ABSTRACT

Title of Document: DEVELOPMENT OF STUDENT MOTIVATION IN THE VISUAL ARTS USING HIP HOP CULTURE, AN ART SHOW, AND GRAFFITI

Stephanie C. Jenkins, Master of Arts, 2009

Directed By: Professor Susan Hendricks, Department of Curriculum and Instruction

This participatory action research study explored the development of student motivation in the visual arts using hip hop culture. Six adolescent middle school students from a Washington, DC, public charter school were studied. They participated in an after-school art club centered on the National Portrait Gallery’s “Recognize: Hip Hop and Contemporary Portraiture” special exhibition. The subjects were interviewed before and after visiting the museum and creating their own graffiti self-portraits. The self-portraits were displayed in an art exhibit at the school along with their artist statements. The interviews, statements and field notes were analyzed using the coding method. The results showed that feelings of competence, adequate support, autonomy, authentic purpose and personal connections to hip hop culture and musical artists all increased student motivation to participate in the visual arts. Motivation decreased when students attempted to create ‘real’ looking graffiti, consistent with existing research.
DEVELOPMENT OF STUDENT MOTIVATION IN THE VISUAL ARTS USING HIP HOP CULTURE, AN ART SHOW, AND GRAFFITI

By

Stephanie C. Jenkins

Thesis submitted to the Faculty of the Graduate School of the University of Maryland, College Park, in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Arts 2009

Advisory Committee:
Professor Susan Hendricks, Chair
Professor Olivia Saracho
Professor Lisa Bote
Professor Linda Valli
Dedication

This study is dedicated to all the students and teachers at Friendship Public Charter School, Chamberlain Campus. The challenges are great, but so are the spirits inside of each one of you.
Acknowledgements

I would like to acknowledge all those who encouraged and helped me along the way in this project:

Thank you, Ms. Bawuah, for your constant support in conducting the art club. Our trip, club meetings, and art show would not have been nearly as fun or successful without your help and creativity.

Thank you, family and friends, for donating money for art supplies through www.DonorsChoose.org and always supporting my efforts: Granny, Uncle Barry, Uncle Jon & family, Uncle Marc, the Henriksens, the Heymans, and Mom and Dad.

Thank you, my dear friend Beth, for sharing all your qualitative data analysis knowledge with me and helping me decide how to approach data analysis in this project.

Finally, thank you, Nathan, for encouraging me throughout the whole process of this project, from IRB submission to the final draft of my paper. I would not have conquered something this challenging without your support and belief in my abilities.
Table of Contents

Dedication ..................................................................................................................... ii
Acknowledgements ...................................................................................................... iii
Table of Contents ......................................................................................................... iv
List of Tables ............................................................................................................... vi
List of Figures .............................................................................................................. vii
Chapter I: Introduction ................................................................................................. 1
  Background ............................................................................................................... 1
  Significance of the Study ......................................................................................... 1
  Scope and Methodology ......................................................................................... 2
    Research Questions ............................................................................................... 2
    Methodology .......................................................................................................... 3
  Organization of the Study ......................................................................................... 3
Chapter II: Review of the Literature ............................................................................. 5
  Introduction ............................................................................................................... 5
  Motivation .................................................................................................................. 5
    Types of Motivation .............................................................................................. 5
    Steps to Building Intrinsic Motivation ................................................................ 8
  Developing Intrinsic Motivation in the Arts ............................................................ 12
    Lowenfeld’s Theories .......................................................................................... 13
    Personal Connections to Subject Matter ............................................................ 14
    Issues-based Curriculum Design ........................................................................ 16
  Special Concerns with Motivating Adolescents .................................................... 18
    Overall Motivation Declines .............................................................................. 18
    Specific Art Concerns ......................................................................................... 18
  Creating Situational Interest through Hip Hop and Graffiti ................................... 19
    Culturally Responsive Teaching through both Ethnic and Pop Culture .......... 20
    Hip Hop and Graffiti ........................................................................................... 22
Chapter III: Research Methodology ............................................................................ 24
  Introduction ............................................................................................................. 24
  Research Design and Questions .............................................................................. 24
  Participants .............................................................................................................. 27
    Sample Selection ................................................................................................. 27
    Protection of Human Subjects ............................................................................ 28
  Procedures ............................................................................................................... 29
    Setting .................................................................................................................. 29
    Prior to the Museum Visit ................................................................................... 30
    Museum Visit ....................................................................................................... 31
    After the Museum Visit ....................................................................................... 31
    Art Show Opening Reception ............................................................................. 33
  Data Collection ....................................................................................................... 33
    Pre- and Post-Project Group Interviews .............................................................. 33
    Art Show Video .................................................................................................. 35
    Artist Statements ................................................................................................. 35
# List of Tables

1. Table 3.1: Subject Characteristics ................................................. 28
2. Table 3.2: Pre-Project Group Interview Questions .......................... 34
3. Table 3.3: Post-Project Group Interview Questions ....................... 34
4. Table 3.4: Guidelines for Writing an Artist Statement ..................... 35
5. Table 3.5: Coding Themes Developed from Research Questions ........ 37
6. Table 4.1: Competence ................................................................. 41
7. Table 4.2: Support and Social Interaction .................................... 43
8. Table 4.3: Personal Connections .................................................. 45
9. Table 4.4: Authentic Purpose ......................................................... 46
10. Table 4.5: Autonomy ................................................................. 48
11. Table 4.6: Museum Visit and Valid Art Forms .............................. 49
12. Table 4.7: Graffiti ................................................................. 50
13. Table 4.8: Realism ................................................................. 51
14. Table 4.9: Self-Expression ........................................................ 53
15. Table 5.1: Subject Attendance to Study Sessions .......................... 61
List of Figures

1. Figure 1: Motivational Continuum..................................................6
Chapter I: Introduction

Background

The problem of creating and maintaining student motivation is common to all fields in education. This study mainly addressed the ways in which student motivation is developed and maintained in art education. Why should students be interested in the material that art educators have to teach? How can art educators demonstrate the relevance of their content area to students in a way that makes sense and motivates students to learn? Some art educators have turned to presenting art as a vehicle for social change and have developed lessons focused on issues relevant to students’ lives. This study investigated how creating cultural connections to subject matter in the arts can broaden students' ideas of what art is and how it can have meaning in their lives.

Significance of the Study

This study adds to the existing body of knowledge of how students develop and maintain motivation to study the arts. This study also contributes to research about student perceptions of using the visual arts as a valid form of self-expression. Finally, this study provides additional information about student perceptions of hip hop culture and graffiti when used in an educational setting.
Scope and Methodology

Research Questions

This project investigated whether identity with subject matter can increase adolescent students' motivation to pursue the visual arts, broaden their understandings of what art can be, and improve their understanding of self-expression through the arts. It was hypothesized that students’ views would change after visiting and discussing the “Recognize: Hip Hop and Contemporary Portraiture” exhibition at the National Portrait Gallery (NPG) because of the personal connections that many students their age have with the kind of musical artists portrayed at the exhibition.

The research was conducted to learn more about the topics discussed above through answering these specific research questions:

I. When teaching art to adolescents, how can student motivation be developed and sustained?
   a. Will creating personal connections through pop culture increase motivation?
   b. Will having an authentic purpose increase motivation?
   c. Will giving students autonomy increase motivation?

II. Will seeing the “Recognize” exhibition broaden student ideas of valid and respected art forms?
   a. Will viewing graffiti in a museum setting change student perceptions about graffiti?
   b. Will using graffiti dissipate student fears of realism?
III. Will students identify with the artists in the “Recognize” exhibition and realize they can express themselves through art in similar ways?

Methodology

To study adolescent motivation in the arts, the researcher developed an after-school art club based on the “Recognize: Hip Hop and Contemporary Portraiture” exhibition in the National Portrait Gallery. Students were invited to participate as long as they obtained permission and were in grades five through seven. Students participated in sessions exploring the exhibition focusing on hip hop culture prior to visiting the museum. Students visited the “Recognize” exhibition under the guidance of a museum educator. Afterwards, students created their own hip hop portrait in the style of graffiti under the guidance of the researcher. Students presented their pieces to the public in an art show at the school they attended. Data were collected through interviews, artist statements, and field notes. Data were analyzed using the qualitative method of coding (Basit, 2003).

Organization of the Study

This thesis is divided into five chapters. Each chapter is discussed briefly and the contents of each are identified in this overview.

Chapter I is a comprehensive introduction to the study. It contains the background of the problem of student motivation and explains the significance of the study. Chapter I identifies the research questions, explains how they will be answered, and outlines the structure of the thesis document.
Chapter II is the review of the relevant literature. Motivation is explored through sections about types of motivation and the development of intrinsic motivation. The history of creating personal connections to increase motivation in the visual arts is uncovered. Specific problems in creating motivation in the visual arts are explained. Motivational concerns with adolescents in the visual arts are explored as well. Finally, using ethnically and socially relevant culture to create motivation in education is discussed, focusing on the use of hip hop and graffiti.

Chapter III describes the research methods used in the study. The study design, subjects, procedures, data collection, and data analysis are all explained in detail. All data collected can be found in the appendices.

The results of the study are presented in Chapter IV and are categorized according to themes that arose in the research questions, literature review, and data collected. Data are organized in tabular format.

Chapter V discusses the implications of the research findings. Conclusions are drawn that have impact on the direction of further research and current practice in art education.

* * *

This chapter introduced the research study, outlining the methodology and the research questions. The next chapter will review the literature used as a basis for the research.
Chapter II: Review of the Literature

**Introduction**

To answer questions about identity and student motivation, past theories and findings on these topics must be explored. This chapter will review the existing research on student motivation. Past and current art education motivational strategies are described. Next, specific problems with motivation to study the arts for students in adolescent years, especially grades five through seven, are explored. Hip hop culture and graffiti’s appeal to the African American student population and use in education in urban areas will be reviewed. The background of this study is explained by this review of literature.

**Motivation**

Types of Motivation

Motivation is the level of interest and pursuit in an activity or topic. Motivation is defined through levels of “energy, direction, persistence and equifinality--all aspects of activation and intention” (Ryan & Deci, 2000, pg. 69). Motivation levels are described in many ways. This review of the literature will focus on motivation through the lens of a motivational continuum (Ryan & Deci, 2000). This continuum spans all levels of motivation from complete opposition and disinterest to voluntary pursuit and exploration of a topic or activity (see Figure I).

At one end of the motivational continuum is complete disengagement and disbelief in the worthiness of the topic or activity in question. A person in the state of amotivation lacks “the intention to act” (Ryan & Deci, 2000, pg. 72).
The next stop in the continuum is extrinsic motivation. Extrinsic motivation is “the performance of an activity in order to attain some separable outcome” (Ryan & Deci, 2000, pg. 71). A person who is extrinsically motivated is not interested in the activity for its own sake but is involved because another outside factor is motivating them. Some motivational theorists define extrinsic motivation as the opposite of intrinsic motivation; motivation solely for outside factors, like pleasing a teacher, getting a good grade for your parents, or earning rewards (Lepper et al., 2005). Others believe that extrinsic and intrinsic motivation are not mutually exclusive and can coexist, especially while motivation for a particular activity or topic is developing (Hidi & Harackiewicz, 2000; Lepper et al., 2005; Ryan & Deci, 2000).
Extrinsic motivation can be externally regulated or internally regulated (Ryan & Deci, 2000). The degree of control the person has over the extrinsic motivation determines their location on the motivational continuum. If a person is subject to following a rule or regulation being imposed upon them, they are under external control (Ryan & Deci, 2000). This is close to amotivation on the continuum. If students must maintain a 3.0 GPA to play on the basketball team, a basketball player could be extrinsically motivated to get good grades to play basketball. This would be an example of external control of extrinsic motivation. However, a student could be extrinsically motivated to get good grades for other reasons that are under their own control. A student who wants to get into Harvard would strive to get good grades to meet their own goal of receiving admission to that prestigious school. This would be an example of internal control of extrinsic motivation. A person is considered to be closer to intrinsic motivation on the continuum if extrinsically motivating regulations are self-imposed because of the characteristics they exhibit: “more engagement, better performance, lower dropout, higher quality learning” (Ryan & Deci, 2000, pg. 73).

The opposite end of the motivational continuum from amotivation is intrinsic motivation. Intrinsic motivation is “the desire to engage… for no reason other than sheer enjoyment, challenge, pleasure, or interest” (Lepper, 2005, pg. 184). Intrinsically motivated people are not led by outside motivating factors but participate in “an activity for the inherent satisfaction of the activity itself” (Ryan & Deci, 2000, pg. 71).

The goal of education in all subject areas is to create in students the desire to pursue learning for its own sake instead of relying on outside forces since intrinsically
motivated people “have more interest, excitement, and confidence, which in turn is manifest both as enhanced performance, persistence, and creativity” (Ryan & Deci, 2000, pg. 69). This is particularly important since extrinsically motivating factors change as students’ environments change. Therefore, the only constant type of motivation is intrinsic motivation. One of the goals of this research is to determine whether cultural identity with art focused on Hip Hop can set students on a path towards intrinsic motivation with respect to participation in the visual arts.

Steps to Building Intrinsic Motivation

People have inclinations toward certain topics over others. These inclinations, known as individual interests, are conceptualized “as a relatively stable motivational orientation or personal disposition that develops over time in relation to a particular topic or domain and is associated with increased knowledge, value, and positive feelings” (Hidi & Harackiewicz, 2000, pg. 152). Personal interests predispose individuals to become intrinsically motivated to pursue topics when environmental factors and opportunities arise.

When individual interest does not exist for an activity or topic, intrinsic motivation must be nurtured. Creating initial interest in an activity is the first step toward building people’s motivation. This “trigger”, called situational interest, is developed by “certain conditions and/or stimuli in the environment that focus attention” (Hidi & Harackiewicz, 2000, pg. 152). These conditions can be a result of emotional arousal, familiarity with subject matter, or even shock and disgust (Hidi & Harackiewicz, 2000). Recent research on motivation suggests that although situational interest does not guarantee long-term commitment to an activity, it can
serve as an important stepping stone to intrinsic motivation by initially grabbing people’s attention, especially for unmotivated children (Fredericks et al., 2002; Hidi & Harackiewicz, 2000; Pearce & Larson, 2006; Ryan & Deci, 2000).

Another way of initially engaging people in an activity is through externally controlled extrinsic motivators (Ryan & Deci, 2000). Schools employ extrinsic motivation strategies to reach students through social pressures, grades, and test scores (Hidi & Harackiewicz, 2000). Many research studies say overuse of externally regulated extrinsic motivators decreases natural intrinsic motivation (Ryan & Deci, 2000). However, just as situational interest serves to catch people’s attention, “there is at least a chance that genuine interests and intrinsic motivation will emerge” through employment of these motivation strategies (Hidi & Harackiewicz, 2000, pg. 159).

The next step to improving people’s motivation in the motivational continuum is establishing personal ownership or investment in the activity (Hidi & Harackiewicz, 2000; Pearce & Larson, 2006; Ryan & Deci, 2000; Simpson, 1996). This is the stage where they take ownership of the decision to pursue the activity. The extrinsic motivation moves from external control to internal control. A sense of internal control comes through building connections and personally identifying with the activity or topic (Simpson, 1996). In education, these connections can be built by developing curriculum that relates the topic or activity to be studied to students’ previously established interests. Research in the arts found that “pupils who were uninterested during art lessons engaged in art activities that related to their interests or hobbies” (Pavlou, 2006, pg. 200). Educators can also promote student connections
through making explicit the purposes of the topic being studied and showing students how understanding the topic could improve their own lives or be useful to them (Hidi & Harackiewicz, 2000; Simpson, 1996). In a study about students’ involvement in volunteer organizations, researchers found that motivation to participate increased when students began “locating themselves in the issues and problems” of their organization (Pearce & Larson, 2006, pg. 125).

Finally, the development of many conditions precedes the change from internal control of extrinsic motivation to intrinsic motivation including “interpersonal connection, belonging, and support in an activity” (Pearce & Larson, 2006, pg. 123). This process is the internalization of motivation and is “more likely to occur in settings that support autonomy and empowerment and that provide an optimal level of challenge” (Pearce & Larson, 2006, pg. 123). For people to pursue an activity solely for their own enjoyment or interest, they must feel competent, in control, and adequately supported (Boscolo & Gelati, 2008; Pearce & Larson, 2006; Ryan & Deci, 2000).

