and less available as record shops close. The

[^34]shift to digital audio available through the personal computer has given many ensembles and directors the opportunity to publish new works - or old works in new performance clothing. These developments are inextricably linked to the evolution of digital recording technology and the surge in personal computer access. The latter can enable almost anyone to make and edit a live recording, make copies of CDs with attractive packaging, and produce musical scores that compare favorably in quality to commercially available products. ${ }^{69}$

There is some criticism that, for example, "authentic" or "period" orchestral playing of the last fifty years has produced something that is a hybrid: that it consists of a highly organized and agreeable (and often intensely musical) effect, but one that is essentially still modern. We can replicate our instruments it seems, but not our ears. We still hear and process music with all the benefits of our contemporary learning and understanding. Although our knowledge and appreciation of authentic performance are being constantly updated by new materials - either greater musicological understanding or new/rediscovered literature - we have to make certain decisions, and no performance can be without compromises of some sort. We cannot ignore what our ears, our modern ears, are telling us. We cannot sing Josquin as if it were new music - for we know Palestrina, Bach, Mozart, Bruckner and Britten: we

[^35]know from our CD collection what Josquin can sound like when performed by Ensembles X, Y or Z. We might like X because it is sung "a cappella" and we espouse that sound because of its purity; but we might prefer performance $Z$ because the instruments used add more depth and color - and besides, we have read all the experts on the subject, so we know that Josquin with instruments (or Palestrina with ornaments, or....) is the latest, most fashionable way to hear his music. We might have to make a judgment between quantity and quality: a large-scale reconstruction must somehow be better than the version with one voice per part because more people are taking part (and therefore tacitly approving of) the performance. It is not long ago that it was the fashion, indeed almost a requirement, on Parisian concert advertisements to state how many musicians were involved in a particular performance, as though that were a guarantee of some kind of musical quality.

In any event, try as we may, we cannot reproduce all aspects of the original performances. We know only a little about how music was rehearsed: how often, or how long, ${ }^{70}$ and we may ponder over the abilities and training of $16^{\text {th }}$-century singers: how they saw and understood the music in front of them. We think nowadays in very harmonic terms - in octave-based, major and minor modes. Even if we understand the hexachord system well and make intuitive decisions about musica ficta, we cannot rely on the same being true of our performing neighbor. We may be fully conversant with the documentation about and practice of the improvisation of ornaments (even in

[^36]sacred music) - but if our musical neighbor is not, then problems may arise. ${ }^{71}$ If our conductor works out ornaments for us, then, in a way, the lack of spontaneity makes it inauthentic.

The urge to re-create what the composer "may have heard" has had some positive effects: recordings of Haydn or Mozart Symphonies played by compact, almost chamber-sized forces on "authentic" instruments can be revelatory, uncovering many lost nuances and details of balance and color. Singing Schubert Lieder to the accompaniment of an 1820's fortepiano instead of a modern concert grand piano is a transforming experience. But on the choral front, we may have fared less well.

## Blend versus Bland

The contemporary concept of how early choral music should sound is often based not on reasonably reliable replicas, but on subjective and pragmatic decisions. Stephen Plank begins Chapter Two of his book on Choral Performance with a quotation from James Joyce's Ulysses, "It's on Account of the Sound it is." He argues that we may "have located blend too exclusively in the realm of dynamics." ${ }^{, 72} \mathrm{We}$ have available today a wide range of serious, committed musicians performing the same music in quite different ways. Some ensembles have a distinctive sound and some have shied away from extremes of sound or style: both styles of performers

[^37]have their advocates and detractors. Renaissance polyphony can look unpromising the sources, especially those in choirbook format, have a symmetrical "calm" about them. The absence of barlines in this music, the lack of obvious regular metrical units, and the mostly white note notation all lend an air of detachment. Each page seems mesmerically similar, as though one were looking at one museum display case after another. Appearances, as they say, can be deceptive, but the damage is done when these images are reinforced with equally consistent and rather monotonous performances. The trouble is that many beautiful, poised, "still" performances are quite beguiling, and more so than the occasional surge in interest in recordings of monastic plainsong, they speak to many people because of their very limpidity.

There is a pragmatic historical scenario that reinforced this style of performance, dating back to the days of audio recordings on tape, when editing was done with razor blades and sticky tape: in those heady, pre-digital days, there was no "cover," no technology to help merge one take with another, or gently ease the pitch from one patch to another. There was a need to have several more or less identical "takes" to give the producer and editor more choice. For the singer, this meant repeating the same section multiple times, and it is difficult to replicate the thrill of performance under these conditions. Even varieties of vocal expression, which in performance are things "of the moment" and contribute to the live rendition, may have to be contained for the perfect edit. Even small amounts of vibrato can cause one take not to match another.

One can imagine, then, that this process evolved into a strange loop: recreating the composer's music moved through being creative in an artistic sense,
into being recreative in a rather dissatisfying repetitious process. Several celebrated ensembles established their house style in this way - and the sound picture, born of pragmatic practices, has become not just the "norm" but the idealized sound of early music. The exquisite blend reflects the enormous musicality of the participants, who can sing "as one voice" for one conductor, and the following day may sing the same piece in a different way for the next director.

There is a risk that what gets lost in this process is one or more parts of Andrea von Ramm's wonderful definition of the "obsession" of singing: "...a fantastic variety of color range, phrasing, tension, smoothness, speed, expression, impulse, magic, imagination and phantasy. ${ }^{, 73}$ These are all qualities that we admire in musical performances of any kind, and it seems a poor exchange to offer instead another diabolus in music, the myth that some kind of manufactured "straight tone" should be the norm for the singing of any Renaissance music.

What lies behind the phrase "straight tone" is not in itself negative: it does attempt to capture the quality of light, uniformly blended vowels, of good intonation, and the need for pure, beatless intervals, especially at cadences. But it is often interpreted in a negative way that emphasizes what one is not to do, and not the positive aspects of listening and accommodating one's vocal neighbors. It implies a constriction of the breath, a narrowing, a restriction of the sound - and this all in search of some elusive, ill-defined "early music" sound. It is no wonder that many voice teachers are suspicious of choral activity: curiously, both are in search of a free, expressive voice, but they have different ideas of how to get there. The one may

[^38]recommend the depressed larynx and production of a large resonant sound suitable for performances of large-scale works, where the voice as soloist has to travel over a large orchestra. The other is asking for a lighter sound with the singer as equal partner with other singers, often performing music of a more intricate nature and more complex texture. The two do seem incompatible.

Straight tone has come to mean trying to sing without vibrato: but the vocal cords must vibrate in order to work, and one cannot sing a single note without it. The issue is akin to the difference between "sound" and "noise." Unwanted sound becomes noise, and unintentional vibrato can become wobble, or "wavering" as Praetorius described it. ${ }^{74}$ The application of a constant amount of vibrato with no awareness of, or response to, context is highly undesirable. So is the attempt to remove all color and variety in the voice in search of some non-existent paradigm, usually based on perceptions gained from hearing and attempting to imitate some elusive but anodyne model. "The new religion," says Bruno Turner, "is no vibrato, and that is rubbish. Less vibrato is a good thing, but whoever authorized no vibrato?" Turner uses a good term when he observed "...we want the voice to be vibrant and full of rich tones, not thick [my italics]." ${ }^{, 75}$ Consort singing can be likened to chamber music playing, and we would no more expect a string quartet to be able to play a program with no vibrato than we would be able to sit through it.

The ensemble Concerto Italiano, directed by Rinaldo Alessandrini, has been praised for colorful interpretations of Monteverdi's music, and their performances

[^39]have been compared to the same repertoire sung by the British ensemble, the Consort of Musicke. The Italian group uses young operatic voices, which, combined with the use of close microphone placement, give a full-blooded effect. The Consort, on the other hand, has been criticized for being too "cool. ${ }^{, 76}$ For sopranos with an ambition to sing early music, the Consort's star soprano, Emma Kirkby, was a role model whose sound and style many tried to replicate. The motivation may have been laudable, but the effects were not often successful, especially for those who ended up with a pale, withdrawn sound in their search to imitate Emma Kirkby's particular and personal sound, with its delicate, but definitely present, vibrato. Whether it is of solo singers or ensembles, imitation is almost bound to fail: emulation may be a better course to follow. ${ }^{77}$

[^40]
## Chapter 5: Performance Matters

## Programming a Concert Performance of a Mass

A concert performance of a mass differs from liturgical use in a number of significant ways. First and foremost, in the liturgy a mass setting is functional, and is used to express the words of the unchanging sections, the Ordinary of the Mass. ${ }^{78}$ Except during penitential seasons, the Kyrie is followed immediately by the Gloria, but then there are significant intervals between the Credo, the Sanctus and the Agnus Dei. The musical setting in its liturgical context has other material interspersed between the movements, and this breaks up the continuity. For concert performance, a decision has to be made whether to present the mass as a whole, by performing its movements consecutively, or whether to divide the mass into sections throughout all or part of the program.

Some of the decisions that may affect the programming include:

- Is the selection of music entirely in the hands of the conductor?
- Is there any external restraint or influence on the choice of music and performers? For example, is the concert part of a series, or a celebration of a particular composer, venue, genre or time period?
- Who is singing and who is listening - what are their abilities and experience in these two roles?

[^41]- How is the program presented? Is there a printed program with extensive notes (and, like our bowing marks, who has written these?) or is the program to include announcements? The former is best for creating and maintaining a consistent atmosphere, but the latter may engage the audience a little more.
- Will the audience applaud and should they be given some guidance when this would be appropriate?
- Does the venue itself exercise any influence over the choice of music? For example, one might hesitate to perform florid baroque music in a highly resonant space.
- Are instruments involved - do they accompany or play solo items; does the choir sing a cappella at any point?

