

Future Ideological Challenges: Fault Lines, Movements, and Competing Models

Report on Survey of the Literature

William J. Lahneman, Ph.D.

June 24, 2005

CISSM
School of Public Policy
4113 Van Munching Hall
University of Maryland
College Park, MD 20742
Phone: 301-405-7601
Fax: 301-403-8107
E-mail: CISSM@umd.edu

Project commissioned by the CIA Strategic Assessment Group
The work does not reflect the position and attitudes of the Strategic Assessment Group



UNIVERSITY OF
MARYLAND

Executive Summary

The Strategic Assessments Group tasked CISSM to survey the literature for information dealing with nascent or future idea-based themes, fault lines, and challenges as part of the *Future Ideological Challenges* research effort. Over a four month period, we performed Web-based searches using various search engines and portals of the University of Maryland's library system. While the vast majority of our searches targeted academic sources, we also searched the archives of major news media. The resulting annotated bibliography contains 417 entries.

In addition to identifying what scholars and other experts consider important emerging ideologies, the survey identified a number of sources dealing with the drivers that are being employed to spread these ideologies as well as the leading theories about how ideologies emerge and spread. The bibliography also contains several useful case studies that combine all three of these elements.

Taken as a whole, the literature shows that Nationalism remains strong, and most of its emerging manifestations seem to emphasize intolerance. These trends seem likely to increase insecurity in the years ahead.

Religion in its many politicized forms also seems likely to play a leading role in future international relations. Many of the politico-religious movements identified in this survey offer alternative, non-violent models for political organization. They might serve to offset more violent types of religious movements.

The New Left seems likely to prove attractive, at first to people in the developing world but probably to citizens of the developed world as well. It seems to combine faith in capitalism's free market structures with a concern for social justice, which usually derives from some connection to a religious ideology.

The study identified several local movements that have the potential to be copied or otherwise adapted by other groups. Many of these espouse non-violent methods.

The advent of information and communications technologies (ICT) has revolutionized the transmission mechanisms for ideologies. However, ICT, like other technologies, is essentially neutral. It doesn't favor any one ideology over another. It's still content that attracts.

The body of theory on ideology comes from several disciplines (political science, anthropology, sociology, and psychology). It provides a resource for understanding what factors make ideologies attractive, how they spread, and what leads to their decline.

Since most of the candidates for emerging ideologies have emerged as alternatives to current conditions, they challenge the *status quo* to some extent. Since the *status quo* tends to be associated with the United States, most new ideologies possess either latent or overt anti-American aspects.

Table of Contents

Executive Summary	i
Acknowledgements	iv
I. Background	1
II. Methodology	2
III. General Findings	4
IV. Detailed Findings	6
V. Conclusions	10

List of Tables

TABLE 1. Search Terms Used in Web Search	2
TABLE 2. Quantitative Content Analysis of Findings	3

Acknowledgements

Many thanks to Sadaf Zahid, my principal research assistant for this project and graduate student at the Maryland School of Public Policy (MSPP), for her creativity and many hours of hard work on this project. Thanks also to Andrea Hoshmand, also a graduate student at MSPP, for her research into news media as a source of information on this topic.

I. Background

The Strategic Assessments Group tasked us to survey the literature for information dealing with nascent or future idea-based themes, fault lines, and challenges as part of the *Future Ideological Challenges* research effort. Specifically, we were to identify references that addressed the following core questions:

1. Do ideas still matter as a consequential force in global affairs? In what ways might powerful ideas plausibly enable important new ideas, movements, challenges, or conflicts over the next two decades – and with what potential ripple effects on the international system and the U.S. position therein?
2. What are some compelling, consequential, and plausible candidates for emergent/future idea-based challenges?
3. What characteristics might they exhibit?
4. In the information-rich era in which we live, what are the principal means and mechanisms by which certain ideas are likely to arise, differentiate, combine and propagate as powerful agents of social change?
5. To what extent do these candidate themes or movements already resonate in particular geographic contexts, as well as across borders and regions? How might they resonate in the future, given underlying economic, social, political and technological dynamics affecting these areas and groups therein?
6. How might you characterize the nature of the challenge as it might present itself? Is it of a potentially existential nature, or more a challenge of adaptability? Is it pervasive or limited/contextual? Is it multi-dimensional and comprehensive or more tailored and specialized in scope?

II. Methodology

Over a four month period, we performed Web-based searches using various search engines and portals of the University of Maryland's library system. Using the Terms of Reference for the project as well as other information about topics of interest, we compiled an initial list of key words and phrases and used these to structure our search. We added additional key words as the search progressed. These terms are listed in TABLE 1. Our findings are contained in the annotated bibliography that accompanies this report. The bibliography contains 390 entries.