Competency, or self-efficacy, is a primary reason people are intrinsically motivated to engage in any activity (Ryan & Deci, 2000). If a person is naturally talented or capable of performing certain tasks, he or she is likely to incur positive feelings from engaging in the activity. In a study about reasons students choose to participate in extra-curricular activities, students primarily reported their “perceptions of being good at their activity seemed to motivate them to keep investing effort over time. They were willing to stick with the activity because they perceived they had the ability” (Fredricks et al., 2002, pg. 78). Similarly, a study focusing on struggling
writers reported that a “sense of competence is a condition and source for feeling satisfied and engaged” (Boscolo & Gelati, 2006, pg. 62).

Inherent talent cannot be taught, but educators, coaches, and motivators can build people’s competence and belief in their own abilities through targeted lessons and specific assignments. Instructors should “continually balance difficulty at an optimum level so that the task is neither too easy and boring nor so difficult that it produces extreme anxiety or avoidance” (Jones, 1997, pg. 34). Teaching within this range is essential to developing students’ sense of self-efficacy. Vygotsky’s social learning theory defines this level as the ‘zone of proximal development’ (1978). This zone reaches beyond what a student can do on their own to what they can accomplish under the guidance of a more experienced teacher. In this explorative zone, students are exposed but supported; theoretically they will not feel overwhelmed or frustrated (Vygotsky, 1978).

Perceived self-control over the activity and level of involvement is also important for intrinsic motivation to develop and last (Fredricks et al., 2002; Roberts, 2008; Ryan & Deci, 2000). Students participating in art lessons reported increased motivation when the teacher “allowed pupils to choose and thus give them [the students] a sense of control over their work” (Pavlou, 2006, pg. 200). Perceived control over the terms for pursuit of some activity or topic frees people from the negative pressures of deadlines, outside evaluations, regulations, and restrictions (Hidi & Harackiewicz, 2000; Ryan & Deci, 2000). These pressures are especially controlling and overwhelming for some students in an academic setting (Roberts, 2008). Studies show that “teachers who are autonomy-supportive (in contrast to
controlling) catalyze in their students greater intrinsic motivation, curiosity, and
desire for challenge” (Ryan & Deci, 2000, pg. 71).

Adequate support from relationships with others involved in the pursued activity is important to intrinsic motivational health. Interpersonal connections and confirmation give people meaning and purpose to continue. As defined by Deci & Ryan (2000), relational support is not necessary, as many intrinsically motivated activities are performed in isolation, but it contributes to continuing motivation. Encouragement and recognition from relationships with others “strengthened adolescents’ perception of their own abilities, which in turn helped to bolster their commitment” to extra-curricular activities (Fredricks et al., 2002, pg. 79). Students reported more successful feelings from art projects that encouraged social interaction and collaboration, supporting this relational aspect of intrinsic motivation (Jones, 1997; Pavlou, 2006).

Developing intrinsic motivation is a process begun by sparking situational interest or encouraging participation in an activity or topic through extrinsic motivators. As exposure continues, motivation will increase if people develop personal connections with the activity or topic and begin to internally control their participation. Intrinsic motivation will be achieved if people pursue the activity or topic for its own sake as they have feelings of competence, self-control or choice, and encouragement.

*Developing Intrinsic Motivation in the Arts*

Visual arts educators face all the common motivational issues discussed above. Some students have a natural affinity for the arts and their personal interest
grows into intrinsic motivation with cultivation. However, other students never develop an appreciation for the arts or understand the arts’ relevance to their lives. Art educators’ goals are to foster lifelong motivation to participate in the arts, whether as an appreciator or creator. Visual art materials like paint and clay are inspiring and offer hands-on creative opportunities that many other school classrooms do not (Pavlou, 2006). Art education researchers believe that lessons that help students develop personal connections to the subject matter are much more effective in promoting students’ motivational growth to pursue the arts than lessons that rely on novel art materials. A recent trend in art education called the ‘issues-based’ approach goes even further than making a subject matter connection. Students create art about issues they face in their daily lives and use it as a communication medium to express their ideas and opinions (Hanes & Weisman, 2002; Yokley, 2002).

**Lowenfeld’s Theories**

Viktor Lowenfeld was an art educator and philosopher in the mid-twentieth century. He organized students into stages of creative development, focusing on students’ drawing characteristics at each stage and the appropriate types of activities for each stage (Viktor Lowenfeld, 2009). Adolescents, as defined in this study as ages eleven to thirteen, are categorized as part of Lowenfeld’s pseudorealistic age or the age of reasoning. Once adolescents turn fourteen years old, they enter into the period of decision and crisis of adolescence (Viktor Lowenfeld, 2009). Lowenfeld’s idea of appropriate adolescent art lessons for students in these stages focused on the questions “Who am I? Where do I belong? Where am I going?” (Hochritt, 2004, pg. 35-36). Lowenfeld’s lessons for adolescents were also aware of students’ struggles
with representing things realistically and helping them overcome their frustrations with ‘getting things right’ (Donley, 1987). Students’ discovery of art and creativity was the purpose of art education, according to Lowenfeld. Students were the center of art education in his child-centered approach (Viktor Lowenfeld, 2009).

Personal Connections to Subject Matter

As Lowenfeld suggested, “the arts allow young people the chance to make sense of their feelings, thoughts, experiences and environment” (Hochritt, 2004, pg. 35). How can art educators use these unique characteristics of the arts to create student interest and motivation? Art teachers should strive to create a sense of belonging and meaning in each art activity they give their students, otherwise art will be a disjointed part of the school curriculum (Pavlou, 2006). Many teachers get so involved with teaching art content that they may “forget the rewards inherent in tapping into the learner's existing cognitive and affective domains” (Simpson, 1996, pg. 55). However, if learners are not motivated to learn, it does not matter how much content teachers cover in classes. The key step to building motivation is providing students with a personal reason to become invested in the learning activities (Hidi & Harackiewicz, 2000; Pearce & Larson, 2006; Ryan & Deci, 2000; Simpson, 1996). Art education philosophers promote beginning lessons with students’ interests and experiences, since relying on the power of situational interest or extrinsic motivators may or may not be enough to engage students in learning (Pavlou, 2006).

Providing opportunities for students to make personal connections with art lessons can be simple or complex. A simple connection opportunity could be an explicit statement at the beginning of a lesson. For example, “painters from the
expressionist period painted light in a special way. Today we will create a picture about a certain time of day and use light as the main technique to convey the time to the viewer”. Another simple connection opportunity could be given to students by using something from their lives. Photographing students and using the resulting photographs as a part of a lesson about contour line drawing would be a good way to engage them in a personal way with the drawing assignment. Discussing a shared experience like a mouse in the classroom and then sculpting a mouse in a clay lesson would be another example of a way to use personal connections to create interest.

Connection opportunities can come from an activity as simple as discussing similarities among several artworks with a similar subject like eating dinner (Simpson, 1996). As students recognize certain themes in the artworks, like loneliness or time of day, they have the opportunity to compare the artworks with similar situations in their lives that have happened around dinner tables (Billings, 1995; Hanes & Weisman, 2002; Simpson, 1996). Through all of these examples, students generate connections and relate artworks or art activities to their lives:

> In the artroom, creating environments where children are encouraged, through verbal and visual explorations, to relate artists' work to their own worlds reinforces the meaning of art in life. Meaningful connections also aid in understanding similar phenomena outside of the art discipline.
> Simpson, 1996, pg. 55

These lessons provide opportunities for surface-level personal connections, related around a theme, but focus on art learning goals (Hanes & Weisman, 2002).

In a Scottish elementary art classroom called Room 13, personal connection opportunities run deeper than a theme. In Room 13, students are given control over everything in the art room, from ordering materials to paying their teachers,
developing their own assignments and carrying them through to fruition (Adams, 2005; Roberts, 2008). In this environment, students are not directly instructed or even supervised by a teacher. Students are independent, but they employ a practicing artist who acts as a resource instead of director, and is known as an artist-teacher (Adams, 2005; Roberts, 2008). Students create art because they have the desire to, not because they have to finish a project or receive a grade. They collaborate with and learn from each other and their artist-teacher. They are more than students when they act in this capacity; they are artist-learners, taking on the practices of contemporary artists (Adams, 2005; Roberts, 2008). In Room 13, students report “it is this freedom of choice that they value so highly” (Roberts, 2008, pg. 22). Excitement is generated from the ownership they are given in their own learning. When students experience this sort of authentic learning, “the first thing that happens is students are eager to get involved in knowing about art, artmaking and learning technical processes” (Simpson, 1995, pg. 58).

Issues-based Curriculum Design

Issues-based art curriculum begins with issues that are relevant to students’ lives and gives them the chance to express their opinions or make a statement about them through art (Billings, 1995; Hanes & Weisman, 2002). The main purpose of this art curriculum is to explore issues that have meaning in students’ lives and show them how art can be a way for them to communicate their opinions on these issues (Billings, 1995; Hanes & Weisman, 2002; Simpson, 1995). The ways for students to make personal connections in this approach to art education are explicit and easily
become authentic tasks if students are able to share their artwork with others to inspire change:

Becoming aware of community problems, architecture, graffiti, social ills, ethnic neighborhoods and market-places, and parks and playgrounds and allowing these issues and places to serve as a basis when novice teachers plan art lessons may be the answer to making a difficult, but possible, choice about content that would truly involve the learner”

Simpson, 1995, pg. 27

Previous research has focused on developing issues-based lessons for action-research projects. Students were much more engaged and excited about the artistic process when they had the opportunity to choose the issue and materials to express their feelings about it rather than being told (Billings, 1995; A. Lohr, personal communication, March 16, 2009). In the preparation of this document, the researcher obtained an anecdotal report supporting this idea from a fellow educator and researcher, Mrs. Alaina Lohr. Her fifth grade students were remarkably excited to attend art class while she conducted research in which students chose their own projects and materials, and expressed concern that her students would rebel if she switched back to more teacher-directed projects upon completion of the experiment. Students had great excitement generated from ownership and connections to their own life (A. Lohr, personal communication, March 16, 2009). These personal connections made art a meaningful experience and created eagerness in her students to know all “about art, art-making and learning technical processes” (Simpson, 1995, pg. 58).

Art education trends like Lowenfeld’s child-centered approach, the thematic approach, the artist-learner approach, and the issues-based approach all attempt to build motivation by making the study of art meaningful to students’ daily lives.
These approaches provide opportunities for students to establish personal ownership or investment in art projects. In this way, art education philosophers and teachers hope to advance students in the motivational continuum towards internally controlling their extrinsic motivation to produce art.

Special Concerns with Motivating Adolescents

Overall Motivation Declines

During the adolescent stage of development, children’s academic motivation drastically declines (Anderson & Maehr, 1994). Social pressures become a much larger force of motivation during this period. School success becomes less ‘popular’ and students struggle with self-confidence and identity. Extrinsic motivators begin to become less effective as students rebel against grades and classroom structure out of the fear that they will be inadequate (Anderson & Maehr, 1994; Ryan & Deci, 2000). Students quit pursuing many activities but continue to participate in certain ones because they “feel good about their talents and identify with the activity” (Fredricks et al., 2002, pg.78).

Specific Art Concerns

The social environment may negatively affect students’ perception of art during their adolescent years because “art is often undervalued as an academic subject” (Toku, 2001, pg. 12). Likewise, when adolescent students become aware of realism, they are less willing to create realistic art for fear of failure (Pavlou, 2006; Toku, 2001). The resulting self-consciousness may prevent students from trying and make them more “sensitive to criticism from art teachers” and judgment from their
peers (Toku, 2001, pg. 12). This research is consistent with Lowenfeld’s theory of creative development that places adolescents in the pseudorealistic stage where ‘getting art right’ becomes a large stumbling block to participation (Donley, 1987).

Art becomes a subject that only the most nurtured and talented students willingly pursue:

Pre-adolescence (11–12 year olds) is of special interest because at this age pupils start to doubt their abilities in art; they become less confident in their art making and need special support from their teachers to continue to be involved with art and art making. In particular art activity is no longer spontaneous.

Pavlou, 2006, pg. 195

To avoid these drastic drops in motivation to participate in art, the available research literature suggests that teachers should guard against excessive criticism and introduce students to all forms of art to provide them with multiple ways to achieve success: “Activities that introduced pupils to other forms of art eased the pressure towards producing realistic art: ‘We now learnt that art is not always something that looks real. We don’t have to do things that look real all the time’” (Pavlou, 2006, pg. 1999). Teachers should also capitalize on the popular trends of students’ adolescent culture by bringing them into the classroom:

For students who are in such a period of losing interest or motivation for art, especially during secondary grades, we should find something to provide the motivational power of learning… It’s time to re-evaluate pop culture to give students motivation to create their own values and identities.

Toku, 2001, pg. 17

Creating Situational Interest through Hip Hop and Graffiti

This research focused on the possibility of creating situational interest through exposing subjects to a contemporary art show about hip hop culture. The subjects of
this research study were urban, African American, adolescent students. Research has suggested that teachers use the educational value of rap music and hip hop culture to engage this sub-group of students in classroom content (Au, 2005; Congdon & Blandy, 2003; Hochritt, 2004). In general, hip hop is the pop culture of the urban, African-American student, just as manga is generally the pop culture of the Japanese student (Toku, 2001). Since including manga in art education has been successful, art teachers should be willing to try using graffiti and tattoo designs, among other pop culture art forms, to improve their students’ interest (Congdon & Blandy, 2003; Toku, 2001).

Culturally Responsive Teaching through both Ethnic and Pop Culture

Many teachers do not take students’ backgrounds and cultures into consideration when planning lessons. In fact, without realizing they are marginalizing students, teachers may make instructional decisions that directly clash with their students’ cultures and put them at a disadvantage in the school setting, isolating them from subject matter (Simpson, 1995). Teachers must make an effort to be “culturally responsive” and put strategies in place that “take students cultures and linguistic differences into consideration by celebrating these differences rather than considering them as deficits” (Moore & Neal, 2007, pg. 2-3). Art education can be very culturally isolating and misrepresentative. Teachers would earn popularity with students, and, hopefully, popularity for their subject, by making connections to students’ everyday situations and ethnic identities. In a study focusing on African-American students, researchers found that “a positive ethnic identity that includes affirmations of the ethnic group and feelings of empowerment contributes to
academic success, whereas a lack of such feelings in one’s ethnic identification may
dissuade youth from academic identification” (Kerpelman, 2008, pg. 999). Art
educators can find diverse artists to teach from to provide opportunities for ethnic
identity to their students. If the exact skills cannot be taught through cultural
material, teachers can use it as a bridge to connect school learning to the real world
(Au, 2005).

With minority populations, many traditional teaching methods lose their
effectiveness. Finding ways to integrate social issues and problem-solving into art
will help students grow and learn how art can be a positive way to express their
feelings: “Activities that connect urban students to art or convince them to adopt art
as an alternative, less violent way of expressing themselves” (Simpson, 1995, pg. 27).
Certain classes will need different things, based on their situations, and the art
curriculum can be culturally responsive by “teaching children about the meaning and
making of art” from whatever situation they come to the classroom (Simpson, 1995,
pg. 27).

In minority cultures and the adolescent stage of development, identity is often
a big issue. Most contemporary art is all about “corresponding concern with issues of
cultural identity and the construction of subjectivity” (Knight, 2006, pg. 24).
Involving students in discussions surrounding contemporary art will help them see
and understand the world around them (Knight, 2004; Fortune, Goodyear III, &
Boone, 2008; Simpson, 1995; Whitehead, 2004).

When teachers approach art in this culturally responsive way they will be:
“engaging their students in making visual statements about the real issues in
their everyday world: issues like AIDS, violence in the streets, drags, and the
students' own identity crises drive the curriculum….Art becomes a positive form of expression and a source of social, artistic, and narrative empowerment for the students.”

Simpson, 1995, pg. 27

Hip Hop and Graffiti

Hip Hop culture is a perfect way to bring contemporary art to the classroom: “Hip hop is a powerful form of portrayal—a means to say something about yourself, your community, and your nation. By giving a voice to a wide range of previously unheard individuals, it has made tangible much that previously had gone unacknowledged” (Fortune et al., 2008, pg. 5). In lyrics and graffiti, clothing and dancing, hip hop focuses on “the need and desire to express one’s individuality—regardless of one’s instrument, training, or social background” (Fortune et al., 2008, pg. 5).