My normal practice has been to favor the interpolated approach, adding groups of motets and dividing the mass through both halves of a concert program, though preserving its proper order. For example:

1. Kyrie followed by Gloria [I would not break between these movements so as to establish the mood]
2. First group of interpolated material
3. Credo
4. Intermission
5. Second group of interpolations
6. Sanctus, Benedictus and Agnus Dei
7. Final group of added material

This practice allows the conductor considerable latitude for varying programming. For pragmatic reasons, however, the performance of the Missa Inclita stirps Jesse discussed in this dissertation was sung straight through. This was to save time and the detrimental effect of constant changes in performing personnel on the concentration of both performers and listeners. These issues are discussed more fully below.

The mass has, of course, been a vehicle for composers since the fourteenth century, and performances in the concert hall have become commonplace. J. S. Bach's Mass in B minor or Beethoven's Missa Solemnis are early examples of religious works that were not intended for straightforward liturgical performance, and it would seem foolish to contemplate adding anything between the movements of these masterpieces for the sake of providing variety. In the twentieth century, settings by composers such as Igor Stravinsky, Ralph Vaughan Williams and Frank Martin have musical contrast "built in," and their movements can be performed contiguously. The more repetitive nature of the music of a Renaissance mass is both a strength and a challenge for programming purposes. ${ }^{79}$ The interpolated approach does provide an opportunity for varied programming, though it is not everyone's choice. Taruskin refers to the mass as a "five-movement choral symphony" and suggests that breaking up its movements "defeats the composer's purpose, which is to unify the service of an

[^42]hour's duration or more by periodic inspiring returns to familiar and symbolic sounds." ${ }^{80}$

## Performance Commentary

The performance of Rogier's Missa Inclita stirps Jesse associated with this submission was given in St. Matthew's Cathedral in Washington, DC, on Thursday $3^{\text {rd }}$ July 2008. The mass was performed as part of the Chorworks 2008 Early Music Workshop entitled Kings \& Conquistadors: Music of Old and New Spain. ${ }^{81}$ Three ensembles participated: each group was led individually by its director, and all combined for a joint performance of several larger-scale works.

The concert host was Dr. William Culverhouse, director of the Schola Cantorum of St. Matthew's Cathedral, who has been associated with the Chorworks workshops since 2005 and participated with his nine-member, mixed-voice ensemble, Icarus. This was the ensemble's farewell performance, and it's members sang a group of motets by Tomás Luis de Victoria, works which have featured prominently in their repertoire (see program, given in Appendix A). Michael McCarthy, choirmaster of Washington's National Cathedral and faculty member of the workshop, led a Chamber Choir consisting of present and former girl choristers and male-voice alto, tenor and bass sections in more music by Victoria. I directed a group of fellow faculty members singing as a five-voice consort called Orpheus, exploring music by several Spanish and New World composers, including Juan Navarro and Hernando Franco,

[^43]and I directed the assembled company in the Missa Inclita stirps Jesse by Philippe Rogier and Victoria's eight-part Ave Maria.

This mix of ensembles allowed us to present a program with variety of choral textures and timbres. It also enabled us to acknowledge Bill Culverhouse's work with his ensemble and their association with the Chorworks workshops during the last few years, and it provided a chance to hear Michael McCarthy's ensemble working in a different acoustical setting. The concert gave participants in the workshop and the general public the opportunity to hear and compare ensembles with differing make-up and styles performing in the same space. Although limited time was available to the whole ensemble for rehearsal, drawing these ensembles together enabled me to perform Rogier's Missa Inclita stirps Jesse with a larger, more experienced ensemble than I would otherwise have been able to assemble. The result was a choral sound that was rich and sonorous in St. Matthew's, where the very long echo makes good balance difficult to achieve. The performance of the Missa Inclita stirps Jesse provided the workshop participants with the chance to hear an unfamiliar composer and piece, and it was also a good opportunity to continue my exploration of Rogier's extant mass settings. ${ }^{82}$

## Preparation

The directors of the three ensembles prepared their own ensembles. Asked to offer Spanish Renaissance polyphony, both ensembles provided a choice of pieces by

[^44]Victoria. Once the choice of program had been mutually agreed upon, no attempt was made to intervene with any decisions concerning performing styles for the respective groups.

## Rehearsal

Each ensemble made its own rehearsal arrangements. I rehearsed the Rogier mass with each ensemble separately, and we had one joint evening rehearsal in St. Matthew's Cathedral prior to the concert day. Previous full ensemble rehearsal was restricted by (a) difficulties in assembling faculty members from out of state and abroad, (b) the cost of remunerating professional singers. The dress rehearsal on the day of the concert was interrupted by two unexpected liturgical events at the Cathedral, which took precedence.

## Performance

Because the performers were all capable of a high level of reading and musicianship, it was possible to give a creditable performance despite these less than desirable rehearsal arrangements. It was interesting to hear the three ensembles singing in the same space. One of them (Icarus) was accustomed to the generous acoustics of St. Matthew's; the National Cathedral Consort also sing in a very resonant building, though the acoustical properties are rather different; as professional musicians, the members of Orpheus are used to performing in varied environments and could adjust accordingly. The biggest challenge was to sing together as one
ensemble with minimal opportunity to work at good blend, balance, intonation and ensemble. With this in mind, copies of the mass and Victoria's Ave Maria were carefully marked with breath, articulation and expression marks. ${ }^{83}$

In planning a concert consisting entirely of Renaissance music, I try to have a recognizable structure in the program. However appealing they are, Renaissance motets can often be relatively short, and a constant string of them can be unsatisfying as a whole program. Although concert habits have changed over the last three hundred years, for the modern symphonic concertgoer, the "Overture - Symphony Intermission - Concerto" format has a lot to commend it: the audience can enjoy a variety within an obvious framework. In an early choral music program, however, we do not have symphonies, in which several contrasting movements are played consecutively (with or without applause between movements!) and where the composer can lay out a work of considerable intellectual content and musical variety. We do, however, have a genre that may take twenty, thirty, even forty minutes to perform: the mass.

The music of the mass was not originally intended to be heard straight through - and in the sixteenth century was not, of course, destined for the concert hall. Concert performances of liturgical music have brought this repertory to the ears of many listeners who would not normally have or take the opportunity to hear it sung in its original context. Originally the parts of the mass that were set to music - the "fixed" movements, or the Ordinary of the Mass, and the parts that changed by liturgical season, the Propers - were separated by readings, prayers or other parts of

[^45]the liturgy. Musical continuity was provided by the use of similar or related musical material in each section of the Ordinary. In the case of Rogier's Missa Inclita stirps Jesse and other "parody" masses, this is achieved by reworking music of the model in each section of the mass setting. As listeners, we become aware of the melodic material acting as a sort of glue, binding together separate movements.

This thematic unity can be very satisfying: a performance of a substantial Renaissance mass, sung straight through in concert, can have the same duration as a symphony by Mozart or Haydn, and it can also have the effect comparable to that of an extended contemporary orchestral work (such as one by Glass or Gorecki), where relatively limited musical material, combined with an a cappella performance, can create an enthralling, if somewhat minimalist, experience.

Another programming decision that is related to the type of performance, to the musicians involved, to the nature of the audience and, to an extent, to the venue itself, is whether to sing or omit the Credo of the mass. The movement is the longest section of the Ordinary, and its omission may enable other pieces and more variety of programming. On a purely practical level, though some choirs perform Renaissance masses in liturgical contexts, it is increasingly rare to have the Credo sung by the choir, partly because of its length and partly because of the decline in popularity of the choir worshipping on behalf of the congregation (and the clerical sentiment that the congregation should not be "excluded" from the opportunity to express their
belief). The Latin text of the Credo is becoming less familiar to singers, and performing an extended musical setting can be challenging. ${ }^{84}$

I had the choice of either the durchgesungen performance or the interpolated pattern. For this program, with its various participating ensembles, my decision was as much a practical as an artistic one: to the keep the musicians onstage and sing the entire mass straight through. This decision was also made for the sake of the singers in the space: if we had split the movements of the mass, they (and the audience) would have had to adjust constantly to changing ensemble sizes and configurations and to alternating directors. Given the lack of rehearsal time, this would have been detracted from the program and performance.

This occasion was an opportunity to perform Rogier's mass in a context of music by his contemporaries: a chance to bring his music to a wider audience, some of whom had not heard it before, and some who had previous exposure to Rogier's music and works by other Spanish Renaissance composers as either performers or auditors. It was also an opportunity for musicians in the local community to sing his music, to work with other musicians of considerable performing experience, and with directors who had different approaches to similar repertoire. But this performance was significantly influenced by opportunity and circumstances that were not necessarily ideal.

As in many larger, echo-prone churches (buildings such as Westminster Abbey or St. Paul's Cathedral in London, the National Cathedral and the National

[^46]Shrine in Washington, DC, or the Basilica of El Escorial), choral performance in St. Matthew's Cathedral seems to works well with a body of sound sufficient to be audible to the performers above the echo. An alternative is to use a consort of 1-2 voices per part voices where clarity results because the total quantity of sound does not set up such a loud response from the building: this is, in effect singing "under" the echo. This range of sound and the acoustical response from the Cathedral was clearly demonstrated by the differing sizes and sound of the vocal ensembles in this program. The danger for the consort is that the noise level in a city-center building can simply create too much ambient sound. Stephen Plank suggests that we should consider the venue to be a part of the performance, "for it shapes the sound, enhances the reception, and inflects the interpretation. ${ }^{, 85}$ David Willcocks, former conductor of King's College, Cambridge, commented on how the ambiance of that highly resonant Chapel affected - and, in a way, became a part of - his performances: "...it narrows the range of expression because if you sing $f f$ you will hear it five seconds later; if you reach $m f$ at the climax you can move on to something else two seconds later."

The number of performers is a crucial part of the equation. If the body of sound is too little, it can be lost in a large space: but if larger, do we lose the effectiveness of subtly expressive phrasing and expressive gestures? Do individual singer's attempts to characterize the music become lost in the general "bathroom" of sound? Admittedly the reverse is true - in a dead room do we need to work harder as performers/interpreters? Memories of difficult performance venues abound in the life of the touring musician - walking into (yet another) carpeted sanctuary or

[^47]acoustically dry campus theater to try and spin a web of beautiful sustained polyphony while horribly jet-lagged does have its challenges. One instinctively tries harder to characterize the music in the present, to make it more "effective," more varied for the audience.