TABLE 1. Search Terms Used in Web Search

Keywords
Africa, Anti-globalization, Arab Countries, Catholic Church, Clash of Civilizations, Communication, Culture, Cyber Space, Democracy, Democracy on Demand, Digital Age, Emerging Ideology, Ethnic Conflict, Ethnic Divisions, Ethnic Movement, Ethno-Nationalism, Ethnic Relations, Europe, Extremism, Followers, Fundamentalism, Green Movement, Ideas, Ideology, Ideologies, Ideologues, Identity, Indonesia, Internet, Islam, Islamic Law, Latin America, Law, Leftist, Liberation Theology, Malaysia, Mass Media, Media, Memory, Nationalism, Nationhood, New Ideas, Pakistan, Palestine, Political Doctrine, Political Ideas, Political Islam, Political Movements, Power, Radical, Religion, Revolution, Secular, Social Change, Social Justice, Sociology of Religion, Tension, Terrorism, Technology, Uruguay, Vanguard Movement

While the vast majority of our searches targeted academic sources, we also searched the archives of major news media. Ten sources were initially targeted during the news search, but only seven provided substantial information. These were Agence France Press (AFP), Voice of America (VOA), National Public Radio (NPR), BBC News, PBS, The Economist, and the Christian Science Monitor. The Financial Times had limited archiving and access, while Radio Free Europe provided situational descriptions and brief snapshots, but little analysis. Regrettably, access was not available to the Foreign Broadcast Information Service (FBIS).

News media sources proved to be a valuable but time-consuming resource that required wading through immense volumes of material to find pertinent references. In particular, news media sources proved valuable for distilling expert opinion and identifying relevant recently published works. One disadvantage was that coverage was somewhat imbalanced because terrorism and Islamic fundamentalism currently have the attention of the media.

Initially, the survey intended to search a number of library catalogs and other sources in foreign languages. In practice, this turned out to be beyond the scope of our capabilities. However, we were able to identify 45 works in foreign languages using English language websites and have included them in the annotated bibliography. Titles in foreign languages that do not use the Roman alphabet are represented phonetically using Roman text with asterisks to separate syllables. Titles in French, German, Spanish, and Russian are accompanied by their English translations, but we were unable to translate titles in Arabic, Farsi, Indonesian, Chinese, Dutch, and Romanian. Unfortunately, only a few foreign language entries include abstracts.

With respect to coding references, my graduate assistants were necessarily the persons who decided whether to include a given source in the draft bibliography. While these decisions were inherently subjective given the nature of the topic, we sought to arrive at commonly accepted standards for inclusion through careful reading and discussion of the Terms of Reference and other amplifying documents provided by the SAG. In addition, we met with our client and discussed his view of the project and topic. In the course of this process, we decided to omit references published prior to the early 1990s unless they dealt with aspects of emerging ideologies.

Based on the fact that I deleted about a dozen citations from the draft bibliography because I considered them to be outside our topic, I am confident that we did not omit references relevant to our key questions.

III. General Findings

TABLE 2 provides a quantitative content analysis of the annotated bibliography by topic. Many of the topics overlap so that several references have been double and triple counted. For instance, several sources on Islamic fundamentalism deal with its religious overtones and discuss the ways that terrorists are using information technologies to obtain funding, recruit new members, coordinate activities, and influence public opinion. These citations would fall under multiple categories, such as “Islam,” “Religion,” “Technology,” and possibly “Ideology.”

TABLE 2. Quantitative Content Analysis of Findings

Category	Number of References	Keywords*
Islam	87	Fundamentalism, Islam, Arab Countries, Political Islam, Indonesia, Pakistan, Terrorism, Islamic Law, Malaysia
Religion	74	Religion, Ideology, Political Ideas, Fundamentalism, Clash of Civilizations, Secular, Sociology of Religion, Vanguard Movement
Democracy	69	Democracy on Demand, Technology, Media, Uruguay
Nationalism	52	Democracy, Political Movement, Radical Ideas, Nationhood, Political Doctrine
Technology	51	Mass Media, Internet, Digital Age, Communication, Cyber Space, Power, Culture
Ideology	44	Emerging Ideology, Tension, Revolution, Followers, New Ideas, Identity, Extremism, Political Movements, Ideas, Ideologues
Ethnic	43	Ethnic Relations, Ethnic Conflict, Ethnic Movement, Ethno-Nationalism, Ethnic Divisions
Christianity	25	Fundamentalism, Political Movements, Liberation Theology
Judaism and Jews	13	Palestine, Memory, Ideology
Environment	11	Green Movement, Europe, Radical, Leftist
Liberation Theology	7	Social Justice, Anti-Globalization, Latin America, Africa, Emerging Ideology, Catholic Church, Social Change, Leftist