Graffiti is the visual art form of hip hop expression. According to Hochritt, graffiti art is:

prevalent in most urban areas and usually thought to be the creation of gangs of unsupervised youth. Graffiti can be created by a person or a group of people, usually incorporating a nickname in the image, and made using spray paint or marker.

2006, pg. 39-40

Graffiti is controversial, as “some see it as an insatiable appetite for destruction”, but others find it their outlet for self-expression (Fortune et al., 2008, pg. 28). The “tag” becomes the artist’s identity and under-cover voice, allowing them to escape (Fortune et al., 2008; Whitehead, 2004).

Graffiti is a particularly exciting form of art for students because it eases “the pressure towards producing realistic art” (Pavlou, 2006, pg. 199). Adolescents enjoy writing graffiti and are not fearful of drawing the stylized letters. The whole premise
of creating their identity through a “tag” is exciting for adolescents and allows them to create art all about themselves, confirming their existence. Some students may already practice this kind of identity creation in similar ways outside school contexts. Some students associate graffiti with negative behavior, but this problem can be overcome with discussions about the correct contexts for expression (Hochritt, 2004; Pavlou, 2006; Whitehead, 2004).

This study gave students an experience with graffiti and hip hop culture by visiting an exhibition in Washington, DC. The “Recognize: Hip Hop and Contemporary Portraiture” exhibition at the NPG was a great way to show students the value of communicating their culture and identity through art. The curators hoped to emphasize the importance of hip hop and its place in our communities:

“The verb ‘to recognize’ holds many connotations, although its most common usage refers to the cognitive process of perceiving something previously known. By titling this exhibition ‘RECOGNIZE!’ we want to emphasize its connection with some of the outstanding hip hop performers and artists at work today. We also wish to pay respect to the progenitor of this musical genre, while also acknowledging those who have continued to push the limits of hip hop’s power, creativity, and flow as an outlet for positive expression” Fortune et al., 2008, pg. 5

The curators collected different representations of hip hop through the visual and literary art forms of photography, painting, collage, videography, poetry, and graffiti.

* * *

This chapter reviewed the literature used as a basis for the research. The next chapter will cover the research methodology.
Chapter III: Research Methodology

Introduction

This study explores the development of student motivation in the arts. Specific research questions regarding the way hip hop culture is used to develop this motivation and combat certain motivational blockades with adolescents are explained in this chapter. Descriptions of student participants, the study setting, the specific procedures and format of the after-school art club developed to answer these questions are detailed. Data collection methods included student interviews, artifacts, and researcher field notes. The qualitative data analysis process by the coding method is explained, including how the coding themes were pulled from both the literature review and research questions.

Research Design and Questions

The main objective of this study was to explore the development of student motivation in the visual arts. The secondary objectives were to understand hip hop culture’s effectiveness as a motivator, discover whether graffiti dispelled adolescents’ fears of realism, and evaluate whether students valued art as a form of communication and expression. These issues tie into the main objective of developing motivation.

I. When teaching art to adolescents, how can student motivation be developed and sustained?

a. Will creating personal connections through pop culture increase motivation?
b. Will having an authentic purpose increase motivation?
c. Will giving students autonomy increase motivation?

II. Will seeing the “ Recognize” exhibition broaden student ideas of valid and respected art forms?
   a. Will viewing graffiti in a museum setting change student perceptions about graffiti?
   b. Will using graffiti dissipate student fears of realism?

III. Will students identify with the artists in the “ Recognize” exhibition and realize they can express themselves through art in similar ways?

To appropriately study and answer these questions, the researchers proposed a narrative case-study built around the NPG’s “ Recognize: Hip Hop and Contemporary Portraiture” special exhibition. A narrative case-study is a study that takes an in-depth look at a particular “phenomenon in its natural context” through thick descriptions (Gall, Gall, & Borg, 2003, pg. 439). This research is also considered participatory action research because the researcher is a stake-holder in the school where she is conducting the research and expects it to improve her students’ participation in the visual arts (Bogdan & Bilken, 2003; Scriven, 2008).

The “Recognize” exhibition included portraiture from eight artists who pursued graffiti, painting, poetry, sculpture, videography, and photography. Each artist represented an aspect of hip hop culture through their work: graffiti, DJ-ing, MC-ing, or break-dancing. Most of the artists were African American. The show was dynamic, current, and infused in the hip hop sub-culture (Fortune et al., 2008).
The researcher believed that the “Recognize” show at the NPG would inspire African American students to identify with art by making personal connections with hip hop culture. The researcher hypothesized this would most likely occur for students in adolescence, particularly in grades five through seven, because pop culture and music are very important and influential in this developmental stage, according to Lowenfeld’s theory (Donley, 1987). The researcher believed students would personally connect to the hip hop musical artists represented in the show, who were all African-American. It was hypothesized that students would broaden their perspectives of what art can be about because of the way the “Recognize” exhibition validated graffiti as a higher art form when done in the right context.

In addition to taking students to see the “Recognize” exhibition, the researcher developed a related self-portrait project for students to complete as part of an after-school art club. The researchers chose self-portraiture as the art form because its purpose is self-expression.

Graffiti was chosen as the artistic style for students to use in their projects to remove the fear of creating realistic images and to provide another opportunity to personally connect with hip hop culture and the familiar urban surroundings. The researcher purposely gave students freedom in the design of their graffiti self-portrait, allowed them to work at their own pace, use outside resources, and provided support when asked with the caveat that it was ultimately the students’ decision. This work environment was created to give students autonomy. Finally, the researchers attempted to make art an authentic task that reached beyond the bounds of the after-school club by holding an opening exhibition for the art show that displayed the
students’ work. Details concerning how this research plan was carried out are in the following sections.

**Participants**

This research study was conducted at Friendship Public Charter School (FPCS) Chamberlain campus in Southeast Washington, DC, where the researcher is a kindergarten teacher. All art club meetings were held in the supporting art teacher’s classroom at Chamberlain, except for the visit to the NPG.

**Sample Selection**

The sampling procedure used in this study is known as convenience sampling (Gall, Gall, & Borg, 2003). Although convenience sampling is not ideal, the investigator believed that it was the most practical approach for this specific case for a number of reasons. The researcher believed convenience sampling would allow for study results to be generalized to the desired populations. This research focused on studying the motivational power of relating hip hop culture to the visual arts. The researcher needed subjects who were exposed to hip hop culture, were adolescent students, and lived within reasonable proximity of the “Recognize” exhibition at the National Portrait Gallery in Washington, DC. Chamberlain serves students in grades pre-k to seventh grade, has a student population that is mostly African American, and is located in Southeast Washington, DC, near a Metro train station. All the necessary requirements for subjects could be met at this school, so conducting the study with students there was a logical choice.
All students in fifth, sixth, and seventh grades at the school were considered eligible adolescents for the purposes of this study and were invited to be a part of the art club and research study. The only selection criteria for participation were that the students were in these grades and had returned the required Institutional Review Board parental and student consent forms. Participants were recruited by fliers posted throughout the school advertising the opportunity and instructing students to see the supporting art teacher for more information. The art teacher recruited students in her classes that met the grade-level requirements. The art teacher gave all interested students a cover letter, parental consent form, and student consent form. The researcher and art teacher had difficulty getting the required consent forms returned in a timely manner. The starting date of the art club was delayed by one week to recruit as many students as possible. The researcher had received four complete consent packets by the delayed start date of September 24th, 2008, and began the club meetings on that date. After the first meeting, two more students turned in completed consent packets and joined the club at the second meeting, making a total of six students that participated in the art club and research study.

Table 3.1 describes the characteristics of the subjects that participated in this study.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Student</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>B</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>D</th>
<th>E</th>
<th>F</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Grade Level</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sex</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Female</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Protection of Human Subjects

All student subjects returned a completed consent packet in prior to enrollment in the research study. Both the parental and student consent forms
included an area that had to be checked yes to give permission to audiotape conversations about art that occurred during the art club and photograph student work. All participants were encouraged to ask questions throughout the duration of the study and were informed that they could withdraw from the study at any time without penalty. The club was free to every subject who participated. All art supplies were provided by donations to the project proposal on www.DonorsChoose.org. Frames for the art show were donated by FPCS Chamberlain’s student activity fund. Subjects and their guardians were not compensated monetarily for participating in this research project.

All of the subjects’ information, comments, and artwork were de-identified, using an identification key. The key allowed the researcher to link subjects’ comments and artwork to their identity. However, the researcher was the only person to have access to the identification key. All audio recordings of group discussions and photographs of student work were labeled with the identification key and stored in a locked cabinet. All reports referring to specific subjects in this study use the identification key label for the subject, such as “Student A”, “Student B”, etc.

**Procedures**

**Setting**

This research project took place in an after-school setting. The after-school setting gave the researcher more freedom to implement the study without the constraints of district standards, although many of the visual art standards were covered within the scope of the club meetings. The after-school setting allowed the trip to the NPG to occur without students missing any classroom instruction.
The subjects participated in approximately fourteen after-school club meetings held on Wednesday or Thursday afternoons every week from late September to mid-December, 2008. Some additional meetings were held on other weekday afternoons when students needed more time to finish their individual portrait projects (see attached calendar, Appendix J). Each after-school club meeting was held from 4:15 PM to 5:45 PM in the supporting art teacher’s classroom at FPCS Chamberlain, except for the trip to the NPG.

Prior to the Museum Visit

The art club met twice before visiting the NPG for initial data collection and preparation of the students for the artwork they would see in the “Recognize” exhibition. During the first art club meeting, students were asked open-ended questions concerning their feelings about art, its purpose, and their participation in art in a group discussion (see Table 3.2 for specific questions). The researcher recorded the discussion as a form of data collection. Following the discussion, the students discussed the history of traditional and modern portraiture, compared a few prints of portraits provided by the supporting art teacher, and drew a self-portrait using pencils, colored pencils, and paper. The researcher gave students a general outline of what they would do in the art club for the rest of the semester. During the second art club meeting, the researcher showed students the NPG’s “Recognize” exhibition online using Promethean board technology. The students viewed clips of “Recognize” artist interviews, read their artist statements, and viewed their artwork on the website. The researcher hoped that introducing students to the “Recognize” exhibition prior to visiting the museum would begin to create situational interest and allow students to
feel more connected to the artwork they would see. The researcher also prepared
students for the museum visit by reviewing proper museum etiquette and encouraging
them to formulate questions to ask the tour guide during the trip.

Museum Visit

During the third meeting, the researcher took the students, along with the
supporting art teacher, to the NPG via the Metro. The group toured the “Recognize:
Hip Hop and Contemporary Portraiture” exhibition with a member of the education
department at the NPG. She focused on explaining the artists represented in the
“Recognize” show and the reasons they made their artistic choices. The museum
educator asked many open-ended and opinion-seeking questions. The students
answered many of her questions, were engaged in the discussion, and recalled some
of the information they had already learned about the exhibit prior to the visit. On the
way back on the Metro, the students spoke positively about their experience.

After the Museum Visit

At the fourth club meeting, the students discussed what they saw at the
“Recognize” exhibition and began to come up with ideas for their “My Hip Hop
Portrait” project. Graffiti was chosen as the art form for students to use in their self-
portraits to remove the fear of creating “realistic” images and to connect with the
familiar city surroundings. It was hypothesized that the graffiti part of hip hop
culture would appeal to adolescent students and they would be excited to work in its
style. Students were given the “My Hip Hop Portrait” direction sheets so they could
understand the process to follow to create a finished piece. The students were
couraged to come up with a meaningful “tag”, essentially a signature in graffiti art.
Their “tag” was supposed to mean something to them or symbolize them in some way.

The process of developing a “tag” continued into the sixth club meeting. The researcher showed the students a video of the “Recognize” graffiti artists creating and explaining how they made the mural for the show on www.npg.gov. Students followed the steps of the project and sketched their “tag” in many different ways in order to design the layout of their self-portrait.

Throughout the next several meetings, as the students were ready, they chose their favorite designs, experimented with adding color to their sketches, researched different imagery they wanted to add to their self-portraits, and began drawing their final sketches on large paper, which matched the size of the canvases they would be using. The researcher and supporting art teacher worked with students until they believed their designs were well-planned out and ready to be painted on the canvases. Students used tracing paper to transfer their readied images to the canvas.

As students were ready, during the tenth through thirteenth meetings, they began painting. The researcher and supporting art teacher demonstrated painting techniques, color mixing principles, and material care methods at the students’ requests or when they felt students were using the materials inappropriately.

When students’ projects were nearing completion, the date was set for the art show, students titled their pieces, and wrote their artist statements. Students helped hang up fliers around the building and took some home to advertise their art show opening reception. The final meeting was held on December 12, 2008. The subjects participated with the researcher in a final discussion about why they create art and
whether they believe art is important and relevant in their lives (specific questions are found in Table 3.3). Students completed any remaining work. The discussion was recorded. Students also wrote thank you notes to the people who donated supplies to the project through www.DonorsChoose.org.

Art Show Opening Reception

The students participated in the culminating art show on the evening of December 13, 2008. They shared their self-portraits with their peers and families, explained the artistic choices they made in their pieces, and enjoyed refreshments. Approximately fifty people attended the art show opening. Overall, subjects spent approximately twenty-four hours working with the researcher and supporting art teacher in the art club over three months.

Data Collection

Pre- and Post-Project Group Interviews

Subjects were interviewed two times during the span of the study. During the first art club meeting, students were asked open-ended questions concerning their feelings about art, its purpose, and their participation in art in a large group discussion. These specific Pre-Project Interview questions are presented in Table 3.2. Each student was asked to answer each question. Students were allowed to say, “I don’t know” for an answer or agree with another student’s answer and say “me too”. During the final art club meeting, students were asked similar open-ended questions concerning their feelings about art, its purpose, and their participation in the museum visit and graffiti project. These specific Post-Project Interview questions can be
found in Table 3.3. The researcher followed the same guidelines as she did in the Pre-Project Interview in regards to acceptable student answers. Student responses in the two group interview sessions were recorded, transcribed, and coded according to major themes identified in the literature review.

Subjects were familiar with the art room where the group interview sessions were held because they had their regular art class there once a week. During the recorded group interview sessions, the supporting art teacher left the room to prevent pressuring students to answer questions in a certain way to please her instead of being honest.

**Table 3.2:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pre-Project Group Interview Questions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. What is art? What are different types of art? What things qualify as art?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Why is it important? How has it been important in history?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. What is it used for today?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Who likes art? Who doesn’t like art? Why?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Can art change people’s opinions? How or how not?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Do you create art? Why or why not?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Is just art pretty stuff to hang on the wall?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 3.3:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Post-Project Group Interview Questions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. What is art? Has your definition of art changed?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Why is art important?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Do you think that art can change people's opinions? Do you think your piece can change people's opinions?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Do your parents or the kids at our school see art like this everyday?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Do you think art is used for anything else today? Or is expression the main reason?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Reflect on what you have done… What did you learn? Would you want to do it again? Would you not? What would you change?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Art Show Video

The principal of the school took some video of students at the art show while they were explaining their artwork to their audience. Students’ statements about their self-portraits from the video were analyzed as an additional session of audio data. The main prompt for students’ comments on the video was simply “Tell me about your work”. The video was returned to the principal after student comments were transcribed and coded according to the identification key.

Artist Statements

Students wrote artist statements when their graffiti self-portraits were complete or nearing completion during the final art club meetings. The researcher gave students guidelines of what needed to be included in a good artist statement. Those guidelines are in Table 3.4. The researcher and supporting art teacher helped students edit their statements for grammar mistakes but did not change the content in any way or make suggestions beyond the guidelines of what should be included. The student artist statements were assembled in an exhibition opening program distributed at the door the night of the art show.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 3.4: Guidelines for Writing an Artist Statement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Name</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Age</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Reasons for creating the artwork</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Favorite part of the artwork</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Thanks for contributors, assistance given (optional)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Researcher’s Field Notes

The researcher kept notes throughout the entire experience in a running computer document. She wrote notes about procedural changes and issues,
observations about students’ feelings and behaviors, additional research questions that arose from weekly meetings, and other information that she thought would be helpful later (Bogden & Bilken, 2002). These notes served as an important resource to weed out researcher bias later in data analysis when they were compared against the other forms of data collection.