## Post-Performance Commentary

Achieving a sense of coherence with good balance, blend and secure intonation in the Cathedral was a problem due to lack of time. The tutti group was large enough to create a more homogenous choral sound, but still small enough for individual vocal traits to be audible. A problem with the long echo is that high pitches in particular last a long time: some slightly sharp soprano singing at one end of the ensemble, for example, may not be instantly audible at the other, but it will be heard in the echo, and it is hard to resist the pull of such notes.

Good blend was more difficult to achieve within some of the sections, notably the soprano and tenor parts: the individual vocal personalities and timbres of the singers took time to gel with the wide range of ages and levels of experience. The difficulties of singing in such a resonant space meant that some differences of opinion about pitch did not settle down in the concert performance. This was particularly audible in the soprano parts as they crossed the break in their voices around $d^{\prime}-f^{\prime}$. The tenor voices exhibited some occasional soloistic singing in the individual ensembles, but settled to a more even sound in the tutti pieces.

The program content was very much determined by the circumstances: the visiting ensembles were, for the most part, repeating items already in their repertoire, and there was not much time for the learning of new music. The program offered a mixture of "classic" Spanish polyphony with the works of Victoria and Guerrero, plus the less familiar music by Rogier, Navarro and Franco.

An ingredient in Rogier's music, which distinguishes it from the purely Spanish sound of Guerrero or Victoria, is his love of sequence. Particularly at the end of some of his mass movements, he embarks upon great swirls of (often descending) sequential phrases, which inevitably throw out some challenges about his chromatic language. As editors, we may feel ourselves forced to intervene - we may be tempted to introduce some musica ficta to "correct" Rogier's music. Reasons to avoid this temptation, and the risk of being sucked into a cyclic descent into extraordinarily flat keys, is well illustrated by Peter Urquhart in his article on cross-relations in FrancoFlemish music. ${ }^{86}$ As a consequence of research on the topic and listening to the performance, I have become more aware of the effect of some decisions about accidentals and musica ficta. Urquhart's thesis is that we have tended to shy away from the essentially melodic nature of this Franco-Flemish music and have considered it from a more harmonic angle, trying to force the music into more conventional patterns. We have sought to correct some unusual diminished intervals resulting from the imitative treatment by altering the lines with raised and lowered degrees. He argues that in so doing, we are diluting the flavorful essence of this music - and getting ourselves into some tight, flat corners in the process.

[^48]One such decision is found at measure 44 of the Christe eleison. The tenor part, when considered on its own (as the performer would have seen it in the partbook), looks like this:

Fig. 21


The second F in this extract is sharpened in the print, but as is normal, there is no accidental for the next F, two notes later. In modern notation, the accidental would last until the end of the bar, but as in this case there are no bars, and it is not so clear what to do. The key here is the melodic contour: the notes on the syllable "lei-" form a single gesture and the singer would almost certainly use the sharp for both the second and the third. ${ }^{87}$ The first F has to be F natural as it is part of a chord with an A and another F natural. The shift to the F sharp is so distinct that returning to F natural for the asterisked note is almost unthinkable. The source reinforces the view that the singer would sing an F sharp for both notes:


Fig. 22. Rogier, Christe eleison from Missa Inclita stirps Jesse, bars 43-46, tenor.

[^49]When we see it in the context of the other voice parts, however, the effect becomes quite striking (see fig. 23) where we see a simultaneous cross-relation between the Tenor and Cantus.


Fig. 23. Rogier, Christe eleison from Missa Inclita stirps Jesse, bars 43-46.

This effect is more usually associated with English music of the period, but thanks to the work of Peter Urquhart and others, we are becoming more used to its appearance in Flemish music. The eminent Victorian editor of Tudor Church Music and of the series Early English Madrigals, Edmund Horace Fellowes, found this clash hard to take, and he would sometimes tacitly alter the "offending" parts. ${ }^{88}$ This editor is fond of similar dissonances, partly for their own sake, but also because they serve to provide more of a link between English and continental polyphony and reduce the image of England being a culturally isolated island. Others might prefer to take the

[^50]editorial pen and add an editorial natural over the third F in "an unwillingness to believe the harmonic effect of a music essentially linear in conception." ${ }^{89}$

The performance of the Missa Inclita stirps Jesse went well, helped considerably by careful preliminary markings of breathing and expression marks. ${ }^{90}$ Though all the individual ensembles and singers were familiar with performing imitative Renaissance polyphony, there were definite differences in their "house" styles, and the bulk of the available time was spent not on notes (which, given the melodic material in Clemens non Papa's motet and Rogier's treatment of it, are fairly straightforward), but on trying to move towards a sort of "uniform freedom" of expression.

In my work as a choral director, I naturally emphasize the importance of keeping time and having good ensemble, but there are often places where the music and the singers need to be flexible. We often speak of taking time over an activity, but as a conductor, I prefer the notion of giving time - giving each other time to execute a phrase or decorative figure without hurry. If necessary, we may have to commit that choral sin of being out of time, in the sense of letting go of a rigid and inflexible tactus and yet still being together, particularly at cadences. If the last note of a phrase, for example, is snatched short to allow a breath, it can have a deleterious effect on the flow of the music. The "snatched last note syndrome" has the effect of an accent on

[^51]what is often a weak syllable, of the end of a phrase when the energy level would normally be dissipating, so it is especially unwelcome when trying to encourage proper verbal accentuation as a sine qua non of good Renaissance singing. The unexpected accent introduces too much of a reference to time and pulse, as though these things were more important than shape and beauty of expression. ${ }^{91}$

This kind of care and attention requires great concentration on behalf of the singers, and a willingness to engage with each other, which does take time to achieve. There were many beautifully managed cadences and finely wrought phrases in the Rogier performance, which was very gratifying. Though the text of the Ordinary of the Mass is familiar to many (and certainly to the performers gathered together for this performance), other texts are not so well known; therefore the inclusion of a translation in the edition is an essential ingredient, together with reminders, either written or by demonstration, of the correct accentuation. I like to encourage singers to insert the strong and weak signs of syllabic stress (- and ${ }^{\text { }) ~ t o ~ b e ~ a n ~ i n s t a n t ~ v i s u a l ~}$ reminder of any phrase where the agogic accent does not match the metrical flow across a barline, for example. ${ }^{92}$

Much fine, expressive singing helped bring the music to life and illumined the qualities of Rogier's music that I find so intriguing. Rogier undoubtedly has one foot clearly planted in the soil of his Franco-Flemish predecessors, Clemens non Papa and Gombert, but he also gives more than a nod to the passionate outpourings of his

[^52]adopted homeland, typified by the music of Guerrero and Victoria. As indications of his "pan-European" interests, Rogier takes the Italian Palestrina for his model for a more formal style of writing in the eight-part Missa In virtute tua, and is clearly aware of and interested in the more Venetian polychoral style of the Gabrielis, as demonstrated in his 12-part motets and Missa Domine Dominus noster. Five French chansons are all that is left of his secular vocal pieces, and so far, none of his vernacular Spanish villançicos have surfaced. Douglas Kirk's recent publication of music for the ministriles of the Duke of Lerma contained transcriptions of several pieces by Rogier that added to the corpus of his known music, so we can remain optimistic that further discoveries may be made that will further reinforce Rogier's position of one of the great masters of late sixteenth-century polyphony.

# Missa Inclita Stirps Jesse by Philippe Rogier (c.1561-1596): A Critical and Performing Edition 

Kyrie eleison






* See Dissertation, Chapter 5 for a discussion of this accidental.




*See Editorial Commentary for suggested Intonation











*For suggested Intonation, see Critical Commentary









$102$













Sanctus












Agnus Dei








## Editorial Commentary

## Primary Source

The single source for this edition was published posthumously in Madrid in 1598. It was prepared by Philippe Rogier's pupil and the executor of his will, Géry de Ghersem. The original dedicatee was King Philip II, who died before the work was completed. The published edition was dedicated to Philip III; it contains five masses by Rogier and one by de Ghersem.

Title: $\quad$ Missae Sex Philippi Rogerii Atrebatensis Sacelli Regii Phonasci Musicae peritissimi, \& aetatis suae facile Principis. Ad Philippum Tertium

Hispaniarum Regem. Matriri. Ex Typographia Regia, M.D.XCVIII.
Publisher: Madrid, Typographia Regia, 1598
RISM: $\quad \mathrm{R}-1598^{1}$
Source consulted: microform of print in Milan, Biblioteca del Conservatorio de Musica "Giuseppe Verdi."

Other prints are to be found in Germany (Neuberg/Donau, State Library); Spain (Cordoba, in the Cathedral Archive; Madrid, National Library; Malaga, Cathedral Archive; Toledo, Cathedral Archive); Italy (Milan, Conservatory Library, and Turin, Library of the Duomo); and Portugal (Coimbra, University Library).

Contents: Five Masses by Philippe Rogier (c.1561-1596)
Missa Philippus Secundus Rex Hispaniae
Missa Inclita stirps Jesse

Missa Dirige gressus meos
Missa Ego sum qui sum
Missa Inclina Domine aurem tuam
and
Missa Ave virgo sanctissima by Géry de Ghersem
This edition contains the Missa Inclita stirps Jesse in five movements: Kyrie, Gloria, Credo, Sanctus and Benedictus (all scored for four voices) and Agnus Dei (for five voices).

## Secondary source

Missa Inclita stirps Jesse: Trésor musicale: Collection Authentique de Musique Sacrée et Profane des Anciens Maîtres Belges. Robert-Julien van Maldeghem, ed. (Brussels: C. Muquardt, 1885. Reprint, Vaduz, Liechtenstein: Kraus Reprint, 1965), 3-24.

The intonations for the Gloria and Credo are not included in the print; an intonation for the Gloria was supplied by Michael Noone from a contemporaneous Toledan source; that of the Credo is taken from the Liber Usualis.