* Keywords were used in combinations across categories

In addition to identifying what scholars and other experts feel constitute important emerging ideologies, TABLE 2 also helps identify the drivers that are being employed to spread these ideologies (entries under the topic of “Technology”)

and the theories about how ideologies emerge and spread (entries under the topic of “Ideology”). The bibliography also contains several case studies that tend to combine all three of these elements. These studies offer useful insights. For example, see citations for: Barzilai-Nahon, K. & G. Barzilai; Miles, W.F.S.; Moaddel, M.; and Sandbrook, R. & D. Romano.

IV. Detailed Findings

A careful review of the bibliography identified several theories, drivers, and ideologies that might emerge as important forces in the future. These are listed below.

Citations that address theories, models, or processes (listed alphabetically):

1. Andrain, C.F. & D.E. Apter (political activism)
2. Ben-Rafael, E. (ideology viewed through theories of sociology)
3. Black, A. (history of Islamis political thought as basis for current conditions)
4. Boudon, R. (classical theories of ideology)
5. Castells, M. (the power of identity in the information age)
6. Cotter, J.K. et al (the concept of radical teaching)
7. Dudley, S. (theory of culture and external dimensions of self-determination movements)
8. The Economist 2004 (the rationality of extremism)
9. Flaherty, L.T. (psychology of mass movements and true believers)
10. Gerring, J. (attributes of an ideology)
11. Hopper, D.H. (theoretical treatment of the concept of progress)
12. Leistyna, P. (cultural theories of social change and political activism)
13. Marangudakis, M. (new social movements formation)
14. Nandy, A. (foundations of ethno-religious violence in South Asia)
15. Ntambue Tshimbulu, R.I. (concept of humanization)
16. Rude, J.C. (concept of virtual communities)
17. Schmidt, C.G. et al (understanding political extremism)
18. Van Dijk, T.A. et al (ideology as social cognition)

19. Warner, M. (politics of globalization)
20. Wattenberg, B. - 1998 (democratization)
21. Zeidan, D. (religious fundamentalism)

Citations that address potential **drivers** of emerging ideologies:

1. Baysha, O. & K. Hallihan (role of Ukrainian news media in political crisis of 2000/2001)
2. Bennett, W.L. (communicating global activism)
3. Biswas, B. (mobilizing structures for Diaspora Sikhs and Hindus)
4. Castells, M. (identity in the information age)
5. Dahan, M. & G. Sheffer (use of distance shrinking communication technologies by ethnic minorities and Diasporas)
6. Demetrius, N. (media role in Greek/Macedonian relations)
7. Fair, C.C. (enabling technology for Tamil Diaspora's role in Sri Lanka's Tamil insurgency)
8. Fincher, L.H. (drivers of religious activism)
9. Gerstenfeld, P.B. et al (content analysis of extremist websites)
10. Gunn, G.C. (relationship between language and power)
11. Hill, H.J. et al (media treatment of new and established religious movements)
12. Jones, S. (virtual culture)
13. Juris, J.S. (use of digital technologies by anti-globalization activists)
14. Lee, R.C. et al (how Asian Americans have both defined and been defined by electronic technology)
15. Moon, D. ("mainstream" Muslims are dominant voice of Islam on the Web)
16. Morgan, M. (nonviolent Web-based opposition groups)

17. Mushengyezi, A. (limitations of modern media in Africa)
18. Poggio, P.P. et al (industrialization as source of desperation in developing world)
19. Postmes, T. & S. Brunsting (indirect mobilizing influence of the Internet's powers of mass communication)
20. Robinson, R. (content analysis of Internet sites devoted to religious and fundamentalist beliefs, particularly transnational Hinduism)

Citations that address emerging ideologies. Note: Most ideologies that have already become well-known are not included (e.g., Islamic fundamentalism)

1. Activist NGOs (Mallaby, S. et al)
2. Afro-radicalism & nativism (Mbembe, A.)
3. Al-Qaedaism [my term] (Hellmich, C.)
4. American ideology (Levine, A.; Pilbeam, B.; San Juan, E.)
 - and populist democracy (Lukacs, J.)
5. Anarchism (Epstein, B.)
 - Anarchosyndicalism (Ventura, M.)
 - Green anarchism (Taylor, B.)
6. Anti-Americanism/U.S. imperialism (Laxer, G.; Nazer, H.M.; Warner, M.)
7. Anti-globalization (Bhagwati, J.; Couch, J.; Juris, J.S.; "Globalization is Not An Ideology")
 - Anti-consumerism (Webb, D.)
8. China:
 - Emerging Party Ideology (Brodskaard, K.E. & Y. Zheng)
 - Nationalism (Lim, L.)
9. Communitarianism (Chua, B.H.; The Economist 1995; Marangudakis, M.)
10. Eco-fundamentalism (Lal, D.)
11. Global modernity (Dirlik, A.)
12. Glocalization [local adaptations to globalization] (Satyavrata, I.)
 - modular ideology (Talshir, G.)