Data Analysis

Coding

The data collected in this study through pre- and post-project interviews, artist statements, and researcher field notes were analyzed through the qualitative method of coding. Coding is a common way to organize and analyze qualitative data (Basit, 2003; Bogdan & Bilken, 2002). Coding helps researchers in “noticing relevant phenomena; collecting examples of those phenomena; and analyzing those phenomena in order to find commonalities, differences, patterns and structures” (Basit, 2003, pg. 144). The study's specific research questions were used to identify the labels by which to organize and code the collected data. The major themes, identified by their corresponding question in Table 3.5, were employed in the coding process to focus evaluative efforts.
Table 3.5:
Coding Themes Developed from Research Questions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Research Question</th>
<th>Coding Theme</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. When teaching art to adolescents, how can student motivation be developed and sustained?</td>
<td>Competence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Will creating personal connections through pop culture increase motivation?</td>
<td>Personal Connections to Art</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Will having an authentic purpose increase motivation?</td>
<td>Authentic Task</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Will giving students autonomy increase motivation?</td>
<td>Autonomy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Will seeing the “Recognize” exhibition broaden student ideas of valid and respected art forms?</td>
<td>Museum Visit and Ideas of Art</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Will viewing graffiti in a museum setting change student perceptions about graffiti?</td>
<td>Graffiti</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Will using graffiti dissipate student fears of realism?</td>
<td>Realism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Will students identify with the artists in the “Recognize” exhibition and realize they can express themselves through art in similar ways?</td>
<td>Identity</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Internal Validity

The researcher worked to prevent errors in data analysis through a technique known as methodological triangulation (Patton, 2003). The researcher collected three sources of data and cross-referenced the findings from one against the others to ensure validity and prevent analytical mistakes (Patton, 2003). Using three data sources prevents the errors and biases that could result from using only one perspective (Bogden & Bilken, 2002; Patton, 2003). Findings from the pre-project, post-project, and art show interviews, artist statements, and researcher field notes were all compared and checked against each other to guarantee the integrity of the results.
*   *   *

This chapter outlined the research methodology. The next chapter will explain the research results.
Chapter IV: Data Analysis and Results

Introduction

This study focuses on student developing student motivation in the visual arts. Data were collected through a three-month long after-school art club developed around the NPG’s “Recognize: Hip Hop and Contemporary Portraiture” exhibition. Data were organized and coded according to themes that emerged from the interviews, artist statements, and field notes, as they related to the research questions. Full transcripts of interviews and videos, complete artist statements, and the researcher’s field notes can be found in the appendices.

Results according to Research Question Themes

Question I. Competence, Support and Social Interaction

When teaching art to adolescents, how can student motivation be developed and sustained? To answer this question, themes were identified that related to research on developing and sustaining motivation. As discussed in Chapter 2, in order for people to pursue an activity solely for their own enjoyment or interest, they must feel competent, in control, and adequately supported (Boscolo & Gelati, 2008; Pearce & Larson, 2006; Ryan & Deci, 2000). Therefore, data were organized according to the themes of competence and support or social interaction for this overarching question on motivation. Other parts of the data that address motivation are coded under the more specific questions they answer.
In regards to competence, students discussed their feelings about their abilities and their perceptions of others’ abilities. Data are organized into positive and negative feelings of competence. Some students related feelings of competence to their worth and directly explained their talent, or lack of talent, as their reason for continuing or quitting the art-making process. All data related to competence are located in Table 4.1.
| Table 4.1: |
| Competence |
| **Positive Feelings** |
| • “I thought I can make something awesome and I did” (Student F, Artist Statement). |
| • “I was inspired by the fact that I was able to learn how to use paint and how to mix different colors” (Student E, Artist Statement). |
| • “I imagined and completed a beautiful graffiti artwork” (Student D, Artist Statement). |
| • “My favorite part of my artwork is the background because it looks cool” (Student C, Artist Statement). |
| • “This project has changed my feeling about art a great deal in a good way. I did more than I thought I could do” (Student E, Post-Project Interview). |
| • “I can show people art and be happy because they like what I did” (Student A, Pre-Project Interview). |
| • “Art is important to me. Because of art, I am worthwhile” (Student E, Post-Project Interview). |
| • “I never made anything like this before. I never made flames because I never knew how to draw it” (Student F, Art Show Video). |
| **Negative Feelings** |
| • “She got very frustrated, even with me sitting right beside her. Student D even balled up a paper she was working on, stating she would change her idea because drawing the dancer was too hard” (Field Notes, Working Club Meetings). |
| • “Students B, C, and E were almost copying the lettering and I encouraged them to make it their own in some way. They felt as though what they could do was not ‘good enough’ and their lettering looked dumb” (Field Notes, Working Club Meetings). |
| • “Students D, A, and F felt this ‘brainstorming’ process was too difficult. They kept changing their minds, complaining, and asking for help” (Field Notes, Post-Trip Meetings). |
| • “Like one of my friends, he don't know how to draw a portrait” (Student A, Pre-Project Interview). |
| • “Some people may say I don't like [art] because they are not that good at it and they have never tried it” (Student C, Pre-Project Interview). |
Support was given by the researchers and supporting art teacher during the art club meetings. Students commented on that support and how it made them feel. Social interaction among students created both positive and negative feelings of support within the dynamics of the art club meetings and the culminating art show. Students both criticized and complimented one another. All data related to the social environment, support and social interaction, are presented in Table 4.2.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 4.2:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Support and Social Interaction</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Teacher/Researcher Support</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• “What inspired me was how my teachers encouraged me to be creative and to do more so my artwork could look better” (Student F, Artist Statement).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• “My teachers showed me how to actually mix it up …. Every time someone showed me how to do something, I did it different” (Student F, Art Show Video).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• “I managed to encourage her [Student D] not to give up and help her pinpoint what proportions needed to be changed for the caricature of the dancer to look ‘right’” (Field Notes, Working Club Meetings).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• “Students D, E, and F needed more direction and resisted some of the direction” (Field Notes, Working Club Meetings).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• “I helped [Student D] look up pictures of dancers online, we used tracing paper to piece together what we wanted her dancer to look like, and she worked on drawing her. I did not draw the dancer for her, because then she wouldn’t be learning, but I managed to encourage her not to give up and help her pinpoint what proportions needed to be changed for the caricature of the dancer to look ‘right’” (Field Notes, Working Club Meetings).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Social Interaction</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• “Students C, E, and F teased Student B a lot because they felt that his artwork was the best. They were clearly jealous, and would say things like, ‘Man, look at your [student B’s] work. I hate you. You’re so good.’ They compared their work to his and judged despite the fact that I was complimenting each of them, teaching them, and demonstrating how each of them could make their paintings more dynamic” (Field Notes, Working Club Meetings).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• “He [Student B] seemed to bashfully enjoy the envious comments of his peers and recognized that the extra time paid off” (Field Notes, Working Club Meetings).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• “The students received many compliments from everyone who visited the show, including a representative from the community office” (Field Notes, Art Show).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• “I can show people art and be happy because they like what I did” (Student A, Pre-Project Interview).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Question I. a. Personal Connections to Art and to the Museum Visit

Will creating personal connections through pop culture increase motivation? This research question continues to address motivation, specifically through creating connections. Students stated personal connections to art, mostly as previously existing “likes” and “interests”. Student connections to pop culture are the second type of personal connections found, referencing the museum visit. The “Recognize: Hip Hop and Contemporary Portraiture” exhibition was supposed to create situational interest in the arts by capitalizing on the connection between the pop culture of hip hop and students’ personal lives (Au, 2005; Congdon & Blandy, 2003; Hochritt, 2006). The personal connection data surrounding pop culture are inseparable from the section on theme of graffiti, since it is a part of hip hop culture. Surprisingly, students also discussed personal connections in a third way. They wanted their audience to make personal connections to their self-portraits when they viewed them. These personal connections are discussed later in the next section concerning authentic tasks. Data addressing the themes of personal connections to both art and the museum visit are found in Table 4.3.
Table 4.3: Personal Connections to Art

- “People will see check and maybe they can read it and think of working and trying to get a job and trying to get money for their children” (Student D, Post-Project Interview).
- “[Art] is something [artists] really like doing and its totally in their blood” (Student C, Pre-Project Interview).
- “I like to create art outside because its fun” (Student B, Pre-Project Interview).
- “[Art] is one of the things I really like doing” (Student C, Pre-Project Interview).
- “I would love to do this again” (Student D, Post-Project Interview).
- “Then I added some of my favorite characters from off of Dragonball-Z. Its one of my favorite shows and past times” (Student E, Art Show Video).

Personal Connections to the Museum Visit

- “Student A was attentive. She seemed excited to have a new experience. Student B really listened to the interviews of the artists and seemed to have a lot of interest. I think he thought it was neat that we were going to see something that there was already information about on the internet” (Field Notes, Prior to Museum Trip).
- “[Student C] identified with some of the clothing items included in the collage, commenting that she had similar items or would like to wear them” (Field Notes, Museum Visit).
- “My students had still heard of them and began humming their songs and exclaiming, ‘Oh, yeah, I know him!’” (Field Notes, Museum Visit).
- “Student C was really into the paintings. She would get three inches away from the Kehinde Wiley portraits and wander away from our group…Student C also walked beyond the boundary tape around Shinique Smith’s collage and reached out to touch part of it” (Field Notes, Museum Visit).
- “[Our tour guide] brought examples of the king portraits for the students to see and compare to Wiley’s works. This was very interesting to them and probably the only part of the tour where all of them were completely engaged” (Field Notes, Museum Visit).
- “[The students] wanted to re-visit some of the other pieces. We allowed them to wander around for about twenty more minutes. Only Student E was sitting disengaged at the end of those twenty minutes. We had to tell the rest of the students it was time to leave and they met us with some resistance” (Field Notes, Museum Visit).
- “Student A remembered all the information about how David Scheinbaum became interested in photographing Hip Hop artists from his online artist interview. She told our tour guide about how he saw a concert with his son, who was her age, and then fell in love with the music and wanted to photograph rappers” (Field Notes, Museum Visit).
- “I used to always just see [graffiti] on walls and things, but it is in the museum too” (Student D, Post-Questions).
Question I. b. Authentic Tasks

Will having an authentic purpose increase motivation? This study also focused on how student motivation would increase as a result of creating art for an authentic purpose. Students displayed their artwork for everyone at their school in a professional, authentic way in an Art Show Opening Reception. A classroom was turned into a gallery and refreshments were served to celebrate their art and their audience. This authentic task was hypothesized to give meaning to their art beyond the usual classroom display or take-home project. Students reported ideas they wished their audience would walk away with after seeing their art. All data related to authentic purposes were coded accordingly and are presented in Table 4.4.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Authentic Purpose</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“I hope you can see how much I love music in my art” (Student A, Artist Statement).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“When they see my piece, they might think that the only type of dance is not Hip Hop, there’s ballet too” (Student D, Post-Project Interview).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“I did this graffiti piece because I wanted to inspire others” (Student E, Artist Statement).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“People will see check and maybe they can read it and think of working and trying to get a job and trying to get money for their children” (Student D, Post-Project Interview).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Students became very excited about the show and eagerly took bunches of fliers to hand out to their friends and family” (Field Notes, Final Meetings).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“All the students, even E and F who seemed to have lost interest as their projects progressed, spoke eloquently as they explained their artistic choices. The level of understanding they displayed surprised me, even though I had been working with them the whole time. The authentic experience of displaying their work for others made them real artists, and they proudly stood by their pieces. I underestimated the power of the art show validating their artistic expression” (Field Notes, Art Show).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Question I. c. Autonomy

Will giving students autonomy increase motivation? Autonomy was hypothesized to be inspiring and motivating for students. Students had the freedom to choose the details of their projects and make decisions on their own. Student feelings, researcher observations of work time, and student comments related to choice were all coded under the theme of autonomy. Data related to the autonomous environment created in the art club are under the heading “Situations with Autonomy”. Contrasting data surfaced that related to student art production under direct teacher control and are included under the heading “Situations without Autonomy”. Data addressing the theme of autonomy are found in Table 4.5.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 4.5:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Autonomy</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Situations without Autonomy</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• “Their art teacher (who was partnering with me in the project) had just discussed self-portraits with them. The students had completed their own self-portrait which followed a certain format: half of their face was supposed to look realistic and half was to be built of things that represent them, like music notes, words, sports items, etc. The students understood that they could represent themselves through a picture like that, since it was “of” them, but I don’t think they understood that art could represent ideas beyond the representation of objects and people” (Field Notes, Pre-Trip Meetings).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• “I drew these other things because we had to draw half our face, and the other things are about how we express ourselves” (Student A, Pre-Project Interview).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Situations with Autonomy</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• “Students D, A, and F felt this ‘brainstorming’ process was too difficult. They kept changing their minds, complaining, and asking for help. I refused to tell them what to do, saying I wanted it to be their self-portrait, not mine!” (Field Notes, Post-Trip Meetings).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• “I like [my project] the most because I got to express myself with something I do everyday, which is music” (Student A, Post-Project Interview).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• “After seeing the exhibit ‘Recognize’ I imagined and completed a beautiful graffiti artwork” (Student D, Artist Statement).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• “My favorite parts of my artwork are the spikes, the way I shape my graffiti, and my background. I also like the flames because of the colors and technique I used to create them” (Student F, Artist Statement).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• “Student B was the most focused of the group. He attempted to do lots of bricks in the background of his tag, which ended up being arduous, but very beautiful. He invested much more time into the detail of the bricks and reaped the benefit of his investment” (Field Notes, Working Club Meetings).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• “their artistic choices” (Field Notes, Art Show).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Question II. Museum Visit and Ideal of Art

Will seeing the “Recognize” exhibition broaden student ideas of valid and respected art forms? Comments concerning the museum visit and general ideas about art are collected here. Student perceptions of valid art forms were expected to be challenged and expanded through the visit to the “Recognize: Hip Hop and Contemporary Portraiture” exhibition because of its diverse collection of contemporary art. Many students noticed and specifically commented on the different types of art they saw at the NPG and how it made them feel. Data about this theme are found in Table 4.6. Comments specifically related to graffiti fall under the next question and section.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 4.6</th>
<th>Museum Visit and Valid Art Forms</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• “I think the museum helped me because I saw different types of art and different types of graffiti and you can express yourself in different types of ways. Like one person, he expressed himself by taking pictures of different people while they was rapping and they was singing” (Student A, Post-Questions).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• “I think that the museum was really nice and the different types of artwork were neat. Especially the art of the different rappers singing, they just caught that moment at exactly the right time…” (Student E, Post-Questions).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• “We took a trip to the Portrait Gallery. I was inspired by the artwork I saw” (Student D, Artist Statement).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• “My artwork is inspired by the art exhibit I saw at the National Portrait Gallery called ‘Recognize’” (Student A, Artist Statement).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• “I went on a trip to the art museum exhibit called ‘Recognize’. I saw lots of cool, inspiring graffiti” (Student B, Artist Statement).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• “Before I started my graffiti artwork, the art club went to the Portrait Gallery to see an art exhibit entitled ‘Recognize’. We saw a lot of graffiti art and it inspired the artwork I created” (Student C, Artist Statement).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Question II. a. Graffiti

Will viewing graffiti in a museum setting change student perceptions about graffiti? The museum was hypothesized to play an important role in validating graffiti as a respected form of visual art. Graffiti surrounds students in the urban environment of Washington, DC, but they do not necessarily identify it as a form of art. Initial student comments about graffiti and later comments about their change toward it were prevalent in the data. Attitudes towards graffiti were generally positive. Student comments about the theme of graffiti are organized in Table 4.7.