A facsimile of selected pages is included in the Appendix B.

## Critical Commentary

## Editorial Policy:

Note-lengths have been halved. Original Voice names have been retained, clefs modernized and the work has been transposed down a tone for SATB voices. The original score is written in chiavette, or "high clefs (G2, C2, C3, C4) and the work could also be transposed down a fourth and be sung by ATBarB. Spelling has been modernized where necessary. Text repetitions originally shown by "ij" have been added in italics. Any additional editorial text is shown in [square brackets]. Abbreviated text has been silently expanded. Opening clefs, key signature, mensuration sign and first pitch are shown at the start of the each movement. The range of each voice part as transposed for this edition is given below.


Barlines are inserted continuously through the score: these are for visual coordination only and should not be taken to imply regular stress patterns.

The last note in each voice part, shown as a longa in the manuscript, is represented by tied notes with a fermata.

Normal conventions apply to accidentals, which have been modernized. Those shown on the stave attached to a note are in the source and apply to a whole measure unless otherwise indicated. Suggestions for altered notes are shown as musica ficta above the notes: these accidentals apply only to the note indicated. Any cautionary accidentals are shown in parentheses. For the sake of clarity, the accidentals presented as musica ficta in the voice staves are presented as actual notes in the reductio partes.

Ligatures and coloration are shown by full and broken horizontal brackets respectively. Cases of minor color $\bullet \downarrow$ are transcribed as $\bullet \cdot \stackrel{\downarrow}{ }$ and not as triplets.

Suggested Intonations for the Gloria and Credo:


## Texts and Translations

The text and translation of the Ordinary of the Mass are printed inside the concert program. See Appendix A.

The text and translation of the Motet text:
Inclita stirps Jesse virgam produxit amoenam, de qua processit flos miro plenus odore.

The Stem of Jesse produced a beautiful branch, on which bloomed a flower of great perfume.

Responsory of Antiphon for 1st Vespers, Feast of St. Anna (Mother of the Blessed Virgin Mary).

Source: Analecta hymnica, Vol. 25, page 52

Appendix A

Concert program including performance of Missa Inclita stirps Jesse.


## CONQUISTADORS

## Music of the Spanish Golden Age

Icarus - director William Culverhouse<br>National Cathedral Consort - director Michael McCarthy<br>Orpheus - director Pbilip Cave<br>Thursday $3^{\text {rd }}$ July, 7:30pm, St. Matthew's Cathedral Rhode Island Avenue, NW, Washington, DC<br>Admission free: suggested donation $\$ 20$

Missa Inclita Stirps Jesse

Philippe Rogier (c.1561-1596)
i. Kyrie eleison
ii. Gloria in excelsis
iii. Credo in unum Deum
iv. Sanctus \& Benedictus
v. Agnus Dei

Icarus, the National Cathedral Consort and Orpheus - directed by Pbilip Cave

## Intermission of fifteen minutes

Alma redemptoris Mater
Ave Regina caelorum
Tomás Luis de Victoria (c.1548-1611)
Tomás Luis de Victoria
Icarus - director William Culverhouse

Laboravi in gemitu meo
Ave verum corpus
Ave virgo sanctissima

Juan Navarro (c.1530-1580)
Francisco de Peñalosa (1470-1528)
Francisco Guerrero (1527/8-1599)

Regina caeli
Quem vidistis pastores
Salve Regina

Tomas Luis de Victoria Tomas Luis de Victoria Tomas Luis de Victoria

> National Cathedral Consort - director Michael McCartby

Ave Maria
Tomas Luis de Victoria
Icarus, National Cathedral Consort, and Orpheus - directed by Pbilip Cave

## PERFORMERS

Icarus<br>Shannon Kelly, Ellen Kliman - Soprano<br>Jennifer Goltz, Michelle Rice - Alto<br>David Arbury, Timothy Reno - Tenor<br>William Culverhouse, Ryan Lewis \& Jonathan Woody - Bass

National Cathedral Consort<br>Christine Buras, Catherine Fireman, Genevieve McGahey \& Charlotte Woolley - Soprano<br>Christopher Dudley, Roger Isaacs - Alto<br>Lawrence Reppert, Matthew Smith - Tenor<br>Karl Hempel, Benjamin Park - Bass

## Orpheus

Sally Dunkley, Jacqueline Horner Kwiatek - Soprano Steven Rickards - Alto Philip Cave - Tenor
Michael McCarthy - Bass

## 88

## Music of the Spanish Golden Age

This evening's program celebrates the enormously rich repertoire of Renaissance sacred music in Spain. The earliest composer represented tonight is Francisco de Peñalosa (1470-1528). He was a prolific composer of sacred music, including some six masses, six Magnificat settings, three Lamentation settings, and many hymns, motets and songs attributed to him in Iberian or New World sources. Though primarily associated with Seville Cathedral, he was also chamberlain and a singer in the chapel of Pope Leo X in Rome, for whom some of his masses and motets may have been composed.

Little is known of his early years, but in 1549, Juan Navarro (c.1530-1580) was a singer in the service of the Duke of Arcos, and then sang in the cathedral choirs of Jaén and Málaga under the direction of Cristóbel de Morales. From 1562 to 1564 he was maestro de capilla at the collegiate church in Valladolid. He held similar posts at the cathedrals of Ávila, Salamanca, Ciudad Rodrigo, and Palencia. Navarro's surviving music is mainly sacred, most of it appearing in a posthumous publication, Psalmi, bymni ac Magnificat totius anni (Rome, 1590).

Francisco Guerrero (1527/8-1599) studied composition with Morales, and in 1542, he too was employed as a singer at Seville Cathedral. In 1546 he was appointed maestro de capilla of Jaén Cathedral, but he returned to Seville in 1549, where he remained for the rest of his life. Guerrero began publishing his music in the 1550 s, and his masses and motets rapidly brought him considerable renown. He twice visited Italy in order to publish his works and his ouput was prolific, including works in both Latin and Spanish, whose aim was "not to caress the ears of pious persons with song, but to excite their ... souls to worthy contemplation of the sacred mysteries" (Liber vesperarum, Rome, 1584).

Both Emperor Charles V (reg. 1519-1555) and his son Philip II (reg. 1556-1598) maintained elaborate musical courts. Choristers from the Netherlands were recruited to sing in the royal chapel, and in 1572 Philippe Rogier (c.1561-1596) was one of several boys brought to sing in the royal court at Madrid. His name reappears some years later as a priest and he became maestro di capilla at the age of 25 . Another prolific composer, much of Rogier's music (over 240 pieces) is lost, but several mass settings and motets survive and indicate a composer of astonishing maturity and imagination. Copies of a book of Six Masses published posthumously in 1598 survive in Spain and Mexico, including the Missa Inclita Stirps Jesse, which is based on a motet of that name by the great Flemish composer Jacobus Clemens.

Hailed as the greatest Spanish composer of the Renaissance, and also one of the finest European composers of the time, Tomás Luis de Victoria (c.1548-1611) spent many years in Rome, where he may have studied with Palestrina, before returning to Spain in 1695. He entered the service of the Dowager Empress Maria, sister of King Philip II, for whose funeral he was to compose his great Officium defunctorum of 1605. Victoria's output was exclusively sacred, much smaller than that of his contemporaries Palestrina or Lassus, and included several masses and numerous motets, many to texts associated with the Virgin Mary.

The music in tonight's program gives us an overview of $16^{\text {th }}$ century Spanish sacred music ranging from the simple chordal structure of Peñalosa's Ave verum corpus to the passionate double-choir setting of Victoria's eight-part Ave Maria. Much of the music reflects the imitative, polyphonic style of the Franco-Flemish tradition stretching back to Josquin and Gombert - but we also hear the influence of the more contemporary Italian musical ideas of contrast and variety. Common to all this repertoire is a richness of expression, and music which is simultaneously passionate yet deeply personal. It is rightly described as a Golden Age.

## 88

This concert is part of the annual Early Choral Music Workshop organized by CHORWORKS led by Philip Cave, with distinguished international faculty of performers and teachers including

Jacqueline Horner Kwiatek (Anonymous 4), Sally Dunkley (Tallis Scholars \& The Sixteen), Steven Rickards (Chanticleer \& American Bach Soloists), Michael McCarthy (National Cathedral \& the Monteverdi Choir), Michael Noone (Ensemble Plus Ultra). Further details:
www.chorworks.com

## Other performances during the week:

Saturday $5^{\text {th }}$ July 7:30pm, Pate Auditorium, Virginia Theological Seminary, Alexandria, VA
ORPHEUS and Chorworks Summer Workshop participants perform music ranging from Medieval Old Spain to the music of the New World

Admission free
Sunday 6th July 11:15am, Christ Church, Old Town, Alexandria, VA
Chorworks Summer Workshop participants perform music by Victoria, Padilla and Peñalosa in the context of the Sung Eucharist

Admission free

## TEXTS and TRANSLATIONS

Kyrie eleison. Cbriste eleison. Kyrie eleison.
Lord, have mercy upon us. Christ, have mercy upon us. Lord, have mercy upon us.
Gloria in excelsis Deo. Et in terra pax hominibus bonae voluntatis. Laudamus te. Benedicimus te. Adoramus te. Glorificamus te. Gratias agimus tibi propter magnam gloriam tuam. Domine Deus, Rex caelestis, Deus Pater omnipotens. Dominie Fili unigenite Jesu Cbriste. Dominie Deus, Agnus Dei, Filius Patris. Qui tollis peccata mundi, miserere nobis. Qui tollis peccata mundi, suscipe deprecationem nostram. Qui sedes ad dexteram Patris, miserere nobis. Quoniam tu solus sanctus. Tu solus Dominus. Tu solus Altissimus, Jesu Cbriste. Cum Sancto Spiritu, in gloria Dei Patris. Amen.
Glory be to God on high, and on earth peace, good will towards men. We praise thee, we bless thee, we worship thee, we glorify thee, we give thanks to thee for thy great glory, O Lord God, heavenly King, God the Father Almighty. O Lord, the only-begotten Son, Jesus Christ; O Lord God, Lamb of God, Son of the Father, that takest away the sins of the world, have mercy upon us. Thou that takest away the sins of the world, receive our prayer. Thou that sittest at the right hand of God the Father, have mercy upon us. For thou only art holy; thou only art the Lord; thou only, O Christ, with the Holy Ghost, art most high in the glory of God the Father. Amen.