13. India
- ideology (Lloyd, J.)
 - Hindu fundamentalism (Robinson, R.; Yi, C. -u.)
 - Hindutva & Khalistan Diaspora movements (Biswas, B.)
14. Landless Movement [M.S.T. in Brazil] (Hinchberger, B.)
15. Liberation Theology/Marxism/democratic left (Berryman, P.; The Economist 1998; Painter, J.)
16. Nationalism
- Authoritarian [Eastern Europe] (Tismaneanu, V.)
 - Chinese (Lim, L.)
 - Fascism (Larsen, S.U.; Mouffe, C.; Weiss, H.)
 - Pancasila Indonesian national ideology [secular Islam] (Ramage, D.E.)
 - religious nationalism and democracy (Oommen, T.K.)
 - Russian nationalism and Russian Orthodox religion (Verkhovsky, A.)
 - Xenophobia (Watts, M.W.)
17. Post-humanism/trans-humanism (Bendle, M.F.; Fukuyama, F.)
18. Religion (and politics)
- and gender (Foot, J.M.)
 - Buddhist Compassion Relief Foundation (Huang, C.J.)
 - Global Christianity (Jenkins, P.)
 - Hindu fundamentalism (Robinson, R.; Yi, C. -u.)
 - Khomeiniism (Falk, R.; Webb, D.)
 - Liberation theology (Berryman, P.; Rutschman, L.A.A.)
 - Meenakshipuram mass religious conversions [Tamil] (Raj, S.A.)
 - Nonviolent Islamic fundamentalism [similar to Khomeiniism] (Johansen, R.C.; Ouis, P.)
 - Pancasila Indonesian national ideology [secular Islam] (Ramage, D.E.)
 - Pentacostalized evangelicism (Freston, P.)
 - radical anabaptism (Rutschman, L.A.A.)
 - religious nationalism and democracy (Oommen, T.K.)
 - Russian Orthodox religion & nationalism (Verkhovsky, A.)
 - Talibanization (R*iy*aja, A.i.)
19. South African model of regional cooperation [my term] (Hentz, J.J.)
20. Southern Consensus [as opposed to Washington consensus] (Gore, C.)

V. Conclusions

Nationalism remains strong, with new types emerging continuously. Most of the emerging manifestations seem to emphasize intolerance. These trends seem likely to increase insecurity in the years ahead.

Religion in its many politicized forms seems likely to continue to play a leading role in international relations, for better and for worse. Several sources argue that Christianity could grow explosively throughout the world in the next few decades, but provide few forecasts concerning to what degree politicized forms of Christianity will emerge. Many of the politico-religious movements identified in this survey offer alternative, non-violent models for political organization. They might serve to offset more violent forms of religious-political expression. However, most will probably incorporate some degree of anti-Americanism and anti-globalization ideology into their doctrines.

The New Left seems likely to prove attractive, at first to many in the developing world but probably to the developed world as well. Its various types all combine faith in capitalism's free market structures with a concern for social justice, which usually derives from some connection to a religious ideology (e.g., liberation theology and Khomeiniism). If a so-called Southern Consensus does emerge, it could contain significant anti-American and anti-globalization strains if trends continue.

The study identified several distinctly local movements that have the potential to be adapted by other groups. Many of these offer non-violent means to advance agendas. The Landless Movement in Brazil, the South African model of regional cooperation, and several of the politico-religious movements seem to offer real alternatives for channeling the desperation that currently fuels many violent opposition movements. However, such movements would still result in new winners and losers and thus have the potential to cause violent backlashes.

Continued progress in information and communications technologies (ICT) has revolutionized the transmission mechanisms for ideologies. ICT has enabled ideologues to reach much larger audiences in much shorter times than before, which can mean greater access to funding and increased capability to act at long distances using small cadres. These capabilities could also contribute to more volatile international political and security environments. However, ICT, like other technologies, is essentially neutral. It doesn't favor any one ideology over another. It's still content that attracts.

The body of theory on ideology comes from several disciplines (political science, anthropology, sociology, and psychology). It provides a resource for understanding what factors make ideologies attractive, how they spread, and what leads to their decline.