| Table 4.7 |
|---|---|
| **Graffiti** | |
| • “I saw lots of cool, inspiring graffiti that had lots of colors and different shades” (Student B, Artist Statement). | |
| • “I made graffiti because for a long time I’ve wondered, ‘What are those big funny looking words—I want to do words like that because it looks cool.’ And now after being in the art club, I understand it” (Student C, Artist Statement). | |
| • “I did graffiti. It was kinda cool because it has a lot of curves and shapes” (Student B, Post-Project Interview). | |
| • “[This project] expressed a new style of art that I never heard of. I had seen it, but I didn’t know what it was called; I just called it big bubble letters” (Student C, Post-Project Interview). | |
| • “Then when I tried graffiti work, I really got into it” (Student E, Art Show Video). | |
| • “I just thought graffiti was used for bad things, but it can be used for good things also, like I used to always just see it on walls and things, but it is in the museum too” (Student D, Post-Project Interview). | |
| • “The museum helped me because I saw…different types of graffiti and you can express yourself in different ways” (Student A, Post-Project Interview). | |
| • “Student E was really impressed by the graffiti. He commented how it ‘glowed’ in the gallery lighting. He asked questions like, ‘How did they do that? It looks like sunlight’” (Field Notes, Museum Visit). | |
Question II. b. Realism

Will using graffiti dissipate student fears of realism? Realism is a major concern for adolescent students participating in the visual arts (Pavlou, 2006; Toku, 2001). The self-portrait project used graffiti because it was hypothesized to be an attractive artistic style to urban adolescents. Graffiti is very cartoon-like and could be considered the antithesis of realism, when done in its simplest form. Discussions of realism surfaced even though graffiti was the style in which the students worked. Positive reactions and negative reactions to realism were identified within the data and are separated accordingly in Table 4.8.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 4.8</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Realism</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Associated Positive Feelings</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● “[Student C] commented that the paintings looked like photographs. She was in awe of Kehinde Wiley’s power to create realistic pieces” (Field Notes, Museum Visit).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● “Students had never used tracing paper before. I had them transfer their full-sized sketches to the canvas board with large pieces of it. They found it almost magical and enjoyed using it. Students E and C wanted some to take home and use for their own personal doodling. I gave them extra. I believe it gave them a crutch for creating things that look real” (Field Notes, Working Club Meetings).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Associated Negative Feelings</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● “They felt as though what they could do was not ‘good enough’ and their lettering looked dumb” (Field Notes, Working Club Meetings).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● “The frustration level that Student D had with drawing something realistic was so great that I would not be surprised if she gave up on it entirely if she confronted this again in a setting without proper support and direction” (Field Notes, Working Club Meetings).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● “I chose graffiti so the frustration of creating realistic art would not be an issue, but I did not want to discourage Student D from making her own artistic decisions or tell her not to attempt a dancer” (Field Notes, Working Club Meetings).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● “Student D wanted her tag to be “dance”. She wanted to include a ballerina in her piece…She got very frustrated, even with me sitting right beside her. Student D even balled up a paper she was working on, stating she would change her idea because drawing the dancer was too hard” (Field Notes, Working Club Meetings).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Question III. Identity and Self-Expression

Will students identify with the artists in the “Recognize” exhibition and realize they can express themselves through art in similar ways? Through understanding the reasons why “Recognize” artists created art, students were predicted to become more aware of arts power to communicate messages and ideas. The themes initially identified as part of this idea were identity and self-expression. However, after coding all the data, these themes really became one. Students used the word “express” very often in their statements about art and viewed it as a main purpose of art. They were able to articulate how their self-portraits expressed things about their lives in specific ways. The few comments focusing on identity were more about others making personal connections related to artists’ subject matter and are included in the section about authentic tasks.
| Table 4.9  
Self-Expression |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• “If you go into somebody's house and you see all their pictures on their wall, you could see how they have expressed themselves and what they think” (Student A, Pre-Project Interview).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• &quot;I think art is being creative and expressing yourself in all kinds of creative ways&quot; (Student A, Pre-Project Interview).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• “[Art] is a way of expressing your feelings and the way it comes out is art” (Student C, Pre-Project Interview).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• “[Art is] a way they can express themselves…We will be able to see what they have been thinking” (Student A, Pre-Project Interview).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• “You can express what you are feeling at that moment in time” (Student C, Pre-Project Interview).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• “Art is having a way to express your emotions and your skills” (Student C, Post-Project Interview).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• “Something is not noticed, when you make it noticeable and make it worthwhile so others notice it…it is expressing yourself” (Student A, Post-Project Interview).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• “Art is creativity and it is doing what's on your mind…Sometimes it might tell about the struggles you are going through today or tomorrow…I mean if you were deaf…you can talk through your paintings” (Student D, Post-Project Interview).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• “…like one person, he expressed himself by taking pictures of different people while they was rapping and they was singing” (Student A, Post-Project Interview).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• “The ‘S’ represents the first letter in my name. The ‘P’ represents the participation I put in my artwork. The ‘L’ represents lions because they are my favorite animals. The ‘A’ represents the artwork I put in. The ‘T’ represents the first letter in my mom’s name. I made the ‘SPLATS’ of color green because I like money and also because green is my favorite color” (Student B, Artist Statement).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• “My life has also inspired me to create my artwork. I love to listen to music and that is what I do” (Student A, Artist Statement).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• “I like [my project] the most because I got to express myself with something I do everyday, which is music” (Student A, Post-Project Interview).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• “My artwork is entitled ‘My First Pay Check’ because I love money and I like dealing with money” (Student C, Artist Statement).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• “My life inspired me to do this artwork because when I grow up I want to become a professional dancer” (Student D, Artist Statement).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• “My artwork is entitled ‘The Two Faces of Gohan’ because I was able to show the two different sides of me (the good side and the bad side) through the two different faces I created” (Student E, Artist Statement and Art Show Video).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Summary of Findings

Data were organized according to the research questions and related themes they addressed. If certain patterns became apparent within the identified themes, data were further divided to promote greater understanding. All identified themes had data from at least two data sources. Three sources were used when a third was available. This ensured the validity of the data through triangulation.

* * *

This chapter gave the research results in detail. The next chapter will discuss those results and their implications in detail.
Chapter V: Discussion

Introduction

This study found that positive feelings of competence, adequate support, autonomy, authentic purpose and personal connections all increased student motivation to participate in the visual arts in this project and in the future. Students may have resisted help or wanted to quit difficult parts of their self-portrait projects, but at the end of the project they were able to reflect positively and be proud of their accomplishments. Hip hop culture in the NPG’s “Recognize” exhibition connected students to contemporary art, broadened their perceptions of valid art forms, and perceptions of how art is used as a communicative tool. Graffiti was a ‘cool’ and inviting art form for the students to use in their self-portraits, but it did not alleviate all fear of producing realistic art. Overall, this project was a success because students expressed themselves in thoughtful, well-carried out graffiti self-portraits they shared intelligently with others at a culminating art show opening at their school.

Interpretation of Results by Research Question Themes

Question I. Competence, Support and Social Interaction

When teaching art to adolescents, how can student motivation be developed and sustained? In order to pursue an activity solely for enjoyment or interest, students must feel competent, in control, and adequately supported (Boscolo & Gelati, 2008; Pearce & Larson, 2006; Ryan & Deci, 2000). Student participants’ feelings of competence, both positive and negative, were analyzed to address the first requirement for intrinsic motivational development, as discussed in Chapter 2.
Autonomy, the second factor mentioned, is discussed in Question I C. The third factor, the social environment surrounding the entire project, included teacher support and peer interaction. These were studied in relation to this research question to determine whether students felt adequately supported.

All six art club students were found disappointed and frustrated in their abilities at some point during the project. Since this study involved an after-school club, the students who participated in art club chose to pursue art as an extracurricular activity. They were some of the better artists in their classes, and they still all felt overwhelmed and inadequate. They reported feeling their work was “not good enough and their lettering looked dumb” (Field Notes, Working Club Meetings). Complaints and pleas for help were common during meetings. This confirms research that students in adolescence fear that they will be inadequate and thus only pursue safe activities where they feel they can succeed (Anderman & Maehr, 1994; Fredricks et al., 2002; Ryan & Deci, 2000). Students in art club mentioned other friends who would not attempt art because “they are not that good at it” (Student C, Pre-Project Interview). Art educators must consider how important it is to create opportunities for students to build feelings of competence and have successful art experiences, even if they are small steps to building larger skill sets (Jones, 1997).

Positive feelings of competence surfaced in reference to the end of the project. All but one student made positive comments describing their artwork in their artist statement. The post-project interviews directly related to feelings of competence: “cool”, “beautiful”, and “awesome” (Students C, D, F, Artist Statements). Student E explained the way the graffiti project helped his feelings of competence grow: “This
project has changed my feeling about art a great deal in a good way. I did more than I thought I could do… I was inspired by the fact that I was able to learn how to use paint and how to mix different colors” (Student E, Post-Project Interview and Artist Statement). These findings show the rewards were obvious to the students at the culmination of the project. The challenge for art educators is to encourage students to be persistent throughout the learning process and develop projects that are the correct combination of challenge and previously-learned skills, as Vygotsky recommends in his Zone of Proximal Development Theory (Vygotsky, 1978; Jones, 1997).

Support from the researcher and supporting art teacher as well as social interaction among peers created the social environment of this research project. The researcher and supporting art teacher acted as “guides on the side” instead of guiding and directing students every move. They provided support, without criticism, whenever their help was sought (Pavlou, 2006). Certain students needed more support than others. Student D had a particularly frustrating experience creating a realistic dancer for her piece, even with the researcher giving her all her attention, providing strategies to solve her problem, and walking her through each step. Most of the support given helped students achieve realistic results and demonstrated needed drawing and painting techniques. Student F was resistant to simple suggestions about painting and proportions during some of the working sessions. However, it was Student F who wrote and discussed how the support helped make her work better at the art show opening: “What inspired me was how my teachers encouraged me to be creative and to do more so my artwork could look better… My teachers showed me how to actually mix it up” (Artist Statement and Art Show Video). These findings
show how vital encouragement and support are, even when students are initially resistant to taking the extra time and effort to make their work better (Pavlou, 2006; Toku, 2001). Providing students with tools to succeed, while giving them choice in how to use them, proved to be a strategy that worked with the students in this art club. Art educators should attempt to act more in the “artist-teacher” role, providing support but not directing art activity (Roberts, 2008).

Peer interaction was the other important part of the social environment that added to the level of support students felt in the art club. Students criticized each other, exhibiting feelings of jealousy and inadequacy. They put each other down to make themselves feel better, as a defense mechanism: “I hate you. You’re so good” (Field Notes, Working Club meetings). Student B was the main focus of the negative peer interaction, but he did not seem to be upset by the teasing, possibly because he had the best technical painting skills in the art club. Positive peer interaction at the art show opening reception was enjoyable for the students and fulfilled their desire for approval: “I can show people art and be happy because they like what I did” (Student A, Pre-Project Interview). These findings confirm research that students need more encouragement from one another and their teachers (Fredricks et al., 2002; Jones, 1997; Pavlou, 2006). Fear must be removed from the environment for motivation to pursue art to increase (Pavlou, 2006).

This study found that in order for student motivation to be developed and maintained, students must feel competent and safe in the learning environment (Ryan & Deci, 2000). All the skill-based instruction and assistance that an art teacher can provide in the midst of student-directed projects will increase motivation.
Art teachers must help students reach their goals by providing them with the tools to achieve them or adjust them to fit in their artistic “zone of proximal development” (Vygotsky, 1978). This will allow students the opportunity to feel successful and encouraged.

Question I. a. Personal Connections to Art and the Museum Visit

*Will creating personal connections through pop culture increase motivation?*

Personal connections were represented in three dimensions in this study’s collected data: to art itself, to the “Recognize” museum visit, and to the audience who would view the students’ work. Personal connections related to art itself and the museum visit are evaluated in this section, while connections related to the audience are discussed further in Question I B, regarding authentic purpose.

Students reported feeling personally connected to art in the pre-project interview because they really like doing it and “because its fun” (Student B). These feelings are considered the result of an individual or personal interest; a natural disposition related to a certain topic (Hidi & Harackewicz, 2000). These students volunteered for art club and had some sort of previously-existing interest for art. The results to this study, especially those concerning motivation, might be significantly different if it was conducted on a random sample of adolescent students that did not all share a pre-disposition to art.

The “Recognize: Hip Hop and Contemporary Portraiture” exhibition at the NPG forged the student participants’ personal connection with art through their familiarity and interest in hip hop culture. Particularly, students made connections to the musical artists portrayed in the photography and paintings in the exhibition.
These personal connections were exciting findings because they could develop situational interest in art or encourage students to take ownership of their artistic growth to pursue art related to their musical and cultural interests. All five students who attended the museum trip were engaged in the museum experience the majority of the time, especially in the rooms with Kehinde Wiley’s life-sized portraits of rappers, including Ice T, Grandmaster Flash, etc. The students would look at a new painting, guess who was painted in the picture, and read the title, exclaiming, “Oh, yeah, I know him!” (Field Notes, Museum Visit). All the students were interested in the musical artists and hip hop culture represented in the “Recognize” exhibition. This finding implies that art educators should bring culturally relevant artwork into the classroom as often as they can. This would assist art teachers in developing motivation through providing opportunities for students to connect with age-appropriate subject matter. Because this study successfully used hip hop to spark interest, it supports the research that hip hop culture, in particular, has educational value when brought into urban classrooms because of the students’ automatic connection with the subject matter (Au, 2005; Congdon & Blandy, 2003; Hochritt, 2004; Moore & Neal, 2007).

Two students were extremely attentive to the artwork they saw. Student C got extremely close to Kehinde Wiley’s paintings and Shinique Smith’s collage. Student A “remembered all the information about how David Scheinbaum became interested in photographing Hip Hop artists from his online artist interview” (Field Notes, Museum Visit). These students were two of the three who had fully prepared for the visit through the first two art club meetings. This may have positively affected their
level of interest. If so, a future study could be conducted to compare the interest
development between student groups who were fully prepared for a museum visit and
those who visited without preparation. This piece of research could greatly contribute
to making museum experiences for all students in all subjects more meaningful.

Question I. b. Authentic Tasks

*Will having an authentic purpose increase motivation?* Students in this study
created their graffiti self-portraits for display at an art show in their school. Having
an authentic purpose seemed to increase student motivation to produce high quality
work and to communicate through art, although no real comparison data is available
to show what student motivation would be without this culminating art show. This
study found that four out of six students clearly thought of what their audience would
experience when viewing their artwork. They included certain images to cause their
audience to recall information or learn something new: “they might think that the
only type of dance is not Hip Hop, there’s ballet too” (Student D, Post-Project
Interview). Students also mentioned the opportunity to inspire others through their
artwork. Even if students are given the opportunity to share their work with their
peers in class, this authentic experience surpassed those share times by creating a
‘real artist’ experience. These findings support recent trends like the issues-based art
education movement, which focuses primarily on providing students with a reason to
make art, then secondarily on giving them the tools to create it (Simpson, 1995). This
finding coincides with the increased motivation found by fellow graduate students’
similar action research projects that ended with a chance to ‘use’ student art for its
intended purpose: to communicate the ideas it represents (Lohr, personal communication, March 16, 2009).

Question I. c. Autonomy

Will giving students autonomy increase motivation? Autonomy did not increase all students’ motivation throughout the span of the project, but it did increase student feelings of success at the end of the project. Students in this study were given few limitations in the graffiti project, mostly derived from the materials used and artistic style of graffiti. Mostly, students made all the decisions concerning how their work would look. Students A, D, and F complained about feeling overwhelmed and incapable to make decisions about their work during the beginning, middle, and nearing the end of the project (Field Notes, Working Club Meetings). These students were resistant to this open-ended task at first because they had to think for themselves. However, these same students made positive statements, explaining their decisions in depth and taking personal pride in their success, at the end of the project: “My favorite parts of my artwork are the spikes, the way I shape my graffiti, and my background” (Student F, Artist Statement); “I like [my project] the most because I got to express myself with something I do everyday, which is music” (Student A, Post-Project Interview), “I imagined and created a beautiful artwork” (Student D, Artist Statement). The other students did not specifically address their feelings towards their own artwork. The students who struggled the most had greater feelings of triumph. Pushing students to the limit, challenging them, and not giving up on them is crucial to building their confidence and motivation (Hidi & Harackiewicz, 2000; Ryan & Deci, 2000).
To compare this study to situations where students did not have control, data were identified surrounding the participants’ art projects within their art class. Students A, B, and C had just finished a unit on self-portraits with the supporting art teacher. They had completed step-by-step projects and explained their choices saying, “because we had to draw half our face” (Student A, Pre-Project Interview). This shallow explanation pales in comparison to the rich artist statements students wrote and reasons they were able to articulate in the post-project interview. This confirms that beginning with student interests and allowing them control over artistic decisions gives them feelings of investment and leads to deeper learning (Roberts, 2008). This directly relates to Elliot Eisner’s theory that the art classroom should be a place where students are challenged to problem solve and think ‘artistically’ instead of following a prescription (Eisner, 2002). Students not only get more out of the learning experience, but they remember it because it had more personal investment (Ryan & Deci, 2000).