Credo in unum Deum, Patrem omnipotentem, factorem caeli et terrae, visibilium omnium, et invisibilium. Et in unum Dominum, Jesum Cbristum, Filium Dei unigenitum. Et ex Patre natum ante omnia saecula. Deum de Deo, lumen de lumine, Deum verum de Deo vero. Genitum, non factum, consubstantialem Patri: per quem omnia facta sunt. Qui propter nos homines, et propter nostram salutem descendit de caelis. Et incarnatus est de Spiritu Sancto ex Maria Virgine: Et homo factus est. Crucifixus etiam pro nobis: sub Pontio Pilato passus, et sepultus est. Et resurrexit tertia die, secundum Scripturas. Et ascendit in caelum: sedet ad dexteram Patris. Et iterum venturus est cum gloria iudicare vivos et mortuos: cuius regni non erit finis. Et in Spiritum Sanctum, Dominium, et vivificantem: qui ex Patre Filioque procedit. Qui cum Patre et Filio simul adoratur, et conglorificatur: qui locutus est per Prophetas. Et unam sanctam catholicam et apostolicam Ecclesiam. Confiteor unum baptisma in remissionem peccatorum. Et exspecto resurrectionem mortuorum, et vitam venturi saeculi. Amen.
I believe in one God, the Father Almighty, maker of heaven and earth, and of all things visible and invisible; And in one Lord Jesus Christ, the only-begotten Son of God, begotten of his Father before all worlds, God of God, Light of Light, very God of very God, begotten, not made, being of one substance with the Father; by whom all things were made; who for us men and for our salvation came down from heaven, and was incarnate by the Holy Ghost of the Virgin Mary, and was made man; and was crucified also for us under Pontius Pilate; he suffered and was buried; and the third day he rose again according to the Scriptures, and ascended into heaven, and sitteth on the right hand of the Father; and he shall come again, with glory, to judge both the quick and the dead; whose kingdom shall have no end. And I believe in the Holy Ghost the Lord, and Giver of Life, who proceedeth from the Father and the Son; who with the Father and the Son together is worshiped and glorified; who spake by the Prophets. And I believe one holy Catholic and Apostolic Church; I acknowledge one Baptism for the remission of sins; and I look for the resurrection of the dead, and the life of the world to come. Amen.

Sanctus, Sanctus, Sanctus Dominus Deus Sabaoth. Pleni sunt caeli et terra gloria tua. Hosanna in excelsis. Benedictus qui venit in nomine Domini. Hosanna in excelsis.

Holy, holy, holy, Lord God of Hosts: Heaven and earth are full of thy Glory. Glory be to thee, O Lord Most High. Blessed is he that cometh in the name of the Lord. Hosanna in the highest.

Agnus Dei, qui tollis peccata mundi: miserere nobis. Agnus Dei, qui tollis peccata mundi: miserere nobis. Agnus Dei, qui tollis peccata mundi: dona nobis pacem.
O Lamb of God, that takest away the sins of the world, have mercy upon us. O Lamb of God, that takest away the sins of the world, have mercy upon us. O Lamb of God, that takest away the sins of the world, grant us thy peace.

Alma Redemptoris Mater, quae pervia caeli Porta manes, et stella maris, succurre cadenti, Surgere qui curat, populo: tu quae genuisti, Natura mirante, tuum sanctum Genitorem Virgo prius ac posterius, Gabrielis ab ore Sumens illud Ave, peccatorum miserere.
Mother of Christ, hear thou thy people's cry Star of the deep and Portal of the sky! Mother of Him who thee made from nothing made. Sinking we strive and call to thee for aid: Oh, by what joy which Gabriel brought to thee, Thou Virgin first and last, let us thy mercy see.

Salve, Regina, mater misericordiae, vita, dulcedo, et spes nostra, salve. Ad te clamamus exsules filii Hevae. Ad te suspiramus, gementes et flentes in hac lacrimarum valle. Eia, ergo, advocata nostra, illos tuos misericordes oculos ad nos converte. Et Jesum, benedictum fructum ventris tui, nobis post hoc exsilium ostende. O clemens, O pia, O dulcis Virgo Maria.
Hail holy Queen, Mother of mercy, our life, our sweetness, and our hope. To thee do we cry, poor banished children of Eve. To thee do we send up our sighs, mourning and weeping in this valley of tears. Turn then, most gracious Advocate, thine eyes of mercy toward us. And after this our exile show unto us the blessed fruit of thy womb, Jesus. O clement, O loving, O sweet Virgin Mary.

Laboravi in gemitu meo, lavabo per singulas noctes lectum meum, lacrimis meis stratum meum rigabo. I am weary with sighing, every night I flood my bed with weeping: I will drench my couch with my tears.

Ave verum corpus natum de Maria Virgine: vere passum, immolatum in cruce pro homine: cuius latus perforatum unda fluxit et sanguine: esto nobis praegustatum, in mortis examine.
Hail the true body, born of the Virgin Mary: You who truly suffered and were sacrificed on the cross for the sake of man. From whose pierced flank flowed water and blood: Be a foretaste for us in the trial of death.

Ave virgo sanctissima Dei mater püsima, maris stella clarissima, salve semper gloriosa, Margarita pretiosa, sicut lilium formosa, nitens olens velut rosa.
Hail, Holy Virgin, most blessed Mother of God, bright star of the sea. Hail, ever glorious, precious pearl, lovely as the lily, beautiful and perfumed as the rose.

Regina caeli laetare, Alleluia. Quia quem meruisti portare, Alleluia. Resurrexit sicut dixit, Alleluia. Ora pro nobis Deum. Alleluia.
Queen of Heaven, rejoice, alleluia. For He whom you were worthy to bear, alleluia, has risen, as He said, alleluia. Pray for us to God, alleluia.

Quem vidistis, pastores, dicite, annuntiate nobis, in terris quis apparuit? Natum vidimus et choros angelorum collaudantes Dominum, Alleluia. Dicite, quidnam vidistis? et annuntiate Cbristi nativitatem. Alleluia.
Whom did you see, shepherds, say, tell us: who has appeared on earth? The newborn we saw and choirs of angels praising the Lord, alleluia! Say, what did you see? And tell us of Christ's nativity. Alleluia.

Ave Maria, gratia plena, Dominus tecum, benedicta tu in mulieribus et benedictus fructus ventris tui, Jesus. Sancta Maria, regina coeli, dulcis et pia, o mater Dei, ora pro nobis peccatoribus, ut cum electis te videamus.
Hail Mary, full of grace, the Lord is with thee; blessed art thou amongst women, and blessed is the fruit of thy womb, Jesus. Holy Mary, Queen of Heaven, sweet and holy, O Mother of God, pray for us sinners, that with the elect we may see thee.

## Appendix B

Title page and Christe eleison (pages 38 \& 39) from the Missa Inclita stirps, Madrid 1598.

## Miflx Sex

PHILIPPIROGERII
ATREBATENSISSACELLI
REGII PHONASCI MVSICAE
perivifimi, \&e xratis fux facile
Principis.

## ADPHILIPPVM TERTIVM

 HISPANIAR VM RECEM.

$$
M A T R I T I
$$

Ex Typographia Regia.
M. D. Xcvill.


(b) Contratenor and Bassus parts.

## Appendix C

Sample pages of rehearsal score, marked with dynamics and expressive ideas. The musical points are also given strong and weak syllable marks to help identify the articulation and phrase structure. The extract given is the opening of the Gloria, bars 1-80.





## Appendix D

Possible use of internet resources for early music editing project.
Website pages such as those outlined below, could serve to illustrate many of the issues of early choral editing and performance.

## TITLE OF PIECE

1. Historical introduction
a. Composer's biography
b. Circumstances of composition
2. Sources
a. Primary and any secondary sources
b. Description of publication(s)
c. Provenance and Variants
3. Facsimile of printed materials
4. Preparation of a modern edition
a. Commentary
b. Editorial process - pitch, note-lengths, barring, text underlay or repetition
c. Explanation of original notation and any time signatures or other markings in the original
5. Presentation of score
a. Facsimiles - part books and/or score
b. Critical edition with editorial annotations - musica ficta, mensural relationships, coloration and ligatures
c. Performing edition with some performance suggestions - this could be in the form of an "overlay" - like a plastic film over the critical edition, but the PITCH of the performing edition could be infinitely variable
d. Option to print modern "part-books" with text for possible instrumental participation, or for performer who wish to sing from this material. The possibility also exists to have an overlay in the facsimile or in these part books that would have rehearsal letters to facilitate a rehearsal from a mid-point in a piece.
6. Performance
a. There could be the option to play a "live recording" with a professional ensemble, which could perform either the printed edition, or, if relevant, could explore some alternative ideas: alternate ficta or some ornamentation, if appropriate. This would require significant funding, but a professional, human (not an electronic organ sound) ensemble is a necessity.
b. Some commentary on possible performance issues not covered above: possible inclusion of instruments
c. Different styles of pronunciation could be illustrated
7. By use of hyperlinks to other websites, visitors to the website could follow links to scholarly articles and related topics of interest.

## Modern Editions

## Modern Editions of Missa Inclita stirps Jesse:

Rogier, Philippe and Lavern Wagner, ed. Opera omnia. Vol.1. Corpus Mensurabilis musicae, 61. [S.I.]: American Institute of Musicology, 1974.

Rogier, Philippe. Missa Inclita stirps Jesse, published in Trésor Musical edited by Robert-Julien van Maldeghem. Brussels: Muquardt, 1885.