Question II. Museum Visit and Ideas of Art

Will seeing the “Recognize” exhibition broaden student ideas of valid and respected art forms? Students unanimously reported either a change in their feelings about art or inspiration as a result of visiting the “Recognize” exhibition. Student A was able to directly identify how it broadened her perspectives: “I think the museum helped me because I saw different types of art and different types of graffiti” (Post-Project Questions). Many students directly related their self-portraits to the work they saw at the show: “We took a trip to the Portrait Gallery. I was inspired by the artwork I saw” (Student D, Artist Statement). Two students mentioned the
photographs of the rappers and considered them “different types” of artwork. One student seemed surprised at how the photographer’s art was capturing the art of others: rapping. The significant part of this finding is that students reported the effect of the museum visit on their opinions and artwork on their own; most of the comments surfaced in their artist statements. This proves the power of the “Recognize” exhibition in their minds because they discussed it without being prompted. Students had their ideas of art expanded through the graffiti in the museum as well. These results are discussed in the next section.

Question II. a. Graffiti

Will viewing graffiti in a museum setting change student perceptions about graffiti? Student perceptions about graffiti were positively changed through interacting with graffiti in the museum and using it in their self-portrait projects. Student E was captivated by the graffiti in the NPG and asked many questions referencing how the artist achieved certain effects. Student C did not know what graffiti was called or that it was a valid art form. She reported her desire to learn about “a new style of art that I never heard of” and claimed that “after being in the art club, I understand [graffiti]” (Student C, Artist Statement and Post-Project Interview). Her perceptions changed from curiosity to full understanding (Hochritt, 2004; Whitehead, 2004). Student D did not realize the positive potential of graffiti as a valid art form: “I just thought graffiti was used for bad things, but it can be used for good things also, like I used to always just see it on walls and things, but it is in the museum too” (Student D, Post-Project Interview).
Question II. b. Realism

Will using graffiti dissipate student fears of realism? Using graffiti in student’s projects helped to dissipate student fears of realism, but it did not completely remove the fears or challenges associated with realism. As reported in the literature, students in this research study experienced most of their frustration with attempts to created realistic images (Pavlou, 2006). Their attention to the details of Kehinde Wiley’s portraits of the rappers at the “Recognize” exhibition showed their recognition and admiration of realistic painting. Students’ reactions to the ‘magical powers’ of tracing paper also showed their desire to pursue realistic imagery. Students begged for tracing paper to take home and use on their own. It was not a surprise when students became frustrated even with the stylized form of graffiti. Some students reported feeling that their “lettering looked dumb” (Field Notes, Working Club Meetings). Even though student projects did not require them to paint photographic people or items, students were still caught up in whether their art looked like ‘real’ graffiti or not. Shading and gradation were still technical skills associated with realism that were important to make graffiti lettering look three-dimensional, so students became concerned with these skills. Student D became extremely frustrated with creating a dancer for her self-portrait. Although she was guided and assisted one-on-one, she “balled up a paper she was working on, stating she would change her idea because drawing the dancer was too hard” (Field Notes, Working Club Meetings). Although the project was designed to avoid this challenge, Student D completed her work and included a dancer in the end. She was one of the students who specifically reported pride in her work at the culmination of the project. Fear of
realism is a very big hurdle for adolescent students to overcome when pursuing art. Art teachers need to provide students with as much help and assistance in creating realistic images as they possibly can, including using reference images and tracing paper. Assigning projects in stylized artistic forms will help to alleviate their fears, but they will not disappear completely.

Question III. Identity and Self-Expression

*Will students identify with the artists in the “Recognize” exhibition and realize they can express themselves through art in similar ways?* Students understood that art was a way to express themselves prior to visiting the “Recognize” exhibition. But after visiting the museum and participating in the graffiti self-portrait project, students showed a deeper understanding of how to express themselves through their art and related their explanations of self-expression to specific examples in their work. Each student that participated in the museum visit linked their self-portraits directly to a personal interest outside of art: music, money, dancing, comics, etc (Hanes & Weisman, 2002). None of the pieces looked remotely the same. Each was original and unique.

Student A demonstrated a particularly deep understanding of art’s power of expression. She was also transfixed with the photographer David Scheinbaum’s story of how he became interested in photographing rappers: he was attending a concert with his son and fell in love with the music. Student A connected with the fact that Scheinbaum’s son, who was her age, inspired his father. She remembered this when creating and explaining her own work: “My life has also inspired me to create my
artwork. I love to listen to music and that is what I do if I am ever bored” (Student A, Post-Project Interview).

These findings reinforce the research encouraging art educators to provide students with contemporary art examples in the classroom. Artist purpose needs to be addressed if educators expect students to create meaning in their own pieces and understand that art is a powerful tool for self-expression (Fortune et al., 2008; Knight, 2006; Simpson, 1995; Whitehead, 2004).

**Summary**

Positive feelings of competence, adequate support, autonomy, authentic purpose and personal connections all increased student motivation to participate in the visual arts in the future. Students may have resisted help or wanted to quit tasks they felt were too open-ended or technically challenging, but the freedom of decision and ownership they felt in their self-portraits helped them overcome these difficulties. Visiting the NPG’s “Recognize: Hip Hop and Contemporary Portraiture” exhibition helped students understand the role of artists in the world today and validated non-traditional art forms, including graffiti. Although graffiti lettering was less intimidating than realistically painting objects or people, students still encountered some frustration in producing ‘real’ looking graffiti. The students ultimately produced meaningful graffiti self-portraits they were able to explain and share with others at the art show opening reception.
Limitations of the Study

This study’s findings can only be generalized to other urban after-school art clubs. As mentioned in the findings concerning developing student motivation, the student participants in this study already had personal interest in art. Students volunteered to join the art club and felt that art was something worthwhile to pursue after school. This pre-existing personal interest would not be found in every student if a project like this was conducted for everyone in a grade level. Certain principles of motivation concerning hip hop culture should be applicable to most urban adolescents though, since interest in hip hop has nothing to do with feelings towards art.

As mentioned, certain problems with student recruitment and attendance to all meetings may have affected the results of this research. The art club began with only three students, three more joined, but only five attended the museum visit. Table 5.1 shows which students participated in the important meetings, which students missed key meetings, etc. A larger group of subjects would have allowed the study findings to be more reliable.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 5.1</th>
<th>Subject Attendance to Study Sessions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Student</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pre-Trip Meetings</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Museum Visit to NPG</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Majority of Post-Trip Meetings</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Art Show Opening Reception</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Students D and E’s answers to questions prior to the museum visit were not recorded owing to technical problems with the equipment. The setting was not ideal and the researcher was unable to use two forms of recordings in the hallway where
she spoke with students, so the data were lost. These comments could have provided more data to create the before-after comparison.

Finally, Student B was very quiet-natured and did not speak up or share during the interviews often. He usually defaulted to his peer’s answers. However, he had some of the best artwork of the group, and it is speculated that his comments, had he felt more comfortable to share them, could have been very informative. Personal interviews could have given him an environment free of his peers to respond without fear of their teasing. On the other hand, personal interviews could have made others in the group less comfortable to share.

The researcher was using the cooperating teacher’s art room, some of her supplies, and therefore had to operate under some of her established procedures and expectations. This was not a perceived problem, but it did create a different situation than if the art club was held in the researcher’s own space.

**Implications for Future Research**

This research has generated several questions needing further study. The visit to the “Recognize” exhibition was a huge success and helped adolescent students connect to the contemporary art world and understanding why people create art today. How would younger or older students react to the same artwork? Would the connections to subject matter be as strong, even though they are cultural?

This study was conducted in an intimate, after-school club setting. All students’ motivation to create art increased as a result of participating in the study, even the student who was unable to visit the museum. Would all students’ motivation increase if this same museum visit and project were conducted in the regular art
classes at the school? In other words, would such a project be feasible and produce the same results if it was conducted in a sixth grade art class instead of an after-school club? Would it have the same results if the art exhibition was viewed solely online instead of making a visit to the NPG? How would the teacher’s ability to provide support and guidance as students progress and run into problems affect their feelings of competency, (among other issues)?

Answers to these new questions would extend this study's results to the classroom setting and would reach more students than just those already interested in art. In this way, studies on motivation to participate in the arts could be expanded to include those who are not already pursuing it.

Implications for Practice

The students who participated in the pre-museum art club meetings and already knew some of the artists and work were more engaged with the whole museum experience. Educators need to take the time to properly prepare their students prior to museum visits so they can connect to what they are seeing. Museums could extend their outreach programs to include pre-visit programs at school locations to provide the same information and increase the opportunity for connection.

Students in the art club needed freedom to produce art, however they felt most comfortable. Students used tracing paper, looked up images on the computer, took photos on a digital camera, and found a graffiti alphabet to assist them in successfully designing their self-portraits. Art teachers need to remember that the ultimate goal of art education is to create students who pursue art because they enjoy it, not to create
students with perfect technical skills. At the adolescent stage of development where students are already fearful and unwilling to try new things, they need as much support and collaborative freedom as it is possible to provide in the art classroom. Criticism and realistic drawing skills have their place, but they should not be the focus of all instruction.

Hip hop culture and familiarity with the musical artists in the “Recognize” show helped inspire students to create their own meaningful artworks. Teachers should take every opportunity they find to bring material that is culturally relevant to their students into the classroom. When learning is related to life, students are naturally more interested and art is no exception.

Finally, teachers should create as many authentic learning tasks as possible. Creating things simply for an art grade is not motivating. Designing and completing the graffiti self-portrait project for display in a school art show was extremely motivating, especially for adolescents in the search for their own identity. They had the opportunity to receive praise and express themselves in their community.

* * *

This chapter discussed the results and implications of the study in detail. The appendices and bibliography are on the following pages.
# Appendix A

## Pre-Project Interview Transcript

**Students A-C only**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>Student A</th>
<th>Student B</th>
<th>Student C</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>What is art?</strong></td>
<td>&quot;I think art is being creative and expressing yourself in all kinds of creative ways.&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;I think art is colors, shapes, and different lines, and sculpture.&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;I think art is another structured way of using your visualism and having a great intellectual on what you are doing with the art and what you feel about it.&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>What are different types of art? What kinds of materials?</strong></td>
<td>&quot;portraits&quot;</td>
<td>“building something”</td>
<td>“abstract things”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Does it have to be on paper? What other sort of things qualify as art?</strong></td>
<td>“gathered materials like wheels and paper and make a collage”</td>
<td>“build stuff out of wax”</td>
<td>“You can do it on walls.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Why is art important?</strong></td>
<td>&quot;When we didn't have art, you wouldn't be able to have cars, because art is like cars, like toys and television.&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;Art is around the world everywhere you look and it helps you look out for what you are doing.&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;I think that art is important because we have art made all around us and it is a way of expressing your feelings and the way it comes out is art.&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Do you think art has changed things in history before? Was art important back then?</strong></td>
<td>&quot;I think art was still important because some people who made things back in the day…somebody had to create that and then they made it in their own materials.&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;I don't think it was popular back then b/c I don't think there were a lot of people who knew about art.&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;I think it has always been important b/c in order for us to have it on, people have to have a blueprint of what they were going to make.&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Questions</td>
<td>Student A</td>
<td>Student B</td>
<td>Student C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What is art used for today? Why do people make art today? Why do you make art?</td>
<td>“I think artists make art today b/c it's not just what they want to do in life, it's a way they can express themselves. If you enjoy art, people will be able to tell what you are feeling…We will be able to see what they have been thinking.”</td>
<td>NR</td>
<td>“Because it's something they really like doing and its totally in their blood. Plus its one of the ways you can express what you are feeling at that moment in time.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Who likes art? Who does not like art? Are there people who don't like art?</td>
<td>“I think everyone would like art. &quot;My friends say they don't, but then when they get here, they say ‘ooh, that's pretty’.&quot; &quot;Like one of my friends, he don't know how to draw a portrait.”</td>
<td>He thinks everyone likes art.</td>
<td>“People like art b/c it’s a great way of having an expression on yourself and others… Some people may say I don't like it because they are not that good at it, and they have never tried it.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Can art change people's opinions?</td>
<td>“I think it can change their opinions, b/c sometimes when I look at something, I don't like it, but then when I read the idea they had, I think 'that was really cool' b/c I wasn't looking at it that way.”</td>
<td>“Some people rush through their work, but then when they see what art is really about; then I think they can.”</td>
<td>“I do think that it can because once they look at the painting, they can see that visual and see what they did, and then they can think about their own art.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Why do you personally like to create art? Not just in art class, but outside of class, why do you do it?</td>
<td>“I think I draw art and sketch art because it makes me feel better and I can show people art and be happy because they like what I did.”</td>
<td>“Yes, I like to create art outside b/c its fun. Sometimes I sketch at home, I sketch my brother.”</td>
<td>“I look doing it in both settings, because it is one of the things I really like doing. I paint at home and I sketch.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Questions</td>
<td>Student A</td>
<td>Student B</td>
<td>Student C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Is art pretty stuff to hang on the wall?</td>
<td>“I don't think it is just something you hang on your wall. If you go into somebody's house and you see all their pictures on their wall, you could see how they have expressed themselves and what they think.”</td>
<td>“You can make stuff out of anything if you just put your mind to it.”</td>
<td>“I think that art is not just something you put on your wall, it is something you like and have interest in and you love art.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What is a portrait?</td>
<td>“a picture of people, pets, and animals”</td>
<td>“it can be anything, it can be fruit”</td>
<td>“a painting like you can do of yourself, like of anything sitting around in front of you”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Why did you draw all those other things in your picture?</td>
<td>“I drew these other things b/c we had to draw 1/2 our face, and the other things are about how we express yourself.”</td>
<td>NR</td>
<td>“The other things tell about us, not just our face, but things that tell about us.”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Appendix B

**Post-Project Interview Transcript**

**Students A-C**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Student A</th>
<th>Student B</th>
<th>Student C</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>What is art?</td>
<td>NR</td>
<td>NR</td>
<td>“Art is having a way to express your emotions and your skills.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Why is art important?</td>
<td>“When something is not noticed, when you make it noticeable and make it worthwhile so others notice it…and it is expressing yourself.”</td>
<td>“Its important in many ways b/c you can express yourself in different ways.”</td>
<td>NR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do you think that art can change people's opinions?</td>
<td>NR</td>
<td>“I think the different colors and shades might…”</td>
<td>“I think it might change their opinion because how do they think designers design their glove, do they just put a thread on it?”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do your parents or the kids at our school see art like this everyday?</td>
<td>NR</td>
<td>NR</td>
<td>NR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Questions</td>
<td>Student A</td>
<td>Student B</td>
<td>Student C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do you think art is used for anything else today? Or is expression the main reason?</td>
<td>NR</td>
<td>“It’s something fun to do and you can do it in lots of ways.”</td>
<td>NR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reflect on what you have done… What did you learn? Would you want to do it again? Would you not? What would you change?</td>
<td>“My favorite part of doing this was when I actually got to experience how to do it and how different types of paint are and work with it and how different types of colors go together to make different things. I like it the most because I got to express myself with something I do everyday, which is music. I would change it by using spray paint on some of the parts of it. I think the museum helped me because I saw different types of art and different types of graffiti and you can express yourself in different types of ways. Like one person, he expressed himself by taking pictures of different people while they was rapping and they was singing.”</td>
<td>“I like to do art a lot. I did graffiti--it was kinda cool because it has a lot of curves and shapes.”</td>
<td>“I really enjoyed this b/c it expressed a new style of art that I never heard of, I had seen it, but I didn't know what it was called, I just called it big bubble letters.”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Post-Project Interview Transcript (cont’d)