## Modern Edition of the Motet:

Clemens, Jacob. Cantiones selectissimae. Quatuor vocum. Liber secundus. Augsburg: P. Ulhard, 1549. Modern edition: K. Ph. Bernet Kempers, ed., Jacobus Clemens non Papa, Opera Omnia. Corpus Mensurabilis Musicae 9. Rome: American Institute of Musicology, 1951.

## Bibliography

A-R Editions. Sample Editorial Methods: Early Vocal Music. http://www.areditions.com/ac/Early_vocalmusic_EM.pdf (accessed October 9, 2008).

Atlas, Allan W. Renaissance Music: Music in Western Europe, 1400-1600. New York: Norton, 1998.

Becquart, Paul. "Musiciens Néerlandais en Espagne (fin XVIe-début XVIIe siècle): Inventaire Provisoire." Revue belge de Musicologie/Belgisch Tijdschrift vor Muziekwetenschap 14, no. 1/4 (1960): 72-80.
$\qquad$ . "Quatre documents espagnols inédits rélatifs à Philippe Rogier." Revue belge de Musicologie/Belgisch Tijdschrift vor Muziekwetenschap 14, no. 1/4 (1960): 126-131.
. Musiciens Néerlandais à la Cour de Madrid: Philippe Rogier et son École (1560-1647). Brussels: Palace of the Academies, 1967.

Blume, Clemens and Guido M. Dreves, ed. Analecta Hymnica Medii Aevi. Vol. 25. Leipzig, 1897. Reprint, New York: Johnson Reprint Corporation, 1961.

Bradshaw, Murray Charles. The Falsobordone: A Study in Renaissance and Baroque Music. Stuttgart: American Institute of Musicology, Hänssler-Verlag, 1978.

Brett, Philip. "Text, Context, and the Early Music Editor" in Authenticity and Early Music: A Symposium, ed. Nicholas Kenyon. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1998.

Brown, Howard Mayer. "Choral Music in the Renaissance." Early Music 6, no. 2 (April 1978): 164-169.

Caldwell, John. Editing Early Music. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1985.
Copeman, Harold. Singing in Latin, or, Pronunciation explor'd. Oxford: By the Author, 1990.

Crutchfield, William. "Fashion, Conviction and Performance Style in an Age of Revivals" in Authenticity and Early Music: A Symposium, ed. Nicholas Kenyon. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1988.

Dart, Thurston. The Interpretation of Music. London and New York: Hutchinson, 1955.

Dreves, Guido Maria, and Clemens Blume. Analecta hymnica medii aevi. Augsburg: Dr. Erwin Rauner Verlag, 2002.

Elders, William. Composers of the Low Countries. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1991.
Estudantes, Paulo. "A new 17th-century Iberian Source of Instrumental Music." Early Music 34, no. 4 (Aug. 2006): 645-66.

Grier, James. The Critical Editing of Music: History, Method and Practice. Cambridge: University Press, 1996.

Haar, James, ed. European Music 1520-1640. Cambridge: Boydell Press, 2006.
Harrison, Frank Llewellyn, ed. Musica Britannica. Vol. 10. The Eton Choir Book. London: Stainer and Bell, 1956.

Hughes, Andrew, John Dickinson Haines, and Randall Rosenfield. Music and Medieval Manuscripts: Paleography and Performance: Essays Dedicated to Andrew Hughes. Aldershot, Hants, UK: Ashgate, 2004.

Kenyon, Nicholas, ed. Authenticity and Early Music: A Symposium. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1988.

Kirk, Douglas. "Instrumental Music in Lerma." Early Music 23, no. 3 (Aug. 1995): 393-408.
$\qquad$ , ed. Music for the Duke of Lerma: Canciones and Motets of Four, Five, and Six Voices. Watertown, MA: Amherst Early Music, 2006.

Knighton, Tess, and David Fallows, ed. Companion to Medieval \& Renaissance Music. New York: Schirmer Books, 1992.

Kreitner, Kenneth. "Minstrels in Spanish Churches." Early Music 20, no. 4 (Nov. 1992): 533-546.

Maes, Francis, ed. The Empire Resounds: Music in the Days of Charles V. Leuven, Belgium: Leuven University Press, 1999.

McGee, Timothy. Singing Early Music. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1996.
Noone, Michael. Music and Musicians in the Escorial Liturgy under the Habsburgs, 1563-1700. Rochester: University of Rochester Press, 1998.

Phillips, Peter. "Performance Practice in 16th-Century English Music." Early Music 6, no. 2 (1978): 195-199.
$\qquad$ . "Laboravi in Gemitu Meo: Morley or Rogier?" Music \& Letters 63, no. 1/2 (Jan.-Apr. 1982): 85-90.

Plank, Stephen E. Choral Performance - A Guide to Historical Practice. Lanham, MD: Scarecrow Press, 2004.

Pope, Isabel. "The Spanish Chapel of Philip II." Renaissance News 5, no. 2 (Summer 1952): 34-38.

Potter, John. Vocal Authority: Singing Style and Ideology. Cambridge: University Press, 1998.

Ramm, Andrea von. "Singing Early Music." Early Music 4, no. 1 (Jan. 1976): 12-15.
Richafort, Jean. Officium Defunctorum. Das Chorwerk, Vol.124. Wolfenbüttel: Möseler Verlag, n.d.

Rogier, Philippe and Lavern Wagner, ed. Opera omnia. Corpus Mensurabilis Musicae, 61. [S.I.]: American Institute of Musicology, 1974.

Rogier, Philippe. Missa Ego sum qui sum. Magnificat, directed by Philip Cave. Linn Records CKD109, 1999. CD.

Savall, Jordi. "Performing Early Spanish Music." Early Music 20, no. 4 (Nov. 1992): 649-653.

Sherman, Bernard D. "Singing Like a Native" in Inside Music: Conversations with Performers. Oxford: University Press, 1997.

Sherr, Richard. "Performance Practice in the Papal Chapel during the 16th Century." Early Music 15, no. 4 (Nov. 1987): 453-462.
$\qquad$ . "Competence and Incompetence in the Papal Choir in the Age of Palestrina." Early Music 22, no. 4 (Nov. 1994): 607-629.

Stevenson, Robert. Spanish Cathedral Music in the Golden Age. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1961.

Straeten, Edmond vander. La Musique aux Pays-Bas avant le XIX siècle. Vol. 8. Brussels: Schott, 1888. Reprint, New York: Dover, 1969.

Taruskin, Richard. "On Letting the Music Speak for Itself: Some Reflections on Musicology and Performance." The Journal of Musicology 1, no. 3 (1982): 338-349.
[. "A Glimpse of the New British Choral Sound at its Best." Opus (Oct. 1986): 21-25.

Thomas, Jennifer. Motet Database Catalogue Online. http://www.arts.ufl.edu/motet/results.asp (accessed November 10, 2009).

Turner, Bruno. "The Editor: Diplomat or Dictator?" in Companion to Medieval and Renaissance Music, ed. Tess Knighton and David Fallows. London: Dent, 1992.

Urquhart, Peter. "Cross-Relations by Franco-Flemish Composers after Josquin." Tijdschrift van de Vereniging voor Nederlandse Muziekgeschiedenis 43, no. 1 (1993): 3-41.

Weiss, Piero and Richard Taruskin. Music in the Western World: A History in Documents. Belmont, CA: Wadsworth Group, 1984.


[^0]:    ${ }^{1}$ The capilla was described by a visiting ambassador in 1551, quoted in Francis Maes, The Empire Resounds, p. 40-41: "There are forty singers, who form the most respected and most excellent chapel in the whole of Christendom. They were chosen from various provinces of the Low Countries, which may today be seen as the fount of music."
    ${ }^{2}$ See Maes, The Empire, 150.
    ${ }^{3}$ Charles suffered from severe gout, which interfered with his 1552 campaign to recapture the city of Metz. See "The severe gout of Holy Roman Emperor Charles V," New England Journal of Medicine 355/5 (2006): 516-20.
    ${ }^{4}$ Philip's II's chapel-masters included Nicolas Payen (1556-1559), Pierre de Manchicourt (15601564), Jean Bonmarchais (1564-1569), Gérard de Turnhout (1572-1580), George de la Hèle (15811586), and Philippe Rogier (1588-1596). The members of the Spanish chapel included singers, the ministriles (wind players), viol players and lutenists.

[^1]:    ${ }^{5}$ Robert Stevenson, Spanish Cathedral Music in the Golden Age (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1961), 241. A potentially contradictory scenario is discussed by Michael Noone in Chapter 3 of Music and Musicians in the Escorial Liturgy, (University of Rochester Press, 1998), 76. He suggests that "the case for considering either Charles V or Philip II as energetic musical patrons is supported more by anecdotal rather than weighty historical evidence."
    ${ }^{6}$ Noone, Music and Musicians, 87.

[^2]:    7 "Music was accorded such a lofty place in Spanish cathedrals that the extraliturgical genres in Latin and in the vernacular were cultivated as they were perhaps nowhere else in Europe." Haar, European Music (Cambridge: Boydell Press, 2006), 426. Haar goes on to quote from the statutes of Seville cathedral, where permanent, salaried positions for instrumental musicians were established in 1533. The canons stated that it was "a very decent thing and conforms to divine scriptures that the cathedral be served with all kinds of music such as that of the said instrumentalists."
    ${ }^{8}$ See Masses and Models, p. 13.
    ${ }^{9}$ From J. de Sigüenza, Fundación del Monasterio de El Escorial, in Noone, Music and Musicians, 60: "the minstrels with bajones [bassoons] and cornetas [cornetts]... with much polyphony and elegant voices with the organs, which sounded heavenly."

[^3]:    ${ }^{10}$ Noone, Music and Musicians, fig. 3, 57.
    ${ }^{11}$ Noone, Music and Musicians, 55.
    ${ }^{12}$ Noone, Music and Musicians, 53.

[^4]:    ${ }^{13}$ See Noone, Music and Musicians, 52-53.
    ${ }^{14}$ This information is derived from the title page of the 1598 publication of his masses: Missae Sex Philippi Rogerii Atrebatensis Sacelli Regii Phonasci Musicae peritissimi, \& aetatis suae facile Principis. Ad Philippum Tertium Hispaniarum Regem. Matriri. Ex Typographia Regia, M.D.XCVIII.