**Students D-G**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Student D</th>
<th>Student E</th>
<th>Student F</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>What is art?</td>
<td>“Art is creativity and it is doing what's on your mind, and sometimes you just do what's on your mind and sometimes you just do it and it turns out to be creative… (in response to someone else) about your life.”</td>
<td>NR</td>
<td>“Art to me is culture, culture, like putting together things that other people don't even know yet (student is being silly)… so I asked--what does that mean… ‘stuff from your family’.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Why is art important?</td>
<td>“It tells a story about you and the things that you do or sometimes it might tell about the struggles you are going through today or tomorrow… I mean if you were deaf and you can't here anything and you can't talk, you can talk through your paintings.”</td>
<td>“Art is important to me because of art, I am worthwhile.”</td>
<td>NR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Question</td>
<td>Student D</td>
<td>Student E</td>
<td>Student F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do you think that art can change people's opinions?  Do you think your piece can change people's opinions?</td>
<td>“I think sometimes when people hear music playing, they might not want to dance, b/c they are too shy or something, but when they see my piece, they might think that the only type of dance is not Hip Hop, there’s ballet too.”</td>
<td>“Yes, b/c… I guess it would.”</td>
<td>NR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do your parents or the kids at our school see art like this everyday?</td>
<td>“I don’t think it will change people's opinion about art b/c people will see check and maybe they can read it and think of working and trying to get a job and trying to get money for their children (Student C's work).”</td>
<td>NR</td>
<td>NR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do you think art is used for anything else today? Or is expression the main reason?</td>
<td>“It tells a story and sometimes it can get your mind off something, help calm you down, or help you relax.”</td>
<td>NR</td>
<td>NR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Question</td>
<td>Student D</td>
<td>Student E</td>
<td>Student F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reflect on what you have done... What did you learn? Would you want to do it again? Would you not? What would you change?</td>
<td>“I liked the experience of art club b/c at first I just thought graffiti was used for bad things, but it can be used for good things also, like I used to always just see it on walls and things, but it is in the museum too. I would love to do this again.”</td>
<td>“I think that the museum was really nice and the different types of artwork were neat. Especially the art of the different rappers singing, they just caught that moment at exactly the right time… and in doing this art in this project has changed my feeling about art a great deal in a good way. I did more than I thought I could do.”</td>
<td>NR</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix C

Art Show Video Transcript

**Student D:**
“There’s not just Hip Hop dance out there, there’s modern dance too”

**Student E:**
“My painting is called “the two faces of Gohan”. I did this because I wanted to try something new this year, because all I did for the past two years was drum core, drum core. And I got tired of that, so I signed up for art club. Then when I tried graffiti work, I really got into it. Then I added some of my favorite characters from off of Dragonball-Z. Its one of my favorite shows and past times. It took me two weeks, two months. I had to finalize it, so I had to throw something in here because I had too much space going on. I threw in two meteors. The J stands for the J in my name. The dog stands for ---(could not transcribe). My favorite parts of my artwork are my meteors. I named it the Two faces of Gohan because like the two sides of me, the good side and the bad side. And that about wraps it up.”

**Student F:**
“I never made anything like this before. I never made flames because I never knew how to draw it. But then my teachers showed me how to actually mix it up …. Every time someone showed me how to do something, I did it different. I did the spikes because…like you…”
Appendix D

Student Artist Statements

Student A:
“My artwork is inspired by the art exhibit I saw at the National Portrait Gallery called ‘Recognize’.
The name of my art is ‘Music Rocks’.
I chose my tag name that you see in my artwork to be ‘JAM’ because the first two letters are the same as my name and the ‘M’ stands for ‘music’. My favorite parts of my art are the bright colors and the iPod. My life has also inspired me to create my artwork. I love to listen to music and that is what I do if I am ever bored. I hope you can see how much I love music in my art.”

Student B:
“Before I created artwork called graffiti, I went on a trip to the art museum exhibit called “Recognize.” I saw lots of cool, inspiring graffiti that had lots of colors and different shades.
My artwork is entitled ‘SPLAT’.
The ‘S’ represents the first letter in my name. The ‘P’ represents the participation I put in my artwork. The ‘L’ represents lions because they are my favorite animals. The ‘A’ represents the artwork I put in. The ‘T’ represents the first letter in my mom’s name. I made the ‘SPLATS’ of color green because I like money and also because green is my favorite color.”

Student C:
“Before I started my graffiti artwork, the art club went to the Portrait Gallery to see an art exhibit entitled ‘Recognize’. We saw a lot of graffiti art and it inspired the artwork I created. My artwork is entitled ‘My First Pay Check’ because I love money and I like dealing with money. I made graffiti because for a long time I’ve wondered, ‘What are those big funny looking words—I want to do words like that because it looks cool.’ And now after being in the art club, I understand it. My favorite part of my artwork is the background because it looks cool.”

Student D:
“Before I created my graffiti, we took a trip to the Portrait Gallery. I was inspired by the artwork I saw. After seeing the exhibit ‘Recognize’ I imagined and completed a beautiful graffiti artwork. What I like about my artwork is that it tells a little story about me. My favorite parts of my artwork are the background and the colors. My life inspired me to do this artwork because when I grow up I want to become a professional dancer.
My artwork is entitled ‘DANCE’.”
**Student E:**
“I did this graffiti piece because I wanted to inspire others. I was inspired by the fact that I was able to learn how to use paint and how to mix different colors. Using different shades helped make different parts of my artwork stand out. I like that the outline makes my letters stand out. My favorite part of my artwork is the meteors. My artwork is entitled ‘The Two Faces of Gohan’ because I was able to show the two different sides of me through the two different faces I created.”

**Student F:**
“I made graffiti because I thought I can make something awesome and I did. My favorite parts of my artwork are the spikes, the way I shape my graffiti, and my background. I also like the flames because of the colors and technique I used to create them. What inspired me was how my teachers encouraged me to be creative and to do more so my artwork could look better. My artwork is entitled ‘The Bassion for Passion’.”
Appendix E

Student Graffiti Self-Portraits

Student A:
Student B:
Student C:
Student E:
Student F:
Appendix F

Researcher’s Field Notes

Researcher Notes:

Pre-Trip Club Meetings

• First Club meeting:
  o I introduced myself to the group. I was disappointed that more kids were not able to come.
  o The kids were very excited to do some art, so I allowed them to draw and doodle while we talked b/c I didn’t want them to be bored. I figured this way, I would get to talk with them, and they would be able to listen but do a little something while they were listening.
  o We discussed art. I was surprised at the lack of depth in their answers. Their art teacher (who was supporting with me in the project) had just discussed self-portraits with them. The students had completed their own self-portrait which followed a certain format: half of their face was supposed to look realistic and half was to be built of things that represent them, like music notes, words, sports items, etc. The students understood that they could represent themselves through a picture like that, since it was “of” them, but I don’t think they understood that art could represent ideas beyond the representation of objects and people.
  o We looked at 3 different examples of portraits from the art teacher’s print collection. They were a marble bust, a painting where a woman was being dwarfed by a vase of flowers, and a painting where a child was sitting in the shadows.
  o We discussed how all of these pictures were portraits and how a portrait didn’t have to actually be of a human or have any human elements to represent the ideas of a person and be a “portrait” of them.
  o The students seemed surprised that art was not so rigid—if a painting was of an apple, but the artist called it a self-portrait instead of a still life, the idea was what mattered and took precedence. I really felt like this expanded their definition of art and broadened the importance of artists’ purpose.

• Second Club meeting:
  o We used a teacher’s room that had a promethean board to view the National Portrait Gallery’s website. Because of technical difficulties, the volume was at a level where we had to huddle closely to hear well. I think I lost some of their attention some of the time just because the presentation did not make it easy for them to listen and focus.
  o Student C was very distracted when we were exploring and discussing the artists we were going to see; she just wanted to doodle and kept wandering away from what we were viewing.
o Student A was attentive. She seemed excited to have a new experience.

o Student B really listened to the interviews of the artists and seemed to have a lot of interest. I think he thought it was neat that we were going to see something that there was already information about on the internet.

o In the future, I might want to present segments of the interviews and show the pictures over a few more art club sessions. I think it is valuable for the students to be introduced to the artists and what they are going to see prior to visiting the museum; however, I think I needed to stretch out the information over a few sessions so the students were not on overload. They were coming to art club after a long school day where they were already required to listen, so they needed more activity paired with the listening to keep their attention.

Museum Visit

• I attempted to interview students D and E prior to leaving for the museum. I got them out of class early to interview them, but I could not find a classroom for us to use. We had to go over the questions in the hallway. Many people were walking by and distracting us. I was unable to use 2 methods of audio recording because I could not find a plug. Unfortunately, my mp3 player did not actually record the session. Honestly, because of the conditions of the interview, my students’ answers were not very in-depth or revealing about their opinions. They did a bunch of “yeah, I think so’s…” and I did a bunch of suggesting and trying to explain the questions more because they were not focusing.

• We gathered all the students to leave for the visit around 3:45 PM. We arrived at the museum and met our tour guide, a member of the education committee at the National Portrait Gallery. I had given her a little background about our students and what they would be doing after the visit. She began by introducing us to the theme of the exhibition and discussing the four elements of hip hop: graffiti, break-dancing, MCing, and DJing. She then took us through the different rooms of the exhibition and discussing why the museum curators chose these artists to display. She asked my students a bunch of questions—what did they think, why would this be interesting, what was their favorite part about the different art, etc.

• I noticed that Student C was really into the paintings. She would get three inches away from the Kehinde Wiley portraits and wander away from our group. The art teacher, who helped me chaperone, kept calling her back over to us. Our tour guide was a little nervous that she might touch the paintings, I think. I was happy with the way Student C engaged with the artwork, examining the details. She commented that the paintings looked like photographs. She was in awe of Kehinde Wiley’s power to create realistic pieces. Student C also walked beyond the boundary tape around Shinique Smith’s collage and reached out to touch part of it. She identified with some of the clothing items included in the collage, commenting that she had similar items or would like to wear them.
• Student A remembered all the information about how David Scheinbaum became interested in photographing Hip Hop artists from his online artist interview. She told our tour guide about how he saw a concert with his son, who was her age, and then fell in love with the music and wanted to photograph rappers. I believe this meant a lot to her because an adult was inspired by his child. The thought of having the power to change an adult’s opinion through music was exciting to her.

• Student B was very attentive. He seems to be quiet but engaged. He identified a lot of the items in the collage piece by Shinique Smith by name.

• Many of the rappers portrayed by Kehinde Wiley were ‘beginning’ Hip Hop artists, so my fellow teacher recognized them and knew their names. However, my students had still heard of them and began humming their songs and exclaiming, “Oh, yeah, I know him! That’s ____!”

• Our tour guide explained that Kehinde Wiley painted the portraits of the rappers life-sized and in the traditional portrait positions of 16th and 17th century kings to recognize their influential positions in our society today. She brought examples of the king portraits for the students to see and compare to Wiley’s works. This was very interesting to them and probably the only part of the tour where all of them were completely engaged. I believe they felt connected to the process. Seeing the pictures where he got his idea gave them a window into how artists plan and work.

• Student E was really impressed by the graffiti. He commented how it “glowed” in the gallery lighting. He asked questions like, “How did they do that? It looks like sunlight.”

• Our tour guide left us at the door to the video room. My students did not have as much background for understanding the metaphors presented through Jefferson Pinder’s videos (and neither did I), so they wanted to re-visit some of the other pieces. We allowed them to wander around for about twenty more minutes. Only Student E was sitting disengaged at the end of those twenty minutes. We had to tell the rest of the students it was time to leave and they met us with some resistance.

Post-Trip meetings
• Fourth Club meeting:
  o We discussed the project the students would do. They were to come up with their own “TAG” just like Conlon and Hupp had the name “AREK” when they worked together. I challenged them and gave them examples of how this tag could represent them through modeling the brainstorming process and coming up with a tag for myself.
  o Students D, A, and F felt this ‘brainstorming’ process was too difficult. They kept changing their minds, complaining, and asking for help. I refused to tell them what to do, saying I wanted it to be their self-portrait, not mine!
  o Student C, E, and F wanted to rush and go with their first idea. I had shown them the canvases and the paint they would use to create their final piece and asked numerous times if they could start. I wanted their self-portraits to be their very best. Planning and sketching before
plunging right in is a very important part of art that students need to be taught, and I was determined to teach them the value of taking the necessary time to make it the best it could be. They were unhappy and maybe a little bored, but still were struggling to give me valid reasons for the tags they were choosing, so I would not let them move on.

- Student B worked very hard on his tag and ended up coming up with an acrostic. He did not seem to mind the thinking process. I feel like he has experienced thinking through projects before. He seemed to work more methodically and was used to taking his time. He might pursue art on his own more than some of the other students.

- Working Club meetings…
  - When students decided on a tag, they sketched it many different ways on small 8 ½ x 11 scratch paper. They looked up graffiti lettering on the computer and used it for a guide. Students B, C, and E were almost copying the lettering and I encouraged them to make it their own in some way. They felt as though what they could do was not ‘good enough’ and their lettering looked dumb.
  - Students had never used tracing paper before. I had them transfer their full-sized sketches to the canvas board with large pieces of it. They found it almost magical and enjoyed using it. Students E and C wanted some to take home and use for their own personal doodling. I gave them extra. I believe it gave them a crutch for creating things that look real. I used to use tracing paper all the time in my work, but now I can perceive proportions and do not need it to achieve realism. Why not allow students to use it if it creates more positive feelings about art and disperses some of their fear?
  - Students C, E, and F teased Student B a lot because they felt that his artwork was the best. They were clearly jealous, and would say things like, “Man, look at your [student B’s] work. I hate you. You’re so good.” They compared their work to his and judged despite the fact that I was complimenting each of them, teaching them, and demonstrating how each of them could make their paintings more dynamic.
  - Students C, E, and F used art club time ineffectively. I did not mind if students talked while they worked, but I had to ask them to be quiet some sessions because they were only talking and walking around the room, not painting at all.
  - Student B was the most focused of the group. He attempted to do lots of bricks in the background of his tag, which ended up being arduous, but very beautiful. He invested much more time into the detail of the bricks and reaped the benefit of his investment. He seemed to bashfully enjoy the envious comments of his peers and recognized that the extra time paid off.
  - Student D wanted her tag to be “dance”. She wanted to include a ballerina in her piece. Some of the graffiti examples that we looked at
in the art club had caricatures included as part of the works. I chose graffiti so the frustration of creating realistic art would not be an issue, but I did not want to discourage Student D from making her own artistic decisions or tell her not to attempt a dancer. I helped her look up pictures of dancers online, we used tracing paper to piece together what we wanted her dancer to look like, and she worked on drawing her. She got very frustrated, even with me sitting right beside her. Student D even balled up a paper she was working on, stating she would change her idea because drawing the dancer was too hard. I did not draw the dancer for her, because then she wouldn’t be learning, but I managed to encourage her not to give up and help her pinpoint what proportions needed to be changed for the caricature of the dancer to look ‘right’. The frustration level that Student D had with drawing something realistic was so great that I would not be surprised if she confronted this again in a setting without proper support and direction if she gave up on it entirely.

- Students A, B, and C had a natural ability for shading and mixing color that gave their paintings depth. I did not have to assist them much. Students D, E, and F needed more direction and resisted some of the direction. My supporting art teacher was frustrated with Student F one day because she was refusing to work more. Student F’s goal, as she stated several times, was to “be done” instead of enjoy the process. My supporting art teacher marked on her painting so she would be forced to create highlights on her letters. This frustrated Student F that day, but she later commented that she liked it better. I believe this particular situation demonstrated the lack of persistence and commitment this group as a whole, excepting Students A and B, had to a completing a long-term project.

- Final Meetings:
  - Students wrote their artist statements when their pieces were nearing completion. My supporting art teacher gave them a few guidelines of what needed to be included in a good artist statement: their name, age, reasons for doing the artwork, their favorite part, and people they wanted to thank, if any. We helped them edit their statements (grammar and phrasing corrections) but did not change the content in any way or make suggestions beyond the guidelines of what should be included.
  - Students became very excited about the show and eagerly took bunches of fliers to hand out to their friends and family.

- Art Show:
  - Students all dressed up in their Sunday best and stayed after school to help set up the day of the show. I bought cheese, crackers, cookies, and sparkling juice to make the opening reception official.
  - The supporting art teacher procured frames for each of the pieces and we hung the show in our school’s dance room, removing all other posters from the walls so it resembled a gallery.
The students stood by their pieces to explain their art to those that came to the opening. We had about fifty people attend; the attendees were parents, teachers, and fellow students.

All the students, even E and F who seemed to have lost interest as their projects progressed, spoke eloquently as they explained their artistic choices. The level of understanding they displayed surprised me, even though I had been working with them the whole time. The authentic experience of displaying their work for others made them real artists, and they proudly stood by their pieces. I underestimated the power of the art show validating their artistic expression and giving their adolescent search for importance and identity credibility. The students received many compliments from everyone who visited the show, including a representative from the community office.

I couldn’t have been happier about this culminating experience. The show hung in the dance room for a week following the opening reception.
Appendix G

Art Club Flier

Learn more about ART,
Visit an art EXHIBIT,
Make your own GRAFFITI,

Ask your ART TEACHER or MRS. JENKINS for more information if this sounds like fun to you!

This after-school art club is part of Mrs. Jenkins’ art research study.
Appendix H

Institutional Review Board Parental Consent Form

**PARENTAL CONSENT FORM**

*Parents: Please Read Carefully with your child. Initial the top of each page and sign at the bottom of the last page. Please contact Stephanie Jenkins with any questions.*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project Title</th>
<th>Can identity with subject matter help adolescent students understand visual arts’ relevance in their lives?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Why is this research being done?</strong></td>
<td>This is a research project being conducted by Dr. Susan Hendricks and Stephanie Jenkins at the University of Maryland, College Park. We are inviting your child to participate in this research project because they have shown interest in participating in an after-school art club and meet the grade level requirements for the project (5th-7th). The purpose of this research project is to investigate the meaning of art in a small group setting, expose students to artwork that they can relate to, and encourage students to view art as a way to express their ideas and opinions. Through this after-school art club, we hypothesize that students will positively change their opinions about art and the ways they can use it in their lives. If this occurs, we hope this research will encourage the development and funding of other similar after-school programs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>What will your child be asked to do?</strong></td>
<td>Your child will be asked to attend 9 after-school art club sessions beginning in mid-September. One after-school session will be held each consecutive week from 4:30-5:30 PM, unless unforeseen conflicts arise. The club will meet in either Ms. Bawuah’s art room at Chamberlain Elementary School, except for the day the club visits the National Portrait Gallery. Your child may miss one or two sessions if necessary, but <strong>they need to be present on the day of the field trip to the National Portrait Gallery</strong>. Your child will be asked to participate in discussions, express their opinions about art, and listen to instruction. Your child will be expected to have outstanding behavior on the trip to the National Portrait Gallery. Your child will be led in the creation of a graffiti-style portrait and will write an artist statement about their portrait. The club is free for every child who participates. You and your child will not be monetarily compensated for participating in this research.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>What about confidentiality?</strong></td>
<td>As researchers, we will do our best to keep your child’s personal information confidential since this research involves making audiotapes of their comments and photographs of their artwork. To help protect their confidentiality, we will use an identification key. This key will allow us to link your child’s comments and artwork to their identity. We, the researchers, will be the only peoples to have access to the identification key. Audio recordings of group discussions will be transcribed using the identification key and then stored on a CD in a locked cabinet. Photographs of student artwork will be identified with the identification key only and stored in the same locked cabinet on CD. These CDs will be destroyed after 10 years of being locked in the cabinet. Any research reports or articles</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Initials _______ Date ______
that we write about this project will not include student names but will refer to them as they are identified in the key: “Student A” or “Student B”, etc. We will protect their identity to the maximum extent possible. Your child’s information may be shared with representatives of the University of Maryland, College Park or governmental authorities if they or someone else is in danger or if we are required to do so by law.

In accordance with legal requirements and/or professional standards, we will disclose to the appropriate individuals and/or authorities information that comes to our attention concerning child abuse or neglect or potential harm to your child or others during this after-school art club.

Please place a check next to the appropriate statement below:

_____ I agree to let my child be audiotaped during their participation in this study.

_____ I do not agree to let my child be audiotaped during their participation in this study.

What are the risks of this research?

There are no known risks associated with participating in this research study. All participants will be encouraged to ask the researcher questions throughout the duration of the study and will be informed that they may withdraw from the study at any time without penalty. The club will be free to every child who participates, so you and your child will not have any associated financial risk. You and your child will not be compensated monetarily for participating in this research project.

What are the benefits of this research?

Your child may benefit from learning about contemporary portraiture, discussing art in a small group setting, visiting the National Portrait Gallery, creating portraits in a small group setting, and using graffiti, a non-traditional artistic style your child may not be exposed to in regular art classes. We hope that, in the future, other students might benefit from this study through the development of similar after-school art clubs that promote making a personal connection with art.

Do I have to be in this research? May I stop participating at any time?

Your child’s participation in this research and after-school art club is completely voluntary. You may choose for them not to take part at all. If you allow your child to participate in this research and after-school art club, you or they may decide to stop their participation at any time. If your child decides not to participate in this study or if you decide to stop their participation at any time, they will not be penalized in any way. If your child becomes a part of the after-school club but later you or your child decides they do not want to be a part of the research, they will be asked to stop coming to the after-school art club. However, your child will have future opportunities to be involved in similar art clubs that do not involve research.
Is any medical treatment available if I am injured?

The University of Maryland does not provide any medical, hospitalization or other insurance for participants in this research study, nor will the University of Maryland provide any medical treatment or compensation for any injury sustained as a result of participation in this research study, except as required by law.

What if I have questions?

This research is being conducted by Dr. Susan Hendricks and Mrs. Stephanie Jenkins at the University of Maryland, College Park. If you have any questions about the research study, please contact:

**Dr. Susan Hendricks, Primary Investigator**
2219 Benjamin Building
University of Maryland
College Park, MD 20742
sh@umd.edu or 301.405.8206

or

**Mrs. Stephanie Jenkins, Student Investigator**
Chamberlain Elementary School
1345 Potomac Avenue SE
Washington, D.C. 20003
sconley@umd.edu or 678.665.1797

If you have questions about your rights as a research subject or wish to report a research-related injury, please contact: Institutional Review Board Office, University of Maryland, College Park, Maryland, 20742; (e-mail) irb@deans.umd.edu; (telephone) 301-405-0678

This research has been reviewed according to the University of Maryland, College Park IRB procedures for research involving human subjects.

---

**Statement of Parental Consent**

Your signature indicates that:
- You are the legal guardian of the child whose name is on the “Name of Subject” line below;
- You are at least 18 years of age;
- The research has been explained to you;
- Your questions have been fully answered;
- You have discussed the research with your child; and
- You freely and voluntarily choose for your child to participate in this research project.

**Signature and Date**

NAME OF SUBJECT

SIGNATURE OF PARENT OR GUARDIAN

DATE

**Please return this form in the envelope provided to Ms. Bawuah at Chamberlain Elementary School.**
STUDENT ASSENT FORM

Students: Please read, initial, and sign the following statement if you understand what your parents have told you about the After-School Hip Hop Art Club and Mrs. Jenkins’ research project. If you have any questions, please ask Mrs. Jenkins before signing.

I agree to be part of the After-School Hip Hop Art Club. I agree to be on my best behavior during club meetings, especially during our field trip to the National Portrait Gallery.

Please put a check by the statement you agree with:

_____ I will let Mrs. Jenkins audio record our art club discussions so she can understand how I feel about art. I will also let her photograph my artwork.

_____ I will not let Mrs. Jenkins audio record our art club discussions. I will not let her photograph my artwork.

If I decide I do not want her to record me talking or photograph my artwork, I will let her know immediately. I understand this means I will not be able to continue coming to the art club. Mrs. Jenkins will not be upset with me if I decide to quit for any reason. **I am volunteering for this art club and I know that I can stop participating at any time and for any reason without any penalty.**

I understand that the After-School Hip Hop Art Club is free. I also understand that I will not receive any money for letting Mrs. Jenkins audio record me or photograph my work.

NAME OF STUDENT

SIGNATURE OF STUDENT

DATE
Appendix J

Art Club Acceptance Letter and Schedule

Dear Students and Parents,

You have been chosen to be a part of the After-School Hip Hop Art Club!

We will be meeting after school on either Wednesdays or Thursdays beginning on Wednesday, September 24th, from 4:30-5:30 PM. You will be expected to show up on time to Ms. Bawuah’s art classroom and ready to learn! Please try to attend every session, especially the field trip to the National Portrait Gallery on October 9th. Optional days will be available for you if you need or want extra time to work on your portrait project. We will talk about that when the time comes.

Attached, you will find a complete schedule of the After-School Hip Hop Art Club. If any dates change, you will be notified as soon as possible with a note sent home or a phone call from the school.

You will need to travel home the way the signed form you turned in indicates. If anything changes, please send a signed and dated permission note explaining otherwise.

Please email or call me if you have any questions!

Thank you,

Mrs. Jenkins & Ms. Bawuah

Kindergarten Teacher, Chamberlain ES
M.A. Candidate, University of Maryland, College Park
sconley@umd.edu or 678.665.1797 or ext. 1121
## After-School Hip Hop Art Club Calendar

### September

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Monday</th>
<th>Tuesday</th>
<th>Wednesday</th>
<th>Thursday</th>
<th>Friday</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No School</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>30</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**24** 1st Meeting 4:30-5:30PM

### October

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Monday</th>
<th>Tuesday</th>
<th>Wednesday</th>
<th>Thursday</th>
<th>Friday</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td><strong>2nd Meeting</strong> 4:30-5:30PM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Field Trip to NPG: 3-5:30PM</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No School</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>4th Meeting</strong> 4:30-5:30PM</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>5th Meeting</strong> 4:30-5:30PM</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Optional extra work day</strong></td>
<td><strong>6th Meeting</strong> 4:30-5:30PM</td>
<td><strong>Halloween</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### November

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Monday</th>
<th>Tuesday</th>
<th>Wednesday</th>
<th>Thursday</th>
<th>Friday</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5 **Optional extra work day</td>
<td>6 **7th Meeting 4:30-5:30PM</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>12 8th Meeting 4:30-5:30PM</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>18 9th Meeting 4:30-5:30PM</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>20 Thanksgiving</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>26 10th Meeting 4:30-5:30PM</td>
<td>27 **Optional extra work day</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### December

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Monday</th>
<th>Tuesday</th>
<th>Wednesday</th>
<th>Thursday</th>
<th>Friday</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3 **Optional extra work day</td>
<td>4 **11th Meeting 4:30-5:30PM</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>9 **Optional extra work day</td>
<td>10 Last Meeting 4:30-5:30PM **Prep for show!</td>
<td>11 Art Show Opening Reception 5:30-7 PM</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix K

Art Club Lesson Plan Outline

Meeting Outlines & Plans

(Please note---these lesson plans, discussion topics, and dates are not finalized and are subject to small changes. They are presented to provide a general idea of the weekly club goals and activities.)

Sept. 1st - 12th: Advertise for the after-school art club and gather participants.

Week of Sept. 15th: First group meeting: Explore why students create art, why they believe it is important in their lives, and whether or not it can make a difference.

Prompting Questions:
• What is art?
• Why is it important? How has it been important in history?
• What is it used for today?
• Who likes art? Who doesn’t like art? Why?
• Can art change people’s opinions? How or how not?
• Does art affect your life? How or how not?
• Do you create art? Why or why not?

Collect data by recording the conversation.

Week of Sept. 22nd: Second group meeting: Focus on portraiture with the students. Ask students to draw a portrait of themselves (for approximately 30 minutes). Next, show them examples of famous portraits, discuss elements of portraits, and discover purposes of portraits. Contrast traditional portraits and contemporary portraits. Reveal visit to the National Portrait Gallery. Discuss appropriate museum behavior.

Week of Sept. 29th: Third group meeting: Discuss the show “Recognize: Hip Hop & Contemporary Portraiture” with students. Listen to clips of interviews with artists, talk about the different kinds of work exhibited, and help students understand artists’ purposes in exhibit artworks using images and information available on the web (see www.npg.gov). Discuss appropriate museum behavior again.

Week of Oct. 6th: Fourth group meeting: Visit the National Portrait Gallery with students and at least one other teacher as a chaperone. Review appropriate behavior before traveling to the gallery. Schedule
a docent (museum tour guide) to tell us more about the exhibit and encourage students to ask questions. On the Metro rides to and from the NPG, discuss the pieces in the show, explore why students like or dislike pieces, and how they think the show affects those who see it.

Week of Oct. 13th: Fifth group meeting: Discuss the messages in the exhibition: “Recognize” at length. See how students’ feel their messages came across. Introduce the “My Hip Hop Portrait” project and give students’ direction sheets. Discuss graffiti as an art form.

Week of Oct. 20th: Sixth group meeting: Watch video on creation of graffiti piece in “Recognize” (see www.npg.gov). Sketch 6 different designs for “My Hip Hop Portrait”. Discuss why students choose subject matter and words—they should represent their own lives.

Oct. 27th – Dec. 6th: Working group meetings (and optional extra time): Paint “My Hip Hop Portrait” on wood panels from start to finish. Allow students to stay after school on extra days to finish if necessary. Discuss artist statements and assist students in writing them for “My Hip Hop Portrait”.

Dec. 10th: Final group meeting: Prepare for Art Show Opening Reception. Finish artist statements, prepare room, put on finishing touches.

Revisit discussion from the first week. Ask students if their opinions about art’s relevance have changed, using some of the same questions:

- Has your definition of art changed? (prompt by recalling the poetry and installation piece)
- How is art important?
- What is art used for today? Do you think the exhibit is a good example of modern art?
- Who likes art? Why or why not? Do you think everyone who likes art would like the show we just saw? Why or why not?
- Can art change people’s opinions? Do you think people might change their minds about Hip Hop after seeing the show?
- Can art affect your life? Did this show affect you? How or how not?

Collect data by recording the conversation.
Dec. 11th: Art Show Opening Reception: Students share their creations with their parents and peers, celebrating their personal ideas and opinions in their art. Students read their artist statements out loud, sharing the purpose behind their own art.
Appendix L

My Hip Hop Portrait Directions

“My Hip Hop Portrait” Directions

1. Make a list of ideas, objects, words, and places that represent YOU.
2. Sketch these items in different combinations and arrangements. Keep sketching until you have at least 6 designs you like.
3. Let Mrs. Jenkins make copies of your favorite 3 designs.
4. Fill in the copies of your favorite 3 designs with different color combinations.
5. Pick a favorite design! 😊
6. Sketch your design on the wood panel you will paint.
7. Begin filling in the background first, allowing the paint to dry, and building up layers to create depth. Remember to use acrylic medium.
8. Keep working until you finish! Don’t forget to ask your neighbors and Mrs. Jenkins for help if you need it. Stay positive!
9. Write your artist statement (ask Mrs. Jenkins for the requirements). Once you have a rough draft, ask Mrs. Jenkins to look over it with you. When she approves it, type it up to display with your piece.
10. Sign your portrait.
11. Give yourself a pat on the back—you are finished!
Appendix M

Art Show Opening Reception Flier

Everyone is invited to the opening reception of the Chamberlain Art Club Exhibition on Thursday, December 11, 2008 from 5:30 to 6:30 PM in the Dance Room.

Light refreshments will be served in honor of the artists’ hard work!

Cost $1
Glossary

**Adolescents:** students in grades five through eight, approximately ages eleven through fourteen, for the purpose of this study (Viktor Lowenfeld, 2009)

**Cooperating Art Teacher:** the visual arts teacher at FPCS Chamberlain; her role was to help support the researcher through being an extra chaperone, providing basic drawing supplies, storage space, and art instruction at Working Club Meetings, and organizing the culminating Art Show Opening Reception

**Graffiti:** usually urban artwork created with spray paint on building walls or subway cars; includes a form of a signature called a ‘tag’ in large lettering sometimes alongside cartoon imagery; sometimes associated with gang activity, other times associated with art exhibits—always a form of expression (Hochritt, 2006)

**Issues-based Art Education:** an art educational approach focusing primarily on creating art about social issues instead of developing art skills or design techniques
Bibliography