[^5]:    ${ }^{15}$ See, Philippe Rogier, Opera omnia, ed. Lavern Wagner. Corpus Mensurabilis Musicae, 61 ([S.I.]: American Institute of Musicology, 1974), Vol. 1, x.
    ${ }^{16}$ A volume of Rogier's music was requested by the Spanish organist and composer Guttierez de Padilla when he took over as maestro at the Cathedral in Puebla, Mexico, in 1627; as late as 1669, the organist of Toledo Cathedral purchased six books of Rogier's music.
    ${ }^{17}$ These included prebendaries at Yvoir, Arras, Tournai, Leon and Lenz. See Becquart, Musiciens Néerlandais à la Cour de Madrid: Philippe Rogier et son École (1560-1647) (Brussels: Palace of the Academies, 1967), 15, 26-7, 32, 232-3.
    ${ }^{18}$ See Rogier, Opera omnia, Vol. 1, xi.
    ${ }^{19}$ From El Laurel de Apolo. This description is quoted in several sources, including Becquart, Musiciens Néerlandais, 61.

[^6]:    20 "Philippe Rogier, chapel master, who was one of the foremost men of his profession in his time." Quoted in Becquart, "Quatre documents espagnols inédits rélatifs à Philippe Rogier." Revue belge de Musicologie/Belgisch Tijdschrift vor Muziekwetenschap 14, no. 1/4 (1960), 127.
    ${ }^{21}$ Listed in Becquart, Musiciens Néerlandais, 61-69.
    ${ }^{22}$ See Becquart, Musiciens Néerlandais, Chapter 2, for a survey of Rogier's music, including details from the catalogue of the library of King John IV of Portugal.
    ${ }^{23}$ A volume of Rogier's music was requested by the Spanish organist and composer Guttierez de Padilla when he took over as maestro at the Cathedral in Puebla, Mexico, in 1627; as late as 1669, the organist of Toledo Cathedral purchased six books of Rogier's music.

[^7]:    ${ }^{24}$ Rogier owned twelve books of motets and Italian madrigals by Andrea Gabrieli, which were among his effects bequeathed to Géry de Ghersem: see Becquart, Quatre documents, 130. Basso continuo parts for Rogier's 12-part Missa Domine Dominus noster are found in the cathedral libraries of Palma de Mallorca and Segovia.

[^8]:    ${ }^{25}$ Rogier may have paid a compliment to Clemens by the choice of his motet as a model for this mass: a slightly different compliment is paid to Rogier himself by the publication of Laboravi in gemitu in England: though the compliment is somewhat backhanded, as Thomas Morley (of "Plaine and Easie" fame) published the work under his own name.
    ${ }^{26}$ These are published in Rogier, Opera omnia, Vol. 3.

[^9]:    ${ }^{27}$ Douglas Kirk, transcr. and ed. Music for the Duke of Lerma: Canciones and Motets of Four, Five, and Six Voices. (Watertown, MA: Amherst Early Music Inc., 2006).

[^10]:    ${ }^{28}$ Editorial decisions and further information are given in the Commentary to the Edition.

[^11]:    ${ }^{29}$ See Todd M. Borgerding and Louise Stein, "Spain, i: 1530-1600" in European Music, ed. James Haar (Cambridge: Boydell Press, 2006), Chapter 21, for a comprehensive survey of Spanish composers and their models.

[^12]:    ${ }^{30}$ The text Inclita stirps Jesse is prescribed for the Feast of St. Anne (mother of the Virgin Mary) and for the Office of the Nativity of the Virgin. See Andrew Hughes, John Dickinson Haines, and Randall Rosenfield, Music and Medieval Manuscripts: Paleography and Performance: Essays Dedicated to Andrew Hughes (Aldershot, Hants, UK: Ashgate, 2004), 352 and 365. The text of the motet is given in Appendix A.
    ${ }^{31}$ Jennifer Thomas cites six sources in the Motet Database Catalogue Online, http://www.arts.ufl.edu/motet/results.asp (accessed November 10, 2009).

[^13]:    ${ }^{32}$ Bruno Turner, "The Editor: Diplomat or Dictator?" in Companion to Medieval and Renaissance Music" edited by Tess Knighton and David Fallows (London: Dent, 1992), 249.
    ${ }^{33}$ Turner, The Editor, 249, quoting R. R. Terry (1865-1938), Organist of Westminster Cathedral in London, celebrated for his pioneering revival of Tudor liturgical music.

[^14]:    ${ }^{34}$ Turner, The Editor, 250.
    ${ }^{35}$ Turner, The Editor, 252.
    ${ }^{36}$ Musica Britannica, Vol. 10, The Eton Choirbook, edited by Frank Llewellyn Harrison (London: Stainer and Bell, 1956). The cross-beaming is, of course, perfectly logical, as it presents groups of notes in patterns which the eye can see, but it is hard to perform and sometimes even harder to fit

[^15]:    against other equally complex and busy parts, which are all simultaneously dealing with their own involved cross-rhythms.
    ${ }^{37}$ Philip Brett, "Text, Context, and the Early Music Editor" in Authenticity and Early Music: A Symposium, ed. Nicholas Kenyon (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1998), 92.

[^16]:    ${ }^{38}$ John Caldwell, Editing Early Music (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1985), 48.

[^17]:    ${ }^{39}$ Caldwell, Editing, 54.
    ${ }^{40}$ This information and other practical issues are addressed in Performing Issues and in the Commentary to the Edition, below.

[^18]:    ${ }^{41}$ Brett, in Authenticity, 91.
    ${ }^{42}$ Thurson Dart, The Interpretation of Music (London and New York: Hutchinson, 1955), 13-14.

[^19]:    ${ }^{43}$ This is a development of ideas suggested in James Grier's The Critical Editing of Music: History, Method and Practice (Cambridge, University Press, 1996), 177-79, and from discussions with Sally Dunkley and Francis Steele, editors of the Oxford University Press Series Musica Dei Donum.
    ${ }^{44}$ A further refinement could be the availability of sound files of (a) individual voice parts and (b) a complete performance given by human voices, not electronic "midi" sounds. Performances of high quality would provide examples of good performing practice, and make the music available to the scholar or listener in addition to the conductor or performer. See Appendix C for an outline of possible website use for early music editing.

[^20]:    ${ }^{45}$ Will Crutchfield, "Fashion, Conviction and Performance Style in an Age of Revivals" in Kenyon, ed., Authenticity, 22.

[^21]:    ${ }^{46}$ Their attachment is rather like the retractable dog leashes that allow the pet to roam, but which are periodically reeled in more tightly when necessary. At the risk of pursuing the metaphor too far, dog leashes are, of course, not required if, to use Philip Brett's phrase, we are in the "walled garden of early music." Philip Brett, "Text, Context, and the Early Music Editor" in Kenyon, ed., Authenticity, 83.
    ${ }^{47}$ For example, Roger Norrington's performances of Berlioz' Symphonie fantastique with period instruments and the work of John Eliot Gardiner's Orchestre Révolutionnaire et Romantique.

[^22]:    ${ }^{48}$ Setting aside the questions about the practice and desirability of uniform bowing at any particular time or location, the use of the terms conductor and concertmaster does of course raise other questions about the size and make-up of ensembles and how they were formed and led. The more participants there are, the more uniformity seems to matter, and the more uniform the playing, the more anonymous it may become. See discussion on "Blend vs. Bland," below.
    ${ }^{49}$ There is a growing corpus of literature on the subject. See Savall, Performing Early Spanish Music; Kreitner, Minstrels in Spanish Churches; Haar, European Music; Stevenson, Spanish Cathedral Music in the Golden Age; Noone, Music and Musicians in the Escorial Liturgy.

[^23]:    ${ }^{50}$ I have had the opportunity to perform and record Rogier's 12-part Missa Domine Dominus noster with members of the American Renaissance ensemble Piffaro: the inclusion of two shawms alongside a relatively small (10-voices) vocal ensemble required some careful microphone placing to achieve good balance.

[^24]:    ${ }^{51}$ From the archives of the Cathedral of Seville, 1586. This passage is quoted in Music in the Western World, edited by Piero Weiss and Richard Taruskin (Belmont, CA: Wadsworth Group, 1984), 160. The editors suggest that the passage "takes instrumental doubling for granted" and continue, "It is clear that instrumentalists did not merely play along with the chorus, but at times actually replaced the singers or alternated with them."
    ${ }^{52}$ The comments that emerge from the diaries of Sistine Chapel, for example, are more concerned with liturgical propriety than musical detail. See Richard Sherr, "Performance Practice in the Papal Chapel during the 16th Century" Early Music 15/4 (Nov. 1987), 454.

[^25]:    ${ }^{53}$ Peter Phillips, quoted in Richard Taruskin's "The Pastness of the Present," in Authenticity, ed. Kenyon, 143. There is evidence that some of the singers of the Papal choirs in late sixteenth-century Rome were not all of the highest quality. Richard Sherr in "Competence and Incompetence in the Papal Choir in the Age of Palestrina" Early Music 22/4 (Nov. 1994), 614 and 617, lists fairly damning descriptions of several of the singers. In the list of Papal Singers submitted to the Cardinals' Commission of 1565 , descriptions of some of the musicians include comments such as "...poor, but deaf and acceptable; ...ill, infamous and poor; rich, acceptable, keeps a mistress; ...poor, useful and acceptable, has no voice." And in "Remarks on the Abilities of Certain Singers" (1573): "...his voice is without substance and makes no impression whatsoever; ...this one is a tenor and has a terrible voice; ...these [two] are sopranos and have voices that are more hoarse and dissonant than not, but they are very useful because they are priests; ...he does not have a very good voice and is more dissonant, than not." Given these descriptions, Phillips may have a point in not wishing to imitate them, but on behalf of all those of us who have also not heard a sixteenth-century choir, yet are entranced by the music written for them, something about the extraordinary quantity and quality of the choral music of the period would suggest that the performers were doing something right. If the performances were so dire, composers might hesitate to continue to write and make significant demands of their performers - and certainly patrons might question their continued investment.

[^26]:    ${ }^{54}$ The choir of the Sistine Chapel reputedly made do with just one rehearsal per year to prepare for the Holy Week services including the Miserere settings of Allegri and others. See Jean Lionnet, "Performance Practice in the Papal Chapel during the 17th Century," Early Music 15/1 (Feb. 1987), 315.

[^27]:    ${ }^{55}$ Noone, Music and Musicians, 46-7.
    ${ }^{56}$ As a member of the choirs of Christ Church Cathedral and New College in Oxford, I sang daily Choral Evensongs and Sunday services for almost two decades. With this activity certain aspects of singing become more routine. Once a choir has established a style of chanting Psalms, for example, less familiar texts can be made to conform to that style with comparatively little effort. Newcomers to the capilla flamenca, whether junior chorister or adult singers, would quickly absorb the style from their neighbors, since they would be singing services several times every day.

[^28]:    ${ }^{57}$ Colla parte performance is playing the same part or doubling a singer. The likelihood of contemporary players being less familiar with many liturgical texts is a further argument in favor of supplying translations in the score. These texts could easily be transferred to the individual parts.
    ${ }^{58}$ Caldwell, Editing, 54.
    ${ }^{59}$ Michael Noone's ensemble, Plus Ultra, for example, has the advantage of a musicologist-director who is steeped in the language and culture of Spain.

[^29]:    ${ }^{60}$ For more information on historical pronunciation by language and period, see Harold Copeman, Singing in Latin, and Timothy McGee, Singing Early Music.
    ${ }^{61}$ John Potter, Vocal Authority, 121. "RP," or Received Pronunciation, is sometimes referred to as "Oxford English," or the "Queen's English" or "Radio 4 English." Radio 4, once called "The BBC Home Service" has often been accused of having overtones of class-consciousness, which the British Broadcasting Corporation has tried to avoid in recent years by deliberately promoting regional accents. See Red Byrd, below.

[^30]:    ${ }^{62}$ Potter, Vocal Authority, 120. He goes on to speculate about the Tudor singer if the impedimenta of "social and musical constraints" were removed: "The kind of singing that would emerge from a systematic attempt to reconstruct Renaissance or baroque technique would use regional accents and would have a 'natural' sound of an untrained voice, probably not dissimilar to that of a folk or rock singer. Strip away the rock rhetoric of Sting, Phil Collins or Freddie Mercury, and you are left with a basic sound that may be much more appropriate for early music than that made by most of today's specialists." As we now have recordings of Sting's interpretations of Dowland lute songs, perhaps we can still look forward to a classically trained, Renaissance specialist singer such as Rogers CoveyCrump offering a recording of Roxanne or Every Breath You Take.

[^31]:    ${ }^{63}$ Kenyon, Authenticity, 13.

[^32]:    ${ }^{64}$ See the discussion on musical material in Chapter 2. The structural similarities between the mass and symphony are clear. The mass, like a symphony, has a cumulative shape. We could project the following comparison: Kyrie=Slow Introduction; Gloria=Exposition of First Movement/Sonata Form; Credo $=$ Development Section. The analogy breaks down a little here, and we have to skip from "micro" to "macro" as the Sanctus and Benedictus is comparable to the Minuet and Trio (complete with equivalent reduced scoring in the Benedictus and Trio); the Agnus Dei is like a Coda. This has a logic and shape which, though not originally intended, lends itself to concert performance of mass settings.

[^33]:    ${ }^{65}$ In penitential seasons, the Gloria is omitted, and the balance of the mass also shifts a little, as more attention is focused on the Kyrie.
    ${ }^{66}$ See also Noone, Music and Musicians, 46, where he quotes from the Libro de las costumbres (Book of the Customs) of the monastery of El Escorial. Intricate instructions are provided for the tempo for singing particular chants, depending on the solemnity of the feast and the position of the chant within the liturgy, as part of what Noone describes as "the almost intolerable schedule of the divine offices and commemorative obligations" for the monks.
    ${ }^{67}$ Quoted in Plank, Choral Performance, 72.

[^34]:    ${ }^{68}$ See Murray Bradshaw, The Falsobordone: A Study in Renaissance and Baroque Music (Stuttgart: American Institute of Musicology, Hänssler-Verlag), 1978.

[^35]:    ${ }^{69}$ Highly valuable features of modern music software are the abilities to transpose a piece, change underlay or musica ficta markings, and print scores and parts which can be distributed to others instantly over the internet. It is worth observing, too, the plethora of websites from which editions can be downloaded: an astonishingly rich harvest is available from the pens of both amateur and expert editors. Although much of it is freely available, the quality of both scholarship and product can be variable. Two particularly successful examples are the websites of the Choral Public Domain Library and YouTube: the former has thousands of copyright-free scores for download, and the latter a seemingly inexhaustible supply of concert performance video clips. Although these are all available free, the dictum of caveat emptor still applies on issues of quality and copyright. See Appendix for a further discussion of website editions.

[^36]:    ${ }^{70}$ The choir of the Sistine Chapel, for example, reputedly rehearsed only once a year for the Holy Week performances of Allegri's Miserere. The music for daily use was selected by the senior singer of the choir, and we can speculate that it was learned by repeated performances rather than rehearsal. See Richard Sherr, "Performance Practice in the Papal Chapel during the 16th Century," Early Music 15/4 (Nov. 1987): 453-462, and "Competence and Incompetence in the Papal Choir in the Age of Palestrina," Early Music 22/4 (Nov. 1994): 607-629.

[^37]:    ${ }^{71}$ See Guerrero, above, on conflicting ornamentation.
    ${ }^{72}$ Plank, Choral Performance, 13.

[^38]:    ${ }^{73}$ Andrea von Ramm, "Singing Early Music" Early Music 4/1 (Jan. 1976), 12.

[^39]:    ${ }^{74}$ Quoted in Plank, Choral Performance, 20.
    ${ }^{75}$ Turner continues his objections to the "new vice of being over-straight" and comments "passion and warmth are not inappropriate in church polyphony." See Plank, 21.

[^40]:    ${ }^{76}$ Anthony Rooley views the comparison as "the difference between oils and acrylics." He comments that the Italians' style is like "enjoying a powerful effect when you first see acrylic colors. You think Wow!" He likens the Consort's singing to the chiaroscuro of Titian's oil paintings, and comments on Concerto Italiano: "Once you've got accustomed to the brilliance and sharpness of sound and the bright colors assaulting your ears, you begin to hear the strengths and weaknesses of each individual voice." Rooley is quoted in The Renaissance, Oxbridge, and Italy in "Singing Like a Native," Part II of Inside Early Music: Conversations with Performers by Bernard D. Sherman (Oxford: University Press, 1997), 150-51.
    ${ }^{77}$ Perhaps we may leave the last word on the subject of vibrato to Hindemith: "I don't know how, with no vibrato, Bach could have had so many sons." Quoted by Julianne Baird in Beyond the Beautiful Pearl, from "The Baroque" in Inside Early Music, ed. Sherman, 225.

[^41]:    ${ }^{78}$ See Appendix for text and translation of the mass.

[^42]:    ${ }^{79}$ One might make different choices between programming a live performance and a recording. The digital age enables the CD listener to jump from track to track, or program the playing order - or, indeed, there is the "random play" button which absolves us from all responsibility in programming.

[^43]:    ${ }^{80}$ Richard Taruskin, "A Glimpse of the New British Choral Sound at its Best," Opus (Oct. 1986), 2125.
    ${ }^{81}$ Chorworks is a 501 (c)(3) non-profit company, which exists to promote the study and performance of early choral repertoire.

[^44]:    ${ }^{82}$ During the last three years, I have conducted performances of the Rogier's Missa Philippus Secundus, Missa Domine Dominus noster, Missa Inclina Domine and Missa Inclita stirps Jesse in the DC area.

[^45]:    ${ }^{83}$ See Appendix B for an example of the performing score.

[^46]:    ${ }^{84}$ Perhaps there is also an argument in favor of keeping this movement in concert performances, as it declines in use in the liturgy. Singers could remain familiar with the text and be aware of the stamina needed to perform an extended musical setting.

[^47]:    ${ }^{85}$ Stephen Plank, Choral Performance, 43.

[^48]:    ${ }^{86}$ See Peter Urquahrt, "Cross-Relations by Franco-Flemish Composers after Josquin." Tijdschrift van de Vereniging voor Nederlandse Muziekgeschiedenis Vol. 43/1 (1993): 21.

[^49]:    ${ }^{87}$ The F sharp would tell the singer that the interval was the semitone mi-fa and he would approach these notes as though, in modern terminology, he were in the key of G.

[^50]:    ${ }^{88}$ In one case, where the dissonance could not be ignored or altered, Fellowes adds a footnote to instruct the singer that the offending note "should be sung very lightly."

[^51]:    ${ }^{89}$ Urquhart, Cross-Relations, 21. Two further examples serve to illustrate the inconsistency of the marks in the manuscript parts and the importance of seeing them in their full context. In the Bass of the Gloria, see measure 45 of the transcription, the first B is raised in the manuscript, but there is no indication that it should immediately be lowered. The harmonic movement culminating in a V - I cadence (reinforced by the suspension and resolution between Cantus and Contratenor) obliges us to cancel the sharpened note immediately. Later in the same movement, in the Contratenor par of bars 120-121, both Fs have sharp signs in the original.
    ${ }^{90}$ Sample pages showing rehearsal markings are included in Appendix C.

[^52]:    ${ }^{91}$ A comparison may be made to the craftsman who chamfers the edges of the furniture he is making, rather than leaving sharp edges.
    ${ }_{92}$ Accents are of three kinds: the most familiar, the dynamic accent makes a note louder than its surrounding notes; an agogic accent is an emphasis of length; a tonic accent is when the highest note of a phrase receives emphasis.

